

P802.3dj D2.0

Comment Resolution Agenda

Day #7 to Day #10 (Plenary)

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 2.0 comment resolution.
 - This version focuses on Day #7 to Day #10.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

745 comments received
473 comments resolved
272 total comments to resolve

62 common-track comments to resolve
101 electrical-track comments to resolve
56 logic-track comments to resolve
53 optical-track comments to resolve

60 comments in bucket #2

assuming all bucket #2 responses adopted...

212 total comments to resolve
30 common-track comments to resolve
95 electrical-track comments to resolve
38 logic comments to resolve
49 optical comments to resolve

| Clause | E | G | T | ER | GR | TR | Open | Closed | Total |
|--------|-----|---|-----|----|----|-----|------|--------|-------|
| 00 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| 1 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 8 | 8 |
| 116 | 5 | 0 | 6 | 2 | 0 | 6 | 6 | 13 | 19 |
| 119 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 3 | 7 | 2 | 9 |
| 120 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| 120F | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| 169 | 8 | 0 | 7 | 1 | 0 | 3 | 5 | 14 | 19 |
| 170 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 171 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 4 | 5 |
| 172 | 3 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 6 |
| 173 | 1 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 3 | 5 |
| 174 | 1 | 0 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 9 |
| 174A | 1 | 0 | 4 | 9 | 0 | 13 | 4 | 23 | 27 |
| 175 | 2 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 10 | 10 | 6 | 16 |
| 176 | 3 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 10 | 8 | 9 | 17 |
| 176B | 6 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 13 | 13 |
| 176C | 1 | 0 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 18 | 6 | 18 | 24 |
| 176D | 1 | 0 | 7 | 2 | 0 | 27 | 16 | 21 | 37 |
| 177 | 10 | 0 | 4 | 3 | 0 | 17 | 10 | 24 | 34 |
| 177A | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| 178 | 7 | 0 | 14 | 12 | 0 | 34 | 28 | 39 | 67 |
| 178A | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 14 | 0 | 14 | 14 |
| 178B | 37 | 0 | 19 | 0 | 0 | 24 | 12 | 68 | 80 |
| 179 | 2 | 0 | 9 | 8 | 0 | 50 | 27 | 42 | 69 |
| 179A | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 8 |
| 179B | 4 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 17 | 16 | 9 | 25 |
| 179C | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 4 |
| 180 | 2 | 0 | 9 | 0 | 0 | 22 | 22 | 11 | 33 |
| 180A | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 3 |
| 181 | 3 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 12 | 11 | 6 | 17 |
| 182 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 13 | 12 | 4 | 16 |
| 183 | 3 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 8 | 8 | 5 | 13 |
| 184 | 6 | 0 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 11 | 13 |
| 185 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 11 | 10 | 2 | 12 |
| 185A | 2 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 5 | 4 | 9 |
| 186 | 11 | 0 | 10 | 4 | 0 | 7 | 8 | 24 | 32 |
| 186A | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 187 | 1 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 6 | 9 | 2 | 11 |
| 30 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 8 | 8 |
| 45 | 11 | 0 | 6 | 10 | 0 | 3 | 3 | 27 | 30 |
| 69 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 6 | 6 |
| 73 | 5 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 3 | 7 | 10 |
| 73A | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| FM | 3 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 5 | 5 |
| Total | 149 | 0 | 162 | 64 | 0 | 370 | 272 | 473 | 745 |

Comment resolution sequence

| Meeting Date | Business and Tracks |
|----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Day #1: 2025/7/9 (electronic session) | opening business for electronic session common (no commenter presentations) |
| Day #2: 2025/7/10 (electronic session) | common (no commenter presentations) post report with comments closed so far after close of meeting |
| Day #3: 2025/7/14 (electronic session) | bucket #1 motion common track |
| Day #4: 2025/7/15 (electronic session) | electrical track |
| Day #5: 2025/7/16 (electronic session) | common + electrical track closing business for electronic session post report with comments closed so far after close of meeting |
| Day #6: 2025/7/23 (plenary session) | opening business for plenary session presentations and related discussion (all tracks) no comment resolution |
| Day #7: 2025/7/28 (plenary session) | PM1 bucket #2 motion PM1/PM2 common track |
| Day #8: 2025/7/29 (plenary session) | AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 electrical/optical/logic tracks, parallel meetings PM3 common track (contingent) |
| Day #9: 2025/7/30 (plenary session) | AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 electrical/optical/logic tracks, parallel meetings |
| Day #10: 2025/7/31 (plenary session) | AM1/AM2 common track, single meeting) closing business for plenary session |

Common {30}

Day #7 to #10

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| AN timeout and ILT timers {7} | 119, 172, 175, 73, 45 | [441, 442, 443, 444, 445] [420, 466 slavick_02] |
| ILT timers {1} | 178B | [269, wang_02] |
| Block error ratio vs BER (O) {7} | 180-183, 174A, 176D | [593, 396, 394, 411, 404, 406, mi_03, he_m_01], 721, 395 |
| TDECQ taps (O) {7} | 180-183 | [392, 343, 345, 347, 349, 430, 508, ghiasi_03] |
| TDECQ (O) {6} | 180-183 | [384, 381, 382, 383, 393], 592, ghiasi_04 |
| Alternate Transmitter Tests (O) {1} | 180-183 | 1, el-chayeb_01, cole_01 |
| Coherent ILT | 185, 187 | 397, 400, 419, 546, 547, 548, 549, 550, 551, 552, 553 |
| Miscellaneous | | 232, 233, 234, 729 (all withdrawn) |
| Assigned to bucket #2, not pulled | | 54, 55, 57, 58, 105, 119, 162, 225, 227, 325, 405, 407, 671, 673, 679, 682, 692, 731 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. | | |
| Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: assigned to bucket #2; Orange highlight: pulled from bucket #2 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track #1 {50}

Days #7 to #10

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|-------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| AC coupling (3) | 178, 176C, 176D | [543 323] 447 |
| Amplitude tolerance (2) | 179, 176D | [410 667 ran_01] |
| ILdc/ILcd (2) | 176C, 179B | 503 516 ran_01 |
| CR test fixtures (8) | 179A, 179B | [289 513 594 601] [512 600] 658 660 |
| ERL Tfx (2) | 179, 176D | [139 361 ran_01] |
| KR channel / link diagram (6) | 178 | 319 [92 302 303 304 640 ran_01] |
| KR test fixture diagram (1) | 178 | 306 [ran_01] |
| Mated test fixtures ILdd (5) | 179B | [44 45 46] 43 136 |
| RLdc and RLcd (5) | 178, 179, 176C, 176D | [492 493 494 dudek_01] [368 365] |
| FOM_ILD and ICN (3) | 179B | [604 605 kocsis_01] 47 |
| COM (2) | 178, 176D | 655 480 |
| SCMR (3) | 178, 179 | 48 [49 50] |
| DC common mode (1) | 179 | 446 |
| ERL (2) | 179, 176D | 371 360 |
| Tx equalizer (2) | 178, 176D | 706 463 |
| Host connector (3) | 176D, 179A | 413 654 502 |

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 Magenta highlight: assigned to bucket #2; Orange highlight: pulled from bucket #2

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track #2 {51}

Days #7 to #10

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ITOL / JTOL (3) | 178, 179 | 745 [496 497] |
| package class (1) | 176C | [362 ran_01] |
| R_peak (1) | 176D | [412 mi_02] |
| Presets and Tx max swing (2) | 179 | 666 668 |
| AN max voltage (1) | 73 | 455 |
| RLM (1) | 179 | 526 |
| SNR_ISI (1) | 178 | 495 |
| C2M ILT (1) | 176D | 324 |
| MDI (2) | 179C | 519 438 |
| VEC (2) | 176D | 352 353 |
| Module input specifications (2) | 176D | [141 505] |
| Test points illustration (1) | 178B | 511 |
| Frequency masks (6) | | [348 363 364 369 366 367 ghiasi_05] |
| Comments pulled from bucket #1 with actionable suggested remedy (20) | | Technical: 656 709 710 Editorial: 717 [378 380 712] [646 647 648 649] [707 708 719 734] 738 713 714 718 301 |
| Other comments pulled from bucket #1 (7) | | 643 715 739 741 742 743 511 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 Magenta highlight: assigned to bucket #2 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Track

Day #8 & #9

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Coherent parameters | 185, 187 | 387, 390, 388, [385, 386, 389, 399, maniloff_01, maniloff_02] |
| Coherent slew rate | 185 | 398 |
| Coherent receiver sensitivity | 185 | 2 |
| Coherent ETCC | 185A | 11, 12, 14, [625, 13, kota_01] |
| | | |
| IMDD parameters | 180-183 | [16, 15, 17, 18, 342, 19, 20, 22, 23, 24, 21, 344, 25, 27, 26, 29, 30, 31, 32, 28, 346, 33, 35, 34, 288, 287, 286, johnson_01, ghiasi_02] |
| CeQ | 180-183 | [491, 490, 488, 489] |
| Fiber specs | 180-183 | 285 |
| Annex title | 180A | [51, 520] |
| ILT optical tuning (O) | 178B | 377, ghiasi_01 |
| PMD to MDI signal mapping | 180A | 523 |
| | | |
| Comments assigned to bucket #2 | | 329, 330, 96, 104 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: assigned to bucket #2 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track

Days #8 & #9

| Topic | Clause/Annex | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|
| FEC bin counters | 119, 177, 45, 184 | 68, [561, 282, 283], 570, nicholl_01 |
| PCS stateless encoder/decoder | 175, 119, 172 | [669, 432, 433, 670, 331, 431, 584, 676, 339], nicholl_01 |
| AM Padding | 175 | 454, nicholl_01 |
| PCS delay constraint | 175 | 589, nicholl_01 |
| Variable definitions | 175, 177 | 72, 694, 699 |
| Use of “round-robin” | 176 [175, 177, 184, 186] | 696 |
| PMA layering tables | 176 | 75, nicholl_01 |
| Convolutional Interleaver figure | 177 | 88, nicholl_01 |
| Test patterns | 177 | 189 |
| Test vectors and Pad Insertion | 177A 186A | [453, 294, he_x_01], [110, nicholl_01] 334 |
| ER1 loopback | 186 | 208, nicholl_01 |
| ER1 pad bits | 186 | [98, 214], 97 |
| ER1 error monitoring | 186 | [451, 452], 326 |
| ER1 OH | 186 | 218 |
| Matrix math | 177 | [702, 703], 704 |
| Comments pulled from bucket #2 | | 683, 684, 76, 77, 79, 701, 686 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: pulled from bucket #2 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Day #7

Bucket #2 comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p0/8023dj_D2p0_comments_proposed_id_bucket2.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #2:

76, 77, 79, 232, 233, 234, 371, 397, 400, 419, 546, 547, 548, 549, 550, 551, 552, 553, 655, 658, 683, 684, 686, 701, 729

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):

588, 38, 522, 524, 422, 435, 341, 129, 391, 409, 619, 369, 407, 425, 426, 427,
428, 263, 729, 686, 232, 233, 234