802.3ah Ethernet in the First Mile

November 2002 802.3 Plenary Meeting Kauai, Hawaii USA

Task Force Minutes

Scott Simon, Recording Secretary

PLENARY TF MEETING MONDAY, NOVEMBER 11

Howard Frazier, Chairman IEEE 802.3ah EFM Task Force, opens the meeting as part of the 802.3 opening plenary and presents agenda_1_1102.pdf.

session concludes

TF MEETING THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 14

1. Motion to approve the minutes from the previous meeting

Moved: Daun Langston Second: Brian Arnold

Unanimous by voice vote

MOTION PASSES

2. Motion to add an FEC option to the 1 Gig P2MP PMD Phys based on the following presentations: khermosh_general_1_0702.pdf as further elaborated in khermosh_fec_1_0902.pdf and maislos_fec_2_0902.pdf.

Moved: Larry Rennie Second: Meir Bartur

Motion to divide by separating maislos fee 2 0902.pdf from the motion on the floor.

Moved: Pat Thaler Second: Piers Dawe

Procedural motion, requires >= 50% to pass

Y: 26 N:0

MOTION IS DIVIDED

3. Motion to add an FEC option to the 1 Gig P2MP PMD Phys based on the following presentations: khermosh_general_1_0702.pdf as further elaborated in khermosh_fec_1_0902.pdf. (Part 1 of divided Motion #2)

Moved: Larry Rennie Second: Meir Bartur

Technical motion, requires \geq = 75% in favour to pass

Among those present: Y:64 N:3 A:24

Howard and Bob Grow agree to decline a vote among 802.3 voters.

MOTION PASSES

4. Motion to add an FEC option to the 1 Gig P2MP PMD Phys based on maislos_fec_2_0902.pdf. (Part 2 of divided Motion #2)

Moved: Larry Rennie Second: Meir Bartur

MOTION WITHDRAWN

5. Motion to charter the editor to create D1.2 of C56 and C57 based on the comment resolutions from D1.1 as recorded in the comment database.

Moved: Gerry Pesavento Second: Ariel Maislos

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present: Y:80 N:0 A:11

6. Motion to charter the editor to create D1.2 of Clauses 58, 59, 60 and Annex 64A based on the comment resolution from D1.1 as recorded in the comment database.

Moved: Vipul Bhatt on behalf of the optical PMD STF

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present:

Y:89 N:0 A:5

MOTION PASSES

Straw poll to decide which option for burst mode timing parameters is preferred by the TF. As presented in bhatt_general_1_1102_v4.pdf.

Voting for just one option:

Those who like Option A – Specify tight (a la FSAN) timing parameters: 22

Those who like Option B – Specify loose (a la 802.3z) timing parameters: 7

Those who like Option C – Specify tight parameters for ONU-Tx and loose parameters for OLT-Rx: 2

Those who like Option D – Don't specify timing parameters: 35

7. Motion that for PMD burst-mode timing parameters, choose Option D, described in bhatt_general_1_1102.pdf (That is, don't specify timing parameters. Specify only the startup values, and leave operational values to implementers)

Moved: Vipul Bhatt Second: Glenn Kramer

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present: Y:50 N:15 A:30

Among 802.3 voters: Y:41 N:15 A:20

MOTION FAILS because it failed to carry >= 75% among both populations

8. Motion to adopt the liason to ITU-T Q2/15 as in frazier_general_5_1102.pdf.

Moved: Vipul Bhatt Second: Barry O'Mahony

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present: Y: Unanimous voice vote

MOTION PASSES

9. Motion to adopt the optical PMD naming nomenclature per Naming #1 in diab general 1 1102

Moved: Wael Diab

Second: Jonathan Thatcher

Technical motion, requires \geq 75% in favour to pass

Among those present:

Y:74 N:0 A:10

MOTION PASSES

10. Motion to adopt the OAM comment responses (22, 24, 30, 36, 43B, 55) to D1.1 as the basis for creating D1.2

Moved: Matt Squire on behalf of the OAM STF

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present:

Y:66 N:0 A:15

MOTION PASSES

11. Motion to accept the liason response to ITU-T Q.12/15

Moved: Matt Squire Second: Don Pannell

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present:

MOTION PASSES

12. Motion to send letter as prepared by Barry O'Mahony to committee ITU-T Q4/SG15

Moved: Hugh Barrass on behalf of CuSTF

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present: Y: Unanimous voice vote

MOTION PASSES

13. Motion to send letter as prepared by Michael Beck and as amended by 802.3ah to committee ETSI TM6

Moved: Hugh Barrass on behalf of CuSTF

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present:

Y: Unanimous voice vote

MOTION PASSES

14. Motion to adopt draft 1.1 of Clauses 45, 61, 62 and Annex 62A along with all resolved comments as the basis of draft 1.2 of Clauses 25, 61, 62 and Annex 62A. Unresolved comments will be reproduced in the draft.

Moved: Hugh Barrass on behalf of CuSFT

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present:

Y:89 N:0 A:11

MOTION PASSES

Vancouver.

15. Motion to reproduce draft 1.1 as draft 1.2 Clause 63 with the LR PHY debate to be resolved in

Moved: Hugh Barrass on behalf of CuSTF

Motion to amend the motion in question by adding the text "and incorporate all resolved comments" after the words "draft 1.1". Add the sentence "Unresolved comments will be reproduced in the draft."

Moved: Doug Artman Second: Jonathan Thatcher

Technical motion, requires \geq = 75% in favour to pass

Among those present:

Y:80 N:1 A:24

MOTION PASSES

Motion to amend the motion in question by changing the text "draft 1.2" to "draft 1.1a"

Moved: Geoff Thompson

Second: Tom Dineen

Motion to amend the motion to read: "Add the text `as a separately published document (1.1a), `after the words `Reproduce as`."

Moved: Hugh Barrass

MOTION DEEMED FRIENDLY

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass Among those present: Y:45 N:8 A:41

MOTION PASSES AS AMENDED

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass Among those present:
Y:71 N:1 A:26

MOTION PASSES AS AMENDED

Final text of the motion:

Reproduce, as a separately published document (1.1a), draft 1.1 and incorporate all resolved comments for Clause 63 with the LR PHY debate to be resolved in Vancouver. Unresolved comments will be reproduced in the draft.

16. Motion to send the letter prepared by Michael Beck, as amended by the 802.3ah TF, to committee T1

Moved: Michael Beck Second: Daun Langston

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present:
Y: Unanimous voice vote

MOTION PASSES

Howard presents draft 1.1 comment #116.

17. Motion to adopt the proposed response to comment #116

Moved: Geoff Thompson Second: Brad Booth

Technical motion, requires >= 75% in favour to pass

Among those present: Y:74 N:0 A:16

MOTION PASSES AS AMENDED

Howard presents draft comment #129, describing a proposed remedy.

Howard asks if there is any opposition to the remedy, none indicated.

Howard reminds the TF of the next interim meeting to be held in Vancouver from January 6-9. Straw Poll to determine preference for the location of the May 12-16 interim meeting

Those who like Rome in May: 58

Those who like Seoul, South Korea in May: 51

Those who like Rome in September: 58

Those who like Seoul, South Korea in September: 46

Those who support Rome in September, Seoul in May: 90

MEETING ADJOURNED