802.3 PARs ad hoc report

IEEE 802.3 ad hoc on PARs from other WGs

Robert M. Grow, ad hoc chair

RMG Consulting

Vienna, Austria

18 July 2019

Agenda and notes

- Agenda
  - Welcome
  - Comment review
- Comments
  - Comments reflect a consensus of ad hoc meeting attendees.
  - Ad Hoc Chair tasked to post comments to EC reflector prior to Tuesday deadline.
  - Ad Hoc Chair tasked to include responses from other WGs prior to 802.3 closing plenary.

P802.1ABdh

Revision: Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks - Station and Media Access Control Connectivity Discovery Amendment: Support for Multiframe Protocol Data Units

PAR

- No comment.

CSD

- 1.2.4,b, Technical Feasibility — Though the CSD does not go to NesCom, it might be helpful to some if "ISIS" was expanded.

➢ Response: Accept
Replace 1.2.4,b text with the following:
"b) Existing layer 2 and layer 3 routing protocols, such as the Intermediate System to Intermediate System (IS-IS) protocol, defined in ISO/IEC 10589:2002, have similar transmission and reception characteristics and have been implemented and supported for many years on similar devices."

P802.1Qdj

Amendment: Bridges and Bridged Networks Amendment: Configuration Enhancements

PAR

- No comment.

CSD

- No comment.

P802.1AS

PAR extension

- No comment.

P802.11ay

Amendment: Enhanced Throughput for Operation in License-Exempt Bands Above 45 GHz

PAR extension

- No comment.

P802.11az

Amendment: Enhancements for Positioning

PAR extension

- No comment.

P802.15.9ma

Revision: Standard for Transport of Key Management Protocol (KMP)

NOTE - The revision upgrades the document from a Recommended Practice to a full Standard.

PAR

- 5.2, Scope — The new scope reads more like the need for the project or the project purpose would read if it were an amendment project. It is not of the quality of the previous Scope statement. Recommend deletion of first sentence (the last sentence makes the point). Replace "Additionally it" with "This Standard". Add any additional description on what the revised standard will contain. The Scope should not contain "may be added" statements, delete the "New KPM…" sentence.

➤ Response: "This standard defines security key management extensions to address session key generation (both 128-bit and 256-bit key lengths), the creation and/or transport of broadcast/multicast keys, and security algorithm agility. New Key Management Protocols (KMPs) are considered as part of this Standard. This standard maintains backwards compatibility with IEEE Std 802.15.9-2016."

P802.15.9ma (p.2)

- 5.3, Dependence on other projects — The question is not answered.
- ➤ Response: Answer is now No.
- 5.5, Need — Replace the last sentence with: "This revision will address the above deficiencies."
- ➤ Response: Accept with minor grammar change.
- 6.1.b, Registration activity — The current recommended practice contains registration activity (OUI, CID, and Ethertype specifications, reference to IANA Dragonfly registry, and has the KMP registry of Table E.1 where the standard itself is the registration authority). Therefore, the answer to this question should be yes. If no significant changes are expected in the revision, that can be added to the explanation.
- ➤ Response: "The current recommended practice contains registration activity (OUI, CID, and Ethertype specifications, reference to IANA Dragonfly registry, and has the KMP registry of Table E.1 where the standard itself is the registration authority). At this time, no significant changes are expected in the revision."

P802.15.9ma (p.3)

CSD

- The project number in the Title field of the 802.15 document header does not agree with the number on the PAR.
- ➢ Response: Now harmonized.
- 1.2.4, b, Technical Feasibility — "802.1x" should be "802.1X".
- ➢ Response: Accept.
- 1.2.5, c, Installation Cost — The answer about "manufacturing" is non-responsive to installation. Perhaps leverage the answer to Balanced Cost would be appropriate, e.g., existing equipment may be upgradable via firmware upgrade, and installation costs would not vary from current products implementing the recommended practice.
- ➢ Response: Accept.

P802.15.22.3

Extension: Spectrum Characterization and Occupancy Sensing

PAR extension

- No comments.