

IEEE 802.5

August 24th – 27th, 1998
Harrisburg, PA

Hosted by AMP

Minutes of meeting ‘gg’

Neil Jarvis, Recording Secretary
Madge Network Ltd, York, UK

njarvis@madge.com
http://www.8025.org/

| <i>Revision History</i> | | |
|-------------------------|-----------|------------------|
| r0 | 27 Aug 98 | End of recording |
| r1 | 7 Sep 98 | First release |
| | | |

Attendees

Full Time:

Andy Fierman
Simon Harrison
John Hill
Richard Knight
Neil Jarvis
Ivar Jeppesen
Robert Love
John Messenger
Karl Reinke
Ken Wilson
Moshiko Levhar
Bo Thomsen

Part Time:

Peggy DiMauro

802.5t, Draft 2.2, Ballot Results.

The ballot on 802.5t, 100Mbit/s DTR, Draft 2.2 closed successfully at noon (PST), Monday 17th August. Since this was a recirculation ballot, votes against draft 2.1B are carried forward to this ballot, unless changed by a new vote. The balloting pool for the recirculation ballot was made up of all members who had submitted a vote against draft 2.0. This gives us a balloting pool of 23 members. Full results are as follows:

| Voting Members | Draft 2.1B After Comment Resolution | Draft 2.2 Before Comment Resolution | Draft 2.2 After Comment Resolution |
|--------------------|---|---|--|
| Peggy Jean DiMauro | Approve | Approve | Approve |
| Andy Fierman | Disapprove | Approve ^(*) | Approve |
| Paul Gessert | Approve | Approve ^(*) | Approve |
| Michael Hanrahan | Approve | Approve | Approve |
| Simon Harrison | Approve | Approve ^(*) | Approve |
| John Hill | Approve | Approve | Approve |
| Bob Hubbard | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain |
| Neil Jarvis | Approve | Disapprove^(*) | Approve |
| Ivar Jeppesen | Approve | Disapprove^(*) | Approve |
| George Lin | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain |
| Bob Love | Approve | Approve ^(*) | Approve |
| Keith Luke | <i>Not eligible</i> | <i>Not eligible</i> | <i>Not eligible</i> |
| John Messenger | Approve | Approve | Approve |
| Avishay Noam | Approve | Approve | Approve |
| Ivan Oakley | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain |
| Syou-Chin Peng | <i>Not eligible</i> | <i>Not eligible</i> | <i>Not eligible</i> |
| Karl Reinke | Approve | Approve ^(*) | Approve |
| Bob Ross | Approve | Approve | Approve |
| Tam Ross | Approve | Approve ^(*) | Approve |
| Steve Scandalis | <i>Not eligible</i> | <i>Not eligible</i> | <i>Not eligible</i> |
| Carson Stuart | <i>Not eligible</i> | <i>Not eligible</i> | <i>Not eligible</i> |
| Bo Thomsen | Disapprove | Disapprove^(*) | Approve |
| Scott Valcourt | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain |
| Trevor Warwick | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain |
| Dave Wilson | Disapprove | Abstain ^(*) | Abstain |
| Ken Wilson | Approve | Approve | Approve |
| Ed Wong | Approve | Approve | Approve |

| Measurement | Count (Before) | Count (After) |
|-----------------------|-------------------|------------------|
| Balloting pool size | 23 | 23 |
| Approve vote count | 14 | 17 |
| Disapprove vote count | 3 | 0 |
| Abstain vote count | 6 | 6 |

| Question | Criteria | Result | Answer |
|-------------------------|--|--------|--------|
| Ballot Closes? | ≥75% of voters participated | 100% | Yes |
| Ballot Passes? (Before) | ≥75% of Approve/Disapprove votes are Approve | 82% | Yes |
| Ballot Passes? (After) | ≥75% of Approve/Disapprove votes are Approve | 100% | Yes |

Daily Notes

Monday, 24th August 1998

Introductions and agenda

Agenda (08-01r2) approved.

802.5t, draft 2.2 comment resolution

Reviewed comments against clauses 2, 9, 9.1, 9.2 and 9.3

Reviewed comments against clauses 9.7 and 9.8

Reviewed comments against clause 11

The proposal is to produce a draft 2.3 changes document to accompany the comment database report. These documents will be sent out for a 10 day recirculation ballot. It is hoped that the recirculation ballot will start later this week.

By the end of the day, 5 comments remained open, all waiting for Ivar's approval when he arrives on Tuesday. The committee has come to a joint position on the closure of these comments.

Tuesday, 25th August 1998

802.5t, draft 2.2 comment resolution

PM_CONTROL.request was found to be wrong in draft 2.2 – this generated a number of EDTR database comment entries.

All comments have been successfully closed, and a comment database report generated (08-05r3).

802.5t, draft 2.3 recirculation ballot

A table of deliverables, owners and dates was put together:

| Deliverables | Owners | Due date |
|---|---------------|-----------------|
| 802.5t draft 2.2 → draft 2.3 changes document (08-10) [PDF] | KTW, ANF, NAJ | 27 Aug |
| 802.5t draft 2.2 comment database report (08-05r3) [PDF] | KTW, ANF, NAJ | 27 Aug |
| Re-circulation ballot cover note [PDF] | NAJ | 27 Aug |
| Re-circulation ballot individual's databases [MDB] | NAJ | 27 Aug |
| Re-circulation web page [Web] | NAJ | 27 Aug |
| 802.5t draft 2.3 with change bars [DOC] | KTW, ANF, NAJ | 27 Aug |
| 802.5t draft 2.3 without change bars [PDF & DOC] | NAJ | 31 Aug |
| Re-circulation ballot master database [MDB] | NAJ | 7 Sep |
| LMSC Ballot cover note | RDL | Done |

Interim meeting site decision

The York meeting will now be held the week of 18th through 22nd January 1999.

Wednesday, 26th August 1998

802.5t, draft 2.3 recirculation ballot

Finished 08-10. Closed and updated all comments and produced 08-05. Wrote cover note. Made database.

802.5v, strawman 0.2 comment resolution

Richard went through his comment database. Many items remain open, mainly dealing with MAC issues which have not yet been dealt with by the strawpoll.

Thursday 27th August 1998

PAR development

Aggregation of Multiple Links

Take e-mail vote on participation in link aggregation, to fill in “??” for participants and companies.

Enhanced Source Route Operation

Before we create a PAR for this work, the committee must instigate a study group in November, and aim for a PAR in March.

Source Route Over 802.1Q

We still do not have an editor for this work. We need to take an electronic vote on the PAR and 5 criteria for this work before the November meeting. The text of these documents is available from the web site.

802.5 Revision

We wrote the scope and purpose of PAR for this work. 5 criteria should not be required. The plan is to pre-submit the completed PAR (Bob to fill in blanks) to SEC 30 days prior to the November plenary meeting. The final wording of the PAR would be voted on by the committee during the 802.5 November plenary. [Straw Poll: 08-03]

802.5w Errata

Straw Poll 08-04 assigns John Messenger as chief editor of 802.5w. An electronic vote will be held to approve sending draft 1.0 of 802.5w out for a 30 day working group ballot on October 1st. Ballot comments will be resolved at the November plenary.

A.O.B.

The group would like to thank John Hill (and his supporting staff) for providing great facilities for the meeting. The beer and pizza wasn't too bad either...

Motions

| | | | |
|----------------------------|----------------|----------------|--------|
| Straw Poll or Vote? | Straw Poll | Number: | 08-01 |
| Moved by: | John Messenger | Date: | 25 Aug |
| Seconded by: | Richard Knight | Status: | PASS |

Move that:

802.5 hold an interim meeting during the week of 18th through 22nd January 1999, in York (UK, not PA). Madge will host the meeting.

Yes: **No:** **Abstain:**

| | | | |
|----------------------------|-------------|----------------|--------|
| Straw Poll or Vote? | Straw Poll | Number: | 08-02 |
| Moved by: | John Hill | Date: | 26 Aug |
| Seconded by: | Karl Reinke | Status: | PASS |

Move that:

Clause editors resolve non-technical comments arising from the recirculation ballot on the draft 2.2 to draft 2.3 changes document (paper 802.5/98/08-10).

Yes: **No:** **Abstain:**

| | | | |
|----------------------------|----------------|----------------|--------|
| Straw Poll or Vote? | Straw Poll | Number: | 08-03 |
| Moved by: | Neil Jarvis | Date: | 27 Aug |
| Seconded by: | Richard Knight | Status: | PASS |

Move that:

Robert Love complete the PAR for the 802.5 revision standard, and submit it to the SEC 30 days prior to November IEEE 802 plenary meeting. The initial scope and purpose wording is captured in paper 802.5/98/08-13.

Yes: **No:** **Abstain:**

| | | | |
|----------------------------|------------|----------------|--------|
| Straw Poll or Vote? | Straw Poll | Number: | 08-04 |
| Moved by: | Ken Wilson | Date: | 27 Aug |
| Seconded by: | John Hill | Status: | PASS |

Move that:

The errata items captured in 802.5/98/08-09 form the basis of an 802.5w/draft 1.0 document. John Messenger will be the chief editor. 802.5w/draft 1.0 will be released for a 30 day working group ballot on 1st October, subject to approval via 802.5 electronic vote. Comment resolution will take place during the 802.5 meeting in Albuquerque, NM. Neil Jarvis will provide a database for capturing comments.

Yes: **No:** **Abstain:**

| | | | |
|----------------------------|----------------|----------------|--------|
| Straw Poll or Vote? | Straw Poll | Number: | 08-05 |
| Moved by: | Ivar Jeppesen | Date: | 27 Aug |
| Seconded by: | Moshiko Levhar | Status: | PASS |

Move that:

The committee desires to hold an interim meeting in Denmark between the March and July plenary meetings. Olicom has offered Copenhagen as a possible venue, during May 1999. The exact meeting dates to be determined during the November meeting.

Yes: **No:** **Abstain:**