

P802.3dj D2.1

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 2.1 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

Comment summary:
509 received on time
285 in bucket #1
8 comments pulled from bucket #1 (so far)
10 withdrawn (so far)
222 total comments to resolve

Electrical track: 88
Optical track: 62
Logic track: 20
Common track: 59

8 late comments received
(require task force approval)

| Clause | E | G | T | ER | GR | TR | Open | Closed | Total |
|--------|-----|---|-----|----|----|-----|------|--------|-------|
| 00 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 1 | 3 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 0 | 7 |
| 116 | 3 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 6 | 0 | 6 |
| 118 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 119 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| 120 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 169 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 170 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 172 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 174 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| 174A | 2 | 0 | 7 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 16 | 0 | 16 |
| 175 | 5 | 0 | 10 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 14 | 1 | 15 |
| 176 | 0 | 0 | 12 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 13 | 0 | 13 |
| 176C | 3 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 10 | 16 | 0 | 16 |
| 176D | 4 | 0 | 7 | 0 | 0 | 11 | 22 | 0 | 22 |
| 177 | 5 | 0 | 8 | 3 | 0 | 5 | 21 | 0 | 21 |
| 178 | 11 | 0 | 14 | 1 | 0 | 17 | 42 | 1 | 43 |
| 178A | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 178B | 36 | 0 | 40 | 4 | 0 | 30 | 110 | 0 | 110 |
| 179 | 6 | 0 | 12 | 4 | 0 | 11 | 30 | 3 | 33 |
| 179A | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 7 | 9 | 0 | 9 |
| 179B | 1 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 14 | 0 | 14 |
| 180 | 5 | 0 | 15 | 1 | 0 | 23 | 44 | 0 | 44 |
| 180A | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 5 | 10 | 0 | 10 |
| 181 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 10 | 14 | 0 | 14 |
| 182 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 11 | 12 | 0 | 12 |
| 183 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 13 | 16 | 0 | 16 |
| 184 | 1 | 0 | 7 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 12 | 0 | 12 |
| 185 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| 185A | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 5 | 10 | 0 | 10 |
| 186 | 2 | 0 | 24 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 31 | 0 | 31 |
| 187 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 5 | 0 | 5 |
| 30 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 5 | 0 | 5 |
| 31B | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 45 | 3 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 7 | 1 | 8 |
| 73 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 73A | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| FM | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Total | 101 | 0 | 194 | 24 | 0 | 198 | 511 | 6 | 517 |

Comment resolution summary

| Meeting Date | Business and Tracks |
|-----------------------------|--|
| Day #1: 2025/9/15 Monday | Opening business Bucket #1 motion; announce tentative bucket #2 Common track comments AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3) |
| Day #2: 2025/9/16 Tuesday | Optical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3) Electrical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3) |
| Day #3: 2025/9/17 Wednesday | Logic track AM1/AM2 Electrical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 Optical track PM1/PM2 (immediately after Logic track complete) |
| Day #4: 2025/9/18 Thursday | Liaison motions Tentative bucket #2 motion Common-track comments Any other remaining on-time comments Closing business |

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|--|--------------------------------------|----------------------|
| Receiver sensitivity error ratio | 178-183, 185, 187, 176C/D 180-183 | [62, brown_04] 61 |
| Error ratio tests | 174A | 453, brown_03 |
| PICS | 174 | 376 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 | | |

Common Track – ILT {25}

Day #1, #4

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|--|-----------------|--|
| Scope | 178B | <u>301</u> , 416, 219, 41, 202 |
| Naming | 178B | 224 |
| Structure | 178B | <u>225</u> , 9, 478 |
| End to end path, RTS @ PCS SI | 178B, 175+ | [<u>417</u> , 471, 329, 323, 324, ran_03] |
| Terminology | 178B | 11 |
| PMD control function | 179, 180+, 178B | 435, 452 |
| ILT state diagram | 178B | [463, slavick_01] |
| Retimers | 178B | 232, 15 |
| Timer | 178B | 66, 418, lusted_02 |
| Training disable | 178B | 43, 480 |
| Introduction clause | 169 | 375 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common Track – Optical {30}

Day #1, #3, #4

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|--|--------------------------|---|
| jitter for optical interface | 180 to 183 | [399, ran_04] |
| TDECQ CER | 180 to 183 | [179, 180, 181, 182, chayeb_01], alloin_01_late |
| TDECQ method | 180 to 183 | [144, 146, 147, 148, 149] [187, 171, 172, 173, chayeb_02], [351, swenson_01_late] alloin_01_late |
| TDECQ reference EQ | 180 181 182 183 | [313, 314, 174, 183, 445, 400 175, 184 176, 185 177, 186, rodes_01] 446 [226, 352, mi_02_late] |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight : pulled from bucket #1 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track #1 {49}

Day #2, #3

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|--|----------------------------|---|
| AUI Functional specifications (2) | 176C, 176D | 214 195 |
| COM P_QC (1) | 178, 179, 17C, 176D | 392 |
| ITOL (3) | 178, 176C | 270 280 384 |
| ITOL/JTOL (5) | 179, 176D | 269 [271 kutscher_01] [152 153] 210 |
| JTOL (10) | 178, 179, 176C, 176D | 303 [302 385 386] 304 305 [154 155 156 168] |
| Host output SNDR (1) | 176D | 276 |
| Jitter (2) | 179, 176D | [297 298] |
| Mode conversion (23) | 178, 179, 176C, 176D, 179B | [253 254 256 257 258 259 261 262 264 265 266 267 268] [255 260 263 411] [317 ellison_01] 397 [368 369 kocsis_01] [169 170 ghiasi_03] |
| CM reference impedance (1) | 178, 179, 17C, 176D | 380 |
| Test equipment impedance (1) | 178 | 381 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track #2 {37}

Day #1 to #4

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|--|-----------------|--|
| RX test channel IL (3) | 178 176C | 273 274 440 |
| CR host output specs (2) | 179 | [299 300 rysin_01] |
| Test fixture reference IL (14) | 179A, 179B | [357 heck_01] [425 424 426 427 428 429 430] [363 364] [365 kocsis_01] 444 356 359 |
| CR IL budget (2) | 179, 179B | [358 heck_02] 360 |
| C2M IL budget (1) | 176D | 353 |
| KR test fixture IL (1) | 178 | 272 |
| Test points (4) | 179, 176D, 179A | 348 349 441 216 |
| Test fixture ERL (1) | 179B | [367 kocsis_01] |
| Host classes (2) | 179A | [198 70] |
| Tx specifications (2) | 179, 176D | 277 151 |
| Clause title (2) | 178, 179 | [330 331] |
| AUI service interface (1) | 176C | 355 |
| PICS (2) | 179, 176D | 2 65 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Track {52+8}

Day #2, #3

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|--|--------------------------|---|
| Test pattern | 187 | 56, 294 |
| Tx parameter | 185 | 229 |
| Reference equalizer | 185, 187, 185A | [438, 437, 439, 337, 338, 178, kota_01_late, temprana_01_late] |
| Shall statements | 185A | 126, 127, 128 |
| Editorial | 180, 181 | [57, 131], 234 |
| RINxxOMA | 180+ | 401, 402 |
| TDECQ limits | 180 181 182 183 | [157, 133, 136, 166 137, 158, 167 132, 138, 159 134, 135, 139, 140, 141, 160, 161] ghiasi_01, ghiasi_02 |
| TX overshoot | 180 to 183 | [162, 163, 164, 165, ghiasi_01] |
| MDI breakout | 180A | [220, 221, 222, 223, 422, 431, dambrosia_02], 419, 420 |
| TX FRX | 180 | 145, 227, 228, 315, [448, 450, dudek_01] |
| TX FRX (Late comments) | 180 to 183 | 510, 511, 512, 513, 514, 515, 516, 517, cole_01, dudek_01 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 Late comments will be addressed if approved by Task Force and after all on-time comments have been addressed | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track {20}

Day #3

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|--|--------------|--|
| Clock ppm tolerance | 120 | [188, 432, nicholl_02] |
| AM PRBS9 padding | 175 | 237 |
| AM figures | 175 | 238 |
| Pseudocode variable names | 184 | 407 |
| PRBS31[Q] generator | 177 | 454 |
| RS-FEC error marking | 172 | 459 |
| PHY delay | 31B | 250 |
| State diagram variable definitions | 178B | 119, 122, 118, 120, 121, 123, nicholl_01 |
| Other comments from bucket #1 | 176 | 284 |
| ILT: definitions of training_status and local_rts | 178B | [45, 481, 230] |
| ILT: Control precoding | 178B | 485, 486 |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket

Day #1

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p1/8023dj_D2p1_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):
208, 421, 398, 118, 120, 121, 123, 284

Comment #208 was withdrawn by the commenter.

A second bucket (bucket #2) may be utilized. If needed, a comment report will be posted Monday evening and an announcement will be sent to the reflector.

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):
59, 372, 204, 205, 208, 209, 404, 405, 406, 409