

P802.3dj D3.1

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Qualcomm, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 3.1 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this comment resolution group (CRG) meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution procedure

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion.

We are here...

Comment summary (so far):

307 received

179 closed

128 comments to resolve

~ comments to resolve by track

5 common

9 APSU comments

6 electrical

10 logic

98 optical

11 additional non-ballot (late) comments
(to be addressed, time-permitting)

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
0	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	2	2
120	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
120F	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
169	3	0	0	0	0	2	1	4	5
171	1	0	0	0	0	2	0	3	3
173	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	2	2
174	1	0	1	0	0	3	1	4	5
174A	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	1
175	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	2
176	0	0	1	0	0	3	2	2	4
176C	0	0	3	0	0	1	0	4	4
176D	0	0	2	1	0	3	1	5	6
177	1	0	2	0	0	2	0	5	5
177A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
178	9	0	2	0	0	3	1	13	14
178A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
178B	6	0	8	5	0	24	6	37	43
179	4	0	1	1	0	7	2	11	13
179B	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
179D	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
180	17	0	10	28	0	64	86	33	119
180A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
181	2	0	3	3	0	4	7	5	12
182	1	0	4	2	0	5	5	7	12
183	1	0	2	1	0	3	4	3	7
184	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	2	2
185	5	0	2	0	0	1	1	7	8
186	6	0	4	4	0	5	5	14	19
186A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
187	1	0	1	0	0	2	1	3	4
45	3	0	0	1	0	0	1	3	4
FM	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
Total	72	0	47	47	0	141	128	179	307

Agenda Grid

Plenary Meeting Time Slots	Day 1 Mon July 13 Collocated Interim and Plenary	Day 2 Tue July 14 Plenary	Day 3 Wed July 15 Plenary	Day 4 Thu July 16 Plenary	Day 5, 6, 7 Tue/Wed/Thu July 21/22/23 Online meetings
AM1 (8AM-10AM)	Single track (task force)	Three tracks: E+O+L	no meeting [400 GPL]	Task force	Contingent online meeting (only required if all comments are not addressed at the plenary meeting) 9AM to 1PM EDT
AM2 (10:15AM-12:15PM)	no meeting		If 400 GPL adjourned... Task force		
PM1 (1:15PM-3:15PM)	Single track No optical comment [802.3ds]	Two tracks: E+O [P802.3dt]	Task force	no meeting	
PM2 (3:30PM-6:00PM)					
PM3 (7PM-9PM)	no meeting	Two tracks: E+O (if needed)	possible meeting after social for optical ~9PM		

Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
Day #1: 2026/7/13 Monday (colocated interim and plenary)	AM1: task force: opening, bucket motion, common topics; maybe optical PM1/PM2: single track: non-optical comments (APSU, electrical, etc.)
Day #2: 2026/7/14 Tuesday (plenary)	AM1/AM2: three tracks: optical, electrical, logic PM1/PM2/PM3: two tracks: optical, electrical, except... PM2 will start with slide 8 "Common #2"
Day #3: 2026/7/15 Wednesday (plenary)	AM2: if 400GPL is adjourned: single track (task force) optical comments PM1/PM2: single track (task force) optical comments
Day #4: 2026/7/16 Thursday (plenary)	AM1/AM2: single track (task force) liaisons, if any any remaining comments closing business
Day #5: 2026/7/21 Tuesday (online)	Contingent, TBD
Day #5: 2026/7/22 Wednesday (online)	Contingent, TBD
Day #5: 2026/7/23 Thursday (online)	Contingent, TBD
Note that comment resolution agenda may be readjusted.	

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Optical signal detect	180-183	289, 290, 251, 252
PHY tables	180+	273
APSU signal detect	178B	291, 292, 293
APSU SIGNAL_OK		[221, 144], 217, 260
APSU management, recovery modes	178B	[167, 189, 248, 249, osorio_01]
APSU State diagrams	178B	187, [L03, ran_02], L04W, 247 (candidate for logic track on day 2)
APSU variables	178B	1, [185, 245], 246, L00, L02W (candidate for logic track on day 2)
APSU wording	178B	177, 176
BLER	176G	[200, 201, L06W, dudek_01, ran_04]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides		

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
APSU coherent PHYs	185, 187, 178B	[166, 165, 140, 141, 142, 143, huber_01]
APSU wording	169	169, slavick_01
BLER	180	274, 275
Reference clock recovery unit	179, 180, 182	[151, 152, 153, ghiasi_01]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides		

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
APSU State diagrams	178B	[188, 220] Parked: consensus slides expected
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides		

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
dv_f	178	210
R_peak	176D	240, rysin_01
reference connector	179B	150
reference IL	179B	149, heck_01
fitted IL	179	11
MTF ERL and modal ERL	179B	31*
Non-ballot (Late) comments		L01, [L07, ran_03]

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation
Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ER1 FEC flows	186	81
ER1 FEC SIL	186	164
ER1 MNT bits	186	258
ER1 payload	186	68
PMA Path Data Delay (TimeSync)	176	131, dekoos_01
Service interface syntax	186	137
FEC degrade capitalization	174	67
Typo fix (alignment marker)	175	62
SIL block and description	176	250
Polarity Inversion defintion	45	171

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
channel IL	180-183	[191, 192], [193, 194]
Tx extinction ratio	181	78
Tx power excursion	180-183	[85, 86, 87, 88, 84, johnson_01],
Tx OMA	180	278
Tx overshoot	180	288, [83, johnson_01]
TFT introduction		307, cole_01, 207
TFT nomenclature	180 - 183	[132, 134, 135, 136]
TFT equations	180	77, 306, L05
TFT wording	180	283*, 119, [80, 196]
TFT block error measurement time		286
TFT operating BER	180	[118*, 305] ,124, 125
TFT hmax	180	312, 313
Rx LRS (extinction ratio)	180	208, 89
Rx sensitivity	180	[79, cole_01], 128, 294, [195, 129, 130], 277, 279, 15
Rx SRS interference	180	[304, dawc-02], 16
Tx OMA	180	[298, dawc-04]
Tx transition time	180	[299, dawc-03]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides		

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
TDECQ replace	180	287
TDECQ nomenclature	180	262
TDECQ remove sampler	180	284
TDECQ calculation	180	[103, 229, 230], [228, 13], chayeb_01, swenson_01
TDECQ editorial	180	[98, 99, 100, 101, 96, chayeb_01], 226*, 92
TDECQ histogram	180	[198, L09], [264, 267, swenson_01, swenson_02], L08
TDECQ optimization	180	265, [205, 95, 227, L10, chayeb_01, swenson_01], [102, 117, 239, chayeb_01]
TDECQ eye diagram	180	[97, 263, chayeb_01, swenson_01]
TDECQ tap limit	180	235, 236, 281, [280, 282, 285, dawc_03]
TDECQ threshold	180	276, [93, 309, 12], dawc_03
TDECQ wording	180	223, 261, 296, 297
TDECQ CEQ	180	237, kimber_01
TDECQ limit	180	295
TDECQ/TFT AUI	180 - 183	[154, 155, 156, 157], 158, 159, ghiasi_02, 224
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides		

Bucket #1

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D3p1/8023dj_D3p1_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf

(count 176)

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):

15, 62, 67, 80, 83, 84, 89, 92, 118, 124, 137, 144, 171, 176, 177, 196, 207, 217, 221,
224, 226, 250, 251, 252, 260, 262, 273, 275, 296, 297, 305

(count 31)

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):

105, 109, 110, 113, 222, 231, 232, 233, 234, 247, 268, L06, L02
(count 10)