

To: Robert Love/Raleigh/IBM
cc: bob@xlnet.com
Subject: Comments on IEEE 802.5t D2.5

Bob Grow / 1

Global

Approve

Editorial

Concern:

Thanks for changing the 802.3u references to 802.3, but you used the wrong syntax in the title of 802.3. The published consolidated document of 802.3 is IEEE Std. 802.3, 1998 (comma not colon).

Proposed Solution:

Search and replace before publication.

Bob Grow / 2

Section 13

Disapprove

Technical

Concern:

The additions to Clause 13 were lost between draft 2.4 and draft 2.5.

Proposed Solution:

Put them back in with the changes accepted in response to my (and possibly others) comments on D2.4..

Bob Grow / 3

Section 9.8.1.1.1 Line 59

Approve

Editorial

Concern:

Inconsistent terminology: Data_byte or Data_octet.

Proposed Solution:

I assume since 9.8.1.1.2 line 99 was changed to Data_octet, the same change should be made here.

Bob Grow / 4

Section 14.5.1.2 Table 14-11

Disapprove

Editorial

Concern:

I assume this was an oversight in removing TPK hooks. The SPV(AP_MASK)

still has a permitted value for TKP operation.

Proposed Solution:

Remove and reserve the code-point; or if this policy variable is also defined for lower speeds, note that the policy must be set to X'0002' for high speed operation.

Bob Grow / 5

Annex A

Approve

Editorial

Concern:

Though I am unfamiliar with 802.5 PICS conventions, it would seem that a PICS item should have been added for the new shall in "Media_rate" in 9.8.1.1.4. I could not find one on a scan through the PICS.

Proposed Solution:

Add a PICS item for Control register bit 0.12.

Bob Grow / 6

Section 9.1.1.1 Line 64-65

Approve

Editorial

Concern:

A clock has two edges only one active, and you have earlier stated which edge is active. I assume it is not intended to transfer an idle on both rising and falling edges. Similar confusion exists in other of the service primitive descriptions. In addition, the direction of some of the primitives is backward, the Indication primitives map from the MII signals, and the Request primitives map to the MII signals, both sets of primitives are primarily written as mapping to the MII.

Proposed Solution:

Change the clock references in all of these sections to reference RX_CLK and TX_CLK as appropriate. Rewrite the prose to correct the direction of mapping. I may be able to find time during this week to propose exact text, but will not be able to submit that text as part of this comment. In the event I find the time, I will forward that text directly to the working group.

```
=====
| Bob Grow                | Voice: 619-487-9320 x232 |
| XLNT                    | Fax:      619-487-9768 |
| 15050 Avenue of Science | Internet:  bob@xlnt.com |
| San Diego, CA 92128 USA | Web: http://www.xlnt.com |
=====
```