C/ 00 SC Brad Booth	Р 6 АМСС	L 13	# 16	C/ 00 SC Brad Booth	<i>Р</i> 6 АМСС	L 29	# 18
Comment Type E An extra I was added.	Comment Status A			Comment Type E Typo.	Comment Status A		
SuggestedRemedy Change to be:				SuggestedRemedy `'Clock should just b	be `Clock.		
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C		
C/ 00 SC Brett McClellan	P 6 Solarflare	L 13	# 2	Cl 00 SC Ilango Ganga	P 6 Intel	L 32	# 8
Comment Type E typos: "Idle in II ', not"	Comment Status A should be "'Idle in I ', nor"			Comment Type E Answer to Question stream" could be us 48.2.4.2.3. Hence th	Comment Status A 3c: Change "unenclosed domain sed instead of "domain", to be com he last sentence of the paragraph	" to "unencode isistent with the could be reph	ed domain". Also "data e explanation in rased as follows.
correct as shown above Response	Response Status C			SuggestedRemedy Rephrase the sente	nce as follows: "Hence in the end	oded data stre	am deletion has to be a
ACCEPT.				whole column, wher	reas in the unencoded data stream	n it does not".	
C/ 00 SC Brad Booth Comment Type E	P 6 AMCC Comment Status R	L 25	# [17	ACCEPT IN PRINC Implement suggester line 9 and 14.	IPLE.	main' to ' da	ta stream' on page 7,
.'. should be just .' SuggestedRemedy				C/ 00 SC Brad Booth	Р 6 Амсс	L 32	# [19
As per comment. Occur	s in multiple instances.			Comment Type E	Comment Status A		
Response	Response Status C			Missing an 'and', an	d unenclosed incorrectly used.		
The first one is a period	and the second is a full stop.			SuggestedRemedy Insert 'and' to make and in the unencode	end of sentence read: ed domain		
				Response ACCEPT IN PRINC	Response Status C		
				See comment #8.			
				The word 'whereas'	will be added rather than 'and'.		

CI **00** SC

C/ 00 SC Brett McClellan	P 6 Solarflare	L 32	# 3	C/ 00 SC Brad Booth	P 7 AMCC	L 20	# 21
Comment Type E typo: "unenclosed	Comment Status A " should be "unencoded"			Comment Type E Incorrect spelling.	Comment Status A		
SuggestedRemedy correct as shown a	above			SuggestedRemedy that = than			
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C		
C/ 00 SC Ilango Ganga	P 7 Intel	L 14	# 6	C/ 00 SC Ilango Ganga	P 7 Intel	L 27	# 7
In answer to Ques other answers tha "see answer to qu SuggestedRemedy As per comment	tion 3g - part 2: Delete "above" fro t refer to question 3a, 3b. (or) If it is estion 3a above" then add "above	m end of the line s required to kee to all the answe	e to be consistent with op the sentence as ers that refer to 3a,3b.	Answer to Question SuggestedRemedy Change spelling to U sychronization in 802 As per comment	5: UK English versus US English JS English "synchronization" to B 2.3-2005.	h for spelling "s	ynchronisation". th spelling for
Response ACCEPT IN PRIN	Response Status C			Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C		
The word 'above'	will be deleted from end of the line.			C/ 00 SC Brett McClellan	P 7 Solarflare	L 9	# 4
Cl 00 SC Brad Booth Comment Type E Incorrect spelling. SuggestedRemedy	P 7 AMCC Comment Status A	<i>L</i> 14	# 1 <u>20</u>	Comment Type E typo: "decoded" sho SuggestedRemedy correct as shown ab	Comment Status A uld be "encoded" ove		Technical
Change to be: une Also, insert a com Response	encoded ma after domain. <i>Response Status</i> C			Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C		
ACCEPT.							

CI **00** SC

C/ 00 SC Brett McClellan	P 7 Solarflare	L 9	# 5	C/ 03 Pat Thaler	SC 3b	P6 Broad	L	24	# 22
	Commont Status			Commont 7		Commont Status	•		
typo: "unedcoded" shou	uld be "unencoded"			This an	swer isn't corre	ect. The question inclu	A ded "sequence,	transmit error	propagation or
SuggestedRemedy				li ivaliu			are not the only	column that ca	n be deleted.
correct as shown above	9			Suggestear	remeay	s the rules concerning	a what can be d	olotod It statos	that 'Idla
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			insertio orderec deletior	n or deletion or sets are dele	ccurs in groups of four ted to adapt between	· Idle characters clock rates." and	d "Sequence or	"Sequence dered_set
Note - typo is on line 14	I, not line 9.			and del deleted	etes only one of is a sequence	of the two." Hence the ordered_set that is ac	only code group	p "other than id er sequence or	e" that may be dered_set.
CI 03 SC 3a	P 6	L 20	# 23	Response	·	Response Status	C	·	_
Pat Thaler	Broadcom			ACCEF	νT.	,	-		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status A			01.00	00.04			20	# 04
I think we should docun because the current sta	nent the bug in the standard b andard allows deletion of an id	etter to aid in fix le ordered_set t	ing it correctly and hat could cause a	Pat Thaler	SC 30	P 6 Broad	lcom	32	# 24
packet to be dropped. L know about the issue so it gets fixed.	Jntil we put a fix in place it wo o they can avoid it and to docu	uld be appropria ument the bug w	te to let implementers rell enough to ensure	Comment 7 "unencl	<i>ype</i> E losed domain"	Comment Status ?	Α		
SuggestedRemedy				Suggestedl	Remedy				
Add the following betwe	een the two sentences of the c	urrent response	:	should	be "unencodec	I domain"			
Also subclause 48.2.4.2 packet. Consider the fol	2.3 allows deletion of a set of a lowing sequence of columns	4 idles that will r	esult in loss of a	Response ACCEF	ΥТ.	Response Status	С		
Column 12345				C/ Interpre	SC Questio	n3c P6	L	32	# 31
Lane0 DTOTT				Jeff Lapak		UNH-	IOL		
Lane2IIOII				Comment 7	уре Е	Comment Status	Α		
Lane3 ITOTT				Spelling	g Error				
Column 1 contains a ter column 2 appears to be	rminate, column 3 contains ar a allowed by all the criteria in 4	sequence orde 8.2.4.2.3: it is a	red_set. Deletion of group of 4 Idle	Suggestedl Replac	R <i>emedy</i> e the word une	nclosed with unencod	ed		
characters and deleting set is not counted. If col in lanes 2 and 3 of the c column after the T co	it will leave a greater than five lumn 2 is deleted, the check_c column before 1 and in lanes (plumn contains code groups of the state of the state of the state of the state of the state of the state of the state of the state of the state of the state of the state of the state of the st	e character IPG end function (48 0 and 1 of colum her than /A/ or /	even if the ordered .2.6.1.4) will insert E in 1 because the K/.	Response ACCEF	ΫТ.	Response Status	С		
Response	Response Status C								
ACCEPT.									
TYPE: TR/technical required COMMENT STATUS: D/dis SORT ORDER: Clause, S	d ER/editorial required GR/g patched A/accepted R/reject Subclause, page, line	eneral required ed RESPON	T/technical E/editorial G/ge SE STATUS: O/open W/wri	eneral tten C/closed	U/unsatisfied	Z/withdrawn	Cl Interpre	3c	Page 3 of 7 10/30/2006 00:09:40

Cl Interpre SC Question5 Jeff Lapak	P 7 UNH-IOL	L 27	# 25	C/ Q3 SC Piers Dawe	Р 6 Avago Techr	L 32 nologies	# 11
Comment Type E Spelling Error	Comment Status A			Comment Type E unenclosed	Comment Status A		
SuggestedRemedy Replace the word synchr	onisation with synchroniza	tion		SuggestedRemedy unencoded. Is this t	he official terminology anyway'	?	
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			Response ACCEPT IN PRINCI	Response Status C PLE.		
CI Q2 SC Piers Dawe Comment Type E Not proper names	P 6 Avago Techn Comment Status A	L 14 ologies	# 9	The word 'unenclose Unencoded is the te compensation may b unencoded data stre	ed' will be corrected to be 'uner rm used in subclause 48.2.4.2. be performed via insertion or re am or R in the encoded Idle	ncoded'. 3 Skip R which moval of either Io stream.'.	reads 'Clock rate lle characters in the
SuggestedRemedy Lower case: reserved, in	valid			C/ Q3 SC g1 Piers Dawe	Р 7 Avago Techr	L 9 nologies	# 12
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			Comment Type E decoded	Comment Status A		
C/ Q2 SC Piers Dawe	P 6 Avago Techn	L 15	# 10	SuggestedRemedy encoded?			
Comment Type T This sentence mystifies r	Comment Status A me. Why are we talking ab	out an XGMII da	ta code of 0x07? Does	Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C		
it somehow follow from the up by way of illustration? data character? Or 3 or one bit of TXC of Table 4 simply binary 1). Accord	he question (how?) or is it a (If so, say so.) By "XGMI 4 similar ones? Is the "con I8-2, TXC<3:0> or what? (ing to Table 48-2, TXC=1 y	an example the r I data code" doe trol code" an XC If it's one bit of T vith TXD=07 coo	espondent has made s he mean an XGMII GMII control character, IXC, it's not "0x1" but les to idle, not K30.7.	C/ Q3 SC g2 Piers Dawe Comment Type E	P 7 Avago Techi Comment Status A	L 14 nologies	# [13
SuggestedRemedy ?				unedcoded SuggestedRemedy			
Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE	Response Status C			unencoded? <i>Response</i> ACCEPT.	Response Status C		
of 0x0 is the XGMII code	for /l/)'.						

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI Q3 SC g2 Page 4 of 7 10/30/2006 00:09:40

CI Q3c SC	P6	L 32	# 1	C/ Questio SC		P6	L 10	# 26
Robert Grow	Intel Corporation			Hugh Barrass		Cisco Syster	ns	
Comment Type E	Comment Status A			Comment Type	T Comr	ment Status A		
Spell check finger fault	t error?			I do not agree t	hat the source is	unambiguous. I th	ink that option 1 (or 4) is also a valid
SuggestedRemedy				detected by the	receiver.			s an error being
Change "unenclosed"	to "unencoded"			SuggestedRemedy				
Response ACCEPT.	Response Status C			Change "Unam	biguous." to "Am	nbiguous."		
	07		"	Change the foll	owing text to rea	d:		
Piers Dawe	P7 Avago Technologi	# 14	This represents an ambiguity in the standard. This has been brought to the attention of the Working Group for possible action at the next revision.					
Comment Type E Be kind to the reader! SuggestedRemedy Point out that the text i	Comment Status A	2.6.1.3.		In the example cannot be cons codes cannot b 48-2. Instead th	given in question idered to be a I e considered to b herefore they sho	n 2, there is not a fu ordered_set (see be ældle in I Æ, r buld be considered	ull column of Idle, subclause 48.2.4 nor ældle in T Æ either a Reserved	and therefore this 2). Hence these ., as defined in Table 4 XGMII character or code of 0/1 is an
Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIPL	Response Status C _E.			invalid XGMII c invalid XGMII c interpretation.	haracter and will	be encoded as /K3	30.7/. Option 2 is	thefore the preferred
We will add text to poir	nt out that the submitted question	refers to wro	ng clause.	However, "Erro basis" (see sub been detected i	r is signaled per clause 48.2.4.4) in an IIIII ordered	lane since code-vio therefore an altern	blations are detec ative interpretatio	ted on a per lane n is that an error has r-lane basis. This would
Piers Dawe	Avago Technologi	es		indicate that op	tion 4 (also optio	on 1) is a valid inter	pretation.	
Comment Type E that	Comment Status A			Note that either and will lead to	interpretation withe same end re	ill allow the receive sult.	r to detect that an	error has occurred
SuggestedRemedy				Response	Respc	onse Status C		
than				ACCEPT IN PR	INCIPLE.			
Response	Response Status C			Change the res	ponse to read:			
ACCEPT.				There are two a unambiguously Theses two alte	alternatives interp detect that an er ernatives are as f	pretations however rror has occurred a follows:	both enable the r nd will lead to the	eceiver to same end result.
				[Alternative 1] In therefore this ca Hence these co as defined in Ta XGMII characte code of 0x1 is a 0x07 with a con the interpretation	n the example gi annot be conside ides cannot be c able 48-2. Instea er or invalid XGMI an invalid XGMII ntrol code of 0x0 on for this alterna	ven in question 2, t ered to be a I ord onsidered to be 'Id d therefore they ha III character. An XG character and will t is the XGMII code tive.	here is not a full c ered_set (see sub le in 1 ', not for t ve to be consider GMII data code of be encoded as /K for /I/). Option 2 w	column of Idle, and oclause 48.2.4.2). hat matter 'Idle in T ', ed either a reserved 0x07 with a control 30.7/ (a data code of rould be therefore be
TYPE: TR/technical require	ed FR/editorial required GR/gene	eral required	T/technical E/editorial G/ge	neral				

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ Questio SC 10/30/2006 00:09:40

[Alternative 2] Subclause 48.2.4.4 states 'Error is signaled per lane since code-violations are detected on a per lane basis' therefore an alternative interpretation is that an error has been detected in an ||I|| ordered set and that this should be signaled on a per-lane basis. Option 4 would be therefore be the interpretation for this alternative.

C/ Questio SC	P 6	L 19	# 27
Hugh Barrass	Cisco Systems		

Comment Type T Comment Status R

I do not agree that the text in 46.2.1 is ambiguous. It may not convey the intent of the Working Group that drafted the paragraph but it is, nonetheless unambiguous.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Ambiguous." to "Unambiguous."

Change the following text to read:

The first sentence in 46.2.1 states unequivocally, "The inter-frame <inter-frame> period on an XGMII transmit or receive path is an interval during which no frame data activity occurs." This does not make any relation between any specific code groups and the definition of inter-frame period.

The second sentence in 46.2.1 makes assertions regarding the start and end of the interframe period. "The <inter-frame> corresponding to the MAC interpacket gap begins with the Terminate control character, continues with Idle control characters and ends with the Idle control character prior to a Start control character." Therefore the first characters of the inter-frame period must be Terminate and some number of Idle control characters. After that there may be other control (non-frame data) characters as long as the inter-frame period finishes with an Idle control character followed by a Start control character.

The final sentence of 46.2.1 states that "The minimum IPG at the XGMII of the receiving RS is five octets." The counting of "octets" is not restricted to Idle control codes.

Therefore the answer to question 3a) is unambiguously "yes."

Response Status C

Response

REJECT.

Taking a very conservative viewpoint the word 'continues' could be seen to imply that the IPG is only counted during the Idle control characters.

Cl Questio SC		P 6	L 34	# 28
Hugh Barrass		Cisco Systems		
Comment Type	т	Comment Status R		

I do not agree that the text in 46.2.1 is ambiguous. It may not convey the intent of the Working Group that drafted the paragraph but it is, nonetheless unambiguous.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Ambiguous." to "Unambiguous."

Change the following text to read:

As stated in the response to question 3a) the counting of octets in the IPG is not dependent on Idle control codes.

Therefore the answer to question 3d) is unambiguously "yes." It should be noted, however, that the sequence shown in the example does not conform to the definition of 46.2.1 as interpreted in the response of question 3a).

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

See #27.

Cl Questio SC Hugh Barrass	P 7 Cisco Systen	L 4 ns	# 29	C/ Questio SC Hugh Barrass	P 7 Cisco Syste	L 13	# 30		
Comment Type T I do not agree that th Working Group that	Comment Status R ne text in 46.2.1 is ambiguous. I drafted the paragraph but it is, i	t may not conve nonetheless una	ey the intent of the ambiguous.	Comment Type T I do not agree tha Working Group th	Comment Status R at the text in 46.2.1 is ambiguous hat drafted the paragraph but it is	. It may not conve , nonetheless una	y the intent of the mbiguous.		
SuggestedRemedy Change "Ambiguous	s." to "Unambiguous."			SuggestedRemedy Change "Ambigu	ous." to "Unambiguous."				
Change the following	g text to read:			Change the follow	wing text to read:				
As stated in the response to question 3a) the counting of octets in the IPG is not dependent on Idle control codes. Therefore the inter-frame period after deletion would be 5				As stated in the response to question 3a) the counting of octets in the IPG is not dependent on Idle control codes.					
However, if column 3 is deleted in the example the remaining inter-frame period would start with only 1 Idle following a Terminate and would end with an Error preceding a Start. This				Therefore the ans It should be noted the definition of 4	swer to question 3g) for an uneco d, however, that the sequence sh 6.2.1 as interpreted in the respon	ided data stream in own in the examp use of question 3a	s unambiguously "yes." le does not conform to).		
is in contradiction to	the definition in 46.2.1.			Response	Response Status C				
Therefore the answe that this may not cor	Therefore the answer to question 3f) is unambiguously "no." It should be noted, however,								
attention of the Working Group for possible action at the next revision.				See #27.					
Response REJECT.	Response Status C								
See #27.									