

# **P802.3dj D3.0**

## **Comment Resolution Agenda**

Matt Brown, Qualcomm, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief  
Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor  
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor  
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor  
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

# Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the **Draft 3.0** comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this comment resolution group (CRG) meeting series.
- ❖ **Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).**
  - **Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.**

# Comment resolution procedure

Source: [https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24\\_05/brown\\_3dj\\_01\\_2405.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf)

## Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”  
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion.

# We are here...

Comment summary (so far):

487 received

286 closed

201 comments to resolve

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	1	0	0	1	0	1	2	1	3
116	1	0	0	1	0	2	1	3	4
118	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	4	4
120	1	0	0	0	0	2	0	3	3
169	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	2	2
170	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
171	1	0	0	1	0	4	0	6	6
172	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
174	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
174A	1	0	1	1	0	4	2	5	7
175	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
176	7	0	1	2	0	7	8	9	17
176A	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	1
176B	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
176C	1	0	1	0	0	6	4	4	8
176D	3	0	4	2	0	27	1	35	36
177	3	0	1	2	0	8	2	12	14
178	2	0	5	2	0	11	2	18	20
178A	0	0	0	1	0	4	0	5	5
178B	11	0	4	6	0	39	27	33	60
179	2	0	3	1	0	30	10	26	36
179A	0	0	0	3	0	0	0	3	3
179B	0	0	2	0	0	11	2	11	13
179C	3	0	0	1	0	13	9	8	17
179D	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
180	5	0	10	13	0	97	85	40	125
180A	0	0	1	1	0	1	0	3	3
181	0	0	4	2	0	6	8	4	12
182	4	0	3	1	0	5	9	4	13
183	4	0	3	1	0	6	10	4	14
184	0	0	0	0	0	4	1	3	4
185	2	0	1	2	0	0	0	5	5
185A	1	0	2	0	0	2	0	5	5
186	0	0	2	0	0	13	8	7	15
186A	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
187	2	0	1	2	0	0	0	5	5
45	3	0	3	2	0	6	2	12	14
73A	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	1
FM	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	2
<b>Total</b>	<b>61</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>321</b>	<b>201</b>	<b>286</b>	<b>487</b>

# Agenda Grid

Day 1 Tue May 5 Online	Day 2 Wed May 6 Online	Interim Meeting Time Slots	Day 3 Tue May 12 Interim	Day 4 Wed May 13 Interim	Day 5 Thu May 14 Interim	Day 6 Fri May 15 Interim
Single track Task force	Parallel tracks E+O	AM1 (8AM-10AM)	Single track Optical common	3 parallel tracks E+O+L	3 parallel tracks O+E+L	Task force
		AM2 (10:15AM-12:15PM)				
x	x	PM1 (1:15PM-3:15PM)	Single track Electrical (3ds/3dt)	Single track Non-optical common (3ds)	2 parallel tracks O+E	x
x	x	PM2 (3:30PM-6:00PM)				x
x	x	PM3 (7PM-9PM)	Single track Electrical If needed.	x	x	x

# Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
Day #1: 2026/5/5 Tuesday (online)	Online meeting, single track (Task Force) Opening business, Bucket #1 motion Common topics (slides 7 and 8)
Day #2: 2026/5/6 Wednesday (online)	Online meeting, parallel tracks: Electrical (slide 14), Optical (slides 9, 10, 11)
Day #3: 2026/5/12 Tuesday (interim)	Brief opening business AM1/AM2: Single track, optical comments (slides 12, 11, 13) PM1/PM2: Single track, electrical comments (slide 14) PM3: Continue with electrical comments (if needed)
Day #4: 2026/5/13 Wednesday (interim)	AM1/AM2: Parallel tracks: Logic (slide 15), Optical (slides 12, 13, 11) PM1/PM2: Single track: Common (slides 8 regardless, 7 if 3ds recessed)
Day #5: 2026/5/14 Thursday (interim)	AM1/AM2: Parallel tracks: logic, Optical PM1/PM2: Parallel tracks: Optical
Day #6: 2026/5/15 Friday	AM1/AM2: Single track (Task Force) Liaison motions, etc. Remaining comments Closing business
Note that comment resolution agenda may be readjusted.	

# Common comments optical-related

Day #1/4/6

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
APSU: conditions	Many	[ <del>280</del> , 279, 281, 282, 287, 288, 283, 284, 289W, 290W, 285, 286, 278, dambrosia_02]
Reference CRU	182	[255]
Reference CRU peaking	179, 180-183	263, 264, 252, 253, 254, 256
Reference receiver		[96, 99, 257]
Error Ratio	178, 176C, 180	52, 85, 105, 94, [106, maniloff_01] ran_3dj_adhoc_01_260421.pdf ran_3dj_adhoc_02_260421.xlsx
References	180, 1	449
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Common comments not optical-related

Day #1/4/6

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
APSU: Functions	178B	[132, 133, 134, 135, 136, 137, <del>huber_01</del> ]
APSU: State diagram - refactor	178B	140, <del>esorio_01</del> , <del>mascitto_02</del> , <del>huber_01</del>
APSU: State diagram - fault handling	178B	109, <del>esorio_01</del> , <del>ran_02</del>
APSU: APSU for 800GBASE-LR1	184, 185, 178B	314, <del>brown_04</del>
APSU: APSU for 800GBASE-ER1	185, 187, 178B?	315, 126, 127, 128, <del>nicholl_01</del>
Remove SFP224	Many	323, 325, 326, 327, 328, 329, 330, 331, 332, 335, 336, 337, 338, 339, 340, 341, 342, 343, 344, 345, 346
Definitions	1	54
APSU: Service interface	116, 180, 176D	145, 429, 108, 104
APSU: Signal detect	179	379
APSU: Definitions, nomenclature	178B	[ <del>131</del> *, 358], 247, <b>194</b>
APSU: Training frame	178B	138, <b>139</b>
APSU: Functions	178B	62, <b>201</b>
APSU: State diagram - fixes	178B	[110, 359], [111, 368, <del>slavick_01</del> ], [206, <del>mascitto_01</del> ]
APSU: State diagram - timers	178B	29, 151
APSU: Variables	178B	205
APSU: Management	178B	30, 209, <b>185</b>
APSU: Terminology	177	[ <del>372</del> , <b>373</b> , <del>374</del> , <del>375</del> ]
Error ratio	174A	<b>241, 421</b>

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.  
 Legend: ~~###,###,###~~ = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

# Optical-Coherent comments (Optical Track)

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Block Diagram	<del>185</del> <del>187</del>	<del>227, 228</del> <del>231, 232, 234</del>
ETCC	<del>185A</del>	<del>235, [237, 236]</del>
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Optical-IMDD comments (Optical Track)

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
MDI connector	180A	115, 116, 117
OMA <sub>outer</sub> test method	180	218, rodes_03, alloin_01, chayeb_01
Extinction ratio and MPI	180	[442, 446], 490
OMA <sub>outer</sub> value	181	150
Tx OMA and Rx Sensitivity value	180, 181	[72, 73, welch_01]
fiber attenuation	183	141
RIN <sub>xx</sub> OMA	180	[492, 491]
Reference receiver	180	452
signal_detect hysteresis	180	437
Block diagram, TP2 patch cord	180	434
TDECQ compliance channel	180	459
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation, \* = editorial slide

# Optical-IMDD comments (Optical Track)

Day #3/4/5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
TDECQ - test pattern	180+	[390, 388, 389], 455, 457
Test pattern – square wave	180+	450, 33
Editorial	180+	392, [417, 418], 420, 456
TDECQ	181, 182	95, 97
PMD service interface	180+	431
APSU	180+	432
Signal ok	180+	433, 436
RIN	180+	445
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation, \* = editorial slide

# Optical comments (Common track)

Day #3/4/5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
<del>TFDECG_GER remove</del>	<del>180, 181, 182, 183</del>	<del>[71, 47, 294, 48, 49, 50]</del>
<del>TFDECG_GER other</del>	<del>180, 181, 182, 183</del>	<del>120, 38, 479</del>
<del>Rx sensitivity</del>	<del>180</del>	<del>[44, 295, cole_01, reimer_01]*, [493]</del>
<del>Rx sensitivity SEH</del>	<del>180, 176C/D, 179, 178</del>	<del>93, [226, 296, 106, maniloff_01, rodes_02, wang_01]</del>
<del>Stressed Rx sensitivity interference</del>	<del>180</del>	<del>302*</del>
<del>TFSEH remove</del>	<del>180</del>	<del>[440, 480]</del>
<del>TFSEH cleanup</del>	<del>180</del>	<del>[43, 121, 122, 123, 124, 293, 481, 485, 486, 487, 488, cole_01]*</del>
<del>TFSEH clock recover</del>	<del>180</del>	<del>25</del>
<del>TFSEH symbol error histograms</del>	<del>180</del>	<del>[225, 482, 483, 484]</del>
<del>PMD transmit function modes</del>	<del>180+</del>	<del>435</del>
<del>Test pattern</del>	<del>180+</del>	<del>451</del>
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1, "*" indicates editorial slide		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation, "\*" editorial slides

# Optical comments (Common Track)

Day #3/4/5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Transition time	180, 181, 182, 183	[319, 443, 320, 321, 322]
Overshoot	180, 181, 182, 183	[248, 265, 441, 489, 249, 266, 250, 267, 251, 268, ghiasi_01, rodes_01]
TDECQ - Reference equalizer	180	[20, 180, 224, 391, 463, swenson_01], [393, swenson_01], 461*, 462, 465
TDECQ - noise term	180	[21, 24, 307, 464, swenson_01]
TDECQ - OMA	180	[219, 23], [69, chayeb_01, alloin_01, rodes_03]
TDECQ - tap weight*	180	[467], [221, 469], [70, 468, alloin_02], [466]
TDECQ - calculation	180	[397, 415], [474, 477], 476,
TDECQ - Ceq	180	222, 223
TDECQ - jitter stress	180, 181, 182, 183	[258, 262, 259, 260, 261, ghiasi_02]
TDECQ - histogram	180	[308, 470], [472, 473]
TDECQ - DFE	180	91, 220*, 394, alloin_02, swenson_01
TDECQ - optimization	180	[92, 395, 396, 478, swenson_02]
TDECQ / Rx sensitivity - limit	180	[439, 447]
Power budget	180	448
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation, "\*" = editorial slides

# Electrical Comments {#}

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	
TX EQ	178, 176C	306
SGMR_CH	178, 179, 179B	171, 170
PMD variables	178	300
ERL	178, 176C	[166, 167]
RLM	179	303
FOM_ILD	179B	348
ILdd fit	179, 179B	[238, 13, heck_01] [168, 169]
SNR_ISI	176D	274
SNDR	179, 176D	[275, 181 calvin_01] , 312
Modal ERL	178, 179, 176C, 176D, 178A, 179B	[46, 155, 156, 157, 158, 239, 159, 160, 161, 162, 163, 164, 165], [153, 154], mellitz_01
RIT, SEH	176C	106, maniloff_01
Jitter	178, 179, 176D	[309, 310, 311, 297], [425, 426], [272, 273], 305, [182, 183, 184]
MDI connector	179, 179B, 179C, 176D	90, 240, 113, [114, 301], 178
Ref pkg	178, 176C, 176D	17, 246
G2M figures	176D	[107 ran_3dj_03a_2603, 173, 292]
Amplitude tolerance	176D, 176C, 178, 179	179
G2M methodology	176D	291, [242, 354, 355]
C2M reference channel	176D	243, 244, 269
C2M specs	176D	[174, 175, 12, 298, 245, 276, 277], 313
Pulled from bucket	178 179 176D 179C	32, 424 88 427, 428 324

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Stateless decoder	172	360
Syntax	175, 176	[74, <u>53</u> , 75, 77, 78]*, 423*
Timesync	175, 176	57, 55
Skew reporting	176	56
Test pattern	186	210, [211, mascitto_03]
Skew	186	405
State diagrams	186	406
Test vectors	186A	316, gnicholl_02
AN reported host class	73A	<u>130</u>
n:n PMA SIL	176	<u>147</u>
Inverse Precoding	177	<u>376</u>
AUI Management	45, 179, 176C	365*, [ <u>142</u> , 363, 299, 318]*
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1, "*" indicates editorial slide		

## Bucket #1

Done

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:

[https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D3p0/8023dj\\_D3p0\\_comments\\_proposed\\_id\\_bucket1.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D3p0/8023dj_D3p0_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf)

(count 182)

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):

32, 33, 88, 95, 97, 130, 139, 147, 185, 194, 201, 241, 324, 373, 376, 392, 417, 418,  
420, 421, 424, 427, 428, 431, 432, 433, 434, 436, 445, 450, 456, 457

(count 32)

## Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):

270, 271, 289, 290

(count 2)