

IEEE P802.3dm D0.d Asymmetrical Electrical Automotive Ethernet 4th Task Force review comments

CI 201 SC 201.3.5.1.4 P 90 L 40 # 3

Razavi, Alireza Eliyan / Infineon

Comment Type T Comment Status D variables

T_TYPE_NEXT is defined as returning "the FRAME_TYPE of the tx_raw vector".
 FRAME_TYPE is not defined anywhere in Clause 201. The correct name is
 T_BLOCK_TYPE.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "FRAME_TYPE" to "T_BLOCK_TYPE".

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 201 SC 201.4.4 P 106 L 29 # 2

Razavi, Alireza Eliyan / Infineon

Comment Type T Comment Status D withdrawn

"Reserved bits shall be transmitted as defined by 201.5.2.4.1." .There is no reserved bits in
 figure 201-24. replaced by "6 bit vender specfic bits (v-s) shall be transmitted "

SuggestedRemedy
 see comment

Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

CI 201 SC 201.5.2.6.1 P 116 L 52 # 5

Razavi, Alireza Eliyan / Infineon

Comment Type T Comment Status D variables

"training_failure" set TRUE in Figure 201–31 and consumed in Figure 201–35 but never
 declared

SuggestedRemedy
 Add training_failure as a Boolean variable to 201.5.2.6.1: "Set TRUE when PHY Control
 enters TRAINING_FAILURE; cleared upon entry to DISABLE_TRANSMITTER."

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Insert the following new variable definition in 201.5.2.6.1 after sync_link_control:

training_failure A Boolean variable indicating whether PHY Control has resulted in a
 successful training.

Add to DISABLE_TRANSMITTER state in Figure 201-31, "training_failure <= FALSE"

CI 201 SC 201.5.2.7 P 121 L 47 # 4

Razavi, Alireza Eliyan / Infineon

Comment Type T Comment Status D EEE

"PMA_refresh_status = FAIL" appears as a guard in Figure 201–32. it is leftover of EEE,
 and should be removed

SuggestedRemedy
 see comment

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 201 SC 201.10.2.1 P 148 L 45 # 6

Razavi, Alireza Eliyan / Infineon

Comment Type T Comment Status D editorial

Both subclauses contain the typo "3 Mz to 4000 MHz" — "Mz" should be "MHz". Error
 appears twice.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "3 Mz" to "3 MHz" in both 201.10.2.1 and 201.10.2.2.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3dm D0.d Asymmetrical Electrical Automotive Ethernet 4th Task Force review comments

CI 202 SC 202.12 P 247 L 14 # 1

Muma, Scott Microchip

Comment Type T Comment Status D Delay limits

The delay limits are tighter than realistic due to some missing factors in XGMII data arrival to form 65B blocks.

Suggested Remedy

See attached presentation Chini-3dm_01c_0426.pdf with updated Table 202-20 values.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace Table 202-24 entries for Bit times, Pause quanta, and Delay with the values shown in slide 3 of https://www.ieee802.org/3/dm/public/0526/Chini-3dm_01c_0426.pdf