

P802.3dj D3.2

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Qualcomm, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 3.2 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this comment resolution group (CRG) meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution procedure

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion.

We are here...

Comment summary (so far):

185 received

145 closed

40 comments to resolve

Comment by track:

Common: 3

Logic: 4

Electrical: 3

Optical: 29

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
119	0	0	0	0	0	3	2	1	3
120F	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
169	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
172	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	7	7
174A	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
175	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
176	2	0	1	1	0	0	1	3	4
176C	3	0	1	0	0	0	0	4	4
176D	0	0	0	0	0	3	2	1	3
177	1	0	4	2	0	0	1	6	7
178	2	0	1	1	0	1	0	5	5
178B	11	0	18	4	0	19	0	52	52
179	3	0	0	0	0	1	0	4	4
179B	4	0	5	0	0	1	1	9	10
180	6	0	8	1	0	24	30	9	39
181	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	2	2
182	0	0	1	0	0	3	0	4	4
183	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
184	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	2
185	7	0	1	0	0	0	1	7	8
186	3	0	1	3	0	7	0	14	14
187	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	1
45	2	0	2	0	0	6	0	10	10
Total	49	0	46	20	0	70	39	146	185

Agenda Grid

Day 1 Wed Sep 9 Online meeting	Day 2 Thu Sep 10 Online meeting	Day 3 Mon Sep 14 Interim
Single track Task force	Track 1: optical Track 2: electrical	Track 1: common/optical Track 2: logic (AM2 only) After logic is done... Single track: task force (subject to change)

Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
Day #1 (online)	opening, bucket #1 motion, common, logic
Day #2 (online)	Track 1: optical - view all presentations - time permitting: discussion and straw polls Track 2: electrical - comment resolution, all electrical comments
Day #3 (interim)	Track 1: common/optical comments (starting AM1) Track 2: logic comments (AM2 only) After logic comments are complete... Single track:Task force Any remaining comments. Closing business
Note that comment resolution agenda may be readjusted.	

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
APSU PAM4: ILT	178B	157
APSU PAM4: Restart on fail	178B	[110*, 47, 158]
APSU: PAM4 rx_ok	178B	49*
APSU coherent: ER1 payload	186	[93*, 37, 33]
APSU: bucket pulls, tf_lock	178B	86
APSU: bucket pulls (editorial)	178B	44, 165, 168, 133
signal detect	180	197, dawc_03
BLER extrapolation	180+	191, rubin_01
BLER histograms	174A+	142, maniloff_01
Coherent test patterns	185	143

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
PCS stateless decoder	119	[<u>152</u> , 140]
Bucket pulls	TBD	5, 173 , 174
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides		

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
SNDR	176D	128
peak-to-peak	176D	127
Reference Test Fixtures	179B	100
Bucket pulls	TBD	38, 39, 40, 41, 9, 176, 10, 11, 12, 207, 104, 84, 56, 85, 58,
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides		

General area	File name	Title/Comments
TDECQ	swenson_01	Consensus Results: Corrections Needed in Clause 180.9.6 Comments: R2-15, R2-16, R2-17, R2-18, R2-126, R2-141, R2-144, R2-188, R2-189, R2-206
TDECQ	swenson_02	TDECQ Improvements with new MMSE optimization points Comment: R2-194
TDECQ	swenson_03	Summary of TDECQ Changes Comment: R2-190
TDECQ	dawe_05	Causal pulse shape and tap limits Comment: R2-204
TDECQ	dawe_06	ECQ method Comment: R2-205
TX Transition Time	simms_01	Transition time in DR transmitters Comments R2-195, R2-200
TX Extinction ratio	dawe_01	Extinction ratio in DR links Comment: R2-199
SRS	dawe_02	Stressed receiver sensitivity setup and calibration Comment: R2-196, R2-203
RS/SRS	dawe_04	All-lanes error counting Comment: R2-198
TFT	cole_01	TFT Illustrations & Examples Comments: R2-25, R2-124, R2-201, R2-202
TFT	dawe_07	TFT consistency with other specs Comment: R2-201

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; **Magenta highlight:** resubmitted comment; **Red highlight:** late comment/presentation

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
PMD spec	180	199, dawe_01
Rx LRS signal	180	25, 202, cole_01
Rx sensitivity	180	[198, dawe_04], [196, dawe_02, dawe_03]
Rx SRS	180	203, dawe_02
Tx transition time	180	200, 195, simms_01]
TFT	180	20, 21, 124, 125, [201, dawe_07], cole_01, issenhuth_01
TFT-xAUI	180	129
TDECQ	180	205, dawe_06
TDECQ-name	180	[190, swenson_03]
TDECQ coeff vector	180	206
TDECQ equalizer name	180	141, swenson_01
TDECQ-eye diagram	180	[189, 16, swenson_01]
TDECQ-normalization	180	[188, 15, 144, swenson_01]
TDECQ-optimization	180	[194, swenson_02]
TDECQ-phase position	180	126
TDECQ reference EQ coefficient	180	204, dawe_05
Bucket pulls	TBD	14, 17, 18

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: resubmitted comment; Red highlight: late comment/presentation

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, , ## = pivot comment, ##* = related editorial slides

Bucket #1

Bucket #1 (reposted) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D3p2/8023dj_D3p2_comments_proposed_id_bucket1_260903.pdf

(count 112)

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:

5, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 17, 18, ~~24~~, 25, 38, 39, 40, 41, 44, 56, 58, 84, 85, 86, 104, 133, 165,
168, 173, 174, 176, 207

(count 28)

However, comment 24 was withdrawn by the commenter.

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):

4, 8, 19, 22, 23, 24, 27, 42, 50, 54, 57, 82, 87, 88, 92, 92, 95, 97, 99, 105, 114, 119, 122, 123, 130, 131, 137, 138, 156, 163, 166, 167, 169, 179, 180, 181, 182

(count 30)