Cl **00**   *SC*   *P*   *L*   **#** **90004**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-228*

A list of tables is now allowed for long documents, and is vital for review.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide a list of tables.
DVJ1-xxx

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. This style conforms to the style of previous 802.3 amendments.

Cl **00**   *SC*   *P*   *L*   **#** **137**

Thompson, Geoff   Nortel Networks

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**

Regarding your response to my TR comment #374.
Your response and the data behind it just goes to show that the balloting group is not always right, something well known by your TF Chair's as a result of his experience on REVCOM. I am confident that history will prove me correct in this matter. Therefore my comment stands.

SuggestedRemedy

Revise the PAR and the draft so that what is currently designated as P802.3ah can be approved as a separate full/new standard that is approved as and will remain a separate standard from IEEE Std 802.3. This will allow this project and its provider oriented successors/amendments to more freely meet the requirements of this significantly different marketplace and set of customers.
Pursue further steps to approval, both editorially and procedurely as a separate standard.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Previously considered. No further action is required

Cl **00**   *SC*   *P*   *L*   **#** **99349**

Thompson, Geoffrey   Nortel

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *D3.1 #372*

There is no provision in the draft to assure that the required disclaimer text (Ref: SB Ops Manual 5.9.3) will be included in the published standard.

SuggestedRemedy

Make provision in the next version of the draft to include the appropriately placed following text:
"At lectures, symposia, seminars, or educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position, explanation, or interpretation of the IEEE."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT.

Appropriate text may be added by IEEE-SA staff editor prior to publication

---

Cl **00**   *SC*   *P*   *L*   **#** `99350`

Thompson, Geoffrey   Nortel

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *D3.1 #374*

I continue to believe that many of the technically sound concepts included in this proposal, while suitable for the access market, are fundamentally at odds with the underlying principals of Ethernet embodied in IEEE Std 802.3 to date. While we have made changes in the past they have been all realativley minor and most of them have worked out. Some, in retrospect, while they seemed like a good idea at the time have set bad precedents for later work. Across it all Std 802.3 has remained conceptually pretty consistent. P802.3ah has several significant departures from that conceptual consistency. I believe that the precedents they set will cause significant confusion over the long term and destroy the conceptual consistency of Ethernet as it is known.
The specific areas that concern me most are:
    Loss of the peer relationship to a provider - customer asymmetry
    Unidirectional transport
    Loopback
    New non CSMA/CD mechanisms for shared media access arbitration.
    OAM mechanism that are not consistent with the earlier Management
    Low speed operation not consistent with prevalent perception of Ethernet.
    The requirement for and complexity of ranging & discovery protocols
    Requirement for additional levels of station addressing

SuggestedRemedy

Revise the PAR and the draft so that what is currently designated as P802.3ah can be approved as a separate full/new standard that is approved as and will remain a separate standard from IEEE Std 802.3. This will allow this project and its provider oriented successors/amendments to more freely meet the requirements of this significantly different marketplace and set of customers.
Pursue further steps to approval, both editorially and procedurely as a separate standard.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This issue has been discussed several times in the past.The scope and content of the draft is properly aligned with the approved PAR. The content of the draft as it currently stands has been approved by the balloting group. The commenter's suggested remedy is therefore clearly at odds with the concensus opinion of the task force that wrote the draft, the working group that approved the PAR and reviewed the draft, and the ballot group that approved the draft.

Cl **00**   *SC*   *P*   *L*   **#** `99300`

Thompson, Geoffrey   Nortel

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *D3.0 #795*

The entirely new concept to 802.3 of doing shared access via an entirely new access protocol is hidden through lack of use of the proper terminology to describe what is going on. The P2MP portion of the proposal is, in fact, a new shared access protocol of the TDMA variety yet none of the following standard terms appears appear anywhere in the description thereof:
    multiple access
    access method
    time division
    TDMA
    access domain
    MAC protocol
In fact the only mentions of a "shared LAN" is the claim that P2MP is emulating a shared LAN rather than admitting it is one!

SuggestedRemedy

Come clean. P2MP is at its most basic level a master-slave TDMA LAN. Revise text to describe P2MP fully as such using established 802 terminology for multiple access shared LANs.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Master-slave relationship is described in 64.3.1. item h.

Modify item d in 64.3.1 as follows:
Multiple MACs operate on a shared medium by allowing only a single MAC to transmit upstream at any given time across the network using a time-division multiple access (TDMA) method.

Cl **00**   *SC*   *P*   *L*   **#** `90003`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-227*

A list of tables is now allowed for long documents, and is vital for review.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide a list of tables.
DVJ1-xxix

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. This style conforms to the style of previous 802.3 amendments.

Cl **00** *SC* *P* *L* **#** **90002**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-226*

A list of tables is now allowed for long documents, and is vital for review.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide a list of tables.
DVJ1-viii

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. A list, bookmarks for and description of all the clauses is included and conforms to the style of previous 802.3 amendments.

Cl **00** *SC* *P* **iii** *L* **18** **#** **138**

Thompson, Geoff   Nortel Networks

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R**

Regarding your response to my TR comment #372.
Your response was non-responsive. No rationale for rejection was provided. Further, while "Appropriate text may be added by IEEE-SA staff editor prior to publication" there is the strong possibility based on experience that the text will not be added by staff. Since staff has not met the long standing requirement for the "addition" of this text, the appropriate remedy is to add draft front matter (in much the same manner as routinely done by 802.1) to assure that mandated material will appear in the published standard. Given that introductory matter has already been developed for this draft, this does not seem like a significant imposition.

SuggestedRemedy

Add draft front matter that includes the following text:
"At lectures, symposia, seminars, or educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position, explanation, or interpretation of the IEEE."thus assuring that the requirements of the Op Manual 5.9.3 will be met.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Previously considered. No further action is required

Cl **00** *SC* **0** *P* **1** *L* **35** **#** **99304**

James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *D3.0 #726*

Excessive capitalization.
This is just one example. Instruct your editors to eliminate capitalization on everything except proper nouns and the first word of headings and sentences.

The profuse use of capitalization, for emphasis, field name delineation, acronyms, etc. is unnecessary and distracting. With so many capitals, its hard to tell when one sentence or field name begins and another one ends.

Start at the front, work through the end, and have a policy in mind. Simply repeating the 802.3 mistakes is not sufficient.

SuggestedRemedy

for network Operations, Administration and Maintenance (OAM) is included
==>
for network operations, administration and maintenance (OAM) is included

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will try to improve on capitalization

Cl **00** *SC* **0** *P* **10** *L* **1** **#** **99305**

James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *D3.0 #730*

Unnecessary page, not part of the specification.
This is normally provided (or so says Tom Alexander) for the convenience of editors when the document is in FrameMaker source. Its not needed in pdf, and (in fact) could lead to some interesting translation ambiguities.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove this and following page.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This has usually been added to 802.3 docs.

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **2**   *L* **1**   **#** **99306**
James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *D3.0 #727*
This trademark usage page is blank, with no notice of any desire to change or method of change.

This comments was not addressed when marked as editorial, in previous working group ballots. I hope action is taken this time.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Eliminate the page
2) Put some text describing what and when will happen to this page.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

This page is a reminder that text will be added on publication. An editors note can be added to this effect

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90027**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-251*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90022**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-246*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90012**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-236*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90019**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-243*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90021**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-245*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90023**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-247*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 4 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90030**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-254*
  Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
  As corrected above.
  DVJ1-8

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Refer db. Will remove extra term

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90025**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-249*
  Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
  As corrected above.
  DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90029**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-253*
  Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
  As corrected above.
  DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90011**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-235*
  Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
  As corrected in nine preceding paragraphs.
  DVJ1-5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90020**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-244*
  Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
  As corrected above.
  DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90026**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-250*
  Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
  As corrected above.
  DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90005**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-229*
  Inconsistent notation.

SuggestedRemedy
  Several steps:
  1) Provide the preceding text on "Numerical representation" in your notation clause.
  2) Enforce this convention on all of your added text.
  3) A disclaimer note that deprecates previous uses could be included, since the baseline
  document does things many ways.
  DVJ1-1

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Notation is explicit in the definition.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 5 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90024**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-248*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90013**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-237*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90014**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-238*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90015**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-239*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90016**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-240*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90017**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-241*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90018**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-242*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90028**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-252*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-7

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **1.4**　　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90033**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-257*
Acronym used, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy
==>FP
DVJ1-8

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. "The abbreviation is used in 67A.3, it is properly introduced there, and it is not   used anywhere else in 802.3."

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **1.4**　　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90034**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-258*
SA meaning is unclear: source address, Source Address, sourceField, or source_address could be implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete this term, as done above.
DVJ1-9

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Scope of previous change was to fix capitalization only.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **1.4**　　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90032**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　*DVJ-256*
Lack of capitalization (Ethernet is used in 802 as a proper noun).

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-8

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT.
Consistent with a comment on an earlier draft. This is the last   lower-case ""ethernet"" in 802.3ah apart from one in a comment to an example program in 61A.3, so we should fix both

---

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **1.4**　　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90031**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-255*
DA meaning is unclear: destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, or destination_address could be implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete this terms, as done above.
DVJ1-8

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Scope of previous change was to fix capitalization only.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **1.4**　　　　　*P* **13**　　　*L* **44**　　　**#** **591**
James, David　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*unchanged text*
Excessive capitalization:

1.4.xxx Aggregation group: ...

SuggestedRemedy
==>
1.4.xxx aggregation group: ...

As per:
1) IEEE style guidelines (only the first word of a heading is capitalized).
2) IEEE IEEE Draft P802.3ahTM/D3.2, page 68, line 13.
2) IEEE Std 802.3(tm)-2002, page 15, 1.4.62

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

This comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **13**   *L* **47**   **#** **593**

James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *unchanged text*

Excessive capitalization:

1.4.xxx Bandplan: ...

SuggestedRemedy

==>
1.4.xxx bandplan: ...

As per:
1) IEEE style guidelines (only the first word of a heading is capitalized).
2) IEEE IEEE Draft P802.3ahTM/D3.2, page 648, line 31.
2) IEEE Std 802.3(tm)-2002, page 15, 1.4.62

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **13**   *L* **50**   **#** **594**

James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *unchanged text*

Excessive capitalization:

1.4.xxx Coupled Power Ratio (CPR): ...

SuggestedRemedy

==>
1.4.xxx coupled power ratio (CPR): ...

As per:
1) IEEE style guidelines (only the first word of a heading is capitalized).
2) IEEE IEEE Draft P802.3ahTM/D3.2, page 15, line 11.
2) IEEE Std 802.3(tm)-2002, page 15, 1.4.62

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **13**   *L* **53**   **#** **595**

James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *unchanged text*

Excessive capitalization:

1.4.xxx Downstream: ...

SuggestedRemedy

==>
1.4.xxx Downstream: ...

As per:
1) IEEE style guidelines (only the first word of a heading is capitalized).
2) IEEE IEEE Draft P802.3ahTM/D3.2, page 98, line 21.
2) IEEE Std 802.3(tm)-2002, page 15, 1.4.62

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **14**   *L* **1**   **#** **596**

James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *unchanged text*

Excessive capitalization:

1.4.xxx Grant: ...

SuggestedRemedy

==>
1.4.xxx Downstream: ...

As per:
1) IEEE style guidelines (only the first word of a heading is capitalized).
2) IEEE IEEE Draft P802.3ahTM/D3.2, page 48, line 40.
2) IEEE Std 802.3(tm)-2002, page 15, 1.4.62

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **14**   *L* **28**   **#** 603

James, David   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *unchanged text*

Excessive terminology:

1.4.xxx P2MP Discovery: ...

My text editor could find no instance of ""P2MP discovery""
nor ""P2MP discovery"".

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **14**   *L* **33**   **#** 604

James, David   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *unchanged text*

Excessive terminology:

1.4.xxx P2MP Discovery window: ...

My text editor could find no instance of ""P2MP Discovery""
nor ""P2MP discovery"".

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **14**   *L* **36**   **#** 605

James, David   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *unchanged text*

Excessive terminology:

1.4.xxx P2MP Timestamp: ...

My text editor could find no instance of ""P2MP Timestamp""
nor ""P2MP timestamp"".

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **15**   *L* **38**   **#** **99344**

James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *D3.0 #732*

Excessive capitalization. There is no point in capitalizing every defined word (or many of them, with no apparent pattern). This confuses the parsing of sentences, since defined words, registers, fields, etc. are all capitalized.

SuggestedRemedy

1.4.xxx Aggregation group: ...
==>
1.4.xxx aggregation group: ...

1.4.xxx Bandplan: ...
==>
1.4.xxx bandplan: ...

1.4.xxx Coupled Power Ratio (CPR): ...
==>
1.4.xxx coupled power ratio (CPR): ...

1.4.xxx Downstream: ...
==>
1.4.xxx downstream: ...

1.4.xxx Grant: Within P2MP protocols, ...
==>
1.4.xxx grant: Within P2MP protocols, ...

1.4.xxx Logical Link Identifier (LLID): ...
==>
1.4.xxx logical link identifier (LLID): ...

1.4.xxx MPCP Registration: ...
==>
1.4.xxx MPCP registration: ...

1.4.xxx OAM Discovery: ...
==>
1.4.xxx OAM discovery: ...

1.4.xxx Operations, Administration and Maintenance (OAM): ...
==>
1.4.xxx operations, administration and maintenance (OAM): ...

1.4.xxx Optical Line Terminal (OLT): ...
==>
1.4.xxx optical line terminal (OLT): ...

1.4.xxx Optical Network Unit (ONU): ...
==>
1.4.xxx optical network unit (ONU): ...

1.4.xxx P2MP Discovery: ...
==>
1.4.xxx P2MP discovery: ...

1.4.xxx P2MP Discovery window: ...
==>
1.4.xxx P2MP discovery window: ...

1.4.xxx P2MP Timestamp: ...
==>
1.4.xxx P2MP timestamp: ...

1.4.xxx Point to Multi-Point Network (P2MP): ...
==>
1.4.xxx point to multi-point network (P2MP): ...

1.4.xxx Point-to-point emulation (P2PE): ...
==>
1.4.xxx point-to-point emulation (P2PE): ...

1.4.xxx Ranging: ...
==>
1.4.xxx ranging: ...

1.4.xxx Reflectance: ...
==>
1.4.xxx reflectance: ...

1.4.xxx Upstream: ...
==>
1.4.xxx upstream: ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will capitalize abbreviations in a definition to be consistant with 802.3ae (part of base document), Otherwise they will not be.

For definitons they will not be capitalized

Cl **01** *SC* **1.4** *P* **16** *L* **8** **#** **99355**

Dr. David V. James

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *D3.1 #591*

has excess capitalization, as can be seen by looking at Definitions are
****>>>>NOT<<<<**** capitalized just because they are defined. Even the most recent
802.3 "bible" has finally done this (mostly) right.

SuggestedRemedy

I view the responses to submitted comments arrogant and ill informed. Your should read
the IEEE Style manual, which is available on line.
After that, establishing editorial guidelines (which a chief editor should do) or distributing
pointers to useful references would be useful, such as
http://dvjames.com/templates/StdBook.pdf.
A response of 802.3 precedence is irrelevent: your job is to write based on IEEE style
guidelines. Besides, the precedence (most recent 802.3) also shows definitions not
capitalized unless proper nouns.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

The editor-in-chief has worked closely with the IEEE staff editor to ensure that the draft
adequately conforms with the IEEE style guide.

Cl **01** *SC* **1.4** *P* **17** *L* **5** **#** **99345**

James, David JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *D3.0 #733*

Excessive capitalization. There is no point in capitalizing every acronym (or many of them,
with no apparent pattern). This confuses the parsing of sentences, since defined words,
registers, fields, etc. are all capitalized.
Also, IEEE Style manual clearly shown acronyms not capitalized unless proper nouns.

Due to the large number of these, and failures in the past when attempting to resolve these
earlier, they have been elevated to a TR.

After fixing the unnecessary capitalization, provide a check list to the other clause editors.
Its easier for them to search, then for me and/or others to do so on their behalf.

SuggestedRemedy

CO Central Office
==>
CO central office

CPE Customer Premises Equipment
==>
CPE customer premises equipment

CPR Coupled Power Ratio
==>
CPR coupled power ratio

DMT Discrete Multi-Tone
==>
DMT discrete multi-tone

DA Destination Address
==>
DA destination address

EFM Ethernet in the First Mile
==>
EFM Ethernet in the first mile

EFM Cu Ethernet in the First Mile ...
==>
EFM Cu Ethernet in the first mile ...

FEC Forward Error Correction
==>
FEC forward error correction

FSW Frame Synchronization Word
==>
FSW frame synchronization word<cr
LLID Logical Link identifier

==>
LLID logical link identifier

MPCP Multi-Point Control Protocol
==>
MPCP multi-point control protoco

OAM Operations, Administration, and Maintenance
==>
OAM operations, administration, and maintenance

OAMPDU Operations, Administration, and Maintenance Protocol Data Unit
==>
OAMPDU operations, administration, and maintenance protocol data unit

ODN Optical Distribution Network
==>
ODN optical distribution network

OH Overhead
==>
OH overhead

OLT Optical Line Terminal
==>
OLT optical line terminal

ONU Optical Network Unit
==>
ONU optical network unit

ORLT Optical return loss tolerance
==>
ORLT optical return loss tolerance

P2P Point to Point
==>
P2P point to point

P2PE Point to Point Emulation
==>
P2PE point to point emulation

P2MP Point to Multi-Point
==>
P2MP point to multi-point

PAF PMI Aggregation Function
==>
PAF PMI aggregation function

PAFH PMI Aggregation Function Header

==>
PAFH PMI aggregation function header

PAM Pulse Amplitude Modulation
==>
PAM pulse amplitude modulation

PMS-TC Physical Media Specific - Transmission Convergence
==>
PMS-TC physical media specific - transmission convergence

PSD Power Spectral Density
==>
PSD power spectral density

SA Source Address
==>
SA source address

SHDSL Single-pair High-speed Digital Subscriber Line
==>
SHDSL single-pair high-speed digital subscriber line

STU-O SHDSL Transceiver Unit - Central Office
==>
STU-O SHDSL transceiver unit - central office

STU-R SHDSL Transceiver Unit - Remote
==>
STU-R SHDSL transceiver unit - remote

TCM Trellis Coded Modulation
==>
TCM Trellis coded modulation

UPBO Upstream power back-off
==>
UPBO upstream power back-off

Proposed Response   Response Status   **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will capitalize abbreviations in a definition to be consistant with 802.3ae (part of base document), Otherwise they will not be.

For definitons they will not be capitalized

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 12 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90006**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-230*
Inconsistent and highly confusing notation throughout.

SuggestedRemedy
Several steps:
1) Provide the preceding text on "Use of italics" in you notation clause.
2) Enforce this convention on all of your added text.
3) A disclaimer note that deprecates previous uses could be included, since the baseline document does things many ways.
DVJ1-1

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This is an amendment to 802.3 and thus cannot enforce a style on the entire document. The style used has stood past reviews and is consistent to previously done work in .3.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90007**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-231*
Inconsistent and highly confusing notation throughout.

SuggestedRemedy
Several steps:
1) Provide the preceding text on "Field conventions" in your notation clause.
2) Enforce this convention on all of your added text.
3) Supplement this with text that describes the 802-specific bit notation, since its prelevance will make it difficult to ever change.
4) A disclaimer note that deprecates previous uses could be included, since the baseline document does things many ways.
DVJ1-2

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This is an amendment to 802.3 and thus cannot enforce a style on the entire document. The style used has stood past reviews and is consistent to previously done work in .3.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90008**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-232*
Inconsistent and highly confusing constant notation throughout.

SuggestedRemedy
Several steps:
1) Provide the preceding text on "Field value conventions" in your notation clause.
2) Enforce this convention on all of your added text.
3) A disclaimer note that deprecates previous uses could be included, since the baseline document does things many ways.
DVJ1-3

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This is an amendment to 802.3 and thus cannot enforce a style on the entire document. The style used has stood past reviews and is consistent to previously done work in .3.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90009**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-233*
Inconsistent and highly confusing constant notation throughout.

SuggestedRemedy
Several steps:
1) Provide the preceding text on "Byte sequential formats" in your notation clause.
2) Enforce this convention on all of your added text.
3) A disclaimer note that deprecates previous uses could be included, since the baseline document does things many ways.
DVJ1-3

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This is an amendment to 802.3 and thus cannot enforce a style on the entire document. The style used has stood past reviews and is consistent to previously done work in .3.

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91446**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1670*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>control
DVJ1-426

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91444**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1668*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>physical layerl
DVJ1-425

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91445**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1669*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>data link layerl
DVJ1-425

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91448**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1672*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>physical layer
DVJ1-426

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91447**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1671*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>physical layer signaling
DVJ1-426

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91450**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1674*
Too many name aliases:
    SA, source address, Source Address, etc. Also, not easy to parse and SA looks like a
constant.

SuggestedRemedy
==>sourceAddress
DVJ1-426

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91449**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1673*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-426

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.1.2.2** *P* *L* **#** 91453
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1677*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-427

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.1.2.2** *P* *L* **#** 91452
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1676*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-427

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.1.2.2** *P* *L* **#** 91451
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1675*
Too many name aliases:
SA, source address, Source Address, etc. Also, not easy to parse and SA looks like a constant.

SuggestedRemedy
==>sourceAddress
DVJ1-427

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.1.4** *P* *L* **#** 91454
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1678*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-428

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.2.1** *P* *L* **#** 91455
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1679*
Quoted "references" are informative bibliography; useless in a normative environment.

SuggestedRemedy
Convert the code to C code, consistent with most other uses. Then, reference ANSI spec.
DVJ1-428

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The use of Pascal as the descriptive language for the
MAC has been accepted practice in the base standard
for over 20 years. There is no need to convert to any
other descriptive language. The references are useful
in this context.

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.2.2** *P* *L* **#** 91456
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1680*
This "shall" cannot be tested tested for conformance.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the text, as shown.
DVJ1-428

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The inclusion of this "shall" has no ill effect. The text parallels the base standard, as
intended.
Comment is on unchanged text

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 15 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.2.2**

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91457**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1681*

This "shall" cannot be tested tested for conformance.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the text, as shown.
DVJ1-429

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The inclusion of this "shall" has no ill effect. The text parallels the base standard, as intended.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91458**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1682*

This "shall" cannot be tested tested for conformance.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the text, as shown.
DVJ1-429

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The inclusion of this "shall" has no ill effect. The text parallels the base standard, as intended.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91459**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1683*

Why, oh why, on earth are you specifying things in Pasca,? No one knows this.
Also, there is no stated reference manual for the language, so this cannot be used.

SuggestedRemedy

Convert the code to C code, consistent with most other uses.
DVJ1-429

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The use of Pascal as the descriptive language for the
MAC has been accepted practice in the base standard
for over 20 years. There is no need to convert to any
other descriptive language.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91461**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1685*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>layer management
DVJ1-431

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91460**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1684*

This "shall" cannot be guaranteed: you can't legislated behaviors, you can only state facts.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the text, as shown.
DVJ1-431

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The inclusion of this "shall" has no ill effect. The text parallels the base standard, as intended.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91462**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1686*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>physical layer
DVJ1-431

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.3.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91463**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1687*
Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
   ==>destinationAddress
   DVJ1-432

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.4.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91468**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1692*
Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
   ==>destinationAddress
   DVJ1-433

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.4.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91469**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1693*
Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
   ==>destinationAddress
   DVJ1-433

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.4.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91466**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1690*
Excess capitalization; only capitalize the first word of headings

SuggestedRemedy
   As corrected above
   ==>Individual addresses
   ==>Group addresses
   DVJ1-433

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.4.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91465**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1689*
Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
   ==>destinationAddress
   DVJ1-433

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A**   *SC* **4A.2.4.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91464**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1688*
Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
   ==>destinationAddress
   DVJ1-432

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.2.4.1.1** *P* *L* # **91467**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1691*
Excess capitalization; capitalizing Broadcast doesn't help specify its meaning.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above
DVJ1-433

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.2.9** *P* *L* # **91470**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1694*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-435

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **04A** *SC* **4A.3.2** *P* *L* # **91471**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1695*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-437

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **22** *SC* **1.4** *P* **21** *L* **1** # **99309**
James, David JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *D3.0 #734*
Excessive capitalization. There is no point in capitalizing every acronym (or many of them, with no apparent pattern). This confuses the parsing of sentences, since defined words, registers, fields, etc. are all capitalized.
Also, IEEE Style manual clearly shown acronyms not capitalized unless proper nouns.

Due to the large number of these, and failures in the past when attempting to resolve these earlier, they have been elevated to a TR.

After fixing the unnecessary capitalization, provide a check list to the other clause editors. Its easier for them to search, then for me and/or others to do so on their behalf.

SuggestedRemedy
22. Reconciliation Sublayer (RS) and Media Independent Interface (MII)
==>
22. Reconciliation sublayer (RS) and media independent interface (MII)

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

Changing the title of an existing clause is outside the scope of P802.3ah.

Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4** *P* *L* # **90040**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-264*
Not properly centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the entries in the leftmost and right two columns.
DVJ1-11

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4** *P* *L* # **90039**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-263*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Basic/extended
DVJ1-11

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 18 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4**

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90038**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-262*
Register names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
As above:
==>mmdAccessControl
==>mmdAccessAddressData
DVJ1-11

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90036**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-260*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
==>auto-negotiation
DVJ1-10

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90037**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-261*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
==>register
DVJ1-10

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90041**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-265*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
As above:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-12

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90042**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-266*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-12

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90043**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-267*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-12

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90044**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-268*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90045**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-269*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90046**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-270*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  SC is an abbreviation for self clearing
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90047**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-271*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90048**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-272*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90049**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-273*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 20 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **22** *SC* **22.2.4.1**

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90050**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-274*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90051**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-275*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90052**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-276*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  SC is an abbreviation for self clearing
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
  LL is an abbreviation for latching low
  LH is an abbreviation for latching high
DVJ1-13

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.1.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90053**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-277*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-14

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90057**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-281*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-14

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90060**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-284*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  LL is an abbreviation for latching low
  LH is an abbreviation for latching high
DVJ1-14

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90059**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-283*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-14

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90056**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-280*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-14

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90058**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-282*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-14

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90054**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-278*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above.
DVJ1-14

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90055**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-279*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-14

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.2.8**   *P* **25**   *L* **9**   **#** **99311**
Thompson, Geoffrey   Nortel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *D3.0 #793*

Proposed text goes well beyond the allowed scope of the project. As worded it would appear to allow "unidirectional ability" on legacy PHY types. This change could cause great confusion and interoperability problems with conformat legacy networks.

SuggestedRemedy

Limit the scope of this change to the PHY types being added by this clause that support unidirectional ability. Require that the value of bit 1.7 will be zero for all other current PHY types.
Any WG action to add unidirectional ability to legacy PHY types should be done through maintenance or a new project with the appropriate scope.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

"Bit 1.7 shall be set to 0 for all PHYs except the following: 100BASE-X using the PCS specified in 66.1 and 1000BASE-X using the PCS specified in 66.2."

Use the major capability from comment #748 in the PICS entry.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90062**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-286*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-15

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90067**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-291*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>register.
DVJ1-16

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90066**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-290*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnote to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-16

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90061**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-285*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-15

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90064**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-288*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-16

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90063**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-287*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-15

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90065**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-289*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-16

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90070**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-294*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-17

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90071**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-295*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-17

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90072**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-296*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-17

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90069**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-293*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-17

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 24 of 242

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.12**

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90068**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-292*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-16

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is
unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.2.4.3.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90073**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-297*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-17

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is
unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.7.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90074**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-298*
The Subclause,Status,Support columns are not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-17

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. This affects an existing table and changing the format of this table is beyond the
scope of P802.3ah

Cl **22**   *SC* **22.7.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90075**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-299*
The Subclause,Status,Support columns are not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-17

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is
unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22D**   *SC* **22D.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91475**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1699*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>register
DVJ1-441

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is
unchanged in this draft.

Cl **22D**   *SC* **22D.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91477**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1701*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>bit error ratio test
DVJ1-445

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT.

The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged
in this draft.

Comment is actually on Annex 58A, not Annex 22D.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90078**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-302*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>link aggregation.
DVJ1-18

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90077**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-301*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>control.
DVJ1-18

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90239**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-463*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>physical medium entity
DVJ1-66

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90238**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-462*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>Layer management
DVJ1-66

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.1.1.10**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90247**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-471*
Don't hide the basic properties.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>Range[]
DVJ1-70

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.1.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90240**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-464*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>UNKNOWN…
DVJ1-67

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.1.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90241**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-465*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>UNKNOWN…
DVJ1-67

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.1.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90242**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-466*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>TRUE…
DVJ1-68

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.1.1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90243**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-467*
Enumerated values are listed, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy
Complete the tbd's.
DVJ1-68

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.1.1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90244**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-468*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>ENABLED…
DVJ1-68

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.1.1.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90245**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-469*
Don't hide the basic properties.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>Range[].
DVJ1-69

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.1.1.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90246**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-470*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>UNKNOWN…
DVJ1-70

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.11.2.1.2** *P* *L* **#** **90250**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-474*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>ENABLED…
DVJ1-71

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.11.2.1.2** *P* *L* **#** **90249**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-473*
Enumerated values are listed, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy
Complete the tbd's.
DVJ1-71

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.11.2.1.2** *P* *L* **#** **90248**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *DVJ-472*
Missing line.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>ATTRIBUTE
DVJ1-71

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.11.2.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **90251**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-475*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>PS_DOWN_NOT_READY…
DVJ1-72

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.11.2.1.5** *P* *L* **#** **90252**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-476*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-73

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.11.2.1.7** *P* *L* **#** **90253**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-477*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>NO_LINK…
DVJ1-73

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.2.1.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90254**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-478*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-74

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.11.2.1.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90255**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-479*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-74

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90087**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-311*
Excess and possibly inaccurate wording.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>standard.
DVJ1-21

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-
2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in
underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged
from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90083**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-307*
Excess and possibly inaccurate wording.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>standard.
DVJ1-20

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-
2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in
underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged
from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90082**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-306*
Excess and possibly inaccurate wording.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>standard.
DVJ1-20

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-
2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in
underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged
from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90084**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-308*
Excess and possibly inaccurate wording.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>standard.
DVJ1-20

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-
2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in
underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged
from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90085**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-309*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>midspan.
DVJ1-20

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90079**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-303*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>systems.
DVJ1-19

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90080**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-304*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>aggregation port.
DVJ1-19

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90086**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-310*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>multi-point.
DVJ1-21

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90081**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-305*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>link aggregation.
DVJ1-19

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged from D3.1.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90088**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-312*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>midspan
DVJ1-22

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments) and is only included to provide context to the change, marked in underscore or strikeout, required for IEEE P802.3ah. In addition this text is unchanged from D3.1.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.2.3** *P* *L* **#** **90089**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-313*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>system.
DVJ1-22

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.2.5** *P* *L* **#** **90090**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-314*
Excess capitalization; only the first word of a heading is capitalized

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>PHY error monitor capability (optional).
DVJ1-22

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.1.1.20** *P* *L* **#** **90092**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-316*
Routines are always differentiated by their parenthesis.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>LayerMgmtTransmitCounters( )
DVJ1-23

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.1.1.20** *P* *L* **#** **90091**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-315*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-23

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.1.1.20** *P* *L* **#** **90094**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-318*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>rate matching.
DVJ1-23

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.1.1.20** *P* *L* **#** **90093**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-317*
Routines should be differentiated by italics.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>LayerMgmtTransmitCounters( )
DVJ1-23

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 31 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.1.1.20**

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.1.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90095**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-319*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
TRUE—…
FALSE—…
DVJ1-23

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.1.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90096**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-320*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>TRUE
==>FALSE
DVJ1-23

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.1.1.36**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90097**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-321*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>UNKNOWN…
DVJ1-24

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.2.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90098**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-322*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>OTHER…
DVJ1-24

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.2.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90099**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-323*
Excess and possibly inaccurate wording.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>standard.
DVJ1-24

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.2.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90100**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-324*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>auto-negotiation.
DVJ1-25

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90101**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-325*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>control.
DVJ1-25

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.10**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90118**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-342*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-29

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90119**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-343*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-29

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90120**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-344*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-30

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90121**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-345*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-30

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.14**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90124**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-348*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-30

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 33 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.14**

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.14**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90123**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-347*

Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-30

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.14**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90122**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-346*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-30

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90126**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-350*

Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-31

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90127**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-351*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-31

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90125**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-349*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-31

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.16**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90129**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-353*

Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-31

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.16**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90130**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-354*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-31

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.16**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90128**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-352*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-31

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90132**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-356*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-32

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is
in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would
make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90133**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-357*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-32

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90131**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-355*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-32

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90136**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-360*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-32

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90135**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-359*

Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-32

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is
in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would
make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90134**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-358*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-32

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90102**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-326*

Enumerated values are listed, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Complete the tbd's.
DVJ1-26

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90103**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-327*

Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above,
==>ENABLED…
DVJ1-26

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90104**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-328*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>control sublayer.
DVJ1-26

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90137**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-361*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-33

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.5.1.23** *P* *L* **#** **90138**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-362*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-33

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.5.1.24** *P* *L* **#** **90139**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-363*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-34

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.5.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **90107**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-331*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>multi-point.
DVJ1-26

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.5.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **90105**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-329*
Enumerated values are not described.

SuggestedRemedy
Fill in the tbd's.
DVJ1-26

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.5.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **90106**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-330*
No need for quotes around defined constants.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Delete the quotes (as illustrated above) or
2) Use non-conflicting longer nonconflicting enumeration names, such as MP_OLT…
DVJ1-26

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.5.1.4** *P* *L* **#** **90108**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-332*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>logical link
DVJ1-27

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90109**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-333*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-27

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90110**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-334*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-27

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90112**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-336*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
==>multi-point
DVJ1-28

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90111**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-335*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>UNREGISTERED…
DVJ1-27

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90114**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-338*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>control.
DVJ1-28

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90113**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-337*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-28

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90115**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-339*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-28

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90116**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-340*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-28

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90117**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-341*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum rate: …
DVJ1-29

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90141**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-365*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>UNREGISTERED…
DVJ1-34

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90140**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-364*
Enumerated values are not described.

SuggestedRemedy
Fill in the tbd's.
DVJ1-34

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.10**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90156**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-380*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-39

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 39 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.10**

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90157**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-381*

The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-39

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90158**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-382*

Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-40

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is
in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would
make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90159**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-383*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-40

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is
in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would
make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90160**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-384*

Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-40

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90161**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-385*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-40

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90163**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-387*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-41

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90162**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-386*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-41

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.16**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90164**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-388*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-41

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.16**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90165**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-389*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-41

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90167**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-391*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-42

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90166**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-390*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-42

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90168**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-392*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-42

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.19**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90171**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-395*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-42

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.19**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90170**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-394*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-42

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.19**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90169**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-393*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-42

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90143**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-367*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>ENABLED…
DVJ1-35

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90142**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-366*
Enumerated values are not described.

SuggestedRemedy
Fill in the tbd's.
DVJ1-35

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.20**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90172**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-396*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-43

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.21**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90174**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-398*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-43

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.21**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90175**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-399*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-43

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.21**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90173**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-397*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-43

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90178**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-402*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-44

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90177**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-401*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-44

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90176**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-400*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-43

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.3.6.1.23**　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90181**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-405*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-44

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.3.6.1.23**　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90180**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-404*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-44

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.3.6.1.23**　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90179**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-403*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-44

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.3.6.1.24**　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90184**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-408*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-45

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.3.6.1.24**　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90182**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-406*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-45

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.3.6.1.24**　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90183**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-407*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-45

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.25**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90186**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-410*

Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-45

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.25**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90187**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-411*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-45

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.25**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90185**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-409*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-45

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.26**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90188**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-412*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-46

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.27**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90189**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-413*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-46

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.27**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90190**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-414*

Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-46

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.27**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90191**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-415*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-46

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.28**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90192**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-416*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-46

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.29**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90195**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-419*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-47

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.29**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90193**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-417*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-47

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.29**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90194**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-418*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-47

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90144**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-368*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>PASSIVE…
DVJ1-35

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90196**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-420*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-47

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90198**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-422*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-48

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90197**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-421*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-48

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90199**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-423*

Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-48

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90200**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-424*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-48

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90202**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-426*

Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-49

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90201**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-425*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-49

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90203**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-427*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-49

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.37**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90204**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-428*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-50

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.39**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90205**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-429*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-51

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90146**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-370*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>LINK_FAULT…
DVJ1-36

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90147**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-371*
Enumerated values are listed, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy
Complete the tbd's.
DVJ1-36

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.41**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90206
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-430*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-52

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90209
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-433*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-53

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90207
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-431*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-52

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90208
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-432*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-52

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90211
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-435*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-53

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90212
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-436*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-53

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.6.1.43** *P* *L* **#** **90210**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-434*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-53

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.6.1.44** *P* *L* **#** **90215**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-439*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-54

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.6.1.44** *P* *L* **#** **90214**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-438*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-54

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.6.1.44** *P* *L* **#** **90213**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-437*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-54

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.6.1.45** *P* *L* **#** **90218**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-442*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-55

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.6.1.45** *P* *L* **#** **90216**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-440*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-54

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 50 of 242
Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.6.1.45**

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.45**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90217**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-441*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-55

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.46**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90219**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-443*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-55

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90148**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-372*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-36

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90149**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-373*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-36

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90150**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-374*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-37

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90153**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-377*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-38

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90151**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-375*
The verbose sentence is hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace with a compact list
DVJ1-37

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90152**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-376*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-38

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90155**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-379*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-38

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.6.1.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90154**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-378*
Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-38

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90222**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-446*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>point to point emulation.
DVJ1-56

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90221**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-445*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>reconviliation sublayer
DVJ1-56

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on text that was unchanged from Draft 3.1 to 3.2. The format in
Draft 3.2 stands approved by the ballot group.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90220**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-444*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>UNKNOWN…
DVJ1-56

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90223**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-447*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-56

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90224**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-448*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-57

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90225**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-449*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-57

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90226**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-450*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-57

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90227**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-451*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-57

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.7.1.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90228**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-452*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-58

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90234**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-458*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-64

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.14**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90235**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-459*

Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above,
==>UNKNOWN…
DVJ1-65

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90236**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-460*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-65

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.16**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90237**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-461*

Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy

==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-66

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90229**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-453*

Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above,
==>MT_GLOBAL…
DVJ1-60

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.4**   *P*   *L*   *#* **90231**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-455*
Bad spacing.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>Mb/s
DVJ1-61

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This formatting issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

---

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.4**   *P*   *L*   *#* **90230**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-454*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>OTHER…
DVJ1-61

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.6**   *P*   *L*   *#* **90233**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-457*
Uniform notation for clarity.
Use a distinct line for parameter specifications, TRUE/FALSE, range, default, etc.

SuggestedRemedy
==>
Maximum increment rate: …
DVJ1-64

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.5.1.6**   *P*   *L*   *#* **90232**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-456*
Generic terms when a constant value is implied.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above,
==>OTHER…
DVJ1-64

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and suggests a departure from the style that is in use in the amended document (802.3-2002 and its amendments). To change here would make this text inconsistent with the existing IEEE 802.3 style.

Cl **31A**   *SC* **31A.**   *P*   *L*   *#* **90701**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-925*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct, as shown above.
DVJ1-147

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text

Cl **43B**   *SC* **43B.1**   *P*   *L*   *#* **90702**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-926*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-148

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, Length/Type is consistently used in the text of Clause 43, of which this is an annex.

Cl **43B** *SC* **43B.1** *P* *L* **#** **90703**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-927*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>client
DVJ1-148

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, MAC Client is consistently used in the text of Clause 43, of which this is an annex.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.** *P* *L* **#** **90257**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-481*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct, as shown above.
DVJ1-76

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **90259**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-483*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>physical layer
DVJ1-76

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **90258**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-482*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>station management.
DVJ1-76

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1** *P* *L* **#** **90264**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-488*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-77

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1** *P* *L* **#** **90263**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-487*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-77

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1** *P* *L* **#** **90260**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-484*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-77

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1** *P* *L* **#** **90262**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-486*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-77

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1** *P* *L* **#** **90261**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-485*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-77

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **90267**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-491*

The table is continued, but there is no continuation note.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the table continuation variable.
DVJ1-78

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **90265**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-489*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>register
DVJ1-77

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **90266**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-490*

The dark line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the table has completed. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy

Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-78

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90291**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-515*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  SC is an abbreviation for self clearing
DVJ1-81

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90288**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-512*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-81

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90290**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-514*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-81

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90287**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-511*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-81

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90289**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-513*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-81

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90286**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-510*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-81

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 58 of 242

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.11**

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.12**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　*#* **90295**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-519*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-83

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.12**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　*#* **90293**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-517*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-83

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.12**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　*#* **90292**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-516*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-83

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.12**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　*#* **90294**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-518*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-83

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.12**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　*#* **90296**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-520*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-83

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.13**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　*#* **90297**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-521*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-84

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   # **90298**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-522*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-84

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   # **90299**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-523*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-84

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   # **90300**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-524*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-84

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   # **90301**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-525*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-84

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   # **90307**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-531*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-85

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   # **90302**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-526*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
 n/a not applicable
DVJ1-84

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 60 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90306**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-530*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-85

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90305**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-529*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-85

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90303**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-527*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-85

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90308**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-532*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  SC is an abbreviation for self clearing
DVJ1-85

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90304**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-528*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-85

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.14.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90310**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-534*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-86

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.14.1** *P* *L* # **90309**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-533*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-86

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.14.1** *P* *L* # **90314**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-538*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
 LL is an abbreviation for latching low
DVJ1-86

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.14.1** *P* *L* # **90313**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-537*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-86

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.14.1** *P* *L* # **90312**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-536*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-86

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.14.1** *P* *L* # **90311**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-535*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-86

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.15** *P* *L* # **90317**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-541*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-87

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.15** *P* *L* **#** **90319**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-543*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
 NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-87

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.15** *P* *L* **#** **90315**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-539*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-87

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.15** *P* *L* **#** **90318**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-542*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-87

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.15** *P* *L* **#** **90316**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-540*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-87

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.17** *P* *L* **#** **90322**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-546*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-87

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.17** *P* *L* **#** **90324**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-548*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-88

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause Page 63 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.17**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90321**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-545*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-87

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90320**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-544*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-87

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90323**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-547*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-88

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90325**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-549*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-88

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90326**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-550*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-88

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90330**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-554*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-88

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90329**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-553*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-88

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90328**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-552*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-88

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90327**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-551*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-88

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90272**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-496*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-79

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90268**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-492*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-78

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90273**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-497*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  SC is an abbreviation for self clearing
DVJ1-79

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90271**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-495*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-79

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90269**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-493*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-78

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90270**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-494*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-78

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.20**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90334**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-558*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-89

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.20**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90331**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-555*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-89

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.20**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90332**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-556*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-89

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.20** *P* *L* **#** **90336**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-560*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-89

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.20** *P* *L* **#** **90333**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-557*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-89

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.20** *P* *L* **#** **90335**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-559*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-89

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.22** *P* *L* **#** **90340**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-564*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-90

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.22** *P* *L* **#** **90341**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-565*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-90

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.22** *P* *L* **#** **90339**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-563*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-90

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 67 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.22**

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.22** *P* *L* **#** **90338**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-562*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-90

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.22** *P* *L* **#** **90337**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-561*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-90

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.26** *P* *L* **#** **90346**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-570*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-91

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.26** *P* *L* **#** **90343**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-567*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-91

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.26** *P* *L* **#** **90344**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-568*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-91

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.26** *P* *L* **#** **90345**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-569*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-91

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 68 of 242
Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.26**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.26**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90342**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-566*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-91

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.28**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90352**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-576*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-92

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.28**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90351**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-575*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-92

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.28**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90350**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-574*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-92

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.28**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90349**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-573*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-92

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.28**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90348**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-572*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-92

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.28**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90347**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-571*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-92

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90364**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-588*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90354**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-578*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90353**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-577*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-92

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90359**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-583*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90360**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-584*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90361**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-585*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90362**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-586*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90363**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-587*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90357**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-581*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90356**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-580*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90355**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-579*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.30**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90358**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-582*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-93

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90366**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-590*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90369**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-593*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90365**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-589*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90367**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-591*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90370**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-594*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 72 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.31**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.31**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90368**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-592*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.32**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90374**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-598*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.32**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90373**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-597*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.32**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90372**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-596*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.32**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90371**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-595*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-94

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.32**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90376**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-600*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.32**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90375**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-599*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90382**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-606*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90381**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-605*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90378**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-602*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90380**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-604*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90377**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-601*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.33**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90379**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-603*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-95

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.34**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90383**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-607*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-96

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.34**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90385**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-609*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-96

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.34**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90386**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-610*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-96

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.34**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90387**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-611*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-96

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.34**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90388**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-612*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-96

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.34**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90384**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-608*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-96

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90389**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-613*
The dark line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the table has completed. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-96

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90393**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-617*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-97

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90390**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-614*
The table is continued, but there is no continuation note.

SuggestedRemedy
Add the table continuation variable.
DVJ1-96

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90392**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-616*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-97

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90395**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-619*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-97

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 76 of 242
Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90396**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-620*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-97

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90391**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-615*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-97

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.35**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90394**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-618*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-97

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.36**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90399**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-623*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-98

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.36**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90397**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-621*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-98

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.36**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90398**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-622*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-98

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.36**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90400**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-624*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-98

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved
by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.36**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90401**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-625*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-98

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved
by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.36**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90402**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-626*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  SC is an abbreviation for self clearing
DVJ1-98

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved
by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.37**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90405**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-629*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-100

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.37**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90404**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-628*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-100

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.37**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90403**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-627*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-99

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 78 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.37**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.37**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90408**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-632*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
a RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-100

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.37**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90407**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-631*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-100

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.37**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90406**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-630*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-100

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.38**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90414**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-638*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-101

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.38**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90411**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-635*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-101

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.38**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90409**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-633*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-101

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.38**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90412`
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-636*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-101

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.38**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90410`
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-634*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-101

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.38**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90413`
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-637*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-101

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.39**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90419`
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-643*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-103

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.39**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90417`
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-641*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-102

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.39**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90420`
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-644*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-103

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.39**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90418**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-642*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-103

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.39**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90416**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-640*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-102

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.39**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90415**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-639*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-102

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90275**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-499*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-79

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90278**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-502*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-79

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90277**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-501*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-79

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90274**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-498*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-79

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90276**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-500*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-79

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90282**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-506*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-80

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90284**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-508*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-80

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90283**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-507*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-80

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90279**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-503*

Unclear notation distinction. Sometimes 1.4.1 means a bit number, othertimes it might mean a subclause number. The distinction is subtle in many cases, and can often be confusing.

SuggestedRemedy

Two things:
1) When used to prepresent a bit ==> (1.4.1)
2) When used to represent a subclause==> (see 1.4.1)
Here and througout.
DVJ1-80

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90285**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-509*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-80

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90280**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-504*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-80

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90281**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-505*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-80

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.40** *P* *L* **#** **90424**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-648*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-104

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.40** *P* *L* **#** **90425**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-649*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-104

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.40** *P* *L* **#** **90422**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-646*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-104

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 83 of 242
Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.40**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.40**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90421**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-645*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-104

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.40**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90423**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-647*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-104

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.40**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90426**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-650*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-104

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.41**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90432**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-656*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-105

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.41**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90431**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-655*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-105

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.41**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90430**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-654*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-105

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.41**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90427**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-651*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-104

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.41**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90428**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-652*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-105

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.41**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90429**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-653*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-105

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90438**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-662*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
   RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-106

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90437**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-661*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-106

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90436**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-660*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-106

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90435**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-659*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-105

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90433**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-657*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-105

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.42**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90434**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-658*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-105

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90443**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-667*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-107

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90441**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-665*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-107

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90444**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-668*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-107

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90440`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-664*

The table is continued, but there is no continuation note.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the table continuation variable.
DVJ1-107

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90446`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-670*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-107

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90445`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-669*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-107

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90442`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-666*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-107

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.43**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90439`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-663*

The dark line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the table has completed. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy

Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-107

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.44**   *P*   *L*   **#** `90450`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-674*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-108

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.44**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90451**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-675*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-108

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.44**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90449**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-673*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-108

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.44**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90448**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-672*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-108

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.44**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90447**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-671*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-108

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.46**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90456**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-680*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-109

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.46**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90453**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-677*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-109

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 88 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.46**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.46**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90454**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-678*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-109

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.46**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90455**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-679*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-109

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.46**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90452**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-676*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-109

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.48**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90458**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-682*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-110

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.48**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90461**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-685*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-110

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.48**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90457**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-681*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-110

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.48**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90459**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-683*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-110

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.48**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90460**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-684*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-110

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.50**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90466**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-690*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-111

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.50**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90462**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-686*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-110

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.50**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90465**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-689*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-111

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.50**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90464**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-688*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-110

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.50**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90463**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-687*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-110

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.52**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90470**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-694*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-111

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.52**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90471**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-695*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-111

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.52**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90469**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-693*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-111

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.52**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90467**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-691*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-111

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.52**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90468**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-692*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-111

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.54**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90474**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-698*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-112

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.54**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90476**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-700*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-112

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.54**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90475**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-699*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-112

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.54**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90473**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-697*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-112

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.54**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90477**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-701*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
  LH is an abbreviation for latching high
DVJ1-112

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.54**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90472**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-696*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-112

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.56**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90479**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-703*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-113

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.56**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90480**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-704*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-113

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.56**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90481**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-705*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-113

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.56**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90482**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-706*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-113

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.56**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90483**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-707*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-113

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.56**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90478**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-702*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-113

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.57**   *P*   *L*   **# 90485**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-709*
The table is continued, but there is no continuation note.

SuggestedRemedy
Add the table continuation variable.
DVJ1-114

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff
Editor

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.57**   *P*   *L*   **# 90488**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-712*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-114

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.57**   *P*   *L*   **# 90487**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-711*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-114

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.57**   *P*   *L*   **# 90484**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-708*
The dark line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply
that the table has completed. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot
be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-114

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff
Editor

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.57**   *P*   *L*   **# 90490**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-714*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-114

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.57**   *P*   *L*   **# 90491**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-715*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-114

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.57**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90486**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-710*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-114

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.57**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90489**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-713*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-114

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90492**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-716*

The dark line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the table has completed. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy

Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-116

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90493**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-717*

The table is continued, but there is no continuation note.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the table continuation variable.
DVJ1-116

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90497**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-721*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-116

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90498**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-722*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-116

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90495**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-719*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-116

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90499**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-723*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  SC is an abbreviation for self clearing
DVJ1-116

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90494**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-718*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-116

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90496**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-720*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-116

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.17** *P* *L* **#** **90508**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-732*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.17** *P* *L* **#** **90510**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-734*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read onlyh
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90506**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-730*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90509**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-733*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90507**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-731*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90505**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-729*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90514**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-738*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-119

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90513**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-737*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-119

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90511**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-735*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-119

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90512**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-736*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-119

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90516**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-740*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-119

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.18**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90515**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-739*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-119

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.19**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90520**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-744*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-120

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.19**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90521**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-745*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-120

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.19** *P* *L* **#** **90522**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-746*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-120

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.19** *P* *L* **#** **90517**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-741*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-120

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.19** *P* *L* **#** **90518**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-742*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-120

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.19** *P* *L* **#** **90519**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-743*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-120

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.20** *P* *L* **#** **90525**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-749*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-121

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.20** *P* *L* **#** **90523**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-747*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-121

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 99 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.20**

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.20** *P* *L* **#** **90524**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-748*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-121

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.20** *P* *L* **#** **90527**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-751*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-121

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.20** *P* *L* **#** **90528**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-752*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-121

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.20** *P* *L* **#** **90526**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-750*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-121

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.21** *P* *L* **#** **90529**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-753*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.21** *P* *L* **#** **90531**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-755*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 100 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.3.21**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.21**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90533**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-757*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.21**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90532**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-756*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.21**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90530**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-754*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90534**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-758*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90536**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-760*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90537**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-761*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90538**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-762*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.22**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90535**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-759*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-122

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.23**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90543**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-767*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-123

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.23**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90541**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-765*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-123

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.23**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90542**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-766*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-123

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.23**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90539**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-763*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-123

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.23**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90540**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-764*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-123

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.24**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90546**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-770*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.24**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90545**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-769*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.24**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90544**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-768*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-123

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.24**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90548**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-772*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.24**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90547**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-771*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.25**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90551**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-775*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.25**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90550**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-774*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.25**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90552**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-776*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.25**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90553**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-777*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.25**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90549**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-773*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-124

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.26**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90555**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-779*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-125

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.26**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90558**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-782*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-125

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.26**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90554**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-778*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-125

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.26**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90556**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-780*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-125

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.26**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90557**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-781*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-125

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.27**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90564**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-788*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-126

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.27**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90562**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-786*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-126

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 105 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.27**

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.27**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90560**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-784*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-125

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.27**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90561**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-785*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-125

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.27**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90559**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-783*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-125

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.27**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90563**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-787*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-126

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.28**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90566**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-790*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-126

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.28**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90565**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　*DVJ-789*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-126

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 106 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.28**

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.28**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90569**

David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-793*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
　NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-126

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.28**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90568**

David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-792*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-126

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.28**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90567**

David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-791*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-126

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90504**

David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-728*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90501**

David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-725*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90500**

David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-724*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-117

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 107 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.3.4**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90503**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-727*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90502**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-726*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-118

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90573**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-797*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-127

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90570**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-794*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-127

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90571**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-795*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-127

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90572**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-796*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-127

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **90574**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-798*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-127

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **90575**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-799*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  SC is an abbreviation for self clearing
DVJ1-127

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **90576**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-800*
An s in isolation is confusing, particularly given the use of s for other purposes, as in book(s) or s in equations (see 63B.3.1). There is no need to abbreviate here, as there are no table width constraints or figure boxes that mandate conservation of horizontal space.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>seconds
DVJ1-128

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.10** *P* *L* **#** **90614**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-838*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.10** *P* *L* **#** **90617**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-841*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.10** *P* *L* **#** **90616**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-840*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 109 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.10**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.10**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90612**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-836*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.10**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90613**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-837*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.10**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90615**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-839*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90621**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-845*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-136

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90618**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-842*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90620**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-844*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90622**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-846*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-136

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90619**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-843*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-135

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90623**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-847*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as
variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-136

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90626**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-850*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-136

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90627**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-851*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
  MW is an abbreviation for multi-word
DVJ1-136

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90624**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-848*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-136

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.12**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90625**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-849*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-136

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90629**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-853*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-137

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90632**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-856*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-137

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90628**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-852*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-136

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90631**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-855*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-137

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.13**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90630**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-854*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-137

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90578**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-802*

This description is too vague. The ambiguity of 802 definitions has recently general several maintenance requests. Folks don't even use these things, or hope to get a symmetric number, since they are so poorly defined.

SuggestedRemedy

An accurate definition, with specific bit mappings is required by the IEEE/RAC.
You can look for specific illustrations from their on-line tutorials (ok, but somewhat underdone), or check out the latest P802.17 draft (preferred), to see what level of graphic detail is desired.
DVJ1-128

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate. 22.2.4.3.1 has the exact format

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90579**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-803*

The value of zero is owned by Xerox and cannot be used to represent a null value.

SuggestedRemedy

Use something else to represent a null value.
DVJ1-128

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate. 22.2.4.3.1 has the exact format

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90577**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-801*

This description runs counter to the IEEE/RAC policy.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use all 24 bits of the OUI, plus a minimum of one additional byte, for a context dependent identifier.
    Also, provide a well defined definition of "context" throughout this draft, so that its meaning is clear to any
    number assignment service, operating within a company, the LMSC, or the MSC.
2) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which is easier to maintain context (there is none) and can be derived from an IAB.
3) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which can be purchased from independent suppliers, several magnitudes cheaper.
DVJ1-128

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate. 22.2.4.3.1 has the exact format

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90580**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-804*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-129

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90584**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-808*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-129

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90581**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-805*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-129

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90583**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-807*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-129

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90582**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-806*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-129

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90585**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-809*
This description runs counter to the IEEE/RAC policy.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use all 24 bits of the OUI, plus a minimum of one additional byte, for a context dependent identifier.
   Also, provide a well defined definition of "context" throughout this draft, so that its meaning is clear to any
   number assignment service, operating within a company, the LMSC, or the MSC.
2) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which is easier to maintain context (there is none) and can be derived from an IAB.
3) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which can be purchased from independent suppliers, several magnitudes cheaper.
DVJ1-129

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.   REJECT - The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate. 22.2.4.3.1 has the exact format

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.5** *P* *L* **#** **90586**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-810*

This description is too vague. The ambiguity of 802 definitions has recently general several maintenance requests. Folks don't even use these things, or hope to get a symmetric number, since they are so poorly defined.

SuggestedRemedy

An accurate definition, with specific bit mappings is required by the IEEE/RAC.
You can look for specific illustrations from their on-line tutorials (ok, but somewhat underdone), or check out the latest P802.17 draft (preferred), to see what level of graphic detail is desired.
DVJ1-130

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.   REJECT - The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate. 22.2.4.3.1 has the exact format

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.5** *P* *L* **#** **90587**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-811*

The value of zero is owned by Xerox and cannot be used to represent a null value.

SuggestedRemedy

Use something else to represent a null value.
DVJ1-130

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.   REJECT - The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate. 22.2.4.3.1 has the exact format

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.6** *P* *L* **#** **90590**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-814*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-130

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.6** *P* *L* **#** **90589**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-813*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-130

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.6** *P* *L* **#** **90591**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-815*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-130

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.6.6** *P* *L* **#** **90592**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-816*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-130

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90593**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-817*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-130

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90588**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-812*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-130

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90598**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-822*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-132

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90597**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-821*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-132

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90595**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-819*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-131

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90599**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-823*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  RO is an abbreviation for read only
  LH is an abbreviation for latching high
DVJ1-132

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90596**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-820*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-131

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90594**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-818*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-131

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90602**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-826*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90601**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-825*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90603**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-827*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90604**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-828*

Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy

Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90605**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-829*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90600**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-824*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90609**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-833*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-134

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90610**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-834*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-134

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90606**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-830*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90607**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-831*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.9**   *P*   *L*   # **90608**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-832*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-133

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.6.9**   *P*   *L*   # **90611**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-835*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-134

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90636**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-860*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90635**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-859*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-137

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90637**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-861*

List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy

Change initial footnotes to be:
a RO is an abbreviation for read only
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90633**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-857*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-137

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7.2** *P* *L* **#** **90634**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-858*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-137

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7.2.1** *P* *L* **#** **90638**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *DVJ-862*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
==>forward error correction
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7.3** *P* *L* **#** **90639**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-863*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7.3** *P* *L* **#** **90640**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-864*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7.3** *P* *L* **#** **90644**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-868*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7.3** *P* *L* **#** **90643**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-867*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.3**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90642**

David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-866*

The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the right column.
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.3**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90641**

David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-865*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.3.1**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90645**

David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　　*DVJ-869*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>forward error correction
DVJ1-138

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90646**

David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-870*

Field names are not names, but sentence fragements that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-139

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90647**

David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-871*

Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy

==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-139

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90648**

David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-872*

Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy

Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-139

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   U/unsatisfied   Z/withdrawn
Page 121 of 242
Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.7.4**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90649**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-873*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-139

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90650**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-874*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment
is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
  NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-139

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90654**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-878*
The right column is not centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the right column.
DVJ1-140

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90652**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-876*
Values are hidden in verbose text, which acts as a pseudo-column of entries.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Include a distinct value column.
DVJ1-139

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90653**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-877*
Names for enumerated values are text strings, not recognizable enumeration names that
can be differentiated from English words (when used in text), nor parsed legally when
included in C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Use terms, like DISABLED, as shown above.
DVJ1-140

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90655**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-879*
Using the same name for the column heading and entries is confusing and ambiguous
when properties are listed elsewhere. Also, the initials RW are more consistent with
enumeration value notation (ALL_CAPS), as is done for SC.

SuggestedRemedy
Except for the column heading, R/W ==> RW.
DVJ1-140

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7.6** *P* *L* **#** **90656**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-880*
List the notation in separate lines, for clarity. And, avoid the use of =, since on assignment is intended or implied.

SuggestedRemedy
Change initial footnotes to be:
aRW is an abbreviation for read/write
 NR is an abbreviation for non roll-over
DVJ1-140

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.7.6** *P* *L* **#** **90651**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-875*
Field names are not names, but sentence fragments that cause confusion when used as variables within code, equations, pseudo code, or compound English sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case run-together italics words for all new definitions, like the following:
==>reset
==>autoNegotiateEnable
(etc.)
DVJ1-139

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.5** *P* *L* **#** **90657**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-881*
The split between Clause and 45 makes this confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
Put a nonbreaking space in here.
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

Cl **45** *SC* **45.5** *P* *L* **#** **90658**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-882*
The title is too long and will (most likely) overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The text in its present format is inherited from the amended document (802.3ae-2002 or 802.3ak-2004). To maintain harmony with the amended document, the old style has been kept when appropriate.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.5.4.3** *P* *L* **#** **90661**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-885*
These PICS are arbitrarily different from the remainder, for no apparent reason.

SuggestedRemedy
Move the Value/Comment column to the right of the Subclause column.
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45** *SC* **45.5.4.3** *P* *L* **#** **90662**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-886*
The Value/Comment field is blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90660**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-884*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90663**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-887*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90687**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-911*
Many of the Value/Comment cells are blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90688**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-912*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90689**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-913*
The dark line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the table has completed. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

---

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.15**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90685**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-909*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.15**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90686**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-910*
These PICS are arbitrarily different from the remainder, for no apparent reason.

SuggestedRemedy
Move the Value/Comment column to the right of the Subclause column.
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.16**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90693**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-917*
Many of the Value/Comment cells are blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.16**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90692**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-916*
These PICS are arbitrarily different from the remainder, for no apparent reason.

SuggestedRemedy
Move the Value/Comment column to the right of the Subclause column.
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.16**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90691**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-915*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.16**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90694**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-918*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.17**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　**#** **90699**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　　　*DVJ-923*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-144

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90698**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-922*
Many of the Value/Comment cells are blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-144

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90696**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-920*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-144

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.17**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90697**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-921*
These PICS are arbitrarily different from the remainder, for no apparent reason.

SuggestedRemedy
Move the Value/Comment column to the right of the Subclause column.
DVJ1-144

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90666**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-890*
These PICS are arbitrarily different from the remainder, for no apparent reason.

SuggestedRemedy
Move the Value/Comment column to the right of the Subclause column.
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90665**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-889*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90667**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-891*
The Value/Comment field is blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-141

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 126 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.2**

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.3**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90673**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-897*

The dark line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the table has completed. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy

Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.3**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90669**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-893*

The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center them.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.3**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90670**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-894*

These PICS are arbitrarily different from the remainder, for no apparent reason.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the Value/Comment column to the right of the Subclause column.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.3**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90671**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-895*

Many of the Value/Comment cells are blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.3**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90672**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-896*

The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy

Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

---

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.5**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　**#** **90675**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-899*

The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center them.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has been approved by the ballot group

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 127 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.5.5.5**

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90676**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-900*
These PICS are arbitrarily different from the remainder, for no apparent reason.

SuggestedRemedy
Move the Value/Comment column to the right of the Subclause column.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90677**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-901*
Many of the Value/Comment cells are blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90682**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-906*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90681**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-905*
Many of the Value/Comment cells are blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90680**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-904*
These PICS are arbitrarily different from the remainder, for no apparent reason.

SuggestedRemedy
Move the Value/Comment column to the right of the Subclause column.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90679**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-903*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-142

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. REJECT - The suggested change is editorial and refers to the style that has
been approved by the ballot group

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.5.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90683**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-907*

The dark line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the table has completed. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy

Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-143

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. REJECT - This formating issue is expected to be addressed by the IEEE Staff Editor

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90706**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-930*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>control
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90707**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-931*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>physical layers
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90708**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-932*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>physical medium dependent
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90709**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-933*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>passive optical networks
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90710**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-934*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>reconciliation
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90712**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-936*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>P2P topologies
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90705
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-929*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>media access control.
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90713
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-937*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be 10 or 12 point.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This is consistant with other similar diagrams.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90711
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-935*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>operations, administration, and maintenance
DVJ1-149

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90715
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-939*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>physical medium attachment
DVJ1-150

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90714
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-938*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>optical network units
DVJ1-150

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90716
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-940*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>multi-point
DVJ1-150

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90717
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-941*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>control protocol
DVJ1-150

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** 90718
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-942*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>optical line terminall
DVJ1-150

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90719**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-943*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>reconciliation sublayer
DVJ1-151

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90720**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-944*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>clientl
DVJ1-151

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90723**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-947*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>upstreaml
DVJ1-151

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90721**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-945*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>physical layer
DVJ1-151

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90725**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-949*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>passive optical network downstream
DVJ1-151

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90722**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-946*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>bidirectional
DVJ1-151

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90724**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-948*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>downstreaml
DVJ1-151

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90726**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-950*
The Rate, Nominal, and Clause columns should be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-152

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 131 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90727**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-951*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
==> Nominal reach.
DVJ1-152

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90728**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-952*
Blank cells cannot be easily differentiated from TBDs, which they represent elsewhere in
this draft (subclause numbers that have not yet been specified, for example).

SuggestedRemedy
==> Place an em dash in these cells.
DVJ1-152

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text. Consistent with previous tables.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90730**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-954*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct, as shown above.
DVJ1-154

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, this is the proper name
of the subclause.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90731**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-955*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>operations, administration, and maintenance
DVJ1-154

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, this is the proper name
of the subclause.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90732**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-956*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>link aggregation
DVJ1-155

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, this is the proper name
of the subclause as defined in Clause 43.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90733**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-957*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>control
DVJ1-155

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, this is the proper name
of the subclause as defined in Clause 31.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.1.5.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90734**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-958*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>discoveryl
DVJ1-155

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, this usage is consistent in 1.4 and the balance of 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.1.5.3**   *P*   *L*   # **90735**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-959*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>flow control
DVJ1-156

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, this is the proper name of the subclause as defined in Clause 31.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90736**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-960*
The intermixture of lower-case and ALLCAPS callouts is discouraged by IEEE Style manual.

SuggestedRemedy
Eliminate the ALLCAPS callouts, here and throughout.
DVJ1-156

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, this style is widely used by 802.3.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.11.4**   *P*   *L*   # **90744**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-968*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>discoveryl
DVJ1-167

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-958.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.12**   *P*   *L*   # **90745**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-969*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>unidirectional
DVJ1-168

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90737**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-961*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>link aggregationl
DVJ1-156

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-956.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90738**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-962*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>control
DVJ1-156

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-959.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90739**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-963*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>discovery
DVJ1-157

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-958.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.5.1.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90740**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-964*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-158

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90741**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-965*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>control
DVJ1-161

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, it is the proper name of
the function.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.8.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90743**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-967*

Inconsistent name with respect to the definition.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>Slow_Protocols_Multicast
DVJ1-163

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - despite some inconsistency, no ambiguity exists as to the value of the
address

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.2.8.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90742**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-966*

Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-163

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. In addition, this parameter is
patterned after those in Clause 2.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.3.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90746**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-970*

Bad reference pointer; I can't find the OAMPDU subtype in 802.3-2002 Table 43B-3..

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>Point to appropriate revision (perhaps this one?).
DVJ1-168

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - Annex 43B will be changed concurrently with the publication of 57
thereby avoiding reference issues.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.3.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **90747**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-971*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-168

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.3.1.2** *P* *L* **#** **90748**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-972*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-169

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.3.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **90749**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-973*
What kind of arithmetic is being used? This doesn't appear to be C code, with the illegetimate use of '/' and '=' assignments, and the syntax is unknown to me.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Define the syntax.
2) Delete these lines
DVJ1-172

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the comment is not on changed text. An alias is used to beautify otherwise cluttered state diagrams. Furthermore, the notation used is consistent with IEEE 802.3-2002/Table 21-2.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.3.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **90750**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-974*
This appears to be some abstract define statement, not a message.

SuggestedRemedy
Eliminate here, expand where used.
DVJ1-172

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-974.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.3.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **90751**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-975*
This appears to be some abstract define statement, not a message.

SuggestedRemedy
Eliminate here, expand where used.
DVJ1-172

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-974.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.3.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **90752**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-976*
What kind of code is that? This doesn't appear to be C code.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Define the formal coding style.
2) Delete these lines
DVJ1-172

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-974.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.3.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90753**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-977*
This appears to be some abstract define statement, not a message.

SuggestedRemedy
Eliminate here, expand where used.
DVJ1-172

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-974.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.3.1.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90754**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-978*
An s in isolation is confusing, particularly given the use of s for other purposes, as in book(s) or s in equations (see 63B.3.1). There is no need to abbreviate here, as there are no table width constraints or figure boxes that mandate conservation of horizontal space.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>seconds
DVJ1-173

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. In addition, timers in 802.3 always use an abbreviation for the interval (e.g., s, ms, us, ns, etc.)

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90756**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-980*
Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address.

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-179

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. DA is a well-known abbreviation and is found in D3.2/1.5.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90758**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-982*
This description is too vague. The ambiguity of 802 definitions has recently general several maintenance requests. Folks don't even use these things, or hope to get a symmetric number, since they are so poorly defined.

SuggestedRemedy
An accurate definition, with specific bit mappings is required by the IEEE/RAC.
You can look for specific illustrations from their on-line tutorials (ok, but somewhat underdone), or check out the latest P802.17 draft (preferred), to see what level of graphic detail is desired.
DVJ1-179

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90755**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-979*
No need to mention the SA.

SuggestedRemedy
==>deleted
DVJ1-178

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. In addition, while mention is unnecessary, it is also doesn't hurt either.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90757**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-981*

This description runs counter to the IEEE/RAC policy.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use all 24 bits of the OUI, plus a minimum of one additional byte, for a context dependent identifier.
   Also, provide a well defined definition of "context" throughout this draft, so that its meaning is clear to any
   number assignment service, operating within a company, the LMSC, or the MSC.
2) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which is easier to maintain context (there is none) and can be derived from an IAB.
3) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which can be purchased from independent suppliers, several magnitudes cheaper.
DVJ1-179

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90761**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-985*

Field values should be centered, as should also be done within figures.

SuggestedRemedy

Center the fields, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-180

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90759**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-983*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

Ocetes==>octets, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
DVJ1-180

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90767**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-991*

Too many name aliases:
   DA, destination address, Destination Address, DestinationField, etc. Also, not easy to parse and DA looks like a constant.

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress, here and througout.
DVJ1-181

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90760**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-984*

Too large font.

SuggestedRemedy

Use 8-point font for all text, including "Common…, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
DVJ1-180

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90769**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-993*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-181

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90765**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-989*
Nonstandard font size (I think).

SuggestedRemedy
Use #8 point Arial, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-180

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90773**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-997*
The FCS all caps is confusing, since this has also been listed as an acronym. All caps normally implies a constant value also.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-181

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90772**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-996*
There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, a consistent name for Data/Reserved/PAD, Data/Pad, Data/Reserved/Pad, etc. is desired.

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-181

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90764**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-988*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-180

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90770**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-994*
Vague cross-reference: Slow_Protocols_Type is a constant, not a field value.

SuggestedRemedy
More accurate reference, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-181

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90762**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-986*
Field values are hard to differentiate from numerical values, since its not clear where the field name stops and the number starts. This is particularly true, since special symbols like '=' are not necessarily a demarcation spot, given that the device symbol '/' is actually part of another field name.

SuggestedRemedy
The value for the field should be placed on the right, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-180

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90768**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-992*

Too many name aliases:
    SA, source address, Source Address, etc. Also, not easy to parse and SA looks like a constant.

SuggestedRemedy

==>sourceAddress, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
DVJ1-181

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90766**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-990*

Unclear text; the field name should be on the left, not an unnecessary a-z) listing. Also, the field values cannot be easily cross-referenced later.

SuggestedRemedy

Use a definition-like style, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-181

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90763**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-987*

Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy

Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-180

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. In addition, canonical format is widely used within 802.3.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90771**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-995*

There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence)..

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-181

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90774**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-998*

This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-183

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90781**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1005*

There is no need to capitalize "Information Type" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-184

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90776**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1000*
Too large font.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use 8-point font for all text, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-184

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90775**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-999*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Octets==>octets, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-184

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90786**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1010*
There is no need to capitalize "OAM Configuration" field names, since the capitalization
doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-185

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90789**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1013*
There is no need to capitalize "Vendor Specific Info" field names, since the capitalization
doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-185

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90782**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1006*
There is no need to capitalize "Information Length" field names, since the capitalization
doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-184

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90779**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1003*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a
range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-184

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90791**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1015*

This description is too vague. The ambiguity of 802 definitions has recently general several maintenance requests. Folks don't even use these things, or hope to get a symmetric number, since they are so poorly defined.

SuggestedRemedy

An accurate definition, with specific bit mappings is required by the IEEE/RAC.
You can look for specific illustrations from their on-line tutorials (ok, but somewhat underdone), or check out the latest P802.17 draft (preferred), to see what level of graphic detail is desired.
DVJ1-185

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90777**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1001*

Field values should be centered, as should also be done within figures.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Center the fields, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-184

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90785**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1009*

There is no need to capitalize "State" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-185

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90787**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1011*

There is no need to capitalize "OAMPDU Configuration" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-185

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90790**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1014*

This description runs counter to the IEEE/RAC policy.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use all 24 bits of the OUI, plus a minimum of one additional byte, for a context dependent identifier.
    Also, provide a well defined definition of "context" throughout this draft, so that its meaning is clear to any
    number assignment service, operating within a company, the LMSC, or the MSC.
2) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which is easier to maintain context (there is none) and can be derived from an IAB.
3) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which can be purchased from independent suppliers, several magnitudes cheaper.
DVJ1-185

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **90788**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1012*

There is no need to capitalize "OUI" field names, since this really refers to something else (a specific value assigned by the IEEE, not this specific field).

SuggestedRemedy

Use lower-case and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-185

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90783**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1007*

There is no need to capitalize "OAM Version" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-185

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90780**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1004*

Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-184

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90778**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1002*

Field values are hard to differentiate from numerical values, since its not clear where the field name stops and the number starts. This is particularly true, since special symbols like '=' are not necessarily a demarcation spot, given that the device symbol '/' is actually part of another field name.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) The value for the field should be placed in a note, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-184

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.1**   *P* **192**   *L* **01**   # **99319**
James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *D3.0 #735*

The need for uniqueness of an OUI based identifier is best met by utilizing the EUI-48 or EUI-64 definitions, so that each organization doesn't have to understand the context when assigning such numbers to the requesting division.

SuggestedRemedy

Revise the OUI and Vendor Specific Information field to be either 48-bit or 64-bit fields, defined to be an EUI-48 or EUI-64.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

During the November meeting of the RAC (see notes below) the following decisions were established.

- - -

INSTITUTE OF ELECTRICAL AND ELECTRONIC ENGINEERS
REGISTRATION AUTHORITY COMMITTEE (RAC)

INTERIM MEETING MINUTES
From: 13 November 2003
Location: Hyatt Regency Albuquerque
Boardroom North
330 Tijeras
Albuquerque, New Mexico

Decision 111303 RAC-04: EUI-48 and 64-bit identifiers are appropriate for instance identification.

Decision 111303 RAC-05: Protocol identifiers in addition to 48 and 64 bits are acceptable to use an OUI followed by N Octet, subject to the constraint for the expected consumption rate, the number space can never be consumed.

- - -

The combination of the OUI and Vendor Specific Information fields does not constitute a unique 56-bit identifier.

The purpose of the Vendor Specific Information field is not instance identification, but rather class identification.

The meaning of the bits in the Vendor Specific Information field is out of scope.

The Vendor Specific Information field _may_ be used to differentiate amongst a vendor's product models and versions. It is not a serial number or anything like unto a serial number.

See also response to comment #737.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* **192** *L* **01** *#* **99318**
James, David JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *D3.0 #736*

In many cases (often 802 related), the ordering of bits in the OUI is rather ambiguous. As such, the IEEE/RAC requires that standards clearly define the mappings of an example hex field, as is done in the online tutorials.

SuggestedRemedy

Show a clear example of how the OUI is mapped, using an hex example.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add a bullet to 57.4.1 to read:

"The bit/octet ordering of any OUI field within an OAMPDU is identical to the bit/octet ordering of the OUI portion of the DA/SA. Additional detail defining the format of OUIs can be found in IEEE Std 802-2001 Clause 9."

Modify Figure 57-14 by removing the bit ordering example.

Modify Table 57-10 by removing the second sentence.

Modify other references as appropriate.

Remove other references to 802-2001 Clause 9.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* **196** *L* **16** *#* **99320**
James, David JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *D3.0 #737*

The need for uniqueness of an OUI based identifier is best met by utilizing the EUI-48 or EUI-64 definitions, so that each organization doesn't have to understand the context when assigning such numbers to the requesting division.

SuggestedRemedy

Revise the OUI and following data, so that this starts with an EUI-48 or EUI-64 value. Otherwise, multi-division organizations will have to define their own subparsing conventions, which is prone to error (some have already happened with Japanese vendors and parts of 1394/AVC that do this type of thing).

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

Governance of the internal behavior of multi-division organizations is entirely out of scope of the IEEE standards activities.

See also response to comment #735.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* **196** *L* **24** *#* **99321**
James, David JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *D3.0 #738*

The IEEE/RAC defines OUIs as HEX values. Given the confusion between leftmost being first, or the first transmitted bit being first, any descriptions in terms of bits and/or bit ordering should be removed.

SuggestedRemedy

Eliminate the binary text: the hex values are sufficient.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #736, which removes the bit ordering example.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* **197** *L* **40** *#* **99322**
James, David JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *D3.0 #739*

Given the inconsistencies/ambiguities of the OUI definitions within 802.3, any definition should be self-contained, not cross referencing something else.

SuggestedRemedy

Eliminate the OUI cross reference to:

found in IEEE Std 802-2001 Clause 9.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

See comment #736, which moves the reference to 802-2001 Clause 9 to 57.4.1.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* **199** *L* **23** *#* **99323**
James, David JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *D3.0 #740*

In many cases (often 802 related), the ordering of bits in the OUI is rather ambiguous. As such, the IEEE/RAC requires that standards clearly define the mappings of an example hex field, as is done in the online tutorials.

SuggestedRemedy

Show a figure with the classical HEX-value example.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Remove second sentence. Also, see #736.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.1** *P* **200** *L* **09** **#** **99324**

James, David   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *D3.0 #741*

In many cases (often 802 related), the ordering of bits in the OUI is rather ambiguous. As such, the IEEE/RAC requires that standards clearly define the mappings of an example hex field, as is done in the online tutorials.

SuggestedRemedy

Show a figure with the classical HEX-value example.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #736, which removes bit ordering examples of OUIs.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **90805**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1029*

There is no need to capitalize "Event Running Total" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-187

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **90795**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1019*

Field values are hard to differentiate from numerical values, since its not clear where the field name stops and the number starts. This is particularly true, since special symbols like '=' are not necessarily a demarcation spot, given that the device symbol '/' is actually part of another field name.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) The value for the field should be placed in a note, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-186

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **90792**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1016*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Octets==>octets, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-186

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **90794**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1018*

Field values should be centered, as should also be done within figures.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Center the fields, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-186

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.4.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **90796**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1020*

Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-186

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90797**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1021*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-186

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90798**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1022*
There is no need to capitalize "Event Type" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-186

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90799**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1023*
There is no need to capitalize "Event Length" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-187

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90800**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1024*
There is no need to capitalize "Event Time Stamp" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-187

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90801**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1025*
There is no need to capitalize "Window" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-187

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90802**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1026*
There is no need to capitalize "Threshold" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-187

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**　　*SC* **57.4.3.2**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90803**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1027*
There is no need to capitalize "Errors" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occasions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-187

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**　　*SC* **57.4.3.2**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90793**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1017*
Too large font.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use 8-point font for all text, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-186

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**　　*SC* **57.4.3.2**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90804**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1028*
There is no need to capitalize "Error Running Total" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occasions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-187

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**　　*SC* **57.4.3.3**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90807**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1031*
Too large font.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use 8-point font for all text, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-188

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - Font size is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**　　*SC* **57.4.3.3**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90813**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1037*
There is no need to capitalize "Variable Leaf" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occasions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-188

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**　　*SC* **57.4.3.3**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90806**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1030*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Octets==>octets, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-188

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - Octets is consistent with other uses throughout Clause 57.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 146 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **57**　　*SC* **57.4.3.3**

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90812**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1036*
There is no need to capitalize "Variable Branch" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-188

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90811**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1035*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-188

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90810**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1034*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-188

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90808**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1032*
Field values should be centered, as should also be done within figures.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Center the fields, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-188

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - Field centering is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90809**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1033*
Field values are hard to differentiate from numerical values, since its not clear where the field name stops and the number starts. This is particularly true, since special symbols like '=' are not necessarily a demarcation spot, given that the device symbol '/' is actually part of another field name.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) The value for the field should be placed in a note, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-188

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - Format of name/value of fields is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90817**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1041*
Field values are hard to differentiate from numerical values, since its not clear where the field name stops and the number starts. This is particularly true, since special symbols like '=' are not necessarily a demarcation spot, given that the device symbol '/' is actually part of another field name.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) The value for the field should be placed in a note, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-189

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - Format of name/value of fields is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90814**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1038*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Octets==>octets, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-189

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Octets is consistent with other uses throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90815**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1039*
Too large font.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use 8-point font for all text, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-189

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Font size is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90816**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1040*
Field values should be centered, as should also be done within figures.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Center the fields, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-189

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Field centering is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90823**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1047*
There is no need to capitalize "Value" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-190

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90818**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1042*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-189

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90819**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1043*

Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-189

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90820**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1044*

There is no need to capitalize "Branch" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-190

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90822**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1046*

There is no need to capitalize "Width" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-190

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90821**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1045*

There is no need to capitalize "Leaf" field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy

Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-190

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90826**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1050*

Field values should be centered, as should also be done within figures.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Center the fields, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-191

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Field centering is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90827**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1051*

Field values are hard to differentiate from numerical values, since its not clear where the field name stops and the number starts. This is particularly true, since special symbols like '=' are not necessarily a demarcation spot, given that the device symbol '/' is actually part of another field name.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) The value for the field should be placed in a note, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-191

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - Format of name/value of fields is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90825**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1049*
Too large font.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use 8-point font for all text, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-191

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Font size is consistent with other
OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90829**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1053*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a
range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-191

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90830**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1054*
There is no need to capitalize "OAM Remote Loopback command" field names, since the
capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).

SuggestedRemedy
Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-191

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90824**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1048*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Octets==>octets, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-191

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Octets is consistent with other uses
throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90828**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1052*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a
range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-191

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90833**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1057*
Field values should be centered, as should also be done within figures.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Center the fields, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-193

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Field centering is consistent with other
OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90832**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1056*
Too large font.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use 8-point font for all text, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-193

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Font size is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90840**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1064*
The value of zero is owned by Xerox and cannot be used to represent a null value.

SuggestedRemedy
Use something else to represent a null value.
DVJ1-194

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Furthermore, the value zero is not defined as a null value.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90837**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1061*
There is no need to capitalize "OUI" field names, since the capitalization has specific other meanings, defined by the IEEE/RAC.

SuggestedRemedy
Use lower-case and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-193

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90834**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1058*
Field values are hard to differentiate from numerical values, since its not clear where the field name stops and the number starts. This is particularly true, since special symbols like '=' are not necessarily a demarcation spot, given that the device symbol '/' is actually part of another field name.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) The value for the field should be placed in a note, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-193

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - Format of name/value of fields is consistent with other OAMPDU figures throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90836**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1060*
Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-193

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90831**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1055*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Octets==>octets, as done in changed illustration, here and throughout.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-193

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Octets is consistent with other uses throughout Clause 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90839**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1063*

This description is too vague. The ambiguity of 802 definitions has recently general several maintenance requests. Folks don't even use these things, or hope to get a symmetric number, since they are so poorly defined.

SuggestedRemedy

An accurate definition, with specific bit mappings is required by the IEEE/RAC.
You can look for specific illustrations from their on-line tutorials (ok, but somewhat underdone), or check out the latest P802.17 draft (preferred), to see what level of graphic detail is desired.
DVJ1-194

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90835**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1059*

Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
2) Use this new illustration.
DVJ1-193

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - see comment DVJ-987

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.4.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90838**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1062*

This description runs counter to the IEEE/RAC policy.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use all 24 bits of the OUI, plus a minimum of one additional byte, for a context dependent identifier.
    Also, provide a well defined definition of "context" throughout this draft, so that its meaning is clear to any
    number assignment service, operating within a company, the LMSC, or the MSC.
2) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which is easier to maintain context (there is none) and can be derived from an IAB.
3) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which can be purchased from independent suppliers, several magnitudes cheaper.
DVJ1-194

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.5.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90841**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1065*

This description runs counter to the IEEE/RAC policy.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use all 24 bits of the OUI, plus a minimum of one additional byte, for a context dependent identifier.
    Also, provide a well defined definition of "context" throughout this draft, so that its meaning is clear to any
    number assignment service, operating within a company, the LMSC, or the MSC.
2) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which is easier to maintain context (there is none) and can be derived from an IAB.
3) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which can be purchased from independent suppliers, several magnitudes cheaper.
DVJ1-195

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.5.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90842**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1066*

This description is too vague. The ambiguity of 802 definitions has recently general several maintenance requests. Folks don't even use these things, or hope to get a symmetric number, since they are so poorly defined.

SuggestedRemedy

An accurate definition, with specific bit mappings is required by the IEEE/RAC.
You can look for specific illustrations from their on-line tutorials (ok, but somewhat underdone), or check out the latest P802.17 draft (preferred), to see what level of graphic detail is desired.
DVJ1-195

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.5.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90843**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1067*

The value of zero is owned by Xerox and cannot be used to represent a null value.

SuggestedRemedy

Use something else to represent a null value.
DVJ1-195

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Furthermore, the value zero is not defined as a null value.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.5.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90844**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1068*

This description runs counter to the IEEE/RAC policy.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Use all 24 bits of the OUI, plus a minimum of one additional byte, for a context dependent identifier.
    Also, provide a well defined definition of "context" throughout this draft, so that its meaning is clear to any
    number assignment service, operating within a company, the LMSC, or the MSC.
2) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which is easier to maintain context (there is none) and can be derived from an IAB.
3) Use an EUI-48 identifier, which can be purchased from independent suppliers, several magnitudes cheaper.
DVJ1-196

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.5.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90845**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1069*

This description is too vague. The ambiguity of 802 definitions has recently general several maintenance requests. Folks don't even use these things, or hope to get a symmetric number, since they are so poorly defined.

SuggestedRemedy

An accurate definition, with specific bit mappings is required by the IEEE/RAC.
You can look for specific illustrations from their on-line tutorials (ok, but somewhat underdone), or check out the latest P802.17 draft (preferred), to see what level of graphic detail is desired.
DVJ1-196

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.5.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90846**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1070*
The value of zero is owned by Xerox and cannot be used to represent a null value.

SuggestedRemedy
Use something else to represent a null value.
DVJ1-196

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text. Furthermore, the value zero is not defined as a null value.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.5.3.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90847**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1071*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>media access control
DVJ1-201

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.6.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90848**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1072*
The shorthand notation in the title is confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
Clarify by listing each variable distinctively, as shown above.
DVJ1-205

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - comment is not on changed text.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90850**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1074*
The title is too long and will (most likely) overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-206

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal title for the PICS section

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90849**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1073*
The split between Clause and 45 makes this confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
Put a nonbreaking space in here.
DVJ1-206

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - the draft does not have a split between clause and 57.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90853**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1077*
Many of the Value/Comment cells are blank and useless.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Place appropriate content within this cell.
2) Add a note: "TBD: Will be defined in the followon maintenance cycle".
DVJ1-206

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS table format

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90852**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1076*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-206

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS table format

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90854**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1078*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Correct as shown above.
DVJ1-206

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the name of the subclause and follows 802.3 practice.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90857**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1081*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS table format

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90858**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1082*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. AIP - IEEE staff editor will fix pagination, orphan rows of PICS tables

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90855**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1079*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Correct as shown above.
DVJ1-206

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT. Accept

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90860**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1084*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90861**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1085*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90866**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *DVJ-1090*

The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy

Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. AIP - IEEE staff editor will fix pagination, orphan rows of PICS tables

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90865**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1089*

The PDU8 & PDU9 entries are not subclauses, as the header indicates..

SuggestedRemedy

Make these have two-line entries, like below:
    x.x.x
(Table 57-6)
That is more convenient for the reader, and the column is thus properly labeled.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format. Cross-references include subclauses, tables and figures.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90864**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1088*

The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy

Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90863**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1087*

The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center them.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90869**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1093*

The LIT8 entries are not subclauses, as the header indicates..

SuggestedRemedy

Make these have two-line entries, like below:
    x.x.x
(Table 57-8)
That is more convenient for the reader, and the column is thus properly labeled.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format. Cross-references include subclauses, tables and figures.

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90868**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1092*

The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy

Center them.
DVJ1-207

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57** *SC* **57.7.3.5** *P* *L* **#** **90871**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1095*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57** *SC* **57.7.3.7** *P* *L* **#** **90873**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1097*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57** *SC* **57.7.4** *P* *L* **#** **90875**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1099*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57** *SC* **57.7.4** *P* *L* **#** **90876**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1100*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57** *SC* **57.7.4** *P* *L* **#** **90877**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1101*
The ET7 subclause cell is not a subclause, as the header indicates..

SuggestedRemedy
Make these have two-line entries, like below:
x.x.x
(Table 57-12)
That is more convenient for the reader, and the column is thus properly labeled.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format. Cross-references include subclauses, tables and figures.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.7.5** *P* *L* **#** **90881**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1105*
The VAR7 subclause cell is not a subclause, as the header indicates..

SuggestedRemedy
Make these have two-line entries, like below:
x.x.x
(Table 57-16)
That is more convenient for the reader, and the column is thus properly labeled.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format. Cross-references include subclauses, tables and figures.

Cl **57** *SC* **57.7.5** *P* *L* **#** **90879**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1103*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **57**   *SC* **57.7.5**   *P*   *L*   # **90880**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1104*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-208

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Reject - this is the normal PICS format

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.**   *P*   *L*   # **90883**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1107*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-210

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.1**   *P* **218**   *L* **9**   # **99331**
Booth, Brad   Intel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *BB D3.0 #780*
Sentence is very disjointed and needs better clarification.

SuggestedRemedy
Change second sentence of paragraph to read:
A 100BASE-LX10 and 100BASE-BX10 PHY (physical layer) device is a combination of a
100BASE-X PCS and PMA with the respective PMD. If the optional OAM is being used,
the 100BASE-X PCS and PMA in Clause 66 shall be integrated; otherwise, the Clause 24
100BASE-X PCS and PMA shall be integrated. The management functions may be
accessible through the optional Management Interface.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
As this is a PMD clause, a shall is not appropriate in this context.
The second sentence will be changed to:
A PMD is connected to the 100BASE-X PMA of Clause 24 or the 100BASE-X PMA of 66.1,
and to the medium through the MDI. A PMD is optionally combined with the management
functions that may be accessible through the management interface defined in Clause 22
or by other means.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.1**   *P* **252**   *L* **8**   # **815**
Grow, Robert   Intel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**
I agree with unsatisfied D3.1 comment #558.

SuggestedRemedy
Implement a complete specification of the components of a port, if not in the location
recommend by #558, in some other clause.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

This comment supports an unresolved negative comment
from a previous ballot. The concensus of the ballot group
is to leave the text unchanged. No further action is required.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.1**   *P* **252**   *L* **8**   # **99354**
Booth, Brad   Intel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *D3.1 #558 Three clauses*
The response for D3.0 comments #780, 786 and 787 cause me some concern. The
response states that "As this is a PMD clause, a shall is not appropriate in this context."
Considering all other 100BASE-X and 1000BASE-X PMDs use shalls in this context, the
response is very misleading. In looking through D3.1, I have found no compliance
statement related to the port types associated with the PMD. There is nothing within this
draft that mandates which PCS/PMA shall be used by the Clause 58, 59 and 60 PMDs to
create a compliant port type.

SuggestedRemedy
Reconsider the responses to comments #780, 786 and 787 in D3.0.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Each one of the clauses 58, 59, and 60, defines only the PMD not a complete port and
cannot make requirements outside the PMD.
Will refer to PMA in 66, where option to be identical to clause 24, and connection to PCS,
will be found.
Clauses 56 and 66 make it very clear what is needed to build a port.
Change "A PMD is connected to the 100BASE-X PMA of Clause 24 or the 100BASE-X
PMA of 66.1," to "A PMD is connected to the 100BASE-X PMA of 66.1,".
Similarly in 59 and 60. Remove 59.10.3 and 60.10.3 PICS "PCS". In 60.1, change
"appropriate 1000BASE-X PMA of Clause 66" to "appropriate 1000BASE-X PMA of Clause
65".

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90903**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1127*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-233

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90902**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1126*
The "Clause" and "58" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-233

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90904**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1128*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>medium dependent
DVJ1-233

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90906**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1130*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-233

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90908**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1132*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-233

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90910**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1134*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-234

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90912**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1136*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-234

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90914**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1138*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-234

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 159 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **58**   *SC* **58.10.2.3**

Cl **58**　　*SC* **58.10.2.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90916**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1140*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-234

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**　　*SC* **58.10.2.5**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90918**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1142*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-234

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**　　*SC* **58.10.2.5**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90919**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1143*
The comma's are unnecessary in the Subclause column, since they are vertically listed..

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-234

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**　　*SC* **58.10.2.6**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90921**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1145*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-234

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**　　*SC* **58.10.2.7**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90923**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1147*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-235

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**　　*SC* **58.10.2.7**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90924**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1148*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-235

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**　　*SC* **58.10.2.7**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90925**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1149*
The PDU8 & PDU9 entries are not subclauses, as the header indicates..

SuggestedRemedy
Make these have two-line entries, like below:
　x.x.x
(Table 57-6)
That is more convenient for the reader, and the column is thus properly labeled.
DVJ1-235

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is actually against Clause 57.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90884**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1108*
Excess space.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, delete the space after the em dash.
DVJ1-213

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90885**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1109*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily)
imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other
published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix
them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-214

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90886**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1110*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily)
imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other
published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix
them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-214

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90887**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1111*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>control
DVJ1-214

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The comment is on non-existent text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90891**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1115*
Use distinct rows when necessary; don't hide this from the reader.

SuggestedRemedy
=>split these rows.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90888**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1112*
Don't intermix two table rows, this confuses the reader

SuggestedRemedy
=>add this distinct column

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90895**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1119*
This title line seems strange

SuggestedRemedy
=>retitle this as "parameter".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58** *SC* **58.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90894**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1118*
This title line seems strange.

SuggestedRemedy
=>retitle this as "parameter".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58** *SC* **58.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90893**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1117*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-215

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58** *SC* **58.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90892**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1116*
Mbd is not a well known standard term (perhaps mega-baud?)

SuggestedRemedy
describe this in a footnote!

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58** *SC* **58.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90889**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1113*
Use distinct rows when necessary; don't hide this from the reader.

SuggestedRemedy
=>split these rows.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58** *SC* **58.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **90890**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1114*
Use distinct rows when necessary; don't hide this from the reader

SuggestedRemedy
=>split these rows.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58** *SC* **58.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90896**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1120*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-216

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.7.1.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90897**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1121*
This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc..

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-218

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.7.1.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90898**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1122*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-218

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.7.1.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90899**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1123*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-219

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.7.11.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90900**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1124*
Should be using alphabetic characters when making lists, not kludge with 2nd level indent.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>a), b), ...l
DVJ1-229

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **58**   *SC* **58.9.4**   *P*   *L*   # **90901**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1125*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>Medium dependent interface
DVJ1-232

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.**   *P*   *L*   # **90927**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1151*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct, as shown above.
DVJ1-236

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.1** *P* **256** *L* **7** *#* **99335**
Booth, Brad   Intel

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *BB D3.0 #786*
Second sentence of second paragraph is very disjointed.

SuggestedRemedy
Change second sentence of paragraph to read:
A 1000BASE-LX10 and 1000BASE-BX10 PHY (physical layer) device is a combination of a
1000BASE-X PCS and PMA with the respective PMD. If the optional OAM is being used,
the 1000BASE-X PCS and PMA in Clause 66 shall be integrated; otherwise, the Clause 36
1000BASE-X PCS and PMA shall be integrated. The management functions may be
accessible through the optional Management Interface.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

As this is a PMD clause, a shall is not appropriate in this context.
The second sentence will be changed to:
A PMD is connected to the 1000BASE-X PMA of Clause 36, and to the medium through
the MDI. A PMD is optionally combined with the management functions that may be
accessible through the management interface defined in Clause 22 or by other means.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.1.4** *P* *L* *#* **90928**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1152*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>medium dependent
DVJ1-237

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.10** *P* *L* *#* **90950**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1174*
The "Clause" and "58" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-250

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.10** *P* *L* *#* **90951**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1175*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-250

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.10.1** *P* *L* *#* **90952**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1176*
The text that referred to Clause 59 was out-of-date.

SuggestedRemedy
Use an explicit cross-reference, to ensure accuracy, as was done above.
(This looks funny now, due to the marked changes, but these will disappear when changes
are finalized.)
DVJ1-250

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.10.2.10** *P* *L* *#* **90971**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1195*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.11**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90973**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1197*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-252

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90954**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1178*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-250

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90956**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1180*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-250

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90959**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1183*
Top-line delimiter is too thick.

SuggestedRemedy
Top of LX4 row ==> very thin.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90958**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1182*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90962**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1186*
Top-line delimiter is too thick.

SuggestedRemedy
Top of BXD3 row ==> very thin.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90961**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1185*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90964**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1188*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90965**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1189*
Top-line delimiter is too thick.

SuggestedRemedy
Top of BXU3 row ==> very thin.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90967**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1191*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.10.2.9**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90969**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1193*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-251

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90929**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1153*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be 10 or 12 point.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point
DVJ1-240

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
change figure font size to be consistent with Figure 60-

Cl **59** *SC* **59.4** *P* *L* **#** **90930**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1154*
Bad line break.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>use nonbreaking hyphen
DVJ1-240

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90932**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1156*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-241

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90933**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1157*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-241

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **90931**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1155*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-240

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.7.1** *P* *L* **#** **90934**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1158*
Vague references to apparent clause numbers.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above.
DVJ1-242

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59** *SC* **59.7.12** *P* *L* **#** **90947**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1171*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>bit error ratio tester
DVJ1-245

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.7.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90946**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1170*
The right three columns should be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-243

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.7.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90935**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1159*
The 1st column looks wrong:
number of octlets is the label but action statements are the entries.

SuggestedRemedy
Clarify.
DVJ1-242

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.7.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90936**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1160*
The right three columns should be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-242

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.7.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90937**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1161*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Binary ==> binary
DVJ1-242

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.7.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90938**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1162*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Number of Octlets==> Number of octlets
DVJ1-242

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.
There also appears to be a typo in the suggested remedy,
as "Octlets" does not appear in the referenced text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.7.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90939**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1163*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily)
imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other
published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix
them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-243

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**　　*SC* **59.7.2**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90942**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1166*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Binary ==> binary
DVJ1-243

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**　　*SC* **59.7.2**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90945**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1169*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Number of Octlets==> Number of octlets
DVJ1-243

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.
There also appears to be a typo in the suggested remedy,
as "Octlets" does not appear in the referenced text.

Cl **59**　　*SC* **59.7.2**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90940**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　*DVJ-1164*
Wrong spelling, base on IEEE Dictionary and preceding table

SuggestedRemedy
Hexa-decimal==> Hexadecimal
DVJ1-243

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT.
Hexa-decimal -> hexadecimal

Cl **59**　　*SC* **59.7.2**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90941**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1165*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Disparity ==> disparity
DVJ1-243

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**　　*SC* **59.7.2**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90944**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1168*
The 1st column looks wrong:
number of octlets is the label but action statements are the entries.

SuggestedRemedy
Clarify.
DVJ1-243

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**　　*SC* **59.7.2**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90943**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1167*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
, Repeat ==> , repeat
DVJ1-243

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.9.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90948**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1172*
   Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be Times.

SuggestedRemedy
   ==>Arial
   DVJ1-247

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **59**   *SC* **59.9.4**   *P*   *L*   # **90949**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1173*
   Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
   As corrected above, ==>dependent interface
   DVJ1-248

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.**   *P*   *L*   # **90975**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1199*
   Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
   Medium Dependent==>medium dependent, if nothing else is changed.
   DVJ1-253

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.**   *P*   *L*   # **90976**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1200*
   Excessive length title: this will cause major problems with auto TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
   ==> PMD sublayer and medium for long wavelength passive optical networks.
   DVJ1-253

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT. This text does not exist. For adding please refer to #226. If added, style
   consistent with existing approved style.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1**   *P*   *L*   # **90977**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1201*
   Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
   Forward Error Correction==>forward error correction
   DVJ1-253

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   REJECT.
   Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1**   *P* **286**   *L* **9**   # **99339**
Booth, Brad   Intel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *BB D3.0 #787*
   Last sentence of first paragraph seems disjointed.

SuggestedRemedy
   Change second sentence of paragraph to read:
   A 1000BASE-PX10-D and 1000BASE-PX10-U PHY (physical layer) device is a
   combination of a 1000BASE-X PCS and PMA with the respective PMD. If the optional
   OAM is being used, the 1000BASE-X PCS and PMA in Clause 66 shall be integrated;
   otherwise, the Clause 36 1000BASE-X PCS and PMA as modified by 65.3 shall be
   integrated. The management functions may be accessible through the optional
   Management Interface.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
   ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   As this is a PMD clause, a shall is not appropriate in this context.
   The second sentence will be changed to:
   A 1000BASE-PX-U PMD or a 1000BASE-PX-D PMD is connected to the appropriate
   1000BASE-X PMA of Clause 66, and to the medium through the MDI. A PMD is optionally
   combined with the management functions that may be accessible through the
   management interface defined in Clause 22 or by other means.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 170 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1**

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90981**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1205*
Merge columns for clarity

SuggestedRemedy
Unstraddle into distinct max/min rows
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90988**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1212*
Excessive capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Downstream=>downstream
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90987**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1211*
Blanks cells look too much like a missprint or editorial error.

SuggestedRemedy
Fill all blank cells with an em dash.
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90978**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1202*
The reader should not be forced to interpolate column or row lines

SuggestedRemedy
Either
1) Swap the order of rows (as illustrated).
2) Don't merge any rows or column, if this forces interpolation.
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90980**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1204*
Merge columns for clarity

SuggestedRemedy
Unstraddle into distinct max/min rows.
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90982**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1206*
Don't intermix units within one row

SuggestedRemedy
Include units in the distinct column
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90983**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1207*
Excessive capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
This is a generic word in this context==>include units in the distinct column
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This text does not exist. For adding please refer to #228. If added, style
consistent with existing approved style.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90985**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1209*
Table rows with one-word values should be centered

SuggestedRemedy
Center this columns
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90986**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1210*
Excessive capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Upstream=>upstream
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90984**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1208*
Table rows with one-word values should be centered

SuggestedRemedy
Center these four columns
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90979**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1203*
Implied columns have been merged.

SuggestedRemedy
Provide a distinct Type column.
DVJ1-254

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90991**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1215*
Figure interrupts the text flow.

SuggestedRemedy
Place figure marker at the end of paragraph, as is normally done.
DVJ1-256

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90989**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1213*
  Inconsistent usage: IEEE Style guide say don't mix all-caps and lowere case

SuggestedRemedy
  Eliminate all caps (except for acronyms) names within the figure
  DVJ1-256

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.2**   *P*   *L*   # **90990**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1214*
  Excessive capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
  Medium ==> medium
  DVJ1-256

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.1.4**   *P*   *L*   # **90992**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1216*
  Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
  Medium Dependent==>medium dependent
  DVJ1-257

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. This text does not exist. For adding please refer to #226. If added, style
  consistent with existing approved style.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10**   *P*   *L*   # **91096**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1320*
  The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
  Make it smaller, as suggested above.
  DVJ1-283

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10**   *P*   *L*   # **91095**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1319*
  The "Clause" and "60" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
  Use a nonbreaking space.
  DVJ1-283

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.1**   *P*   *L*   # **91097**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1321*
  The text that referred to Clause 59 was out-of-date.

SuggestedRemedy
  Use an explicit cross-reference, to ensure accuracy, as was done above.
  DVJ1-283

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91099**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1323*
  These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
  Center them.
  DVJ1-284

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91101**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1325*
  These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
  Center them.
  DVJ1-285

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91103**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1327*
  These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
  Center them.
  DVJ1-286

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91105**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1329*
  The wrapping Status entries are confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
  adjust the column to be slightly wider.
  DVJ1-286

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91104**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1328*
  Use a nonbreaking space to avoid confusion between table names and subclause numbers.

SuggestedRemedy
  Use a nonbreaking space after table.
  DVJ1-286

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91107**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1331*
  These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
  Center them.
  DVJ1-287

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91108**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1332*
Use a nonbreaking space to avoid confusion between table names and subclause numbers.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space after table.
DVJ1-287

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91109**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1333*
The wrapping Status entries are confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
Adjust the column to be slightly wider.
DVJ1-287

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91110**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1334*
The D notation is used in the U specification.

SuggestedRemedy
Change all circled D==>U.
DVJ1-287

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT.
Uppercase D->U in Table 60.10.4.3

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91114**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1338*
The wrapping Status entries are confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
adjust the column to be slightly wider.
DVJ1-288

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91112**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1336*
These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-288

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91113**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1337*
Use a nonbreaking space to avoid confusion between table names and subclause numbers.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space after table.
DVJ1-288

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 175 of 242
Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.4**

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91118**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1342*
The wrapping Status entries are confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
adjust the column to be slightly wider.
DVJ1-289

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91116**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1340*
These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-289

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91117**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1341*
Use a nonbreaking space to avoid confusion between table names and subclause numbers.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space after table.
DVJ1-289

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91120**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1344*
These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-290

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91122**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1346*
These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-290

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.10.4.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91125**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1349*
These rows should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-291

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.2.3**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90994**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1218*
　The font within figures should be 8-point Arial, not Times (or whatever was used).

SuggestedRemedy
　Change font to Arial.
　DVJ1-259

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
　REJECT.
　Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.2.3**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90997**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1221*
　Signal names are hard to identify, since multiple conflicting conventions are used.

SuggestedRemedy
　Signal_Detect ==>signalDetect, here and throughout
　DVJ1-259

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
　REJECT.
　Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.2.3**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90993**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1217*
　Excessive capitalization; capitalize only the first word of a heading.

SuggestedRemedy
　Cord==>cord.
　DVJ1-259

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
　REJECT.
　Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.2.3**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90999**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1223*
　Excessive capitalization; capitalize only the first word of a heading.

SuggestedRemedy
　Bulkheads==>bulkheads.
　DVJ1-259

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
　REJECT.
　Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.2.3**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90998**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1222*
　Excessive capitalization; capitalize only the first word of a heading.

SuggestedRemedy
　Channel==>channel.
　DVJ1-259

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
　REJECT.
　Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.2.3**　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **90995**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1219*
　Signal names are hard to identify, since multiple conflicting conventions are used.

SuggestedRemedy
　Tx_Enable ==>txEnable, here and throughout
　DVJ1-259

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
　REJECT.
　Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **90996**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1220*
The font size within figures should be 8-point Arial, as per IEEE Style Guide.

SuggestedRemedy
Change font to 8-point, and also Arial, here and throughout.
DVJ1-259

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.2.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91003**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1227*
Excessive and inconsistent capitalization; table capitalization is correct and different.

SuggestedRemedy
Signal Detect Threshold==>signal detect threshold.
DVJ1-260

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.2.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91000**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1224*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Signal==>signal
DVJ1-260

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.2.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91005**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1229*
The blank cell looks wrong.

SuggestedRemedy
Straddle these two cells.
DVJ1-260

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.2.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91001**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1225*
Columns with only numbers or one word should be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center this column.
DVJ1-260

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.2.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91004**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1228*
Inconsistent table-row reference.

SuggestedRemedy
sensivity==>sensivity OMA.
DVJ1-260

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.
Suggested remedy is technically incorrect.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.2.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91002**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1226*
Signal names are hard to identify, since multiple conflicting conventions are used.

SuggestedRemedy
Signal_Detect ==>signalDetect, here and throughout
DVJ1-260

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91006**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1230*
Excessive length heading

SuggestedRemedy
1000BASE-PX10-D and 1000BASE-PX10-U==>1000BASE-PX10-D/U
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This text does not exist. For adding please refer to #226. If added, style
consistent with existing approved style.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91017**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1241*
Blank cells look like misprint or errors.

SuggestedRemedy
Put em dash in all blank cells, here and throughout.
DVJ1-262

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91012**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1236*
Don't force the reader to visually interpolate column lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Separate this straddled pair of column cells, with replicated value.
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91018**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1242*
Don't use pseudo rows, with adhoc vertical spacing and parenthesis technique.

SuggestedRemedy
Use two rows, as illustrated.
DVJ1-262

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91013**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1237*
Print the bottom line when table splits across pages.

SuggestedRemedy
This is a two-step process:
1) Fix the templates, to draw a very-thin line on bottom of the page.
2) Manually force a thin line on the last line of the table.
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91015**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1239*

Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy

Center this column
DVJ1-262

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91011**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1235*

Gbd is not a well known standard term (perhaps giga-baud?)

SuggestedRemedy

Describe this in a footnote!
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91010**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1234*

Don't intermix two table rows; this confuses the reader.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the distinct "type" column.
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91007**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1231*

The old heading didn't make sense, so a values heading is needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Use a two-rwo heading, straddled as illustrated.
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91014**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1238*

Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy

Center this column
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91008**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1232*

Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy

Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91016**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1240*

Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy

Center this column
DVJ1-262

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 180 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1**

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91020**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1244*
Tpm amd Tpff are really the same, but this is not clear.

SuggestedRemedy
Straddle the rightmost pair of cells, as illustrated..
DVJ1-262

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91009**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1233*
Common vertical cells should be straddled.

SuggestedRemedy
Straddle the dBm cells, as illustrated.
DVJ1-261

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.1** *P* *L* **#** **91019**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1243*
Don't use pseudo rows, with adhoc bracket-sequencing technique.

SuggestedRemedy
Use two rows, as illustrated.
DVJ1-262

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91022**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1246*
Small numbers or words should be centered, as per style guidelines.

SuggestedRemedy
Center these columns.
DVJ1-264

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91027**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1251*
Gbd is not a well known standard term (perhaps giga-baud?)

SuggestedRemedy
Describe this in a footnote!
DVJ1-265

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91033**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1257*
Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
Center this column
DVJ1-265

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91021**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1245*
This heading row is redundant, with no meaning.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete this row, include text "(nm)" at end of table title.
DVJ1-264

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 181 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **60** *SC* **60.3.2**

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91023**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1247*
Bold font seems to imply special meaning, but the meaning is not apparent.

SuggestedRemedy
Use regular text in these columns.
DVJ1-264

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91028**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1252*
Don't force the reader to visually interpolate column lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Separate this straddled pair of column cells, with replicated value.
DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91026**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1250*
Don't intermix two table rows; this confuses the reader.

SuggestedRemedy
Add the distinct "type" column.
DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91031**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1255*
Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy
Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91032**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1256*
Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy
Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91034**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1258*
Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
Center this column
DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91024**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1248*
Blank line looks like a mistake.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Put something in here that helps explain its meaning.
2) Delete this row.
DVJ1-264

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91030**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1254*
    Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy
    Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
    DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91025**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1249*
    Don't force the reader to interpolate row-dividing lines.

SuggestedRemedy
    Unstaddle these column cells and either:
    1) Replicate the cell contents. (preferred)
    2) Use a ditto marker after the first instance.(OK also)
    DVJ1-264

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91035**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1259*
    Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
    Center this column
    DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91036**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1260*
    Merging the two columns makes the reader interpolate the between-column line.

SuggestedRemedy
    Unstraddle the two columns, replicate the cell text.
    DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91029**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1253*
    The old heading didn't make sense, so a values heading is needed.

SuggestedRemedy
    Use a two-rwo heading, straddled as illustrated.
    DVJ1-265

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91051**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1275*
    This heading row is redundant, with no meaning.

SuggestedRemedy
    Delete this row, include text "(nm)" at end of table title.
    DVJ1-269

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91044**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1268*
    Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
    Center this column
    DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 183 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91037**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1261*
Don't intermix two table rows; this confuses the reader.

SuggestedRemedy
Add the distinct "type" column.
DVJ1-266

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91038**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1262*
Gbd is not a well known standard term (perhaps giga-baud?)

SuggestedRemedy
Describe this in a footnote!
DVJ1-266

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91039**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1263*
Don't force the reader to visually interpolate column lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Separate this straddled pair of column cells, with replicated value.
DVJ1-266

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91040**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1264*
The old heading didn't make sense, so a values heading is needed.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a two-rwo heading, straddled as illustrated.
DVJ1-266

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91041**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1265*
Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy
Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91052**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1276*
Small numbers or words should be centered, as per style guidelines.

SuggestedRemedy
Center these columns.
DVJ1-269

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91054**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1278*
Blank line looks like a mistake.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Put something in here that helps explain its meaning.
2) Delete this row.
DVJ1-269

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91050**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1274*
Tpm amd Tpff are really the same, but this is not clear.

SuggestedRemedy
Straddle the rightmost pair of cells, as illustrated..
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91049**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1273*
Don't use pseudo rows, with adhoc bracket-sequencing technique.

SuggestedRemedy
Use two rows, as illustrated.
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91047**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1271*
Blank cells look like misprint or errors.

SuggestedRemedy
Put em dash in all blank cells, here and throughout.
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91046**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1270*
Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
Center this column
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91045**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1269*
Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
Center this column
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91053**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1277*
Bold font seems to imply special meaning, but the meaning is not apparent.

SuggestedRemedy
Use regular text in these columns.
DVJ1-269

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91043**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1267*
Common vertical cells should be straddled.

SuggestedRemedy
Straddle the dBm cells, as illustrated.
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91042**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1266*
Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy
Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91048**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1272*
Don't use pseudo rows, with adhoc vertical spacing and parenthesis technique.

SuggestedRemedy
Use two rows, as illustrated.
DVJ1-267

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91055**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1279*
Don't intermix two table rows; this confuses the reader.

SuggestedRemedy
Add the distinct "type" column.
DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91058**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1282*
Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy
Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91056**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1280*
Gbd is not a well known standard term (perhaps giga-baud?)

SuggestedRemedy
Describe this in a footnote!
DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91060**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1284*
Print the bottom line when table splits across pages.

SuggestedRemedy
This is a two-step process:
1) Fix the templates, to draw a very-thin line on bottom of the page.
2) Manually force a thin line on the last line of the table.
DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91062**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1286*
Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
Center this column
DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91057**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1281*
The old heading didn't make sense, so a values heading is needed.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a two-rwo heading, straddled as illustrated.
DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 186 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91061**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1285*
  Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy
  Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
  DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91063**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1287*
  Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
  Center this column
  DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91064**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1288*
  Columns without text should be centered, for consistency and IEEE Style guide.

SuggestedRemedy
  Center this column
  DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91065**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1289*
  Merging the two columns makes the reader interpolate the between-column line.

SuggestedRemedy
  Unstraddle the two columns, replicate the cell text.
  DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91059**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1283*
  Min/max values are confusingly intermixed.

SuggestedRemedy
  Split this row, as illustrated, so that min and max are specified separately.
  DVJ1-270

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91071**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1295*
  Table cells should be centered, unless containing a text segment.

SuggestedRemedy
  Center these rows
  DVJ1-272

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91073**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1297*
  By convention, math symbols have no spaces, and are typically italics or Greek.

SuggestedRemedy
  Jitter on upstream signal ==> jitterOnUpstreamSignal
  DVJ1-273

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91075**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1299*
  By convention, math symbols have no spaces, and are typically italics or Greek.

SuggestedRemedy
  Jitter on upstream signal ==> jitterTransfer
  DVJ1-273

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT.
  Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **# 91077**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1301*
Use a multiply x symbol, so that 20log is not mistaken as a function or variable name.

SuggestedRemedy
20log ==> 20 ¥ log
DVJ1-273

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **# 91076**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1300*
The UI term looks like a multiplicative scaler or a function-call argument.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete instances of "(UI)"; no unit spec is really needed (since they cancel).
DVJ1-273

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **# 91070**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1294*
Blank cell looks like an error.

SuggestedRemedy
Place an em dash in this cell.
DVJ1-272

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **# 91080**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1304*
Placing dB in brackets make this look like an array index or function call.

SuggestedRemedy
1) Delete the bracket term 2) On line below, add (in dB)
DVJ1-273

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **# 91082**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1306*
All non-textual cell entries should be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center the terms within these columns
DVJ1-274

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **# 91079**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1303*
The meaning of "dec" is not specified; could be a miscapitalization of a defunct company.

SuggestedRemedy
dec ==> decade
DVJ1-273

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **# 91078**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1302*
Excess capitalization: slope is a variable name, not a heading.

SuggestedRemedy
Slope ==> slope
DVJ1-273

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**   *P*   *L*   **# 91068**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1292*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Downstream ==> downstream.
DVJ1-272

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 188 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **60**   *SC* **60.6**

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.6**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91067**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1291*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Upstream ==> upstream.
DVJ1-272

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.6**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91066**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1290*
The blank cell under "Units" looks strange.

SuggestedRemedy
Straddle this cell with the one.
DVJ1-272

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.6**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91081**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1305*
Blank cell looks like an error.

SuggestedRemedy
Add the word "Parameter" to this blank cell.
DVJ1-274

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.6**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91074**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1298*
By convention, math symbols have no spaces, and are typically italics or Greek.

SuggestedRemedy
Jitter on upstream signal ==> jitterOnDownstreamSignal
DVJ1-273

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.6**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91069**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1293*
Avoid forcing the reader to interpolate vertical between-column lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Unstraddle these columns, replicating their contents name.
2) Move the most-merged rows to the bottom, so that merged cells get wider towards the table bottom.
DVJ1-272

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**　　*SC* **60.6**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91072**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1296*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Type==>type
DVJ1-272

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 189 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **60**　　　*SC* **60.6**

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91086**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1310*
Wrong font for illustrations.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the illustration font to Arial, consistent with IEEE Style guideline and other figures.
DVJ1-277

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91083**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1307*
The capitalization in "Trigger" makes it look like a name or heading.

SuggestedRemedy
Trigger==>trigger
DVJ1-277

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91084**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1308*
A uniform signaling naming convention would help differentiate one from another.

SuggestedRemedy
Tx_Enable ==> txEnable
DVJ1-277

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91085**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1309*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Channel ==> channel
DVJ1-277

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91088**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1312*
A uniform signaling naming convention would help differentiate one from another.

SuggestedRemedy
Tx_Enable ==> txEnable
DVJ1-279

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91087**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1311*
The capitalization in "Trigger" makes it look like a name or heading.

SuggestedRemedy
Trigger==>trigger
DVJ1-279

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91089**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1313*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Channel ==> channel
DVJ1-279

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91090**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1314*
Wrong font for illustrations.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the illustration font to Arial, consistent with IEEE Style guideline and other figures.
DVJ1-279

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 190 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.7.13.2.2**

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.9.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91094**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1318*
Wrong font for illustrations.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the illustration font to Arial, consistent with IEEE Style guideline and other figures.
DVJ1-281

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.9.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91093**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1317*
Hyphenation makes for hard reading.

SuggestedRemedy
Expand the box width, so that that "Unterminated" is not hyphenated.
DVJ1-281

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.9.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91091**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1315*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Cable ==> cable
DVJ1-281

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **60**   *SC* **60.9.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91092**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1316*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Channel ==> channel
DVJ1-281

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91130**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1354*
Excessive length title: this will cause major problems with auto TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Shorter, as shown above.
DVJ1-292

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The Clause title is explicit about the content of the Clause, which is beneficial to the reader.
As it still fits on two lines (as opposed to the titles of e.g. clauses 58, 59, 60 and may other
clauses in the base standard), the Task Force doesn't believe there is a problem here.

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91128**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1352*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Physical Coding Sublayer==>Physical coding sublayer, if nothing else is changed.
DVJ1-292

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91129**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1353*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Transmission Convergence==>transmission convergence, if nothing else is changed.
DVJ1-292

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91131**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1355*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>central office
DVJ1-292

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91132**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1356*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>customer primises equipment
DVJ1-292

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91133**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1357*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>physical coding sublayer
DVJ1-293

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91134**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1358*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>rate matching
DVJ1-293

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.1.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91135**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1359*
The IEEE Style manual frowns on intermixed ALLCAPS and Some caps callouts.

SuggestedRemedy
==>Eliminate the ALLCAPS, here and elsewhere. Then, everything is consistent.
DVJ1-293

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.1.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91136**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1360*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>client
DVJ1-294

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61** *SC* **61.1.4.1.1** *P* *L* # **91137**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1361*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>medium independent interface
DVJ1-295

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61** *SC* **61.1.4.1.2** *P* *L* # **91138**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1362*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>aggregation function
DVJ1-295

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61** *SC* **61.1.4.1.3** *P* *L* # **91139**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1363*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>rate matching
DVJ1-296

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10** *P* *L* # **91152**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *DVJ-1376*
The "Clause" and "61" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-327

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT.
(Comment resolved by the Editor per Motion #2 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of
April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10** *P* *L* # **91153**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1377*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-327

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See also comment #91130.
The Clause title is explicit about the content of the Clause, which is beneficial to the reader.
As it still fits on two lines (as opposed to the titles of e.g. clauses 58, 59, 60 and may other
clauses in the base standard), the Task Force doesn't believe there is a problem here.

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10.3** *P* *L* # **91155**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1379*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-327

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting
of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **91156**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1380*
Bad line break.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>rate matching
DVJ1-327

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **91158**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1382*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-327

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10.4.2** *P* *L* **#** **91160**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1384*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-327

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10.4.3** *P* *L* **#** **91163**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1387*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-328

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10.4.3** *P* *L* **#** **91162**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1386*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-328

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **61** *SC* **61.10.4.4** *P* *L* **#** **91165**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1389*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-328

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 194 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **61** *SC* **61.10.4.4**

Cl **61**　　*SC* **61.2.2.10**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91141**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1365*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>rate matching
DVJ1-306

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**　　*SC* **61.2.2.6.2**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91140**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1364*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>aggregation-receive
DVJ1-302

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**　　*SC* **61.3.2.3**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91142**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1366*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>operation channel
DVJ1-311

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**　　*SC* **61.3.2.3**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91143**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1367*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>indicator bits
DVJ1-311

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**　　*SC* **61.3.3.1**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91144**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1368*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>encapsulation and coding
DVJ1-312

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**　　*SC* **61.3.3.5.1**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91145**
David V. James　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　*DVJ-1369*
Wrong count: spec says 3 conditions, only 2 are listed.

SuggestedRemedy
Change ==>two
DVJ1-316

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT.
(Comment resolved by the Editor per Motion #2 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of
April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.3.3.7.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91146**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1370*

Unknown term; loop was not declared above.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Define loop.
2) Use a defined variable, corresponding to what is actually used.
DVJ1-318

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The definition of loop is in 61.3.3.7.1, between k and TC_link_state.
(Comment resolved by the Editor per Motion #2 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.3.3.7.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91148**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1372*

Enumerated values are listed, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Complete the tbd's.
DVJ1-319

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The variable expectedSync is properly defined in 61.3.3.7.2.
(Comment resolved by the Editor per Motion #2 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.3.3.7.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91147**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1371*

Enumerated values are listed, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Complete the tbd.
DVJ1-318

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The variable expectedSync is properly defined in 61.3.3.7.2.
(Comment resolved by the Editor per Motion #2 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91149**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1373*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>performance guidelines
DVJ1-325

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91150**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1374*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>electrical characteristics
DVJ1-325

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61**   *SC* **61.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91151**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1375*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above, ==>rate matching
DVJ1-326

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61A**   *SC* **61A.2**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91479**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1703*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be 10 or 12 point.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point Arial, no need to use bold or wider line widths.
DVJ1-449

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **61A**   *SC* **61A.2**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91483**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1707*
Unclear usage. I could not find the PME_Discovery_Register here or in 802.3-2002.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>bit error ratio test
DVJ1-449

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
However, the BRC believes the following technical flaw needs to be corrected:
Replace "PME_Discovery_Register" with "Remote_discovery_register" throughout this
subclause.

Cl **61A**   *SC* **61A.2**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91480**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1704*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be larger.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point Arial, no need to use bold or wider line widths.
DVJ1-449

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62**   *SC* **62.**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91167**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1391*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Physical Medium Attachment ==>Physical medium attachment, as shown.
DVJ1-329

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62**   *SC* **62.**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91168**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1392*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Physical Medium Dependent ==>physical medium dependent, as shown.
DVJ1-329

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62**   *SC* **62.1.1**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91169**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1393*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>physical medium attachment
DVJ1-329

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 197 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **62**   *SC* **62.1.1**

Cl **62** *SC* **62.1.1** *P* *L* *#* **91170**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1394*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>physical medium dependent
DVJ1-329

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62** *SC* **62.1.4.2.2** *P* *L* *#* **91171**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1395*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>synchronized flow
DVJ1-330

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62** *SC* **62.2.4.2** *P* *L* *#* **91172**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1396*
Funny scoping on the quotes.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>include the clause number
DVJ1-331

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62** *SC* **62.3.1** *P* *L* *#* **91173**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1397*
Funny scoping on the quotes.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>overview
DVJ1-332

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62** *SC* **62.3.4** *P* *L* *#* **91175**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1399*
Bad line break.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>inhibit line breaks, via distinct character formats.
DVJ1-333

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62** *SC* **62.4** *P* *L* *#* **91176**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1400*
The "Clause" and "62" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-340

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62**   *SC* **62.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91177**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1401*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-340

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62**   *SC* **62.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91179**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1403*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-340

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62**   *SC* **62.4.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91181**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1405*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-340

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62**   *SC* **62.4.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91183**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1407*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-340

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62**   *SC* **62.4.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91184**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1408*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-341

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62A**   *SC* **62A.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91488**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1712*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>clause
DVJ1-458

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A**   *SC* **62A.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91489**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1713*
Font is too small.

SuggestedRemedy
Restructure the table, so 9-point font can be used.
I would split each row into two, so that high and low frequencies are separate rows, and thus narrower.
DVJ1-458

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62A**   *SC* **62A.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91490**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1714*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>reference
DVJ1-458

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A**   *SC* **62A.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91491**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1715*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>profiles
DVJ1-458

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A**   *SC* **62A.3.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91492**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1716*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>profiles
DVJ1-459

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A**   *SC* **62A.3.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91498**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1722*
Don't make the reader interpolate row lines. (Circle C)

SuggestedRemedy
Move the # column to the right, replace # with a "Row" heading
DVJ1-459

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62A**   *SC* **62A.3.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91497**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1721*
Improper column alignment. (Circle B)

SuggestedRemedy
Center the column
DVJ1-459

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.3.7** *P* *L* **#** **91493**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1717*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>Band notch profiles
DVJ1-459

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.3.7** *P* *L* **#** **91495**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1719*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
UPBO reference PSD profiles …
DVJ1-459

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.3.7** *P* *L* **#** **91494**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1718*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>band notch
DVJ1-459

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.3.7** *P* *L* **#** **91499**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1723*
Don't make the reader interpolate row lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Move the # column to the right.
DVJ1-459

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.3.7** *P* *L* **#** **91496**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1720*
Use real heading text.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace # with a "Row" heading
DVJ1-459

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.4** *P* *L* **#** **91500**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1724*
pseudo-C has a pseudo definition and therefore cannot be used for any normative material.

SuggestedRemedy
Both:
1) Upgrade the code to a real C-code snippet (or perhaps it is already?)
2) Change the text from a C procedure to a C-code snippet.
DVJ1-461

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Page 201 of 242
Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.4**

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.5** *P* *L* # **91501**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1725*
The "Clause" and number are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-462

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.5** *P* *L* # **91502**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1726*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-462

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.5.3** *P* *L* # **91504**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1728*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-462

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.5.4** *P* *L* # **91507**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1731*
The line thickness is wrong.

SuggestedRemedy
Table should be very-thin in the center, thin on the edge. Set FrameMaker accordingly.
DVJ1-462

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.5.4** *P* *L* # **91506**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1730*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-462

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.5.4** *P* *L* # **91508**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1732*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily) imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-462

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 202 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   U/unsatisfied   Z/withdrawn
Cl **62A** *SC* **62A.5.4**

Cl **62B**   *SC* **62B.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91510**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1734*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>bit error ratio (BER)
DVJ1-463

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62B**   *SC* **62B.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91512**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1736*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-465

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62B**   *SC* **62B.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91511**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1735*
The "Clause" and number are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-465

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62B**   *SC* **62B.5.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91514**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1738*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-465

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62B**   *SC* **62B.5.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91515**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1739*
This subclause is empty.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Provide the appropriate table.
2) Provide a short sentence, noting that no table is provided (or exists elsewhere, or whatever).
DVJ1-465

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Keep the first table on page 666 together with heading 62B.5.3.
(Comment resolved by the Editor per Motion #2 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62B**   *SC* **62B.5.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91520**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1744*

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

This is comment is blank (probably an artefact of the document conversion process).
(Comment resolved by the Editor per Motion #2 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62B**　　*SC* **62B.5.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91516**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1740*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>performance
DVJ1-465

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62B**　　*SC* **62B.5.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91518**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1742*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-465

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **62C**　　*SC* **62C.2**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91521**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1745*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above, ==>Example PSD masks for MCM 10PASS-TS
DVJ1-468

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62C**　　*SC* **62C.2**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91522**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1746*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; this appears to be using the Times font.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point Arial font.
DVJ1-468

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62C**　　*SC* **62C.3.2**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91523**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1747*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>Example PSD masks for MCM 10PASS-TS
DVJ1-469

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62C**　　*SC* **62C.3.2**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91525**
David V. James　　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1749*
Excess figure title length; this is a title, not a short story or normative text expose.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>VDSL system performance, ITU-T bandplan A, scenario 1
DVJ1-469

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 204 of 242
Cl **62C**　　*SC* **62C.3.2**

Cl **62C** *SC* **62C.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91528**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1752*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; this appears to be using the Times font.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point Arial font.
DVJ1-469

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62C** *SC* **62C.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91526**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1750*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; this appears to be using the Times font.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point Arial font.
DVJ1-469

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62C** *SC* **62C.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91524**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1748*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; this appears to be using the Times font.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point Arial font.
DVJ1-469

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62C** *SC* **62C.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91527**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1751*
Excess figure title length; this is a title, not a short story or normative text expose.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>VDSL system performance, ITU-T bandplan A, scenario 2
DVJ1-469

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62C** *SC* **62C.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91529**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1753*
Excess figure title length; this is a title, not a short story or normative text expose.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>VDSL system performance, ITU-T bandplan A, scenario 3
DVJ1-469

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **62C** *SC* **62C.3.2** *P* *L* **#** **91530**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1754*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; this appears to be using the Times font.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point Arial font.
DVJ1-469

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 205 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **62C** *SC* **62C.3.2**

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91186**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1410*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Physical Medium Attachment ==>Physical medium attachment, as shown.
DVJ1-342

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91187**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1411*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
Physical Medium Dependent ==>physical medium dependent, as shown.
DVJ1-342

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.3.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91189**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1413*
The table is continued, but there is no continuation note.

SuggestedRemedy
Add the table continuation variable.
DVJ1-347

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting
of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.3.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91188**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1412*
The missing line on the bottom is confusing to the reader, since it could (all too easily)
imply that the rows are straddled and split on the bottom of the page. Based on other
published documents, the IEEE staff cannot be relied upon to manually fix all of these. Fix
them now, since its easy to do.

SuggestedRemedy
Do the following:
1) Modify the table style, so a very thin line is enabled on cross-page rows.
2) Manually force the bottom line to be thin, on a per table basis.
DVJ1-347

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting
of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.3.2.5.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91190**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1414*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>General changes
DVJ1-348

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.4**   *P*   *L*   # **91191**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1415*
The "Clause" and "65" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-349

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.4**   *P*   *L*   # **91192**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1416*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-349

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by
the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in
Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.4.3**   *P*   *L*   # **91194**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1418*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-349

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting
of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.4.4.1**   *P*   *L*   # **91196**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1420*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-349

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting
of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63**   *SC* **63.4.4.2**   *P*   *L*   # **91198**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1422*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-349

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting
of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63A**   *SC* **63A.5.3**   *P*   *L*   # **91534**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1758*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-472

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting
of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63A**   *SC* **63A.5.3**   *P*   *L*   # **91532**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1756*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-472

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63A**   *SC* **63A.5.3**   *P*   *L*   # **91533**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1757*
The line thickness is wrong.

SuggestedRemedy
Table should be very-thin in the center, thin on the edge. Set FrameMaker accordingly.
DVJ1-472

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63A**   *SC* **63A.5.4**   *P*   *L*   # **91538**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1762*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-472

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63A**   *SC* **63A.5.4**   *P*   *L*   # **91536**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1760*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>performance
DVJ1-472

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

Cl **63A**   *SC* **63A.5.4**   *P*   *L*   # **91535**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1759*
The line thickness is wrong.

SuggestedRemedy
Table should be very-thin in the center, thin on the edge. Set FrameMaker accordingly.
DVJ1-472

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63B**   *SC* **63B.4**   *P*   *L*   # **91539**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1763*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>guidelines
DVJ1-474

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This comment is made against text that is unchanged from D3.1, and that was approved by the Sponsor Ballot Group. It is therefore outside the scope of this ballot.
(Resolution adopted per Motion #1 of the EFM Task Force Interim Meeting of April 12-13 in Santa Clara, CA.)

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 208 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **63B**   *SC* **63B.4**

Cl **63B** *SC* **63B.5.3** *P* *L* **#** **91541**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1765*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-474

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63B** *SC* **63B.5.3** *P* *L* **#** **91542**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1766*
The Status column is too narrow, which forces unnecessary wrapping.

SuggestedRemedy
Enlarge this column width.
DVJ1-474

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **63B** *SC* **63B.5.4** *P* *L* **#** **91545**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1769*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-474

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
See comment #661. No action will be taken on comments that address only the formatting of tables; these issues will be taken up the IEEE publications editor.

Cl **64** *SC* **64** *P* *L* **#** **91200**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1424*
Excess capitalization

SuggestedRemedy
"Control ==>control, as shown.
DVJ1-350"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.1** *P* *L* **#** **91202**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1426*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>multi-point
DVJ1-351

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.1** *P* *L* **#** **91201**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1425*
Wrong fonts used within the figure (above).

SuggestedRemedy
"Use only 8-point Arial, as per IEEE Style Guide. And, no need to use bold.
DVJ1-350"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 209 of 242
Cl **64** *SC* **64.1**

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91203**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1427*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>control
DVJ1-351

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91205**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1429*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>clients
DVJ1-351

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91204**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1428*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>point-to-point emulation
DVJ1-351

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91206**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1430*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>control
DVJ1-351

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91207**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1431*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"Change, as shown above==>multi-point MAC control
DVJ1-352"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91208**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1432*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>point-to-point
DVJ1-352

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.1.3** *P* *L* **#** **91209**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1433*
Excessive capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"Change, as shown above==>multi-point MAC control
DVJ1-352"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.2** *P* *L* **#** **91210**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1434*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>instance
DVJ1-353

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.2.1** *P* *L* **#** **91211**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1435*
"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-354

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

The variable name is consistent with name used in Clause 4 and Annex 4A

Cl **64** *SC* **64.2.1** *P* *L* **#** **91212**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1436*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>client
DVJ1-355

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.2.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **91215**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1439*
Intermixing of someCaps and ALLCAPS callouts is disallowed by IEEE Style guidelines.

SuggestedRemedy
Don't use ALLCAPS subscripts.
DVJ1-355

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.2.1.1** *P* *L* **#** **91213**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1437*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>timing process
DVJ1-355

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 211 of 242
Cl **64** *SC* **64.2.1.1**

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91214**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1438*
Wrong font size in figure.

SuggestedRemedy
Use only 8-point Arial font.
DVJ1-355

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is
technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91225**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1449*
Wrong font size in figure.

SuggestedRemedy
Use only 8-point Arial font.
DVJ1-357

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is
technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91223**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1447*
Wrong font size in figure.

SuggestedRemedy
Use only 8-point Arial font.
DVJ1-356

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is
technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91220**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1444*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"Change, as above==>Control parser service interfaces
DVJ1-356"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91221**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1445*
Wrong font size in figure.

SuggestedRemedy
Use only 8-point Arial font.
DVJ1-356

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is
technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91216**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1440*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"Change, as above==>Multi-point transmission control service interfaces
DVJ1-356"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 212 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91219**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1443*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>multi-point transmission controll
DVJ1-356

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91218**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1442*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>instance
DVJ1-356

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91222**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1446*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"Change, as above==>OLT control multiplexer serviceinterfaces
DVJ1-356"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91224**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1448*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"Change, as above==>ONU control multiplexer service interfaces
DVJ1-357"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91217**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1441*
Wrong font size in figure.

SuggestedRemedy
Use only 8-point Arial font.
DVJ1-356

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91227**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1451*
Confusing! How can the contents of a variable field be defined to be a constant?

SuggestedRemedy
Clarify.
DVJ1-357

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This element represents a constant value identifying MAC Control frames. The constant value is 88-08.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.2.2.1**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　**#** **91226**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1450*
"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-357

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.2.2.2**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　**#** **91228**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1452*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>layer management
DVJ1-358

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.2.2.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　**#** **91229**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1453*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>control
DVJ1-360

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.2.2.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　**#** **91231**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1455*
"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-360

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.2.2.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　**#** **91232**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1456*
"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-360

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.2.2.4**　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　**#** **91233**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1457*
"Too many name aliases:
  DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address."

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-361

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 214 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **64**　　　*SC* **64.2.2.4**

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91230**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1454*
"Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address."

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-360

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91235**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1459*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>multi-pointl
DVJ1-361

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.2.2.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91234**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1458*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>diagrams
DVJ1-361

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91249**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1473*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>Multi-point control protocol
DVJ1-362

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91251**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1475*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>control
DVJ1-363

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91250**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1474*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>multi-point control protocol
DVJ1-363

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.1** *P* *L* *#* **91252**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1476*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above==>client
DVJ1-363

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.2.3** *P* **469** *L* **15** *#* **99348**

Choi, Su-il ETRI

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *Not Member Of Ballot Group*

This clause describes OLT may support multicast by using additional multicast MACs. Additional multicast MACs require additional LLIDs and filtering rules. However, multicast channel configuration as well as filtering and marking of frames for multicast isn't defined in Clause 65.1.3.3.2

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest a solution for multicast channel configuration as well as filtering and marking of frames for multicast. Attached file "choi_p2mp_1_0304.pdf" suggests a new variable "LGID(logical group identifier)" for grouping of some logical ports (LLIDs). Attached file "choi_p2mp_2_0304.pdf" shows the changes of the draft based on the suggested multicast solution.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

Editor suggests this comment to be rejected as it constitutes a new feature.

Y: 5
N: 1
A: 2

Remove words "(multicast MACs)".
Remove the words "Multicast and" from the section header

Y:1
N:1
A:5

=======================================

Accept solution proposed in the comment
Y:1
N:2
A:5

Motion to accept STF resolution (reject the comment)
IEEE 802.3ah:

Y:17
N:1
A:4

Cl **64**　　　*SC* **64.3.3**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91256**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1480*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"As corrected above, ==>
Discovery processing service Interfaces (OLT, unicasting instance)
DVJ1-365"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　　*SC* **64.3.3**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91259**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1483*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be 10 or 12 point.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point
DVJ1-366

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**　　　*SC* **64.3.3**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91258**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1482*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"As corrected above, ==>Discovery processing service interfaces (ONU)
DVJ1-366"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　　*SC* **64.3.3**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91254**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1478*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"As corrected above, ==>
Discovery processing service interfaces (OLT, broadcasting instance)
DVJ1-365"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　　*SC* **64.3.3**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91253**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1477*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>register
DVJ1-365

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　　*SC* **64.3.3**　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91257**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1481*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be 10 or 12 point.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point
DVJ1-365

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Page 217 of 242

Cl **64**　　　*SC* **64.3.3**

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91255**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1479*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be 10 or 12 point.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point
DVJ1-365

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is
technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91260**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1484*
The definition of opcode_rx was repeated twice.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Delete the redundant text.
2) Correct the redundant text.
DVJ1-366

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The second instance shoule be "opcode_tx"

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91261**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1485*
"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-367

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91262**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1486*
"Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address."

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-367

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91264**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1488*
"Too many name aliases:
DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address."

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-367

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91263**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1487*
"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-367

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot
group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91280**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1504*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

"As corrected above, ==>Report processing service interfaces
DVJ1-372"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91281**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1505*

Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be 10 or 12 point.

SuggestedRemedy

==>8 point
DVJ1-372

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.4.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91282**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1506*

The definition of opcode_rx was repeated twice.

SuggestedRemedy

Either:
1) Delete the redundant text.
2) Correct the redundant text.
DVJ1-373

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The second instance shoule be "opcode_tx"

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91284**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1508*

"Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address."

SuggestedRemedy

==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-373

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91283**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1507*

"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-373

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.4.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91285**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1509*

"Unclear cross reference: Annex 31B only seems to define a code used with PAUSE, which is the value of 01-80-C2-00-00-01."

SuggestedRemedy

"Either:
1) Clarify that, although originally designed for PAUSE, this code may be used for any control function, including this one.
2) Provide other clarification text.
DVJ1-374"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.5** *P* *L* **#** **91290**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1514*
Figure text should be Arial 8-point font; some of this appears to be 10 or 12 point.

SuggestedRemedy
==>8 point
DVJ1-376

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.5** *P* *L* **#** **91289**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1513*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
"As corrected above, ==>Gate processing service interface
DVJ1-376"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.5.3** *P* *L* **#** **91291**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1515*
"Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address."

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-378

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.5.3** *P* *L* **#** **91293**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1517*
"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy
==>lengthType.
DVJ1-378

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.5.3** *P* *L* **#** **91292**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1516*
Vague definition.

SuggestedRemedy
State whether this range is inclusive or exclusive.
DVJ1-378

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Both inclusive and exclusive implemetations are possible. The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.5.3** *P* *L* **#** **91294**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1518*
"Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address."

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-379

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 220 of 242
Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.5.3**

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91301**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1525*
"Field values are hard to differentiate from numerical values, since its not clear where the field name stops and the number starts. This is particularly true, since special symbols like '=' are not necessarily a demarcation spot, given that the device symbol '/' is actually part of another field name."

SuggestedRemedy
"The value for the field should be placed on the right, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-381"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

The figure is consistent with existing 802.3 clauses and was approved by the ballot group. This is also unchanged text from D3.1.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91300**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1524*
"Field values should be centered, as should also be done within figures."

SuggestedRemedy
"Center the fields, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-381"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91298**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1522*
"The octet transmission order need not be shown in every figure, describe in the notation clause once, and then don't repeat ad nausium. Its also inconsistent, when compared to 54.2.4."

SuggestedRemedy
Delete the octet transmission order text and arrow.
DVJ1-381

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91297**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1521*
Showing the LSB on the left is confusing.

SuggestedRemedy
"Delete the LSB... MSB and text below, as done in the changed illustration.
DVJ1-381"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
This representation is consistent with Figure 3-1.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91313**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1537*
"There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, a consistent name for Data/Reserved/PAD, Data/Pad, Data/Reserved/Pad, etc. is desired."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-382"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91312**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1536*
"There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence)."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use lower-case, but an italics font for this and all field names, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-382"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 221 of 242
Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91311**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1535*
"There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occasions (such as the first word of a header or sentence).."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use lower-case, but an italics font for this and all field names, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-382"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91304**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1528*
Nonstandard font size.

SuggestedRemedy
"Use #8 point Arial, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-381"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The style guide preferes 8-point font, but does not mandate it. The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91299**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1523*
Callout text of ALLCAPS is not be to intermixed with someCaps text.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete the octet transmission order text.
DVJ1-381

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

The text format is consistent with Figure 3-1.

The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91307**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1531*
"Too many name aliases:
    DA, destination address, Destination Address, DestinationField, etc. Also, not easy to parse and DA looks like a constant."

SuggestedRemedy
"==>destinationAddress, here and througout.
DVJ1-382"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91295**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1519*
Nonstandard figure (compared to 54.2.4).

SuggestedRemedy
Use the change illustration above.
DVJ1-381

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91296**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1520*
"In other portions of the specification, the octet count is shown on the left."

SuggestedRemedy
"Place the octet count on the left, as done in the changed illustration.
DVJ1-381"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
Figure is technically correct and and the format has been approved by the ballot group.
This is unchanged text from D3.1.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6** *P* *L* # **91306**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1530*

"Unclear text; the field name should be on the left, not an unnecessary a-z) listing. Also, the field values cannot be easily cross-referenced later."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use a definition-like style, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-382"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6** *P* *L* # **91309**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1533*

"This term is defined in too many ways: lengthOrType, Length/Type, type, etc.."

SuggestedRemedy

==>lengthType.
DVJ1-382

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6** *P* *L* # **91303**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1527*

"Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-381"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6** *P* *L* # **91305**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1529*

Vague cross-reference to the MAC control multicast address.

SuggestedRemedy

"Provide a specific standard number (and date), specific name, and specific subclause.
DVJ1-381"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6** *P* *L* # **91314**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1538*

"The FCS all caps is confusing, since this has also been listed as an acronym. All caps normally implies a constant value also."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-383"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6** *P* *L* # **91310**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1534*

Vague cross-reference: MAC_Control_Type could not be found in 802.3-2002.

SuggestedRemedy

"More accurate reference, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-382"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6** *P* *L* **#** **91302**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1526*
"Using a hyphen when describing a hex value is confusing. It could be interpreted as a range of values, for example. Its non-standard and not described in the notation."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use a normal base-16 representation, as done in changed illustration.
DVJ1-381"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6** *P* *L* **#** **91308**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1532*
"Too many name aliases:
    SA, source address, Source Address, etc. Also, not easy to parse and SA looks like a constant."

SuggestedRemedy
"==>sourceAddress, here and througout.
DVJ1-382"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **91321**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1545*
"There is no need to capitalize the Sync Time field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence)."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-384"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **91316**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1540*
"There is no need to capitalize the Flags field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence)."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use lower-case, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-384"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **91315**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1539*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>generic
DVJ1-383

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **91317**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1541*
"A _very_ confusing notation, with a special character # used within. It took we quite some time to figure out what was intended."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use a standard array notation, rather than this rather unique conconction of characters.
DVJ1-384"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause Page 224 of 242
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1**

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **91320**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1544*

"A _very_ confusing notation, with a special character # used within. It took me quite some time to figure out what was intended."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case and italics, to delineate the name, as done above, here and througout. DVJ1-384"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **91319**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1543*

"A _very_ confusing notation, with a special character # used within. It took we quite some time to figure out what was intended."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use a standard array notation, rather than this rather unique conconction of characters. DVJ1-384"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **91318**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1542*

"A _very_ confusing notation, with a special character # used within. It took we quite some time to figure out what was intended."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case and italics, to delineate the name, as done above, here and througout. DVJ1-384"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.1** *P* *L* **#** **91322**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1546*

"There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occasions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, a consistent name for Data/Reserved/PAD, Data/Pad, Data/Reserved/Pad, etc. is desired."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout. DVJ1-384"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.2** *P* *L* **#** **91329**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1553*

"A _very_ confusing notation, with a special character # used within. It took me quite some time to figure out what was intended."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case and italics, to delineate the name, as done above, here and througout. DVJ1-387"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64** *SC* **64.3.6.2** *P* *L* **#** **91326**

David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1550*

"There is no need to capitalize the Number of Queue Sets field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, its sometimes unclear if this really represents an English fragement, with a special kind of 'Number" of "Queue Sets"."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout. DVJ1-386"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.2**   *P*   *L*   # **91328**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1552*

"A _very_ confusing notation, with a special character # used within. It took we quite some time to figure out what was intended."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use a standard array notation, rather than this rather unique conconction of characters.
DVJ1-387"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been
approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.2**   *P*   *L*   # **91327**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1551*

"There is no need to capitalize the Report bitmap field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, its sometimes unclear if this really represents an English fragement, with a special kind of 'Report" and a common use of "bitmap"."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-387"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.2**   *P*   *L*   # **91325**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1549*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above==>generic
DVJ1-386

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.2**   *P*   *L*   # **91330**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1554*

"There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, a consistent name for Data/Reserved/PAD, Data/Pad, Data/Reserved/Pad, etc. is desired."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-387"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.3**   *P*   *L*   # **91333**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1557*

"There is no need to capitalize the Pending grants field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, its sometimes unclear if this really represents an English fragement, with a special kind of 'Pending" and a common use of "grants"."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-388"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.3**   *P*   *L*   # **91334**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1558*

"There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, a consistent name for Data/Reserved/PAD, Data/Pad, Data/Reserved/Pad, etc. is desired."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-388"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.3.6.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　# **91337**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1561*
"Too many name aliases:
　DA, destination address, Destination Address, destinationField, destination_address."

SuggestedRemedy
==>destinationAddress
DVJ1-389

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.3.6.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　# **91340**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1564*
"There is no need to capitalize the Echoed pending grants field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, its sometimes unclear if this really represents an English fragement, with a special kind of 'Echoed" and a common use of "pending grants", or perhaps even "Echoed" as applied to "Pending grants"."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-390"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.3.6.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　# **91341**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1565*
"There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, a consistent name for Data/Reserved/PAD, Data/Pad, Data/Reserved/Pad, etc. is desired."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-390"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.3.6.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　# **91339**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1563*
"There is no need to capitalize the Sync Timefield names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, its sometimes unclear if this really represents an English fragement, with a special kind of "Sync" field name, that applies to a special kind of "Time"."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-390"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**　　*SC* **64.3.6.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　# **91338**
David V. James　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　*DVJ-1562*
"There is no need to capitalize the Assigned Port field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, its sometimes unclear if this really represents an English fragement, with a special kind of 'Assigned" field name, that applies to a special kind of "Port"."

SuggestedRemedy
"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-389"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91347**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1571*

"There is no need to capitalize the Echoed assigned port field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, its sometimes unclear if this really represents an English fragement, with a special kind of 'Echoed" and a common use of "assigned port", or perhaps even "Echoed" as applied to "Assigned ports"."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-391"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91348**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1572*

"There is no need to capitalize the Echoed Sync Time field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, its sometimes unclear if this really represents an English fragement, with a special kind of 'Echoed" and a common use of "sync time", or perhaps even "Echoed" as applied to "Sync" time.."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use lower-case, runTogether, italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-391"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.3.6.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91349**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1573*

"There is no need to capitalize field names, since the capitalization doesn't help in all occassions (such as the first word of a header or sentence). Also, a consistent name for Data/Reserved/PAD, Data/Pad, Data/Reserved/Pad, etc. is desired."

SuggestedRemedy

"Use run-together words and italics, as done above, here and througout.
DVJ1-392"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91350**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1574*

The "Clause" and "66" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy

Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-393

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

The text is not split in the officially released draft. Issues of pagination and formating, if any, are to be resolved by the publication editor."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91351**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1575*

The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy

"Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-393"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91352**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1576*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>control
DVJ1-393

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91354**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1578*
"The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered."

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-393

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

Based on resolution for comment 661

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91355**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *DVJ-1579*
The Subclause columnis blank.

SuggestedRemedy
Either:
1) Insert the proper subclause number.
2) Provide a footnote or other explaination of why no subclause reference is provided.
DVJ1-393

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Refer to subclause 64.1

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91357**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1581*
The "Clause" and "62" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-393

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

The text is not split in the officially released draft. Issues of pagination and formating, if any, are to be resolved by the publication editor."

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91360**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1584*
"The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered."

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-394

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

Based on resolution for comment 661

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91358**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1582*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
"Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-393"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91356**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1580*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct as shown.
DVJ1-393

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91362**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1586*
"The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered."

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-394

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

Based on resolution for comment 661

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91365**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1589*
"The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered."

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-394

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

Based on motion adopted in resolution for comment 661

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.6**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91363**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1587*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>control
DVJ1-394

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91368**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1592*
"The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered."

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-394

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

Based on motion adopted in resolution for comment 661

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.7**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91366**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1590*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>machines
DVJ1-394

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.
The text in the draft is technically correct and the format has been approved by the ballot group.

Cl **64**   *SC* **64.4.2.8**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91370**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1594*
"The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered."

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-394

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

Based on motion adopted in resolution for comment 661

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91373**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1597*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>point to multi-point
DVJ1-395

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91372**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1596*
Excessive length title: this will cause major problems with auto TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Shorter, as shown above.
DVJ1-395

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91374**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1598*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>control
DVJ1-395

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91376**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1600*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>point to point emulation
DVJ1-395

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91375**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1599*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above==>reconciliation sublayer
DVJ1-395

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.1**   *P* **506**   *L* **12**   **#** **99307**

Thompson, Geoffrey   Nortel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *D3.0 #794*

The entire concept of this extension to emulate point-to-point operation seems to be a
violation of the following text extracted from the Overview and Architecture, IEEE Std 802
clause 6.2.1 Service access points (SAPs)
"The MAC sublayer provides a single MAC service access point (MSAP) as an interface
port to the LLC sublayer in an end station."
AND
"The Physical layer provides an interface port to a single MAC station,..."
This also seems to be a violation of the 5 Criteria commitment in Compatibility paragraph 1.

SuggestedRemedy

Alter draft to remain within original commitment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

The statements "The MAC sublayer provides a single MAC service access point (MSAP)
as an interface port to the LLC sublayer in an end station." AND "The Physical layer
provides an interface port to a single MAC station,. . . " do not have a 'shall' and therefore
are not a requirement for 802 networks.

P2P emulation concept is required for interworking with 802 Networks, and is consistant
with compatibility requirements undertaken by the 802.3ah project.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91377**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1601*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==> reconciliatioin sublayer
DVJ1-395

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.Comment is on unchanged text.
The Suggested Remedy contains a typo.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91379**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1603*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>optical network unit
DVJ1-396

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.1.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91378**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1602*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>optical line terminal
DVJ1-396

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment2 is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.1.3.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91380**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1604*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>cyclic redundancy check
DVJ1-397

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.1.3.3.2**   *P* **514**   *L* **11**   **#** **99347**

Choi, Su-il   ETRI

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *Not Member Of Ballot Group*

In subclause 64.3.2.3, additional multicast MACs are described roughly. This means that multicast MACs require multicast_llid individually. However, each ONU checks only the match of SCB_LLID(0x7FFF).

SuggestedRemedy

Add additional comparison as "..., or the received logical_link_id matches 0x7FFF or one of the multicast_llids, then ..."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT.
Proposed new feature is past deadline for new feature addition.

See comment #125 for clause 64.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91382**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1606*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>Auto-negotiation
DVJ1-399

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91381**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1605*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>forward error correction
DVJ1-399

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91383**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1607*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>forward error correction
DVJ1-401

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3**   *P* **538**   *L* **48**   *#* **112**

Kramer, Glen   Teknovus

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**

The specification for FEC is incomplete. It lacks precise specification about how parity bits are generated and in which block and bit order parity bits are transmitted.
In addition, no specification is given to parity buffer. Variable parity_buffer_empty is used without ever being initialized and set. No procedure for removing parity data from the buffer is shown.
Also missing is the state digram for Selector state machine which will forward received code-groups to either packet buffer or parity buffer (refer to Figure 65-10). No synchronization mechanisms are shown which would prevent data to leave the receive buffer before the entire frame is received and corrected.
It seems that there is an assumption that every implementation in some magical way will implement FEC in the same fashion and will become interoperable.

SuggestedRemedy

In its current form, FEC specification is absolutely incomplete. To fix the situation, several new state machines should be developed, at the price of delaying the standard.
Therefore, the commenter suggests to completely remove FEC section from the current draft with the understanding that a new project can be initiated to specify FEC. The new specification can be made generic to benefit different configurations, not only P2MP.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
> It lacks precise specification about how parity bits are enerated
> and in which block and bit order parity bits are transmitted.
> Section 65.2.3.1 (especially p.540 line 5-13) and 65.2.3.2.1 define
> the parity bytes generation method and the block and bit order
> of the data. In addition, no specification is given to parity buffer.

Generally speaking the state machine only describe the data streaming process - transmit (and receive and sync) path. Not the encoding and decoding of the data.
The encoding process is not described in the transmit state diagram, instead the RS_Encode function is described in p.547 l17-21 "
RS_Encode(Data)
This function is used to encode the Reed Solomon (255,239,8) code. The encoder encodes the 239 octets data frame and generates 16 parity octets for each data frame. Before being passed to the Reed Solomon encoder, this function passes the data through DECODE([/x/]). "

The parity data from this function is defined in: P.545 line 29 " parity<D7:D0> An 8-bit array that contains the current parity
bits to be encoded in the FEC Transmit Process. The elements within the array are updated with the next 8-bits to be encoded upon each entry into the XMIT_PARITY state.) "

> Variable parity_buffer_empty is used without ever being
> initialized and set.
The variable usage is defined in figure 65-11 transmit state diagram. In the state:"XMIT_PARITY" In this state the initial setting of the variable is FALSE. And when the transmission of the parity is ended then the setting is set to TRUE. This definition is complete.

> No procedure for removing parity data from the buffer is shown.
The RS_Decode function is specified, this is not in the states diagram. The encoder is filling and emptying the buffer.

> Also missing is the state diagram for Selector state machine which
> will forward received code-groups to either packet buffer or parity
> buffer (refer to Figure 65-10). No synchronization mechanisms are
> shown which would prevent data to leave the receive buffer before the
> entire frame is received and corrected.

The behavior of the data streaming is described in the state machines - figure 65-13 and figure 65-14. The behavior of the state machine in this scenario is fully described in all cases. The state machine is waiting for S_FEC. If it is not found the buffer is filled with the incoming code groups, and the code group is forwarded to the PCS. The buffer emptying defines the replacement of the parity bytes. The alignment of the data is defined by the buffer in the sense that is keeps the streaming of the data whether it is FEC_decoded or not. In that sense the FEC decoding process is done in parallel to the buffer filling and emptying and its delay should be matched.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.4.3**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91384**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1608*

Give me a break! Use normal conventions, so that divide operations are not assumed.

SuggestedRemedy

Use C-like notation and function, since that already dominates.
DVJ1-405

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.4.4**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91387**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1611*

No need to define values for zero and one.

SuggestedRemedy

Change as noted.
DVJ1-405

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.4.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91388**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1612*
  Enumerated values are listed, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy
  Complete the tbd's.
  DVJ1-406

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.4.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91390**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1614*
  Enumerated values are listed, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy
  Complete the tbd's.
  DVJ1-407

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.4.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91389**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1613*
  No need to define values for zero and one.

SuggestedRemedy
  Change as noted.
  DVJ1-406

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.4.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91393**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1617*
  Inconsistent: a function cannot be set.

SuggestedRemedy
  I suspect this should be a variable, and the "this function" needs to be more specific.
  DVJ1-407

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.4.5**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91394**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1618*
  Inclear association for "this".

SuggestedRemedy
  Use the specific name, rather than introduce the possibility for error.
  DVJ1-407

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
  REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.5.3**   *P* **551**   *L* **11**   **#** **117**

Kramer, Glen   Teknovus

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**

FEC receive process is broken.
The FEC syncronization state machine generates sync_status variable synchronously with
data arriving to the receive buffer. This variable is used to reset 2 state machines (Fig 65-
13 and Fig 65-14). But these two state machines operate with at least 12 us (max packet
size) delay and cannot use the same sync_status variable.
Otherwise, a lost sync may affect a previously received good frame which is still partially in
FEC receive buffer.

SuggestedRemedy

In its current form, FEC specification is absolutely incomplete. To fix the situation, several
new state machines should be developed, at the price of delaying the standard.
Therefore, the commenter suggests to completely remove FEC section from the current
draft with the understanding that a new project can be initiated to specify FEC. The new
specification can be made generic to benefit different configurations, not only P2MP.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
> The FEC synchronization state machine generates sync_status
> variable synchronously with data arriving to the receive buffer.
> This variable is used to reset 2 state machines (Fig 65-13 and
> Fig 65-14). But these two state machines operate with at least 12
> us (max packet size) delay and cannot use the same
> sync_status variable. Otherwise, a lost sync may affect a
> previously received good frame which is still partially in FEC
> receive buffer.

A lose if sync state may cause the FEC decoder to lose a frame.
Synchronizing will occur in the next comma detect which is before the start of the next
frame. Fig 65-13 and Fig 65-14 defines the buffer fill and buffer empty state diagrams. In
that sense they are
dealing in a frame bounded case. The sync_status defines a reset to the operation of the 2
state machines. If the state machine is not
synchronized then the buffer is not filling and returning to its initial
state, and an emptying case (in the middle of any parity replacement in idles) should also
return to its initial state.

It is understood that the specifications in Clause 65 will permit
implementations to discard multiple frames in the event
the FEC receive process loses synchronization.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.2.3.5.3**   *P* **551**   *L* **28**   **#** **115**

Kramer, Glen   Teknovus

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**

Figure 65-13 generates incorrect idles. If disparity is positive, /I1/ should be generated,
otherwise /I2/.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix states FILL_TFEC_E_4 and FILL_TFEC_O_5:
tx_disparity=POSITIVE should be tx_disparity=NEGATIVE

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.
The comment and suggested remedy are incorrect, and
no change is necessary.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.3.1.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91395**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1619*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>Physical medium attachment
DVJ1-410

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91397**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1621*

The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy

Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-412

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91396**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1620*
The "Clause" and "64" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-412

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91399**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1623*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-412

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91401**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1625*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>multi-point links
DVJ1-412

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91400**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1624*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>reconciliation sublayer
DVJ1-412

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4.3.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91402**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1626*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>forward error correction
DVJ1-412

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4.3.2.1**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91404**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1628*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-412

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4.3.2.2**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91406**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1630*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-413

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**   *SC* **65.4.3.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91408**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1632*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-413

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**　　*SC* **65.4.3.4**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91410**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1634*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-413

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**　　*SC* **65.4.3.5**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91412**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1636*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-413

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**　　*SC* **65.4.3.6**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91414**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1638*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-413

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**　　*SC* **65.4.3.7**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91416**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1640*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-413

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **65**　　*SC* **65.4.3.8**　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　**#** **91418**
David V. James　　　　　　　　JGG

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **R**　　　　　*DVJ-1642*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-414

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **U**
REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **66**   *SC*   *P*   *L*   **#** `99351`

Thompson, Geoffrey   Nortel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**   *D3.1 #375*

Changes have been made for 100 Mb/s that violate the compatibility promises commited to in the 5 Criteria presentation that added 100 M to the project:
  Compatibility
    100BASE-X PCS & PMA assumed, and the 802.3 MAC
    - No changes whatsoever to the MAC
    - PHY identical to current 100Mbps Std except for a new PMD
    - No change to Clause 24
    - Retain all state machines, 4B/5B coding etc. of 100BASE-X
      o Only need to extend Clause 26, 100BASE-FX PMD, to include SMF
      o Physical medium compatibility through SMF
    - Compatible with existing 1000BASE-LX
    - Provides upgrade paths to higher speeds and multiple wavelengths, with fiber plant untouched

SuggestedRemedy

Remove all changes to 100BASE-X other than PMD optical changes to bring the proposal back into line with the 5 Criteria Compatibility promises made when 100 M was added to the project.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See the presentation dawe_2_0304 that serves to make unidirectional operation dependent upon the ability of the PHY and the existence of the OAM Remote Fault option.

Promises made by a presenter back in St. Louis are in no way binding on the group. The text referenced is from a presentation by Ulf Jonsson, made at a Call For Interest, archived in the file:

http://www.ieee802.org/3/smfx_study/public/jonsson_1_0302.pdf

It was never adopted by the task force, and is not binding on the task force.

The baseline presentation on the subject is archived in the file:

http://www.ieee802.org/3/efm/baseline/jonsson_1_0502.pdf

This presentation also assumes that the 100BASE-X PCS is retained unchanged, but decisions to modify the PCS have been made since the baseline was adopted, and these are reflected in the approved text of the draft.

The PAR and 5 Criteria for EFM never claimed that the 100BASE-X PCS would be retained unchanged. The changes that we have made to the 100BASE-X PCS for the sake of unidirectional OAM PDU transmission were approved by the WG in the course of the WG ballot. This change was approved in Italy in September of 2003 in the following

presentation:

http://www.ieee802.org/3/efm/public/sep03/frazier_1_0903.pdf

Cl **66**   *SC* **66.**   *P*   *L*   **#** `91420`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1644*

Excessive length title: this will cause major problems with auto TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy

Shorter, as shown above.
DVJ1-415

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. This draft has been reviewed by the IEEE editors and they have no comments against the length of the clause title

Cl **66**   *SC* **66.3.2.2**   *P* **540**   *L* **41**   **#** `99313`

Grow, Robert   Intel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *D3.0 #552*

The true value needs to be better tied to the register bits that define unidirectional being enabled.

SuggestedRemedy

TRUE; Unidirectional capability enabled (register bits 0.1 = 1 and 1.7 = 1, see Clause 22)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT.

This is the RS. Clause 22 registers have never been used to represent variables or anything else in an RS. While the RS is part of the physical layer, it is not part of the PHY.

Cl **66**   *SC* **66.3.2.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** `91421`

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1645*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>diagram
DVJ1-418

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **66** *SC* **66.4** *P* *L* **#** **91422**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *DVJ-1646*
The "Clause" and "68" are unnaturally split across lines.

SuggestedRemedy
Use a nonbreaking space.
DVJ1-420

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The "Clause 66" in this subclause title should be a cross-reference

Cl **66** *SC* **66.4** *P* *L* **#** **91423**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1647*
The title is too long and will overflow automatic TOC generation.

SuggestedRemedy
Make it smaller, as suggested above.
DVJ1-420

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. This draft has been reviewed by the IEEE editors and they have no comments against the length of the clause title

Cl **66** *SC* **66.4.3** *P* *L* **#** **91425**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1649*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-420

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The format of this table matches those of nearly all PICS tables throughout this and the base document

Cl **66** *SC* **66.4.4** *P* *L* **#** **91426**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1650*
Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
As corrected above ==>reconciliation sublayer
DVJ1-420

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The comment requests modification of text that was previously approved and is unchanged in this draft.

Cl **66** *SC* **66.4.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **91429**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1653*
The Subclause, columns is mislabeled.

SuggestedRemedy
Change Subclause==>Clause.
DVJ1-421

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The format of this table matches those of nearly all PICS tables throughout this and the base document

Cl **66** *SC* **66.4.4.1** *P* *L* **#** **91428**
David V. James JGG

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *DVJ-1652*
The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
Center them.
DVJ1-420

Proposed Response *Response Status* **U**
REJECT. The format of this table matches those of nearly all PICS tables throughout this and the base document

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
Page 240 of 242
Cl **66** *SC* **66.4.4.1**

Cl **66**   *SC* **66.4.4.2**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91431**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1655*
    The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
    Center them.
    DVJ1-421

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
    REJECT. The format of this table matches those of nearly all PICS tables throughout this
    and the base document

Cl **66**   *SC* **66.4.4.3**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91433**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1657*
    The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
    Center them.
    DVJ1-421

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
    REJECT. The format of this table matches those of nearly all PICS tables throughout this
    and the base document

Cl **66**   *SC* **66.4.4.4**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91435**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1659*
    The Subclause, Status, and Support columns should definitely be centered.

SuggestedRemedy
    Center them.
    DVJ1-421

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
    REJECT. The format of this table matches those of nearly all PICS tables throughout this
    and the base document

Cl **67**   *SC* **67.3**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91437**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1661*
    Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
    As corrected above ==>Hybrid media topologies
    DVJ1-423

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **67**   *SC* **67.6**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91438**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1662*
    Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
    As corrected above ==>administration, and meintenance
    DVJ1-423

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **67**   *SC* **67.6.1**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91439**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1663*
    Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
    As corrected above ==>client
    DVJ1-423

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **67**   *SC* **67.6.2**   *P*   *L*   *#* **91440**
David V. James   JGG

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **R**   *DVJ-1664*
    Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy
    As corrected above ==>passive
    DVJ1-424

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **U**
    REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.

Cl **67**   *SC* **67.6.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91441**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1665*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>multi-point
DVJ1-424

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Style is consistent with previously accepted style in the
document.

Cl **67**   *SC* **67.6.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91442**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1666*

Excess capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

As corrected above ==>control
DVJ1-424

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Style is consistent with previously accepted style in the
document.

Cl **67A**   *SC* **67A.3**   *P*   *L*   **#** **91546**

David V. James   JGG

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *DVJ-1770*

Acronym used, but not defined.

SuggestedRemedy

==>FP, include in the initial abbreviations
DVJ1-479

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **U**

REJECT. Comment is on unchanged text.
Abbreviation is expanded in context.