IEEE 802.3 Maintenance Task Force
September 2011 Meeting Minutes
Chicago, IL
Tuesday, September 13th and Wednesday, September 14th, 2011
http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/index.html

Minutes recorded by the recording secretary.

Meeting called to order by Mr. Wael William Diab (Chair) at 9:05AM September 13th, 2011. Mr. Diab introduced the officers of the Maintenance Task Force and the IEEE P802.3 (802.3bh) Task Force:
- Ms. Valerie Maguire (Recording Secretary/Maint TF; Clause Editor P802.3 TF)
- Mr. PeteAnslow (Section Editor P802.3 TF)
- Mr. Marek Hajduczenia (Section Editor P802.3 TF)

Mr. Diab asked the meeting attendees to introduce themselves.

For the meeting slides, please refer
to: http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0911.pdf

For the comment resolution database, please refer to:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/bh/comments/index.html

Patent Slides
Mr. Diab displayed the patent policy slides and guidelines and allowed time for the group to digest the information. The patent slides were shown at 9:10AM. Mr. Diab called for any known Letters of Assurance (LOAs). Response: none.

Attendance
Mr. Diab informed the attendees about the attendance recording mechanisms. The following individuals recorded their attendance and affiliation on September 13th:

Name	Affiliation	Name	Affiliation
Abbott, John	Corning Inc.	Law, David	HP
Anslow, Pete	Ciena	Lewis, Dave	JDSU
Barrass, Hugh	Cisco	Lingle, Jr., Robert	OFS
Diab, Wael	Broadcom	Maguire, Valerie	Siemon
Dwelley, Dave	Linear Tech	Maki, Jeffrey	Juniper Networks
Elbakoury, Hesham	Huawei	Nowell, Mark	Cisco
Erminhizer, Erich	TE Connectivity	Ossman, Valentin	PMC-Sierra
Grow, Bob	Intel	Palkert, Tom	Molex/Xilinx
Hajduczenia, Marek	ZTE	Petrilla, John	Avaco Technology
Kasturia, Sanjay	PLX Technology	Remein, Duane	Huawei
King, Jonathan	Finisar	Shrikhande, Kapil	Dell

Knittle, Curtis	Cable Labs		Stassar, Peter	Huawei
Kolesar, Paul	CommScope		Swanson, Steve	Corning Inc.
Kramer, Glen	Broadcom		Thaler, Pat	Broadcom
Larsen, Wayne	CommScope			

The following individuals recorded their attendance and affiliation on September 14th:

Name	Affiliation		Name	Affiliation
Alie, Stephen	Cortina Systems		Larsen, Wayne	CommScope
Ben Artsi, Liav	Marvell		Laubach, Mark	Broadcom
Diab, Wael	Broadcom		Maguire, Valerie	Siemon
Elbakenry, Hesham	Huawei		Mallette, Edwon	Bright House Net.
Grow, Bob	Intel		Ossman, Valentin	PMC-Sierra
Hajduczenia, Marek	ZTE		Regev, Eran	Marvell
Hamano, Hiroshi	Fujitsu Labs		Remein, Duane	Huawei
Harel, Ziv	Marvell		Thaler, Pat	Broadcom
Knittle, Curtis	Cable Labs		Wang, Xiaofeng	PMC-Sierra
Kramer, Glen	Broadcom			

Agenda

Mr. Diab went through the agenda:
- Review patent slides
- Review and approve agenda
- Approve maintenance minutes
- Maintenance request status
- P802.3 Revision (IEEE 802.3bh) Task Force
  - Statistics on the initial ballot
  - Chair's guidelines on discussion
  - Comment resolution
    - Per http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/comment_schedule_1_0911.pdf
  - Future schedule
  - MOAM
- Future meetings

Motion #1: Approve agenda
    M: M. Hadjuzenia
    S: H. Barrass
    Procedural (>50%)
    Passed by voice vote without opposition

Motion #2: Approve the July 2011minutes
    M: P. Anslow
    S: R. Grow
    Procedural (>50%)
    Passed by voice vote without opposition

Maintenance Requests
Mr. Diab indicated that we have:
- 32 Open Maintenance requests
- 0 new requests since March
- Current status of open requests:

Balloting	27
Ready for ballot	0
Awaiting clarification	0
Errata	0
To be categorised	5

Note: All requests in balloting state are being balloted in IEEE P802.3 (802.3bh)
Revision to IEEE Std 802.3-2008.

No new maintenance requests were received this period.

Maintenance Notes
Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0911.pdf

P802.3 Revision (IEEE 802.3bh)
Mr. Diab reviewed the initial ballot statistics, including statistics on individual comments related to maintenance requests and overall comment distribution. Mr. Diab also reviewed guidelines for discussion. Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0911.pdf

Comment resolution was recorded online in the comment database. Refer to http://www.ieee802.org/3/bh/comments/P802d3_802d3_bh_D2p0_All_Clause.pdf.

Note: Unless otherwise stated, comments were closed without opposition. Motions related to comments below are when there was discussion or opposition voiced.

Presentations related to comments
- Mr. Jonathan King presented "Defining 10GBASE-S over OM4media".
- Mr. Jonathan King responded to questions related to his "Alternative optical Tx eye-mask for 10GBASE-R modules (Clause 52)" presentation.
- Mr. Tom Palkert presented "Common Mode RL for 40GBASE-CR4/SR4 and 100GBASE-CR10/SR10".
- Mr. Diab appointed Mr. Palkert to Chair an Ad Hoc to gather more information on the impact of this proposed change.

Motion #3: Accept comment 45
No objection to calling the question
Technical ($\geq$ 75%)
All: Y: 15   N: 1   A: 3
Motion Passes

Motion #4: Accept comment 112
No objection to calling the question
Technical ($\geq$ 75%)
All: Y: 16   N: 1   A: 8
Motion Passes

Motion #5: Accept comment 183
No objection to calling the question
Technical ($\geq$ 75%)
All: Y: 6   N: 1   A: 8
Motion Passes

Motion #6: Accept the resolution to the comments identified in Bucket Motion 1
M: M. Hadjuzenia
S: J. King
Technical ($\geq$ 75%)
All: Y: 14   N: 0   A: 3
Motion Passes

Motion #7: Reject comment 427
No objection to calling the question
Technical ($\geq$ 75%)
All: Y: 8   N: 3   A: 6
Motion Fails

Motion #8: Resolve comment 427 as an AIP with the following text, "The 10GBASE-CX4 MDI shall be interoperable with compliant interfaces and cable assemblies."
No objection to calling the question
Technical ($\geq$ 75%)
All: Y: 8   N: 7   A: 2
Motion Fails

A motion was made by Ms. Thaler to re-consider the motion rejecting comment 427. Ms. Thaler noted that as an abstain on the initial vote she was eligible to make the motion. The Chair concurred. There was subsequent discussion on whether or not an abstain voter was eligible to make the motion to reconsider. The Chair noted that an abstain voter, not being on the losing side, would qualify to make the motion. The Chair also noted that RROR are used as a guide, nevertheless, as there was continued discussion on the ruling, the Chair suggested to the dissenting participants that they were welcome to overturn his ruling.

Motion #9: Overturn the Chair's ruling
    M: P. Kolesar
    S: W. Larsen
    Supermajority (> 2/3)
    All: Y: 3   N: 11 A:3
    Motion Fails

Motion #10: Re-consider the motion to reject comment 427
    No objection to calling the question
    Procedural (> 50%)
    All: Y: 12 N: 3   A: 2
    Motion Passes

Motion #11: Reject comment 427
    No objection to calling the question
    M: P. Thaler
    S: R. Grow
    Technical (≥ 75%)
    All: Y: 11 N: 3   A: 2
    Motion Passes

Motion #12: Accept all proposed comment resolutions related to revised ITU-T references
    M: P. Anslow
    S: B. Booth
    Technical (≥ 75%)
    Passed by voice vote without opposition

Motion #13: Accept the resolution to the comments identified in Bucket Motion 2
    M: D. Law
    S: S. Trowbridge
    Technical (≥ 75%)
    Passed by voice vote without opposition

<div align="center">The group recessed Tuesday evening at 9PM</div>

Mr. Diab called the meeting to order at 9AM on Wednesday September 14th.

Presentations related to comments, cont.
- Mr. Valentin Ossman presented "Implications of Comments 234, 235,and 236".
- Mr. Hugh Barrass presented "Comment Resolution for EPON Multicast LLD".

As the comments and presentations covered related areas, comment 235 was used to discuss the mLLID issue.

Motion #14: Accept proposed resolution to comment 235 as outlined in barrass_1_0911.pdf
    M: H. Barrass
    S: H. Frazier
    No objection to calling the question
    Technical ($\geq$ 75%)
    All: Y: 12   N: 6   A:6
    Motion Fails

The Chair appointed Mr. Frazier to run an ad-hoc on the topic and encouraged the participants interested to try and meet during the day.

Motion #15: Defer discussion of comment 235 until 3:00pm
    No objection to the motion
    Procedural (> 50%)
Passed by voice vote without opposition

Motion #16: Accept proposed resolutions to editorial, non-controversial comments in clauses 4 and 6
    M: M. Hadjuzenia
    S: B. Booth
    Technical ($\geq$ 75%)
    Passed by voice vote without opposition

The ad-hoc on mLLID met and made a short report which can be found at
http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/mllid_adhoc_1_0911.pdf

Based on the ad-hoc report, a motion was made to accept the proposed resolution to comment 235 outlined in barrass_1_0911.pdf with the addition of an editor's note in both clause 65 and clause 76 stating that management attributes for multicast LLID need to be added to the draft. A question was raised as to whether this was a different motion from the original one. The Chair ruled that this motion was a different motion as the remedy to the comment had changed to incorporate input from the ad-hoc. The discussion on whether or not this is a new motion continued with a small number of participants at which point the Chair suggested to those participants that the group would have to proceed with business or they may offer a motion to overturn the ruling.

Motion #17: Overturn the Chair's ruling
    M: P. Northcott
    S: V. Ossman
    Supermajority (> 2/3)
    All: Y: 4   N: 20   A: 20
    Motion Fails

Motion #18: Accept proposed resolution to comment 235 as outlined in barrass_1_0911.pdf with the addition of an editor's note in both clause 65 and clause 76 that states that management attributes for multicast LLID need to be added to the draft
    M: H. Barrass
    S: H. Frasier
    Technical (≥ 75%)
    All: Y: 18 N: 6   A: 4
    Motion Passes

Following the motion, there was objection to close all the other mLLID comments with the same resolution as was the norm in the group for related comments. The Chair allowed a separate motion for #236 in an effort to end the debate.

Motion #19: Accept the resolution of comment 236
    Technical (≥ 75%)
    All: Y: 18 N: 6   A: 5
    Motion Passes

The Chair assigned Mike McCormack to Chair an Ad Hoc to resolve the issue identified in comment 145.

Motion #20: Accept the resolution to the comments identified in Bucket Motion 4
    M: M. Hadjuzenia
    S: H. Barrass
    Technical (≥ 75%)
    Passed by voice vote without opposition

The Chair stepped out of the meeting at 8:12pm and asked Mr. Marek Hadjuzenia to Chair. Mr. Diab returned at 8:17pm and assumed the Chair of the meeting.

Motion #21: Request that the IEEE 802.3 editorial team prepare draft D2.1 based upon D2.0 and responses to D2.0 comments as recorded in the database for a recirculation ballot
    M: M. Hadjuzenia
    S: P. Anslow
    Technical (≥ 75%)
    Passed by voice vote without opposition

Schedule
Mr. Diab reviewed the schedule related to the Working Group 1st recirculation ballot. The schedule summarized approximate ballot open and close, post results, post comments, post comments with proposed responses, and meet to consider comments dates. Refer to:http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/public/diab_1_0911.pdf

Motion #22: Adjourn
    M: H. Barrass
    S: R. Grow
    Procedural (>50%)
    Passed by voice vote without opposition

Adjourned at 9:13PM September 14th, 2011