Unconfirmed Minutes
IEEE 802.3 CSMA/CD PLENARY
St. Anthony Hotel, San Antonio, TX
November 15 - 18, 2004

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/index.html

MONDAY, November 15, 2004

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

Mr. Robert Grow, Chair of 802.3 CSMA/CD Working Group, called the meeting to order at 1:15PM. Mr. Grow introduced Mr. David Law, Vice Chair of 802.3and TF of 802.3AM, and Mr. Steve Carlson, Secretary of 802.3. Brad Booth, Chair of the 10GBASE-T TF, Adam Healey, Chair P802.3ap Backplane Ethernet, David Cunningham, Chair of P802.3aq 10BASE-LRM, Ben Brown, Chair of Congestion Management SG, and Kevin Daines, Chair of the Frame Extension Ad Hoc..

Mr. Grow then had the attendees stand and introduce themselves to the group. Mr. Grow reminded the group that there is an ANSI policy regarding affiliation. Participants must state their affiliation to the Working Group.

Mr. Grow asked if there were any additions or corrections to the agenda. The presenters for the CFI are Mike McCormack. The TIA liaison requested their report be delayed until later in the meeting. These corrections were made to the agenda.

MOTION #1

Approve March 2004 Plenary Meeting Minutes

M:Barras

S:Dineen

Passed by acclamation 15-Nov-2004 1:24PM

MOTION #2
Approve July 2004 Plenary Meeting Minutes

M:Booth

S:Dineen

Passed by acclamation 15-Nov-2004 1:24PM

Documents: See http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_open_report.pdf. 802.3 is doing 802.3REVam, a major revision to incorporate all amendments.

Published Standards

802.3 -2002
802.3ae -2002
802.3af - 2003
802.3aj –2003
802.3ak-2004
1802.3 Conformance Doc

Mr. Grow presented his Opening Report:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_open_report.pdf

Mr. Grow suggested the use of the IEEE email alias service to keep contact info current. To maintain voting status, contact information must be up-to-date.

Attendance Books

Mr. Carlson explained the operation of the Attendance books for new voters and established voters. Voters were cautioned that they would be subjected to public humiliation if they failed to follow the instructions. Mr. Grow explained how to gain membership in 802.3. See http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/rules/index.html for complete information.

Simple answer: to maintain your voting membership: We need your email address and affiliation! Otherwise, you are out!

Mr. Grow explained about paying the registration fees and that that your registration as a voter includes the 802.3-200X CD-ROM.

Please see http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_open_report.pdf for voter lists.

These individuals responded Monday:
Abler, Joe
Alping, Arne
Altman, Michael
Anderson, Stephen D.
Brink, Robert D.
Brunn, Brian
Chang, Luke
Darshan, Yair
Fallahi, Siavish
Hudson, Chuck

Jover, Juan
King, Jonathan
Kish, Paul
Lawton, Michael
Lou, Dennis
Moore, Charles
Oltmanns, Mike
Palkert, Tom
Szczepanek, Andre
Woodruff, Bill
Yagil, Ariel

MOTION #3

Approve the agenda as modified

Moved: B. Brand
Seconded: S. Dineen

Passed by acclamation 11-Nov-2004 1:37PM

---

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_open_agenda.pdf

Report from Pat Thaler on Architecture Issues:
(insert URL)

EFM Awards were given out.

MyBallot report moved to REVAM report.

There was a discussion of term limits with regard to 802 officers, and a suggestion to allow for removal of term limits on the Vice Chair at a minimum. Some people wanted to retain term limits as an overall concept.

MOTION #4

802.3 supports the elimination of term limits for Vice-Chairs.

M: P.Thaler
S: R. Brand

Procedural 50%

Passed by acclamation 15-Nov-2004 2:09 PM

<div style="border:1px solid black">

MOTION #5

802.3 supports the existing rules for Working Group chairs.

M: T.Dineen
S: D.Langston

15-Nov-2004 2:18 PM Procedural 50% - Motion Passes

Y:43   N:13   A: 16

</div>

Discussion of IEEE Staff hard copy policy they want to eliminate hard copies – straw poll 3 to 1 in favor of keeping hard copies.

Discussion of ISO standardization of 802 --- should we continue this? The was extensive discussion but no clear direction emerged.

Interim Meetings:

Ottawa, CA – September 26 – October 1, 2004. All TF and SG met. Discussion of cost of meetings, hosts, should we have a treasury? No one is very happy about the situation.

Executive Report

Please see http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_open_report.pdf

Patent Policy

Mr. Grow reminded the group not to discuss territory, market share, price, ongoing litigation, threatened litigation, etc. and read the slides. Mr. Grow asked if anyone had any IP or a letter of assurance, and no one came forth. Mr. Grow requested that the reading of the Patent Policy be entered into the minutes, and is so noted here. Mr. Carlson assured Mr. Grow that the fact that he read the Patent Policy was clearly indicated in the minutes. Please see http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_open_report.pdf

PARS

Please see http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_open_report.pdf

Question on 802.3ar PAR. Will they need another joint tech plenary with 802.1, possibly next March??

Break for 15 minutes at 3PM. Restarted at 3:15PM

Liaison Reports
See http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/liaisons/index.html

TR42.7 – Val Rybinski
TIA TR-42.7 Liaison to IEEE 802.3 Letter handed over to 802.3an

Chris DiMinco commented about additional documents and tools to verify 802.3an operation and verification.

ISO/IEC SC25/WG3 - No report

F0-4.1 – No report

T11.2 and SFF– Shelto van Doorn –T11.2 and SFF Report

ITU-T SG 13 – No report

ITU-T SG15 – No report

802.1 Report – Richard Brand (insert report)

IETF – Paul Cogdon is announcing IETF projects to the SEC reflector. Should Mr. Grow forward this to the 802.3 reflector? No one seemed interested.

Schedule ad hoc on TIA power spec replies---

802.1 Internal Liaison – Richard Brand
(insert report)

802.3 10GBASE-T TF Opening Report – Brad Booth

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_an_open_report.pdf

State of the Standard

Mr. Law reported on the state of the standard
http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_state_of_std.pdf

Operating Rules of 802.3

Mr. Law reported on the Operating Rules of P802.3. The latest updates may be found at http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/rules/index.html

Rules change request since July meeting.

Interpretations

Five new requests are detailed in http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_interp_open_report.pdf

Maintenance

Current maintenance requests are in http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_maint_open_report.pdf

P802.3REVam – WG Ballot completed

Discussion of MyBallot system Christina from IEEE Balloting Center

Backplane Ethernet TF – Adam Healey
http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_ap_open_report.pdf

10GMMF TF – David Cunningham
http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_aq_open_report.pdf

Congestion Management SG – Ben Brown
http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_cmsg_open_report.pdf

Frame Extension SG– Kevin Daines
http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_fesg_open_report.pdf

Residential Ethernet SG – Steve Carlson
http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_resg_open_report.pdf

CFI – Mike McCormack "Higher Power PoE"

Mr. McCormack gave a quick overview and invitation to attend the CFI at 6:30PM Monday.

Room Assignments and TF Schedules

Mr. Law presented the room assignments for additional meetings.

Motion to recess at 5:25PM. Passed by acclamation.

THURSDAY, November 18, 2004

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

Thursday, November 18, 2004 1PM – 5PM

Mr. Grow called the meeting to order at 1:04PM. The agenda was distributed to the group. Mr. Grow asked if anyone wished to modify the agenda. David Law requested that Maintenance and Interpretations be moved to the end. Mr. Carlson ran through the attendance books and lectured people about signing.

MOTION #1

Motion to approve agenda:

M: T.Dineen
S: H. Barass

Passed by acclamation 18-Nov-2004 1:05PM

Mr. Grow displayed the current 802.3 voters list. He then displayed the potential voters list and ran through it.

The following individuals indicated they wished to become 802.3 voters on Thursday:
Abbott, John
Barazande-Pour, Majid
Bhoja, Sudeep
Eiliya, Herman
Gupta, Sandeep
Hill, Tricia
Lerer, Michael
Liu, Cathy
McClellan, Brett
Peters, William R.
Shanbang, Abhijit
Smith, Grant
Traverso, Matt
VanSchyndel, Andre
Vareljian, Albert
Wadeker, Manoj

Weiner, Nick
Witt, Kevin

Liaison and Ad Hoc Reports

TIA DTE Power Ad Hoc Report – Mike McCormack
http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/liaisons/index.html←-------------fix this link

TIA pretty much ignored most of our comments, so we're going to submit them again.

MOTION#2

Move that:

802.3 WG endorse the comments generated by the ad hoc.

802.3 WG direct that the chair submit these comments to TIA editor and Chair of TIA TR-42

Moved: Mike McCormack
Second: Geoff Thompson

Passed by acclamation 18-Nov-2004 1:17PM

RULES - David Law
Insert URL
Discussion about limiting the use of the funds to Interim meetings only; need to get treasury going now for May meeting. (Sec. note-this is going to be trouble going forwards. The group doesn't really get it.)

MOTION #3
To enable timely preparation for the May 2005 IEEE 802.3 interim session the IEEE 802.3 Working Group suspends IEEE 802.3 Operating rule 2.5 (Treasurer) and authorise the IEEE 802.3WG Chair to open a treasury with permission of the SEC for the purpose of funding IEEE 802.3 Interim Sessions.

M: D. Law
S:B. Booth
Tech 75%

Y:56   N:0   A:7
MOTION PASSES 18-Nov-2004 1:40PM

MAINTENANCE – David Law P802.3REVam

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_maint_close_report.pdf

There was a suggestion that REVam be put on continuous approval following the March meeting.

MOTION #4

IEEE 802.3 accepts the resolution to all comments received in the Working Group recirculation ballot of IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 1.1, and authorises the editor to generate Draft 2.0.
IEEE 802.3 requests that the IEEE 802 SEC forwards IEEE P802.3REVam Draft D2.0 for Sponsor Ballot.

IEEE 802.3 authorises the IEEE P802.3REVam Task Force to conduct meetings and recirculation ballots as necessary to resolve comments received during the Sponsor Ballot.
IEEE 802.3 requests that the Working Group Chair to presubmit IEEE P802.3REVam draft to REVCOM for the March 2005 Standards Board meeting or subsequent continuous processing at discretion of the IEEE 802.3 Chair. The Sponsor ballot results will be reviewed at the March IEEE 802 plenary meeting.

M: D.Law
S: G.Thompson Tech 75%

PASSED Date: 18-Nov-2004 1:55PM

Y: 58   N: 0   A: 4

Task Forces

P802.3an 10GBASE-T – Brad Booth

There was a discussion of whether reconsideration of motions after lunch was proper. The point was made that people need to be in a meeting if they expect to vote. Other people seemed to feel that they had been treated badly. According to Mr. Booth, the meeting started on time and the discussion was delayed 15 minutes to allow people to come back from lunch. The vote was taken ½ hour after the meeting started. The point was made that the motion to reconsider was taken properly by the prevailing side. A comment was made by Mr. Thompson, former 802.3 WG Chair, that a more formal

process would have prevented the motion to reconsider. No evidence of wrongdoing has been prevented, so let's move on.

MOTION #5

Move that 802.3 approve and forward the two liaison letters, with appropriate edits by the Chair (or his appointed agent), to TIA TR-42 and ISO/IEC 11801 JTC 1/SC 25/WG 3.
TIA TR42: tia_1_1104
ISO/IEC: iso_1_1104

M: Brad Booth
S : Steve Carlson   75% TECH

Passed by acclamation (voice vote, no opposition) 11-Nov-2004 2:20PM

---

802 Architecture Report - Pat Thaler

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_thaler.pdf

P802.3ap – Backplane Ethernet – Adam Healy

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_ap_close_report.pdf

OIF requested that material from their group be posted in the private area of the Website., Question about release and Mr. Grow asked that we receive written permission before we post anything.

P802.3aq 10GBASE-LRM – David Cunningham

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_aq_close_report.pdf

Question if objectives have changed because the draft speaks to longer ranges and new fiber types.

Congestion Management Study Group – Ben Brown

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_cmsg_close_report.pdf

MOTION #6

Move that 802.3 approved the congestion management objectives, per objectives_0904.pdf

M: Ben Brown
S: David Law

Date: 18-Nov-2004 3:53PM Technical 75%

Y: 30   N: 3 A: 25 MOTION PASSES

MOTION #7

Move that 802.3 approve the congestion management criteria Broad Market Potential, per critters_0904.pdf

M: Ben Brown
S: Brad Booth

Date: 18-Nov-2004 3:56PM Technical 75%

Y: 30 N: 0 A: 19 MOTION PASSES

MOTION #8

Move that 802.3 approve the congestion management criteria Compatibility, per critters_0904.pdf

M: Ben Brown
S: Brad Booth

Date: 18-Nov-2004 3:59PM Technical 75%

Y: 24 N: 2 A: 17   MOTION PASSES

MOTION #9

Move that 802.3 approve the congestion management criteria Distinct Identity, per critters_0904.pdf

M: Ben Brown
S: Richard Brand

Date: 18-Nov-2004 4:00PM Technical 75%

Y: N: A: MOTION PASSES

MOTION #10

Move that 802.3 approve the congestion management criteria Technical Feasibility, per critters_0904.pdf

M: Ben Brown
S: Steve Carlson

Date: 18-Nov-2004 4:05PM 802.3 voters Technical 75%

Y: 28 N: 0 A: 21   MOTION PASSES

MOTION #11

Move that 802.3 approve the congestion management criteria Economic Feasibility, per critters_0904.pdf

M: Ben Brown
S: David Martin

Date: 18-Nov-2004 4:07PM Technical 75%

Y: 27   N: 0 A: 21 MOTION PASSES

MOTION #12

Move that 802.3 approve the congestion management PAR, per par_0904.pdf and as modified in response to 802.1 and 802.17 comments, and forward the PAR and 5 Criteria to the 802 SEC and NesCom for approval

M: Ben Brown
S: Richard Brand

Date: 18-Nov-2004 4:00PM Technical 75%

Y: 36   N: 1   A: 15   MOTION PASSES

MOTION #13

Move that the congestion management study group request 802.3 extend the congestion management study group

M: Ben Brown on behalf of the SG

Date: 18-Nov-2004 4:00PM Proc 50%

Passed by acclamation

Frame Expansion SG – Kevin Daines

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_fesg_close_report.pdf

---

MOTION #14

Motion to amend the compatibility criteria as shown on slide 10

M: P. Thaler
S: D. Law

Date: 18-Nov-2004 802.3 voters Tech 75%

Y: 18   N:0   A: 21 MOTION PASSES

MOTION #15

Motion to divide the motion shown on slide 10

M: G. Thompson
S: D. Law

Date: 18-Nov-2004 802.3 voters Tech 75%

Passed by voice vote, the lone NAY sayer did not request a count

MOTION #16

Move that 802.3 approve the Frame Expansion broad market criteria per
FESG_5_criteria_0411.pdf

M: H. Barass
S: R. Brand

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:02PM Technical 75%

Y: 27   N:9   A: 11 MOTION PASSES

MOTION #17

Move that 802.3 approve the Frame Expansion compatibility criteria criteria, per
FESG_5_criteria_0411.pdf

M: Divided from earlier motion
S:

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:05PM 802.3 voters Technical 75%

Y: 24 N:0 A: 8 MOTION PASSES

MOTION #18

Move that 802.3 approve the Frame Expansion distinct identity criteria criteria, per FESG_5_criteria_0411.pdf

M: Divided from earlier motion
S:

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:07PM Technical 75%

Y: 24 N: 0 A: 7 MOTION PASSES

MOTION #19

Move that 802.3 approve the Frame Expansion technical feasibility criteria criteria, per FESG_5_criteria_0411.pdf

M: Divided from earlier motion

S:

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:09PM 802.3 voters Technical 75%

Y: 20 N: 0 A: 7   MOTION PASSES

MOTION #20

Move that 802.3 approve the Frame Expansion economic feasibility criteria criteria, per FESG_5_criteria_0411.pdf

M: Divided from earlier motion
S:

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:011PM Technical 75%

Y: 24 N: 0 A: 6   MOTION PASSES

MOTION #21

Move that 802.3 approve the Frame Expansion PAR and five criteria, per FESG_PAR_0411.pdf and FESG_5_criteria_0411.

M: K. Daines on behalf of the FESG

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:12PM Technical 75%

Y: 22   N: 0   A: 5   MOTION PASSES

MOTION #22

Move that 802.3 approve the Frame Expansion SG objectives, per FESG_objectives_0411.pdf

M: K.Daines on behalf of FESG

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:13PM Technical 75%

Y: 23   N: 0   A: 5   MOTION PASSES

MOTION #23

Move that 802.3 approve the frame expansion PAR (par_0904.pdf) and 5 criteria critters-0904.pdf.

M: Ben Brown
S:

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:12PM 802.3 voters Technical 75%

Y: N: A: MOTION PASSES

MOTION #24

Move that 802.3 WG forward the Frame Expansion five criteria and PAR, per
FESG_5_criteria_0411.pdf and FESG_PAR_0411.pdfto 802 SEC for approval

Move: K. Daines on behalf of the Frame Expansion Study Group
Move to amend: Brown, Brand (Voice vote)
M: B.Brown
S: R.Brand

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:14PM 802.3 voters Technical 75%

Y: 29   N: 0 A: 6   MOTION PASSES

MOTION #25

Request that 802.3 WG extend the Frame Expansion SG (needed in the event the PAR is
not approved by the Standards Board 12/8/04.

M: K. Daines
S: W. Diab

Date: 18-Nov-2004 5:14PM 802.3 voters Technical 75%

Passed by acclamation

Residential Ethernet SG – **Steve Carlson**

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov04/1104_resg_close_report.pdf

---

MOTION #26

Request the 802.3 extend the Residential Ethernet Study Group to the March 2005
Plenary Meeting

M: Steve Carlson

S: Richard Brand

Date: 18-Nov-2004 802.3 voters Proc 50%

Passed by acclamation

CFI- Power Over Ethernet Plus – Mike McCormack

MOTION #26

Move that 802.3 authorize the formation of a Study Group to develop a standards project proposal (PAR and Five Criteria) for enhancements to PoE beyond the specifications of Clause 33

M: Steve Carlson
S: Richard Brand

Date: 18-Nov-2004 802.3 voters Tech 75%%

Y:34   N: 2   A: 4 MOTION PASSES

INTERPRETATIONS – David Law

MOTION #27

IEEE 802.3 approves the proposed Interpretation responses to Interpretation requests 1-11/04 through 5-11/04 -as presented without the need for a 30 day letter ballot.

M: David Law
S: W. Diab Tech 75%

Date: 11-Nov-2004 6:15PM

Y: 29   N: 0   A: 0 MOTION PASSES

Future Meetings

CM and FE are meeting week of January 12 with 802.1 in Sacremento, CA , rest of 802.3 in January in Vancouver.

Motion to adjourn H. Barass by at 6:17PM.