

IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group **Draft**  
Liaison Communication

Source: IEEE 802.3 Working Group<sup>1</sup>

To: Jooran Lee ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 6 Secretariat  
[jooran@ksa.or.kr](mailto:jooran@ksa.or.kr)

CC: Paul Nikolich Chair, IEEE 802 LMSC  
[p.nikolich@ieee.org](mailto:p.nikolich@ieee.org)  
Adam Healey Vice-chair, IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group  
[adam.healey@broadcom.com](mailto:adam.healey@broadcom.com)  
Pete Anslow Secretary, IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group  
[panslow@ciena.com](mailto:panslow@ciena.com)  
Andrew Myles Chair, IEEE 802 JTC1 Standing Committee  
[amyles@cisco.com](mailto:amyles@cisco.com)  
Jodi Haasz Stakeholder Engagement Liaison, IEEE-SA  
[j.haasz@ieee.org](mailto:j.haasz@ieee.org)

From: David Law Chair, IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group  
[dlaw@hpe.com](mailto:dlaw@hpe.com)

Subject: Liaison reply to China NB comments on the IEEE Std 802.3by-2016 60-day ballot and similar comments on the IEEE Std 802.3bq-2016, IEEE Std 802.3bp-2016, IEEE Std 802.3br-2016, and IEEE Std 802.3bz-2016 60-day ballots.

Approval: Agreed to at IEEE 802.3 Plenary meeting, Vancouver, BC, Canada **[date]**

Dear ISO/IEC JTC1 SC 6 Secretariat,

IEEE 802.3 would like to thank China NB for their review and comment on the submissions of IEEE Std 802.3by-2016, IEEE Std 802.3bq-2016, IEEE Std 802.3bp-2016, IEEE Std 802.3br-2016, and IEEE Std 802.3bz-2016 for adoption by ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 6. Please find below each comment and the proposed change as received followed by the response from the IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group.

**Comment CN1 001 on IEEE Std 802.3by-2016 [6N16535] and similar comments on IEEE Std 802.3bq-2016 [6N16536], IEEE Std 802.3bp-2016 [6N16537], IEEE Std 802.3br-2016 [6N16568], and IEEE Std 802.3bz-2016 [6Nxxxxx]):**

*IEEE 802.3byTM-2016 is the amendment to 802.3TM-2015. China has already submitted the comments on the pre-FDIS ballot of IEEE 802.3bwTM-2015 (6N16445). Security is an essential part of network-related standards, especially to Ethernet. The lack of security mechanisms will enable Ethernet facing various security threats, such as forgery devices, communications from eavesdropping and tampering. However, The version of IEEE 802.3TM-2015 fails to add the specification of Ethernet security in the text, neither security mechanisms nor references to*

---

<sup>1</sup> This document solely represents the views of the IEEE 802.3 Working Group, and does not necessarily represent a position of the IEEE, the IEEE Standards Association, or IEEE 802.

*other security specifications. As an amendment to IEEE 802.3TM-2015, IEEE 802.3byTM-2016 relies on an incomplete standard that lacks necessary security-related contents; moreover, there will be potential security risks for IEEE 802.3byTM-2016 that has no security-related content.*

**Proposed change:**

*Recommend adding necessary security mechanisms in IEEE 802.3 standard series.*

**Response from the IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group:**

The IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group responded to China NB's comments (6N16445) against IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015 in 6N16509. It was explained in this response that IEEE Std 802.3-2015 and its amendments are security agnostic and allow the user to run any security protocol.

**Comment CN2 002 on IEEE Std 802.3by-2016 [6N16535] and similar comments on IEEE Std 802.3bq-2016 [6N16536], IEEE Std 802.3bp-2016 [6N16537], and IEEE Std 802.3bz-2016 [6Nxxxxx]:**

*IEEE 802.3 WG declared that it didn't expect to submit any further versions to ISO/IEC for approval in 6N13919, now it has been submitting IEEE 802.3 standard series to SC6 in droves, including IEEE 802.3bwTM-2015 and IEEE 802.3bpTM-2016, it is inconsistent with the action mentioned in 6N13919. We noticed that IEEE 802.3 WG only explained that they reconsidered the position in 6N16458 and didn't provide any further positive explanation. China NB recommended IEEE 802.3 WG providing positive response or the basis for such an action during the pre-FDIS ballot of IEEE 802.3bwTM-2015; however, we still hasn't got any response from IEEE 802.3 WG.*

**Proposed change:**

*Considering that IEEE 802.3 WG's standards development plan in SC6 will impact a lot on SC6 NBs' international contributions to the field of wired local area network. Therefore, please provide more bases for such a changed action.*

**Response from the IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group:**

The IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group provided further explanation in document 6N16445 in response to comments submitted on IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015. It is stated in the document that the IEEE 802.3 Working Group better understands the value of the adoption of IEEE 802.3 Ethernet standards and amendments as ISO/IEC/IEEE international standards. It further stated that it is now the intention of the Working Group to submit amendments to, and future revisions of, the IEEE 802.3 Standard for Ethernet for adoption under the PSDO agreement. The details of this plan are communicated on an ongoing basis using the procedures established to support the PSDO. In addition, an overview of IEEE 802.3 activities in progress, including a plan for their submission under the PSDO, was provided in 6N16539 to the ISO/IEC JTC1 SC6 meeting in February 2017.

Sincerely,  
David Law  
Chair, IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group