IEEE P802.3dm
How to Comment on drafts

Natalie Wienckowski

P802.3dm Chair / Chief Editor

IVN Solutions LLC / Ethernovia

January 20, 2026

What do the Editors do?

- Editors' responsibilities:

  - Consolidate all approved baselines into the draft

  - Ensure style and format of the draft is consistent with the official IEEE Style Manual (current version: 2014)

  - Make sure text is grammatically correct

- Editors DO NOT:

  - Create text of draft based on bullets from PowerPoint presentations

  - Fill in missing technical details from baselines (any TBDs from baselines will be included in the draft as well)

  - Rewrite or develop text based on proposals

How to Comment

- Use the comment tool
- Use the comment spreadsheet (preferred)

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Do
  - Comment on any Technical or Editorial error you find.

- Don't
  - Assume someone else will find the error and comment on it.

Example: Typos can be hard to spot. Always submit a comment on every typo you find, no matter how simple.

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Do
  - Provide presentations that explain your comments.

- Don't
  - Put generic statements in the implementation details like, "add a sentence to make the frequency "xxxxx MHz".

    When you do this, your comment will receive the response "proposed reject, commenter provides insufficient information for a remedy".

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Do
  - Keep your editor happy by writing clear, concise comments with clear and complete instructions for what you want done!

- Don't
  - Upset your editor by creating more work!

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Do
  - Complete all cells/boxes.

- Don't
  - Include only partial Information.

  See examples of issues on next slides!

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Purpose of Comment Box

  - Explain what the issue is. This may be one word, e.g. "typo", or may be a few sentences explaining what you think is wrong.

- Purpose of Suggested Remedy Box

  - Clearly indicate the text you have an issue with and to what it should be changed. This may be a reference to a presentation. If this is the case, the presentation should be sent to the Chief Editor by the comment deadline to be used during creation of Responses to the comments.

  - The Suggested Remedy should not be a question. This should be a statement of what you want changed.

  - The Suggested Remedy should not include a justification for the change. This belongs in the Comment box.

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- **Don't** put the incorrect text in the "Comment" box and the corrected text in the "Suggested Remedy" box.
- Do put "typo (grammar, etc.)" in the "Comment" box and put your desired change in the "Suggested Remedy" box
  - Change: incorrect text
  - To: correct text
- This makes it clear to all what you are asking to have changed and how.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy	
of1000 Mb/s	of 1000 Mb/s	Obvious
64B/65B PCS	RS-FEC PCS (consistency with 10GBASE-T1)	Not so obvious
typo	change "of1000" to "of 1000"	Excellent!

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Don't use the comment process to ask questions about why something is the way it is in the draft.

- Do
  - Send an email to the reflector with your question.
  - Send an email to someone who is more knowledgeable about the topic or whoever contributed the content to the draft and ask your question.
  - Create a contribution related to your question with information that supports your point of view.
  - Review the contributions that were provided in other meetings related to this topic.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
Does a reset time of 0.5sec make sense given that the link start-up time should be within 100ms	Does 0.5s make sense? I would have expected a maximum value of 50ms rather than 500ms.
"The data path of the MultiGBASE-T1 PMA, depending on type and temperature, may take many seconds to run at optimum error ratio after exiting from reset or lowpower mode."	Is that really acceptable? I would expect a more tightly defined start-up time, like 100ms

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Don't leave the Suggested Remedy blank.
  - If you don't provide a Suggested Remedy the Editor is not going to create one for you. Editors don't read minds! These comments will be Rejected!
  - If you are pointing out an issue and there are multiple acceptable solutions, list the possible solutions that would satisfy you. The Task Force can then discuss the possible solutions and select one.

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Don't leave the Comment blank unless the Suggested Remedy clearly indicates the issue and the solution.
  - The issue is clear in this case.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
	Remove 8 from the list of possible interleave options

  - The issue is not clear in this case.

Comment	SuggestedRemedy
	The PMA Transmit function in the PHY then sends an alert message to the link partner. The Alert signal is a low frequency PAM2 signal. The Alert signal is then followed by a number of Wake frames. After this short recovery time the normal operational mode is resumed.

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- Don't describe multiple issues in a single comment.
  - Standards Association ballot rules prohibit this and this would be an automatic reject of your comment at that stage.
  - We don't want to get into bad commenting habits that have to be broken later.

Commenting Do's and Don'ts

- **Don't include multiple comments in a single presentation.**
  - Standards Association ballot rules prohibit this and this would be an automatic reject of your comment at that stage.
  - We don't want to get into bad commenting habits that have to be broken later.

* If necessary, an individual comment submitted in myBallot may be supplemented by an electronic attachment (file). Such an attachment must relate to a single issue and to a specific line, paragraph, figure, or equation in the balloted draft so that the CRG can address the comment as a single issue.

   * From RevCom1217guidelines.pdf

Commenting Do's and Don'ts – Opportunities for improvement over D0.a comments

Fill out all boxes in the Excel file!

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H
1					Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form			
2	First name				Surname	Affiliation		
3	Natalie				Wienckowski	IVN Solutions LLC		
4					Click on column headers for help			
5	Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change		Must Be Satisfied
6								
7								

🟧 If these boxes are not filled it, the database import fails and I have to manually correct every entry!

🟨 If these boxes are not filled in, it is difficult, if not impossible to respond to your comment.

⬛ The contents of this box are ignored for Task Force Review as there is no ballot on the draft.

Commenting Do's and Don'ts – Opportunities for improvement over D0.a comments

Fill out all boxes in the Excel file!

Sub-clause must be of the form x.y.z.

Don't put Figure x-y. I will have to manually correct this to pull in your comment!

Commenting Do's and Don'ts – Opportunities for improvement over D0.a comments

Ensure your page and line numbers are based on the balloted document.

Early drafts were shared to check on specific content. These should never be used for commenting.

There were a number of comments that had to be updated for this reason, which causes extra work for your Editors!

Commenting Do's and Don'ts – Opportunities for improvement over D0.a comments

Submit your comments on time!

We have set up a schedule to ensure the comments can be processed in time for the scheduled comment resolution meetings.

Extending deadlines could mean that the comment responses aren't ready for the scheduled meeting.

This could delay the next update and put our timeline at risk.

What to do if you want to change your Suggested Remedy

If you realize the error before the comment deadline ends:

- Do send a new file and request that your previous comments be discarded
- Do not send a file with only your corrected comment. Editors are not going to modify your original comment file to delete the row with the comment you want to correct!

If you realize the error after the comment deadline ends:

- DO NOT send an updated comment file!
  - It is not possible to pull in your new comment file to overwrite the original file your provided!
- Do not send an Excel file of any form to correct the comment.
  - Once the received comment database has been posted, look to see what comment # needs to be corrected and send an email to the Editor with the comment number and your corrected Suggested Remedy. The Editor can then copy this into the response as a new Suggested Remedy by the comment author.

Questions?

Thanks!