P802.3dj D3.0
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Qualcomm, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 3.0 comment resolution.
- Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- The agenda is subject to change as required.
- Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this comment resolution group (CRG) meeting series.
- Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
  - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution procedure

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024 8

All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion.

We are here...

Comment summary (so far):
487 received
2 withdrawn
182 in bucket #1
303 total comments to resolve

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	1	0	0	1	0	1	3	0	3
116	1	0	0	1	0	2	4	0	4
118	0	0	0	0	0	4	4	0	4
120	1	0	0	0	0	2	3	0	3
169	1	0	0	0	0	1	2	0	2
170	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
171	1	0	0	1	0	4	6	0	6
172	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
174	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
174A	1	0	1	1	0	4	7	0	7
175	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
176	7	0	1	2	0	7	17	0	17
176A	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	1
176B	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
176C	1	0	1	0	0	6	8	0	8
176D	3	0	4	2	0	27	36	0	36
177	3	0	1	2	0	8	14	0	14
178	2	0	5	2	0	11	20	0	20
178A	0	0	0	1	0	4	5	0	5
178B	11	0	4	6	0	39	60	0	60
179	2	0	3	1	0	30	34	2	36
179A	0	0	0	3	0	0	3	0	3
179B	0	0	2	0	0	11	13	0	13
179C	3	0	0	1	0	13	17	0	17
179D	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
180	5	0	10	13	0	97	125	0	125
180A	0	0	1	1	0	1	3	0	3
181	0	0	4	2	0	6	12	0	12
182	4	0	3	1	0	5	13	0	13
183	4	0	3	1	0	6	14	0	14
184	0	0	0	0	0	4	4	0	4
185	2	0	1	2	0	0	5	0	5
185A	1	0	2	0	0	2	5	0	5
186	0	0	2	0	0	13	15	0	15
186A	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
187	2	0	1	2	0	0	5	0	5
45	3	0	3	2	0	6	14	0	14
73A	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	1
FM	2	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	2
Total	61	0	55	50	0	321	485	2	487

Agenda Grid

Interim Meeting Time Slots	Day 1 Tue May 5 Online	Day 2 Wed May 6 Online	Day 3 Tue May 12 Interim	Day 4 Wed May 13 Interim	Day 5 Thu May 14 Interim	Day 6 Fri May 15 Interim
AM1 (8AM-10AM)	Single-track Task force	Parallel tracks E+O	Single track Available for any track, likely… optical common	3 parallel tracks E+O+L	3 parallel tracks O+E+L	Task force
AM2 (10:15AM-12:15PM)						
PM1 (1:15PM-3:15PM)	x	x	Single-track Electrical (3ds/3dt)	Single track Electrical Non-optical common (3ds)	2 parallel tracks O+E	x
PM2 (3:30PM-6:00PM)	x	x				x
PM3 (7PM-9PM)	x	x	Single track. Available for any track (TBD)	x	x	x

Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
Day #1: 2026/5/5 Tuesday (online)	Online meeting, single track (Task Force) Opening business, Bucket #1 motion Common topics (slides 7 and 8)
Day #2: 2026/5/6 Wednesday (online)	Online meeting, parallel tracks: Electrical (slide 13), Optical (slides 9 and 10)
Day #3: 2026/5/12 Tuesday (interim)	Brief opening business, possible Bucket #2 motion AM1/AM2: (if available): Single track (optical comments) –Will start in AM1 or AM2 if 400GPL SG is adjourned. PM1/PM2: Single track (electrical comments) PM3 (if needed): Common track (either electrical or optical comments)
Day #4: 2026/5/13 Wednesday (interim)	AM1/AM2: Parallel tracks: Logic, Electrical, Optical PM1/PM2: Single track (electrical and other non-optical comments)
Day #5: 2026/5/14 Thursday (interim)	AM1/AM2: Parallel tracks: logic, Electrical, Optical PM1/PM2: Parallel tracks: Electrical, Optical
Day #6: 2026/5/15 Friday	AM1/AM2: Single track (Task Force) Liaison motions, etc. Remaining comments Closing business
Note that comment resolution agenda may be readjusted.	

Common comments optical-related

Day #1/6

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
APSU: conditions	Many	[279, 280, 281, 282, 287, 288, 283, 284, 289, 290, 285, 286, 278, dambrosia_02]
APSU: Functions	178B	[132, 133, 134, 135, 136, 137, huber_01]
APSU: State diagram - refactor	178B	140, osorio_01, mascitto_02, huber_01
APSU: State diagram - fault handling	178B	109, osorio_01, ran_02
APSU: APSU for 800GBASE-LR1	184, 185, 178B	314, brown_04
APSU: APSU for 800GBASE-ER1	185, 187, 178B?	315, 126, 127, 128, nicholl_01
Reference CRU	182	[255]
Reference CRU peaking	179, 180-183	263, 264, 252, 253, 254, 256
Reference receiver		[96, 99, 257]
Error Ratio	178, 176C, 180	52, 85, 105, 106, 94, maniloff_01 ran_3dj_adhoc_01_260421.pdf ran_3dj_adhoc_02_260421.xlsx
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common comments not optical-related

Day #1/3/4/5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Remove SFP224	Many	323, 325, 326, 327, 328, 329, 330, 331, 332, 335, 336, 337, 338, 339, 340, 341, 342, 343, 344, 345, 346
AUI Management	45, 179, 176C	142, 365, 363, 299, 318
Definitions	1	54
APSU: Service interface	116, 180, 176D	145, 429, 108, 104
APSU: Signal detect	179	379
APSU: Definitions, nomenclature	178B	[131*, 358], 247
APSU: Training frame	178B	138
APSU: Functions	178B	62
APSU: State diagram - fixes	178B	[110, 359], [111, 368, slavick_01], [206, mascitto_01]
APSU: State diagram - timers	178B	29, 151
APSU: Variables	178B	205
APSU: Management	178B	30, 209
APSU: Pulled from bucket #1		185, 139

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1, Orange highlight: optical-related

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical-Coherent comments (Optical Track)

Day #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Block Diagram	185 187	227, 228 231, 232, 234
ETCC	185A	235, 236, 237

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical-IMDD comments (Optical Track)

Day #2/3/4

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
MDI connector	180A	115, 116, 117
OMA_outer test method	180	218
Extinction ratio and MPI	180	442, 446, 490
OMAouter value	181	150
Tx OMA and Rx Sensitivity value	180, 181	[72, 73, welch_01]
fiber attenuation	183	141
Transition time	180, 181, 182, 183	[319, 443, 320, 321, 322]
Overshoot	180, 181, 182, 183	[248, 265, 441, 489, 249, 266, 250, 267, 251, 268, ghiasi_01, rodes_01]
RINxxOMA	180	492, 491
Reference receiver	180	452
signal_detect hysteresis	180	437
Block diagram, TP2 patch cord	180	434
TDECQ - compliance channel	180	459
TDECQ - test pattern	180+	[390, 388, 389], 455

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, * = editorial slide

Optical comments (Common track)

Day #3/4/5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
PMD transmit function modes	180+	435*
Test pattern	180+	451
TDECQ_CER remove	180, 181, 182, 183	[71, 47, 294, 48, 49, 50, 479]
TDECQ_CER other	180, 181, 182, 183	120, 38
Rx sensitivity	180	[44, 295, cole_01,reimer_01], [493]
Rx sensitivity - SEH	180	93, [226, 296, maniloff_01, rodes_02]
Stressed Rx sensitivity - interference	180	302*
TFSEH remove	180	[440, 480]
TFSEH clock recover	180	25
TFSEH symbol error histograms	180	[225, 482, 483, 484]
TFSEH cleanup	180	[43, 121, 122, 123, 124, 293, 481, 485, 486, 487, 488, cole_01]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1, "*" indicates editorial slide		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, "*" editorial slides

Optical comments (Common Track)

Day #3/4/5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
TDECQ - Reference equalizer	180	[20, 180, 224, 391, 463, swenson_01], [393, swenson_01], 461, 462, 465
TDECQ - noise term	180	[21, 24, 307, 464]*
TDECQ - tap weight	180	[467], [221, 469, swenson_08], [70, 468, alloin_02], [466]
TDECQ - calculation	180	[397, 415, swenson_06], [474, 477], 476, 478
TDECQ - Ceq	180	222, 223, swenson_08
TDECQ - jitter stress	180, 181, 182, 183	[258, 262, 259, 260, 261, ghiasi_02]
TDECQ - histogram	180	[308, 470], [472, 473]
TDECQ - OMA	180	[219, 23, swenson_08], [69, chayeb_01, alloin_01, rodes_03]
TDECQ - DFE	180	91, 220, 394, alloin_02, swenson_04, swenson_08
TDECQ - optimization	180	[92, 395, 396, ran_xx, swenson_02]
TDECQ / Rx sensitivity - limit	180	[439, 447]
Power budget	180	448
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, "*" = editorial slides

Electrical Comments {#}

Day #2/3/4/5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Modal ERL	178, 179, 176C, 176D, 178A, 179B	[46, 155, **156**, 157, 158, 239, 159, 160, 161, 162, 163, 164, 165], [153, **154**], mellitz_01
TX EQ	178, 176C	306
SCMR_CH	178, 179	171
PMD variables	178	**300**
ERL	178, 176C	[166, 167]
RLM	179	303
FOM_ILD	179B	348
ILdd fit	179, 179B	[168, 13, 169], [238 heck_01]
MTF Requirements	179B	170
SNR_ISI	176D	[274]
SNDR	179, 176D	[275, 181 calvin_01] , 312
Jitter	178, 179, 176D	[309, 310, 311, 297], [425, 426], [272, 273], 305, [182, 183, 184]
MDI connector	179, 179B, 179C, 176D	90, 240, 113, [114, 301], 178
Ref pkg	178, 176C, 176D	17, 246
C2M figures	176D	[107 ran_3dj_03a_2603, 173, 292]
Amplitude tolerance	176D, 176C, 178, 179	179
C2M methodology	176D	291, [242, 354, 355]
C2M reference channel	176D	243, 244, 269
C2M specs	176D	**[174**, **175**, 12, 298, 245, 276, 277], 313
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic {17}

Day #4/5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Stateless decoder	172	360
Syntax	175, 176	[74, 53, 75, 77, 78], 423
Timesync	175, 176	57, 55
Skew reporting	176	56
Test pattern	186	210, 211, mascitto_03
Skew	186	405
State diagrams	186	406
Test vectors	186A	316, gnicholl_02
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket #1

Day #1

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D3p0/8023dj_D3p0_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf
(count 182)

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):
185, 139,
(count #)

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):
270, 271
(count 2)