P802.3dt D1.0
Comment Resolution Agenda

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, P802.3dt Editor-in-Chief

Introduction

- This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.0 comment resolution.
- Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- The agenda is subject to change as required.
- Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.

Comment resolution procedure

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dt/public/26_11/opsasnick_3dt_01_2611pdf

Approach to comment resolution

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- Individuals should review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines": https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf
- All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion

November 2026 IEEE P802.3dt Task Force 7

We are here… (after Day 1)

Comment summary (so far):
106 total comments
76 closed (incl. 57 from bucket)
30 comments remain to resolve on the floor

Day 2: Complete! All comments closed.
(1 withdrawn)

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
119	2	0	2	0	0	2	3	3	6
133	4	0	0	0	0	2	3	3	6
134	1	0	1	0	0	0	1	1	2
161	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	2
172	4	0	0	0	0	0	1	3	4
174	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	2	2
175	3	0	2	0	0	1	3	3	6
195	13	0	10	3	0	2	0	28	28
30	5	0	2	1	0	1	0	9	9
45	1	0	1	0	0	0	1	1	2
81	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	2
82	14	0	9	1	0	4	14	14	28
91	3	0	1	0	0	0	3	1	4
A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
FM	3	0	0	1	0	0	0	4	4
Total	59	0	28	6	0	13	30	76	106

Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Comment Resolution
~~Day #1: 2026/10/28 Wednesday~~	~~Opening business~~ ~~Bucket motion~~ ~~Comment resolution starts~~
~~Day #2: 2026/10/29 Thursday~~	~~Continued comment resolution~~ ~~Closing business/motions~~

Comments {49}

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~Ordered sets and O code - general~~	~~82~~	~~52, huber_01(first half), ran_02~~
~~Ordered set definitions~~	~~82~~	~~4 [5, 6,], 44 (ran_02)]~~
~~Link metadata O code~~	~~195~~	~~[78, 79, 80, 82, 83], huber_01 (second half)~~
~~EMS intro wording~~	~~195~~	~~11~~
~~EMS RX Frame Error~~	~~195~~	~~[13, 14, 77]~~
~~Packet metadata~~	~~195~~	~~18~~
~~Link metadata IDLE effect & Timesync~~	~~195~~	~~[19, 42, 81], 84~~
~~EMS ability/enable~~	~~82~~	~~7, ran_01~~
~~BER monitor~~	~~82~~	~~[51, 85], 55 (ran_01)~~
~~PCS stateless encoder/decoder~~	~~82~~	~~[1, 37], [35, 36] (ran_01)~~
~~EMS PCS/FEC requirements~~	~~82, 133~~	~~38, 105~~
~~RS FEC Full Error Marking~~	~~91, 45~~	~~40, 48~~
~~PICS~~	82, 91, 119, 133, 134 161, 172, 175	~~[8, 9]~~, ~~41~~, [~~56~~, ~~61~~, ~~65~~, ~~73~~, ~~74~~], [~~58~~, ~~67~~], ~~59~~, [~~60~~, ~~68~~ ~~70~~], [~~62~~, ~~63~~, ~~75~~, ~~76~~]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket (no comments pulled from bucket)		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket

Bucket comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dt/comments/8023dt_d1p0_comments_proposed_bucket_id.pdf

No comments were pulled from bucket.

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn:

comment #1 (just the one)