

P802.3ah Draft 2.2 Comments

CI 00 SC P L # 7
 Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd.
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 "b/s" and "bps" are intermingled as a unit of the bit rate.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 22 SC 22.2.4.1.12 P 19 L 24 # 15
 Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 The text:
 "A management entity shall only set bit 0.1 to a logic one after it has enabled an associated OAM sublayer (Clause 57) or this device is a 1000BASE-PX-D PHY."
 doesn't seem to make sense. I believe that it is missing an "if".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to:
 "A management entity shall only set bit 0.1 to a logic one after it has enabled an associated OAM sublayer (Clause 57) or if this device is a 1000BASE-PX-D PHY."
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 30 SC 30.11.1.1.34 P 57 L 5354 # 12
 Martin, David Nortel Networks
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 The Errored Frames field line should follow the Errored Frame Threshold field line to align with the c57 fields sequence, similar to all the other event objects here.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Swap lines 53 and 54 and renumber the INTEGERS.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 30 SC 30.11.1.1.37 P 58 L 5254 # 13
 Martin, David Nortel Networks
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 The Errored Symbols field line should follow the Errored Symbol Threshold field line to align with the c57 fields sequence, similar to the other objects described here.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Swap lines 52 and 54 and renumber the INTEGERS. Also, delete blank line 53.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 30 SC 30.5.1.1.13 P 43 L 47 # 17
 Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Dual entry not necessary.
 It is the custom in this standard when a management count rate scales with speed to only put in a single example. Two examples do not appear to be necessary here.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the higher speed example
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 30 SC 30.5.1.1.4 P 42 L 53 # 16
 Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 The text:
 "the enumeration "available" maps to the condition where at the PCS at least one PMI is operationally linked,"
 needs commas to set off "at the PCS".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to:
 "the enumeration "available" maps to the condition where, at the PCS, at least one PMI is operationally linked;
 (These clauses are almost entire sentences. They should probably be set off with semi-colons instead of commas.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

P802.3ah Draft 2.2 Comments

Cl 58 SC 58.8.1.1 P 229 L 19 # 8
 Thomas Dineen Dineen Consulting

Comment Type T Comment Status X

The value of the Type / Length field (05ffh or 1535d) provided in the example frames shown in Tables 58-12 and 58-13 is neither a valid length or type value.

SuggestedRemedy

I would suggest that the valid length of the payload would be appropriate for this context per Clause 3 Section 3.2.6.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 58 SC 58.8.1.1 P 231 L 18 # 9
 Thomas Dineen Dineen Consulting

Comment Type T Comment Status X

In the column labeled "item" at line 18 there are two issues:
 1) the term "idle" is inappropriate and should be replaced with "IFG"
 2) The value of 35 is incorrect and should be 34.

SuggestedRemedy

- 1) Replace "idle" with "IFG"
- 2) Replace value 35 with 34.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 61 SC 61.1.4.1.1 P 321 L 35-38 # 14
 Shimon Muller Sun Microsystems, Inc

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

This note was inserted into draft 2.1 as a way of providing support for MAC-PHY Rate Matching in implementations that use a full duplex only MAC. However, at this point this note does more harm than good for the following reasons:

It refers to functionality that has not been defined anywhere. Neither clause 4 nor any of the new clauses specify how IFS stretching can be accomplished in a MAC that operates at 100Mb/s. The only specification for IFS stretching in clause 4 is defined for 10Gb/s operation, which is also the only speed that is allowed to use this mechanism. Also, it is not trivial to extrapolate from the existing clause 4 definition how IFS stretching can be made to work for a 100Mb/s MAC without any further guidance to the implementor.

I therefore believe that in that respect this draft is technically flawed. Either provide a complete definition for IFS stretching at 100Mb/s, or drop this functionality completely. During the previous recirculation ballot I tried to do the former. However, since my comment (#68) was rejected, the next best thing is to do the latter.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete this note and all the other references to full duplex MAC operation for EFM copper.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 64 SC P L # 1
 Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co.,Ltd.

Comment Type E Comment Status X

In this clause, "true" and "false" are used to the Boolean value "TRUE" and "FALSE" being used in other clauses.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 64 SC 64.1.2 P 452 L 7 # 21
 Thompson, Geoffrey Nortel

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Layer diagram is incorrect. Box shown as LLC should be generalized to MAC Client. This seems to be particularly significant as this clause is to satisfy the compatibility with 802.1D bridging. 802.1D bridging is not an LLC MAC Client.

SuggestedRemedy

Change so that it will match the correct diagrams elsewhere in the standard.

Proposed Response Response Status O

P802.3ah Draft 2.2 Comments

Cl 64 SC 64.2.3.3 P 461 L 51 # 2
Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd.
Comment Type E Comment Status X
Unit of size should be "octet" instead of "byte".
SuggestedRemedy
This function returns the size of the sdu in octets.
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 64 SC 64.3.4 P 469 L 6 # 3
Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd.
Comment Type E Comment Status X
"byte" should be "octet".
SuggestedRemedy
The reference time used for setting the timestamp value shall be the first octet of the MPCPDU frame at time of transmission.
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.4 P 523 L 16 # 4
Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd.
Comment Type E Comment Status X
"parity bytes" should be "parity octets".
SuggestedRemedy
A boolean set by the FEC Transmit process to indicate if more parity octets need to be encoded.
Values: TRUE; No more parity octets need to be encoded.
FALSE; More parity octets need to be encoded.
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.5 P 523 L 39 # 5
Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd.
Comment Type E Comment Status X
"Reed Solomon (255,239) code" should be "Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code".
"paity bytes" should be "parity octets".
SuggestedRemedy
This function is used to encode the Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code. The encoder encodes the 239 octets data frame and generates 16 parity octets for each data frame.
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.4.5 P 524 L 44 # 6
Hirano, Ikuya Japan Radio Co,Ltd.
Comment Type E Comment Status X
"Reed Solomon (255,239) code" should be "Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code".
SuggestedRemedy
This function is used to decode the Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code.
Proposed Response Response Status O