IEEE P802.3.2(IEEE 802.3cf) YANG Data Model Definitions Task Force
Closing Report

Marek Hajduczenia

Charter Communications

Vancouver, Canada

14 March, 2019

Reflector and Web

- To subscribe to the YANG Data Model Definitions reflector, send an email to:

  ListServ@ieee.org

  with the following in the body of the message (do not include “<>”):

  subscribe **stds-802-3-YANG** ***<yourfirstname> <yourlastname>***

  end

- Send YANG Data Model Definitions Task Force reflector messages to:

  stds-802-3-YANG-request@listserv.ieee.org

- Task Force web page URL:

  http://www.ieee802.org/3/cf/index.html

Progress this week

- Met Monday (1pm-2pm)
- Discussed Liaison Letter from Q14 of ITU-T SG15, no response needed
- Collected sign-off on one of unsatisfied comments (!!!Yes!!!)
- Passed motions needed to move to RevCom

Motion #2,
Move that the IEEE 802.3 Working Group re-affirm the CSD responses in http://www.ieee802.org/3/cf/ec-16-0142-00-ACSD-802-3cf.pdf and request approval to submit the IEEE P802.3cf draft D3.2 to RevCom.
Move: Mark Laubach
Second: Duane Remein
Technical (>=75%) motion,
6 (yes), 0 (no), 0 (abstain)

Motion #3,
The IEEE P802.3cf Task Force supports leaving draft D3.2 on the March 2019 RevCom agenda.
Move: Duane Remein
Second: Kevin Noll
Technical (>=75%) motion
6 (yes), 0 (no), 0 (abstain)

IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 802.3cf)
YANG Data Model Definitions to RevCom

Ballot close date and results

1. Date the ballot closed:

   The 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot on IEEE P802.3.2 Draft 3.2 closed on February 2nd , 2019.

2. Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes

	Initial Draft 3.0			1st Recirculation Draft 3.1			1st Recirculation Draft 3.2			
	#	%	Status	#	%	Status	#	%	Status	Req %
Abstain	7	8	PASS	7	8	PASS	7	8	PASS	<30%
Dis with comment	5	-		3	-		-	-		
Dis w/o comment	0	-		0	-		2	-		
Approve	66	92	PASS	71	95	PASS	73	97	PASS	>=75%
Ballots returned	78	79	PASS	81	82	PASS	82	83	PASS	>=75%
Voters	98	-		98	-		98	-		
Comments	246	-		20	-		0	-		

Unresolved negative comments

- 10 unsatisfied required comments in total from 2 commenters.
  - 1 from commenter#1
  - 9 from commenter#2 on SI / units

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **27** *L* **10** # i-233

Weber, Karl — Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy

Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl **1** *SC* **1** *P* **14** *L* **4** # i-120

Grow, Robert — RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A**

The use of an undated reference (i.e., IEEE Std 802.3) indicates the current version of the reference. Today, this reference includes approved P802.3bt, approved P802.3cb, and by completion should include at a minimum P802.3cd. This standard clearly can't track a moving target. A dated reference should be used, and clarity should be added on what parts of IEEE Std 802.3-2018 are not included. It appears that the current approved amendments are not included. It would also be appropriate to indicate that the YANG modules do not include all cmanagement capabilities for DTE specified in Clause 30.

SuggestedRemedy

Add appropriate words about this standard incorporating selected management capabilities for some DTEs defined in IEEE Std 802.3-2018.

Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change

This standard defines YANG modules for Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes DTEs operating on mixing segments, using either Carrier Sense Multiple Access / Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), link segments, and as Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).

To

This standard defines YANG modules for various Ethernet devices specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes half-duplex and full-duplex data terminal equipment (DTE) using either Carrier Sense Multiple Access / Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), and Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).

IEEE 802.3 WG Motion

- Move that the IEEE 802.3 Working Group re-affirm the CSD responses in http://www.ieee802.org/3/cf/ec-16-0142-00-ACSD-802-3cf.pdf and request approval to submit the IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 802.3cf) draft to RevCom.

- M: Marek Hajduczenia
- S: Duane Remein
- Technical(>=75%)
- Results: