

P802.3-2022/Cor 2 (IEEE 802.3dr) D3.0 Optical Automotive Ethernet TDFOM Initial Sponsor ballot comn

Cl 0 SC 0 P15 L # I-1

Chang, Pin Individual

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

Is there experimental result?

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The comment does not provide the CRG with enough information to understand the specific change that the commenter proposes, as there is no suggested remedy and the comment itself is an open question.

The technical content of the IEEE 802.3-2022/Cor 2 draft D3.0 is based on contributions such as the one available at: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dr/public/Torres_3dr_01_280725.pdf

Cl 166 SC 166.6.4.8.6 P15 L36 # I-2

Spruit, Hans Western Digital Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status R

The value 3.9 has less digits as the other requirements. So, is given with less accuracy.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 3.9 in 3.90

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

The IEEE 802.3 Style Guide states the following: "Do not include any separators in the digits to the right of the decimal point or include any trailing zeros in tables or in text."

(https://ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers) Additionally, IEEE 802.3:2022 subclause 1.2.6, Accuracy and resolution of numerical quantities, states:

"Unless otherwise stated, numerical limits in this standard are to be taken as exact, with the number of significant digits and trailing zeros having no significance."

Cl 166 SC 166.6.4.8.6 P15 L36 # I-3

Chen, Chi-Hua Chunghwa Telecom Laboratories

Comment Type E Comment Status R

For the 25GBASE-AU column, the TDFOM_0 value is currently listed as 3.9, rounded to one decimal place. It is recommended to report this value to two decimal places to maintain consistency with the other columns.

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

The IEEE 802.3 Style Guide states the following: "Do not include any separators in the digits to the right of the decimal point or include any trailing zeros in tables or in text."

(https://ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers)

Additionally, IEEE 802.3:2022 subclause 1.2.6, Accuracy and resolution of numerical quantities, states:

"Unless otherwise stated, numerical limits in this standard are to be taken as exact, with the number of significant digits and trailing zeros having no significance."

Cl 166 SC 166.6.4.8.6 P15 L14 # I-4

Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type T Comment Status A

The way the newly inserted paragraph is written can be interpreted as if the reader is allowed or required to choose TDFOM_0.

("TDFOM_0 is chosen" uses the same phrasing of "TDFOM is calculated", which is normative)

I assume this is not the intent, and instead it is an informative statement explaining how the values of TDFOM_0 were calculated.

SuggestedRemedy

Change this statement into a NOTE, which is informative, and place it after Table 166-16.

Suggested NOTE phrasing:

NOTE---The values of TDFOM_0 in Table 166-16 are calculated such that an ideal signal with very high bandwidth, without emphasis, and with no noise or other impairments, has a TDFOM of 0 dB.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Insert informative NOTE after Table 166-16:

"NOTE---The values of TDFOM_0 in Table 166-16 are calculated such that an ideal signal with very high bandwidth, without emphasis, and with no noise or other impairments has a TDFOM of 0 dB."