P802.3ah Draft 2.2 Comments C/ 00 SC Ρ 1 # 7 C/ 30 SC 30.11.1.1.37 P58 L 5254 # 13 Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Hirano, Ikuya Martin, David Nortel Networks Е Comment Status X Comment Status X Comment Type Comment Type Ε The Errored Symbols field line should follow the Errored Symbol Threshold field line to "b/s" and "bps" are intermingled as a unit of the bit rate. align with the c57 fields sequence, similar to the other objects described here. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Swap lines 52 and 54 and renumber the INTEGERS. Also, delete blank line 53. Proposed Response Response Status 0 Proposed Response Response Status 0 SC 22.2.4.1.12 P19 / 24 CI 22 # 15 C/ 30 SC 30.5.1.1.13 P43 L 47 # 17 Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel Comment Status X Comment Type E Comment Type E Comment Status X The text: "A management entity shall only set bit 0.1 to a logic one after it has enabled an Dual entry not necessary. It is the custom in this standard when a management count rate scales with speed to only associated OAM sublayer (Clause 57) or this device is a 1000BASE-PX-D PHY." put in a single example. Two examples do not appear to be necessary here. doesn't seem to make sense. I believe that it is missing an "if". SuagestedRemedv SuggestedRemedy Change to: Delete the higher speed example "A management entity shall only set bit 0.1 to a logic one after it has enabled an Proposed Response Response Status 0 associated OAM sublaver (Clause 57) or if this device is a 1000BASE-PX-D PHY." Proposed Response Response Status 0 C/ 30 P42 SC 30.5.1.1.4 L 53 # 16 Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel C/ 30 SC 30.11.1.1.34 P 57 / 5354 # 12 Comment Type E Comment Status X Martin. David Nortel Networks The text: Comment Type E Comment Status X "the enumeration "available" maps to the condition where at the PCS at least one PMI is The Errored Frames field line should follow the Errored Frame Threshold field line to align operationally linked." with the c57 fields sequence, simlar to all the other event objects here. needs commas to set off "at the PCS". SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Swap lines 53 and 54 and renumber the INTEGERS. Change to: "the enumeration "available" maps to the condition where, at the PCS, at least one PMI is Proposed Response Response Status O operationally linked:

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

colons instead of commas.

(These clauses are almost entire sentences. They should probably be set off with semi-

P802.3ah Draft 2.2 Comments

C/ 45 SC P72 L 26 # 18	C/ 56 SC 56.1.3 P158 L 34 # 20				
Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel	Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel				
Comment Type E Comment Status X The text: "if the remote discovery register is clear (00000000000000subscript16)" is a little suspicious to me (acknowledged that this comment is out of scope) 12 digits of zeros where the digits are supposed to be base 16 means to me that the register is 12X4=48 bits. If this is correct then is this the clearest way to depict it? SuggestedRemedy Use a more conventional notation that matches what is used in the rest of the 802.3 standard.	Inompson, Geoffrey Nortel Comment Type E Comment Status X The statement: 1000BASE-LX10 is interoperable with 1000BASE-LX on single-mode and multi-mode fiber and offers greater reach than 1000BASE-LX on single-mode fiber SuggestedRemedy Suggest something a little more explanatory, perhaps: "1000BASE-LX10, through tighter transmitter tolerancing, is interoperable with 1000BASE LX on single-mode and multi-mode fiber, and offers greater reach than 1000BASE-LX on single-mode fiber." Proposed Response Response Status O				
Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.15 P 88 L 22 # 19 Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel # 19 Comment Type T Comment Status X RE: 10G WIS Line BIP Errors (Register 2.57 and 2.58) Insert the following sentence at the end of the subclause: NOTE - These registers do not follow the behavior described in 45.2 for 32-bit counters. This text should not be necessary. If an implementor can not tell the difference between a	Cl 57 SC 57.2.12 P 177 L 39 # 10 Martin, David Nortel Networks Image: Comment Type E Comment Status X Suspect incorrect cross-reference to "22.2.4.3.12". SuggestedRemedy Replace cross-reference to "22.2.4.3.12" with "22.2.4.1.12". Proposed Response Response Status O				
register and a counter then all hope is lost long before they get this far. SuggestedRemedy Delete this new text and the equivalent a few lines above. If something along this line is actually felt to be necessary then the text to distinguish registers and counters should go into 45.2 Proposed Response Response Status O	CI 57 SC 57.5.3.1 P 199 L 7 # 1 Martin, David Nortel Networks Image: Comment Type E Comment Status X Suspect incorrect cross-reference to "30.11.1.1.29". SuggestedRemedy Change cross-reference "30.11.1.1.29" to "30.11.1.1.37". Proposed Response Response Status O				

P802.3ah Draft 2.2 Comments

C/ 58 SC 58.8		P 229	L 19	# 8	C/ 61		61.1.4.1.1	P3		L 35-38	# 14
Thomas Dineen	ſ	Dineen Consu	ulting		Shimon M	luller		Sun I	/licrosyste	ems, Inc	
Comment Type T	Comment St	tatus X			Comment	t Type	TR	Comment Status	Х		
	Type / Length field (09 58-12 and 58-13 is ne				Match	ning in im	nplementa	nto draft 2.1 as a wattions that use a full	duplex on	ly MAC. Howev	
SuggestedRemedy					note o	does mo	re harm th	an good for the follo	owing reas	sons:	
I would suggest th per Clause 3 Sec	nat the valid length of tion 3.2.6.	the payload	would be approp	riate for this context	the ne	ew claus	es specify	hat has not been de how IFS stretching	can be a	complished in a	a MAC that operates
Proposed Response	Response St	atus O			opera	ation, whi	ch is also		is allowed	to use this me	fined for 10Gb/s chanism. Also, it is not tching can be made to
C/ 58 SC 58.8	3.1.1	P 231	L 18	# 9				C without any furthe			
Thomas Dineen	I	Dineen Consu	ulting					n that respect this d			
Comment Type T Comment Status X In the column labeled "item" at line 18 there are two issues:					complete definition for IFS stretching at 100Mb/s, or drop this functionality completely. During the previous recirculation ballot I tried to do the former. However, since my comment (#68) was rejected, the next best thing is to do the latter.						
,	is inappropriate and s		laced with "IFG"		Suggeste				0		
,	5 is incorrect and sho	Julu de 34.			00		•	the other references	to full du	plex MAC opera	ation for EFM copper.
SuggestedRemedy 1) Replace "idle"	with "IFG"				Proposed	l Respon	se	Response Status	ο		
2) Replace value	35 with 34.										
Proposed Response	Response St	atus O			<i>CI</i> 64 Hirano, Ik	SC uya		<i>P</i> Japai	n Radio C	<i>L</i> o,Ltd.	# 1
								Comment Status d "false" are used to		ean value "TRUI	E" and "FALSE" being
					Suggeste	dRemed	У				
					Proposed	l Respon	se	Response Status	0		
					C/ 64 Thompsor		54.1.2 ey	P 4 Norte		L 7	# 21
					Comment	t Tvpe	Е	Comment Status	х		
					Layer seem	diagram s to be p	n is incorre particularly	ect. Box shown as L	LC should lause is to		to MAC Client. This npatibility with 802.1D
					Suggeste	dRemed	У				
					Chan	ge so tha	at it will ma	atch the correct diag	rams else	ewhere in the st	andard.
					Proposed	l Respon	se	Response Status	0		

P802.3ah Draft 2.2 Comr	ments
-------------------------	-------

Unit of size should be "octet" instead of "byte". SuggestedRemedy This function returns the size of the sdu in octets. Proposed Response Response Status Cl 64 SC 64.3.4 P 469 1 Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Status X Comment Type E Comment Status O Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 1 Phirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Status X "Reed Solomon (255,239) code" should be "Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code". SuggestedRemedy This function is used to encode the Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code. The encoder encodes the 239 octets data frame and generates 16 parity octets for each data frame. Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.5 P 524 L 44 # 6 Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "reed Solomon (255,239, code". SuggestedRemedy This function is used to decode the Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code". SuggestedRemedy Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4 6 16 Hirano, Ikuya				1 002:0011 2						
Comment Type E Comment Status X Unit of size should be "octet" instead of "byte". SuggestedRemedy This function returns the size of the sdu in octets. Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 64 SC 64.3.4 P 469 L 6 # 3 Liftiano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "byte" should be "octet". SuggestedRemedy The reference time used for setting the timestamp value shall be the first octet of the MPCPDU Harma at time of transmission. Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4 "liano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "byte" should be "octet". SuggestedRemedy The reference time used for setting the timestamp value shall be the first octet of the MPCPDU Harma at time of transmission. Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4 "Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "parity bytes" should be "parity octets. SuggestedRemedy A boolean set by the FEC Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded. Yalues: TRUE; No more parity octets need to be encoded. FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded.				# 2				# 5		
This function returns the size of the sub in octets. Proposed Response Response Status O Ci 64 SC 64.3.4 P 469 L 6 # 3 Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co.Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "byte" should be "octet". Suggested/Remedy The reference time used for setting the timestamp value shall be the first octet of the MPCPDU frame at time of transmission. Proposed Response Response Status O Ci 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4 Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co.Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "parity bytes" should be "parity octets. Suggested/Remedy A boolean set by the FEC Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded. FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded.	Comment Type E Comment Status X Unit of size should be "octet" instead of "byte". SuggestedRemedy This function returns the size of the sdu in octets.				Comment Type E Comment Status X "Reed Solomon (255,239) code" should be "Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code".					
Cl 64 SC 64.3.4 P 469 L 6 # 3 Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "byte" should be "octet". SuggestedRemedy The reference time used for setting the timestamp value shall be the first octet of the MPCPDU frame at time of transmission. Proposed Response Response Status O 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4 This function is used to decode the Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code. Proposed Response Status O Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4 This function is used to decode the Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code. Proposed Response Status O Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4 Comment Status X "parity bytes" should be "parity octets". SuggestedRemedy A boolean set by the FEC Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded. FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded. FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded.					This function is used to encode the Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code. The encoder					
Comment Type E Comment Status X "byte" should be "octet". SuggestedRemedy The reference time used for setting the timestamp value shall be the first octet of the MPCPDU frame at time of transmission. Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4 Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "parity bytes" should be "parity octets". SuggestedRemedy A boolean set by the FEC Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded. Values: TRUE; No more parity octets need to be encoded. FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded.				# 3	Proposed Response	Response Status O				
SuggestedRemedy The reference time used for setting the timestamp value shall be the first octet of the MPCPDU frame at time of transmission. Proposed Response Response Status Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status N Comment Type E Comment Status N N N N N N SuggestedRemedy A boolean set by the FE Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded. N	Comment Type E	Comment Status X	Co,Ltd.		Hirano, Ikuya	Japan Radio		# 6		
Proposed Response Response Status O Proposed Response Status O Proposed Response Res	SuggestedRemedy The reference time used for setting the timestamp value shall be the first octet of the				"Reed Solomon (255,239) code" should be "Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code". SuggestedRemedy					
Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X "parity bytes" should be "parity octets". SuggestedRemedy A boolean set by the FEC Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded. Values: TRUE; No more parity octets need to be encoded. FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded.	Proposed Response	Response Status O					(,,,_,_,			
"parity bytes" should be "parity octets". SuggestedRemedy A boolean set by the FEC Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded. Values: TRUE; No more parity octets need to be encoded. FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded.				# 4						
A boolean set by the FEC Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded. Values: TRUE; No more parity octets need to be encoded. FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded.	51									
Proposed Response Response Status O	A boolean set by the F encoded. Values: TRUE; No mo	re parity octets need to be end	•	y octets need to be						
	Proposed Response	Response Status O								