P802.3dj D2.0
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 2.0 comment resolution.

➢ ==This version of the agenda is focused on the agenda for Days #1 and Day #2==

❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.

❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.

❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be "parked" and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.

❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).

➢ Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- ❖ Review the proposed response
    - ➢ Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
    - ➢ If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
    - ➢ If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
    - ➢ Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
    - ➢ The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
    - ➢ Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

745 comments received
386 comments in bucket #1
10 comments withdrawn
24 comments closed on the floor
34 comment closed total
325 comments to resolve on the floor
(plus any pulled from the bucket)

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
1	2	0	2	2	0	2	7	1	8
116	5	0	6	2	0	6	17	2	19
119	2	0	2	2	0	3	9	0	9
120	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
120F	1	0	0	0	0	1	2	0	2
169	8	0	7	1	0	3	16	3	19
170	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
171	2	0	1	0	0	2	4	1	5
172	3	0	1	0	0	2	6	0	6
173	1	0	4	0	0	0	5	0	5
174	1	0	5	0	0	3	7	2	9
174A	1	0	4	9	0	13	20	7	27
175	2	0	3	1	0	10	15	1	16
176	3	0	3	1	0	10	17	0	17
176B	6	0	6	0	0	1	13	0	13
176C	1	0	5	0	0	18	23	1	24
176D	1	0	7	2	0	27	36	1	37
177	10	0	4	3	0	17	34	0	34
177A	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
178	7	0	14	12	0	34	66	1	67
178A	0	0	0	0	0	14	14	0	14
178B	37	0	19	0	0	24	79	1	80
179	2	0	9	8	0	50	66	3	69
179A	0	0	3	0	0	5	8	0	8
179B	4	0	2	2	0	17	25	0	25
179C	0	0	2	0	0	2	3	1	4
180	2	0	9	0	0	22	29	4	33
180A	1	0	1	1	0	0	3	0	3
181	3	0	2	0	0	12	14	3	17
182	0	0	3	0	0	13	15	1	16
183	3	0	1	1	0	8	12	1	13
184	6	0	5	0	0	2	13	0	13
185	0	0	0	1	0	11	12	0	12
185A	2	0	6	0	0	1	9	0	9
186	11	0	10	4	0	7	32	0	32
186A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
187	1	0	3	1	0	6	11	0	11
30	2	0	2	0	0	4	8	0	8
45	11	0	6	10	0	3	30	0	30
69	0	0	0	0	0	6	6	0	6
73	5	0	2	0	0	3	10	0	10
73A	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
FM	3	0	0	1	0	1	5	0	5
Total	149	0	162	64	0	370	711	34	745

IEEE P802.3dj Task

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
~~Day #1: 2025/7/9 (electronic session)~~	~~opening business for electronic session~~ ~~common (no commenter presentations)~~
Day #2: 2025/7/10 (electronic session)	common (no commenter presentations) post report with comments closed so far after close of meeting
Day #3: 2025/7/14 (electronic session)	bucket #1 motion agenda TBD; common/electrical track
Day #4: 2025/7/15 (electronic session)	agenda TBD; common/electrical track
Day #5: 2025/7/16 (electronic session)	agenda TBD; common/electrical track closing business for electronic session post report with comments closed so far after close of meeting
Day #6: 2025/7/23 (plenary session)	opening business for plenary session no comment resolution
Day #7: 2025/7/28 (plenary session)	bucket #2 motion (contingent) agenda TBD (common track, single meeting)
Day #8: 2025/7/29 (plenary session)	agenda TBD (electrical/optical/logic tracks, parallel meetings)
Day #9: 2025/7/30 (plenary session)	agenda TBD (electrical/optical/logic tracks, parallel meetings)
Day #10: 2025/7/31 (plenary session)	agenda TBD (common track, single meeting) closing business for plenary session

Common #1

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
MDI references (E)	179C	~~483~~
PLI delay	169	~~341W~~
PMD instantiations	174	~~693~~
Data/training mode (O/E)	179-183 116, 169, 174	[~~191~~, ~~190~~, ~~192~~, ~~193~~, ~~195~~, ~~196~~, ~~198~~, ~~brown_03~~] [~~163~~, ~~166~~, ~~177~~]
Precoding (O/E)	176C/D, 179 180 - 183	[~~534~~, ~~532~~, ~~533~~] [~~530~~, ~~531~~]
MII FLR	171	~~685~~
Error ratio figure and paths	174A	~~590~~, [~~292~~, ~~106~~], ~~brown_03~~
block error ratio interpretation	174A	~~137~~, ~~401~~, ~~409~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, <u>##</u> = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common #2

Day #1 & #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ILT jargon	116, 169	[732, 681]
ILT scope	178B	52 [222, 112] [220, 374, 424, 553], 290, [116, 115], 498 484 553
ILT description types	116, 169, 174	[53, 164, 167, 297, 733]
ILT extender	178B	421
ILT enable	178B	[126, 121, 231], 291
ILT layout	178B	225
ILT adjacent SI	178B	123, 448
ILT terminology	178B	[226, 118], 228
ILT frames	178B	111
ILT function	178B	375
ILT PHY tables	116, 169, 174	[232, 233, 234]
ILT retimer	178B	376
ILT state diagrams	178B	[130, 627, 628], [459, 626], 632
ILT types	178B	[634, 450, 229]
AN host types	73A	42 (pulled forward from "Common #3" slide, maybe move to day #4)
block error ratio interpretation	174A	405 (deferred from Day #1)
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common #4

Day #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
FLR allocation for 800GBASE-ER1	174A	585, nicholl_02
Block error ratio vs BER (O)	180-183, 174A, 176D	395, 396, 394, ~~391W~~, 593, 411, 721, 404, mi_03, he_m_01
AN timeout	119, 172, 175, 73, 45	[441, 442, 443, 444, 445, ran_3dj_02a_2505]
ILT timers	178B	[420, 460, 466, slavick_01] (is this independent of #269) [269, wang_xx_plenary] (move to other slide)
ILT optical tuning (O)	178B	377, ghiasi_01
ILT local_pattern PAM4 (O/E)	178B, 178, 183	415, [416, 417], ran_02
ILT coherent (O)	178B, 185, 187, 169	397, mi_01 [418, 400, 547, 548, 549, mi_01, ran_03], [419, 550, 551, 552, ran_03], 546
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Jitter (O)	180-183	[425, 426, 427, 428, ran_04]
TDECQ (O)	180-183	1, el-chayeb_01, cole_xx_plenary
TDECQ (O)	180-183	[384, 381, 382, 383, 393], 592, ghiasi_04
TDECQ taps (O)	180-183	[392, 343, 345, 347, 349, 430, 508, ghiasi_03]
legacy 50 ppm	176B	263, nicholl_01
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track (95)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Reference impedance (40)	178, 179, 176C, 176D	[59-62 63 64-66 235 236-239 514 595-599 606-618 620-624 ran_01, 653] 515
COM quantization noise (19)	178, 179, 176C, 176D, 178A	[243 244-261 comment_243_attachment ran_01]
SNDR (9)	178, 179, 176D	[481 351 736 737 355 356 414 542 ran_01] 357
Channel ILdd (6)	178, 176C, 179	[535 536 537 482] [138 529]
AC common mode (5)	178C, 178D	359 [354 504 506 507 ran_01]
CR host classes / host channel (5)	179	[370 372 373 ran_01] 720 735
AC coupling (3)	178, 176C, 176D	[543 323] 447
BER_added (2)	178C, 178D	39 41
Amplitude tolerance (2)	179, 176D	[410 667 ran_01]
ERL Tfx (2)	179, 176D	[139 361 ran_01]
ILdc/ILcd (2)	176C, 179B	503 516
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, **##** = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track (44)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
CR test fixtures (8)	179A, 179B	[289 513 594 601] [512 600] 658 660
KR channel / link diagram (6)	178	319 [92 302 303 304 640 ran_01]
Mated test fixtures ILdd (5)	179B	[44 45 46] 43 136
RLdc and RLcd (5)	178, 179, 176C, 176D	[492 493 494 dudek_01] [368 365]
FOM_ILD and ICN (3)	179B	[604 605 kocsis_01] 47
COM (2)	178, 176D	655 480
Channel SCMR (2)	178, 179	49 50
DC common mode (1)	179	446
ERL (3)	179, 176D	371 619 360
Tx equalizer (2)	178, 176D	706 463
Host connector (3)	176D, 179A	413 654 502
C2M ILT (1)	176D	324
ITOL / JTOL (3)	178, 179	745 496 497
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, **##** = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track (13)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
KR test fixture (1)	178	306
MDI (2)	179C	519 438
package class (1)	176C	362
presets (1)	179	666
R_peak (1)	176D	412
RLM (1)	179	526
Tx max swing (1)	179	668
SNR_ISI (1)	178	495
VEC (2)	176D	352 353
AN max voltage	73	455
Negative ΔCOM	178A	262
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, **##** = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Track

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Coherent parameters	185, 187	387, 390, 388, [385, 386, 389, 399, maniloff_xx]
Slew rate	185	398
Receiver sensitivity	185	2
ETCC	185A	386, 385, 11, 12, 13, 14, [625, kota_xx]
IMDD parameters	180-183	[16, 15, 17, 18, 342, 19, 20, 22, 23, 24, 21, 344, 25, 27, 26, 29, 30, 31, 32, 28, 346, 33, 35, 34, 288, 287, 286, johnson_01, ghiasi_02]
CeQ	180-183	[491, 490, 488, 489]
Fiber specs	180-183	285
Annex title	180A	[51, 520]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
FEC bin counters	119, 177, 45, 184	68, [561, 282, 283], 570, nicholl_01
PCS stateless encoder/decoder	175, 119, 172	[669, 432, 433, 331, 339, 584, 431, 676, 670, nicholl_01]
AM Padding	175	454
PCS delay constraint	175	589, nicholl_01
Test patterns	177	189
Test vectors	177A 186A	[453, 294, he_x_01], 110 334
ER1 loopback	186	208 (need one editorial slide)
ER1 pad bits	186	[98, 214], 97
ER1 error monitoring	186	[451, 452], 326
ER1 OH	186	218
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p0/8023dj_D2p0_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):
582, 569, 570, 69, 72, 48, 54, 55, 57, 58, 76, 77, 88, 96, 104, 119, 179, 200, 227, 296, 298, 301, 325, 329, 330, 523, 348, 363, 364, 366, 367, 369, 378, 380, 590, 643, 646, 647, 648, 649, 656, 129 (withdrawn)

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn:
588, 38, 522, 524, 422, 435, 341, 129, 391, 409