
802.3 PARs ad hoc report

IEEE 802.3 ad hoc on PARs from other WGs

Robert M. Grow, ad hoc chair

RMG Consulting

Virtual meeting

2 November 2020

Agenda and notes

- Agenda
 - Welcome
 - Comment review
- Comments
 - Comments reflect a consensus of ad hoc meeting attendees.
 - Ad Hoc Chair tasked to post comments to EC reflector prior to 3 November 2020 deadline.
 - Ad Hoc Chair tasked to include responses from other WGs for 802.3 report.

P802.1DP (1)

New Standard: Time-Sensitive Networking Profile for Aerospace Onboard Ethernet Communications

PAR: <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2020/dp-draft-PAR-0920-v01.pdf>

- 5.2, Title — The Title and Scope disagree on “profile” or “profiles”. Suggest the plural in the title would be more correct.
- 5.4, Purpose — The assertion that the standard will “support the entire range” is an ambitious and probably unachievable goal. Suggest: “support a broad range”.
- 5.6, Stakeholders — The ending phrase is awkward. Suggest: replace “of aerospace” with “for aerospace” at end of sentence.

P802.1DP (2)

CSD: <https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2020/dp-draft-CSD-0920-v01.pdf>

- 1.2.5,l, Known costs — From the PAR, it might be appropriate to indicate that availability of standard profiles likely will reduce development costs for products.

P802.11bh (1)

WLAN MAC and PHY Specifications

Amendment: Enhanced service with randomized MAC addresses

- General — Neither the PARs nor CSDs clearly distinguish the need for two similar projects. Scopes overlap, and distinct identity is not established between proposed P802.11bh and proposed P802.11bi.

PAR: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0742-04-0rcm-proposed-par-draft.docx>

- General – We appreciate the submittal is a .pdf, but the file name being a docx extension caused some problems in opening.
- 6.1.2, Registration activity — The PAR does not make it clear that work will only use randomization and changing of MAC addresses within the local address space. Without that restriction, this question should be answered yes. Because the current myProject PAR code only allows an explanation here if answered yes, either the answer could be changed to yes here citing previous RAC interest in MAC address randomization, or an explanation of the restriction could be added to 8.1.

P802.11bh (2)

CSD: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1117-03-0rcm-rcm-sg-proposed-rcm-csd-draft.docx>

- 1.2.2, Compatibility — Once approved an amendment becomes part of the base standard, therefore, IEEE Std 802c is part of IEEE Std 802 and should be addressed for this project. Unless a method for restricting the range for random local MAC addresses is specified, randomization is incompatible with the optional SLAP capabilities of Std 802c. This should be addressed here.
- 1.2.3, Distinct identity — See comments on proposed P802.11bi. There is insufficient information discriminating the work on this project and proposed P802.11bi.

P802.11bi (1)

WLAN MAC and PHY Specifications

Amendment: Enhanced service with Data Privacy Protection

- General — Neither the PARs nor CSDs clearly distinguish the need for two similar projects. Scopes overlap, and distinct identity is not established between proposed P802.11bh and proposed P802.11bi.
- General – We really can't understand what this PAR is proposed to do. A better Project Scope or more detail in Need could help with this.

PAR: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0854-06-0rcm-par-proposal-for-privacy.pdf>

- 2.1, Title – Capitalization is inconsistent (not title case nor consistent with IEEE style). Recommend “Enhanced service with data privacy protection”.

P802.11bi (2)

CSD: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1346-02-0rcm-csd-draft-for-privacy-amendment-of-rcm-project.docx>

- 1.2.3, Distinct identity — There is insufficient information discriminating the work on this project and proposed P802.11bh. P802.11bh seems to be a subset of what this project would allow to be done.

P802.15aa (1)

Low-Rate Wireless Networks

Amendment: Higher data rate extension to IEEE 802.15.4 Smart Utility Network (SUN) Frequency Shift Keying (FSK) Physical layer (PHY)

PAR: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/20/15-20-0202-00-0jre-802-15-4aa-par-for-japanese-rate-extension.docx>

- 3.1 Working Group officers — This comment assumes the PAR content was entered into myProject then copied and pasted into the Word document as stated in the Abstract field. Checking on 23 October, myProject has been updated with the new officers of 802.15. Please check when submitting that these updates are shown before the submittal to NesCom. If this does not happen, please submit a bug report on my project asking that auto-fill data be updated whenever a draft PAR is saved.

P802.15aa (2)

CSD: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/20/15-20-0159-04-0jre-draft-csd-for-japanese-rate-extension.docx>

- Title page — P802.15.4.xx should be replaced with the project identification P802.15.4aa in three places.

P802.16t

Broadband Wireless Access System

Modification to Amendment PAR: Fixed and Mobile Wireless Access in Narrowband Channels

General – The ad hoc recommends the 802.3 WG Chair vote against this modified PAR unless the submittal is corrected to use a modified PAR form from myProject (or information copied from myProject), rather than a markup of the 06 October 2019 submittal for 802 review (not even a markup of the approved PAR on myProject). Looking at the P802.16t PAR on myProject, the following are some of the noted differences:

1. Current PAR output eliminates phone numbers (reduces the amount of PII in public documents)
 2. Submitter Email (submitter) differs
 3. PAR Request Date, PAR Approval Date, PAR Expiration Date
 4. 3.1 WG, and WG officers on myProject are current for 802.15 not as on 6 Oct 2019 draft PAR
 5. 5.2a, Download only displays what is in “Changes in Scope” of 6 Oct 2019 draft PAR
- Response: A myProject pdf was sent to the EC reflector 2nd November. Personal review by the ad hoc chair indicated no changes to modified fields from the 6th October 2019 plus change marks document reviewed by the ad hoc.

PAR: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/20/15-20-0196-00-016t-licensed-narrowband-amendment-par.pdf>

- No comments assuming we are figuring out the proposed modifications to the approved PAR correctly.

CSD: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0222-00-ACSD-p802-16t.docx>

- We could not identify any changes in the CSD submitted for 802 review.