

P802.3dj D2.3

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Qualcomm, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the **Draft 2.3** comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this comment resolution group (CRG) meeting series.
- ~~❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).~~
 - ~~➤ Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.~~

Comment resolution procedure

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion.

We are here...

Comment summary (so far):
 158 received
 7 withdrawn
 28 in bucket
 123 total comments to resolve

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
116	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	1
174A	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
175	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
176	2	0	1	0	0	0	3	0	3
176C	1	0	3	0	0	2	6	0	6
176D	3	0	1	0	0	7	11	0	11
177	0	0	1	0	0	2	3	0	3
178	3	0	1	2	0	4	10	0	10
178A	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
178B	1	0	1	0	0	2	4	0	4
179	5	0	4	0	0	4	12	1	13
179B	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
179C	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
180	8	0	10	2	0	32	52	0	52
180A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
181	0	0	2	0	0	9	10	1	11
182	1	0	0	1	0	10	11	1	12
183	1	0	2	1	0	11	13	2	15
184	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
185A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
186A	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
45	1	0	0	1	0	0	2	0	2
73A	1	0	0	0	0	1	2	0	2
Total	27	0	34	8	0	89	151	7	158

Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
Day #1: 2026/1/19 Monday	Opening business Bucket #1 motion Cross-clause comments Optical comments
Day #2: 2026/1/20 Tuesday	Optical comments May transition to electrical comments if above complete
Day #3: 2026/1/21 Wednesday	Electrical comments May transition to remaining non-optical if above complete
Day #4: 2026/1/22 Thursday	Liaison motions, etc. Logic/architecture comments Any other remaining comments Closing business
Note that comment resolution agenda may be readjusted.	

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
square wave	176+	92
mask table	180+	103, brown_03
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

DONE

Optical Comments, part 1 {#}

Day #1/2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
CRU	180	112
DFE tap	180	35
TDECQ and jitter	180	124, ghiasi_02
TDECQ method	180-183	[125, 126, 127, 128, ghiasi_02]
TDECQ_CER	180-183	[51, 54, rodes_01], 36 37, 38 61W 64, 65, 66, 67W, 68W, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73 83 53
TDECQ and TDECQ_CER	180	49
TDECQ	180	63,
precoding	180	101, 102
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Comments {#}

Day #1/2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ETCG	185A	98
OMA value	181, 183	[151, 152], [153, 154], he_01
Overshoot	180-183	[108, 109, 110, 111, ghiasi_01]
TFSEH	180-183	[9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, cole_01], 74, 75, 77, 97 [2, maniloff_02] 129, 130
TFSEH error mask compliance	180	76
TFSEH - CDR	180-183	[117, 119, 121, 123]
TFSEH organization		116, 118, 120, 122
Rx Sensitivity	180-183	[15, 16, 17, 18, cole_01], 79
Stressed Rx Sensitivity	180	55, 80
RINxxOMA	180	78
OMOuter	180	62, 94, ran_04
TDECQ and OMA	180	[1, 4, 50, 52, 157, allion_01], [45, 46, 29, 158, 72, 73], issenhuth_01, 156

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1\

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Comments {26}

Day #2/3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
RL masks {2}	178, 179	34 40
channel model {6}	176D	[58 60 healey_01] 136 137 138 139
COM {2}	178A	39 155
editorial {6}	178 179 176C 176D 176D	[132 <u>133</u> 134 135] 19 57
jitter {4}	179	[<u>105</u> 141] [<u>143</u> 144]
Modal ERL {1}	178	[41 mellitz_01]
Rx tests {2}	176C	20 96
SCMR {1}	178	42
Test fixtures {1}	179B	[85 ran_02 mammenga_01]
TX EQ limits {1}	176C	145
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
bin counters	177	150
C2C functional spec	176C	104
hi_ser	175	3
Test vectors	186A	44, sluyiski_01
APSU: ILT/RTS/APSU wording	179+	[8, 25], [26, 27, 28]
APSU: State diagrams	178B	21, 146
BLER using PCS	174A	106
Functional specifications	178+	7
MDI connectors	179C, 180A	86, 87, 107, ran_03
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Bucket #1

Day #1

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p3/8023dj_D2p3_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf

(count 28)

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):

53

(count = 1)

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):

88, 89, 113, 114, 115, 131, 142

(count 7)