# P802.3dt D1.0
# Comment Resolution Agenda

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, P802.3dt Editor-in-Chief

# Introduction

- This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.0 comment resolution.
- Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- The agenda is subject to change as required.
- Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.

# Comment resolution procedure

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dt/public/26_11/opsasnick_3dt_01_2611pdf

## Approach to comment resolution

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- Individuals should review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines": https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf
- All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion

November 2026 IEEE P802.3dt Task Force 7

# We are here...

Comment summary (so far):
106 received
57 in bucket (none pulled)
49 comments to resolve on the floor

| Clause | E | G | T | ER | GR | TR | Open | Closed | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 119 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 6 | 0 | 6 |
| 133 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 6 | 0 | 6 |
| 134 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 161 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 172 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 174 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 175 | 3 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 6 | 0 | 6 |
| 195 | 13 | 0 | 10 | 3 | 0 | 2 | 28 | 0 | 28 |
| 30 | 5 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 9 | 0 | 9 |
| 45 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 81 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 82 | 14 | 0 | 9 | 1 | 0 | 4 | 28 | 0 | 28 |
| 91 | 3 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| A | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| FM | 3 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| Total | 59 | 0 | 28 | 6 | 0 | 13 | 106 | 0 | 106 |

# Comment resolution summary

| Meeting Date | Business and Comment Resolution |
|---|---|
| Day #1: 2026/10/28 Wednesday | Opening business<br>Bucket motion<br>Comment resolution starts |
| Day #2: 2026/10/29 Thursday | Continued comment resolution<br>Closing business/motions |

# Comments {49}

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|---|---|---|
| O code - general | 82 | 52, huber_01(first half), ran_02 |
| Ordered set definitions | 82 | 4, [5, 6, 44 (ran_02)] |
| Link metadata O code | 195 | [78, 79, 80, 82, 83], huber_01 (second half) |
| EMS intro wording | 195 | 11 |
| EMS RX Frame Error | 195 | [13, 14, 77] |
| Packet metadata | 195 | 18 |
| Link metadata IDLE effect & Timesync | 195 | [19, 42, 81], 84 |
| EMS ability/enable | 82 | 7, ran_01 |
| BER monitor | 82 | [51, 85], 55 (ran_01) |
| PCS stateless encoder/decoder | 82 | [1, 37], [35, 36] (ran_01) |
| EMS PCS/FEC requirements | 82, 133 | 38, 105 |
| RS-FEC Full Error Marking | 91, 45 | 40, 48 |
| PICS | 82, 91, 119, 133, 134 161, 172, 175 | [8, 9], 41, [56, 61, 65, 73, 74], [58, 67], 59, [60, 68, 70], [62, 63, 75, 76] |
| Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.<br>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket (no comments pulled from bucket) | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

# Bucket

Bucket comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dt/comments/8023dt_d1p0_comments_proposed_bucket_id.pdf

No comments were pulled from bucket.

# Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):
tbd
(count #)