

IEEE P802.3dm D0.a Asymmetrical Electrical Automotive Ethernet 1st Task Force review comments

CI 200 SC 200.1.2 P45 L26 # 424

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type T Comment Status D late

The use of a different "transmit speed" and "receive speed" here is confusing because it implies that the same link have different transmit and receive speeds. This should be a reference to transmit direction, rather than transmit speed. Also M and G alone are not appropriate units and should be labeled as Mb/s or Gb/s. Also applies to Table 201-2 (page 73/74) and 202-2 (page 144/145)

SuggestedRemedy

Use "Uplink speed (b/s)" and "Downlink speed (b/s)" or "Forward direction speed (b/s)" and "Reverse direction speed (b/s)" Apply the same changes to Table 201-2 (page 73/74) and 202-2 (page 144/145)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TFTD Uplink/Downlink and Forward/Reverse are not used in the spec.

CI 201 SC 201.4.2.2 P97 L3 # 425

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type E Comment Status D late

The symbol period is an exact value and can be written as such, instead of a formula

SuggestedRemedy

Use 8.533 ns instead of "1000/117.1875 ns"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

This would have a repeating 3 at the end. I don't believe it is possible to put a line over the 3 in FM.

CI 201 SC 201.4.5 P105 L34 # 415

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type E Comment Status D late

Wording, the use of abbreviations muxed/demuxed is not needed

SuggestedRemedy

Use "multiplexed or demultiplexed" instead of "muxed/demuxed."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The multiplexer used to select training vs. data is not mentioned in most clauses, although it is in the block diagram.

Change: During PMA training, the PHY operates as shown in Figure 201-11 and Figure 201-12 except the training frame is muxed/de-muxed in lieu of the four 64/65 blocks.

To: During PMA training, the PHY operates as shown in Figure 201-11 and Figure 201-12.

CI 201 SC 201.7.3 P112 L32 # 416

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type E Comment Status D late

Missing spaces

SuggestedRemedy

Add a space between 50 and ppm (line 32), 34.133 and ns (line 36), 1024 and ns (line 37), 50 and ns (line 41)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 201 SC 201.8.2.3.1 P122 L3 # 417

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type E Comment Status D late

Use of * instead of x operator, also appears in line 31 and 35, page 129 line 37 and page 130 line 8

SuggestedRemedy

Change 10*xJ to 10xJ or remove * and use 10J, also make changes in line 31 and 35, page 129 line 37 and page 130 line 8

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace * with the multiplication symbol.

IEEE P802.3dm D0.a Asymmetrical Electrical Automotive Ethernet 1st Task Force review comments

Cl 201 SC 201.8.2.6 P125 L 30 # 418

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type E Comment Status D

late

Extra spaces

SuggestedRemedy

Remove extra space between 10 and % and 1 and %. Also page 183, line 42, 30 and %.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

There are not extra spaces. The larger spaces are due to the fact that the text is justified to both the right and left edges.

Cl 202 SC 202.1.4.1 P147 L 13 # 419

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type T Comment Status D

late

"Modulation order" is not defined in the document so can be added here for clarity

SuggestedRemedy

Add to Note, "Modulation order = 2 for PAM4 signaling and modulation order = 1 for PAM2."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

On P147, L12:

Replace, "NOTE—Duration = L × 1040 bits / modulation order / baud rate."

With, "NOTE—Duration = L × 1040 bits / bits per symbol / baud rate."

On P147, L51:

Replace, "NOTE—Duration = 1040 bits / modulation order / baud rate..."

With, "NOTE—Duration = 1040 bits / bits per symbol / baud rate..."

Cl 202 SC 202.4.2.4.5 P202 L 24 # 420

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type E Comment Status D

late

Table 202-10 is not a table in the traditional sense with column headers and rows of data, it appears to be more of a graphic. Also applies to Table 202-11.

SuggestedRemedy

Change Table 202-10 and 202-11 captions to Figure captions

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

TFTD

What makes a table a table, and what makes a figure a figure. Similar structures are tables in 149 and 165.

Cl 202 SC 202.4.4.1 P209 L 3 # 421

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type E Comment Status D

late

Typo

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "DSIABLE_TRANSMITTER" with "DISABLE_TRANSMITTER"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl 202 SC 202.5.1.1 P217 L 11 # 422

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type E Comment Status D

late

Minor graphics correction

SuggestedRemedy

The line ends of the link segment overlap the boxes in Figure 202-31

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3dm D0.a Asymmetrical Electrical Automotive Ethernet 1st Task Force review comments

CI 202 *SC 202.8.1.1* *P228* *L12* *# 423*

Long, Richard TE Connectivity

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *late*

Fmax is greater than 10 MHz

SuggestedRemedy

Update the Fmax to the actual value or add an editors note to do so if not determined

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Solution to comment #410 should fix this.