

IEEE 802.5

November 9th - 13th, 1998
Albuquerque, NM

Minutes of meeting 'HH'

Neil Jarvis, Recording Secretary
Madge Networks Ltd, York, UK

njarvis@madge.com
http://www.8025.org/

<i>Revision History</i>		
r0	13 Nov 98	End of recording
r1	17 Nov 98	First release

Attendees

Full Time:

Andy Fierman
Simon Harrison
John Hill
Richard Knight
Neil Jarvis
Ivar Jeppesen
Robert Love
John Messenger
Karl Reinke
Christian Thrysøe

Scott Valcourt
Ken Wilson

Part Time:

Thaddeus Kuziela
Keith Luke
Tam Ross
Paul Kolesar
Ken Hall
Tad Szostak

Daily Notes

Monday, 9th November 1998

802.5t/Draft 2.4 Comment Resolution

Comment database was made available to the document editors. The database report will also be made available for all committee members on Tuesday morning.

802.5 Opening Plenary

- *Welcome and introductions*
Business cards collected by Ken Wilson
- *Review of agenda*
Approved
- *IEEE patent policy*
If you are aware of any patents that affect current or future 802.5 work, please make them known to Bob Love.
- *Approval of minutes*
Minutes for 'GG' and 'gg' approved by votes 11-01 and 11-02.
- *Status of PARS*
IEEE 802.5t:
LMSC ballot passed with 196 comments. Recirculation ballot to be sent out by 15th December to allow time to get it approved during March 1999.
IEEE 802.5v:
New presentations on gigabit PHY and MAC will be given this week.
IEEE 802.5w:
Document not yet available, but a John, Ken and Neil have made progress on the creating it. Vote 11-05 directs the editors to publish draft 1.0 by December 1st for a 30 day working group ballot.
IEEE 802.5REV, IEEE 802.5y, IEEE 802.5z:
PAR and 5 criteria to be voted on and submitted this week. Mick Seaman (802.1) will give a technical presentation on the link aggregation control protocol later this week.
- *Source Route redirect study group formation*
Looking for a study group leader. The committee is to prepare a motion for the SEC by Thursday noon.
- *Report on 802 rules*
802 rules are under revision at the moment.
- *Document production in Framemaker*
Motion 11-06 passed, instructing 802.5 editors to produce all future committee documents intended for IEEE publication with Framemaker, in conjunction with the IEEE standards' template.
- *Token Ring MIB refresh*
- *New business*

Tuesday, 10th November 1998

802.5t/Draft 2.4 Comment Resolution

The day was spent reviewing all comments against the 802.5t LMSC ballot.

Wednesday, 11th November 1998

Gigabit connector discussion

3 presentations about gigabit connectors – the LC connector (Paul Kolesar, Lucent), the MT-RJ (Ken Hall, AMP) and VF-45 (SG) (Tad Szostak, 3M). The presentations will be made available on the web.

PAR development

The PAR and 5 criteria documents for 802.5x (VLANs: Source Routing), 802.5z (Aggregation of Multiple Link Segments) and 802.5REV were reviewed and voted on by the committee (Votes 11-07, 11-08, 11-09 and 11-10). These PAR will be voted on by the SEC on Thursday evening.

802.5t/Draft 2.4 Comment resolution

Finished comment resolution. 23 comments that were rejected or modified have not yet got commenter approval. This is the hit list for the remainder of the meeting.

Voting rights and rules

The IEEE 802 SEC is revising the rules for gaining and retaining voting rights. These conflict with the scheme adopted by the 802.5 committee. John Messenger presented his interpretation of the new rules and how 802.5 would use them [Presentation: 11-08]. The committee adopted these rules with vote 11-11.

Thursday, 12th November 1998

Study Group Creation

The “Enhanced Source Routing Operation” study group was formed, to be led by Christian Thryssøe.

Gigabit Presentations

John Messenger gave a presentation about possible future directions of gigabit token ring. [Presentation 11-16].

Neil Jarvis and Simon Harrison gave a presentation about Token Ring *MAClite*, a cut down version of the dedicated token ring MAC, which retains the benefits of Token Ring, while making it possible to build product with Ethernet costs. [Presentation 11-12r2].

Optical Fibre Discussion

John Hill presented his ideas for the connector matrix [Presentation 11-17]. Straw poll 11-14 asks for input to this matrix.

Recirculation ballot timetable

13 Nov: Publish unresolved LMSC DIS comments, and send to GM, HF and BG

20 Nov: All updated d2.5 sources to be sent to NAJ

23 Nov: NAJ to publish pre-release d2.5 PDF

23 Nov: BRG to review pre-release d2.5 PDF

23 Nov: RDL to give LMSC cover note to KTW

30 Nov: Deadline for HF, GM and BG to respond to dispositions

04 Dec: All review comments back to editors

10 Dec: Final d2.5 sources and updated comment databases to be sent to NAJ

11 Dec: NAJ to publish d2.5, full comment database report and unresolved DIS report

11 Dec: KTW to print and send cover letter, d2.5 and unresolved DIS report to IEEE

15 Dec: Recirculation LMSC ballot starts

22 Jan: Recirculation LMSC ballot closes

05 Feb: Send d2.6 to Kristin Dittman

Link Aggregation [802.3ad] (Mick Seaman)

Key Concepts:

- Transparent bandwidth & availability

Higher layers unaware of link aggregation (including spanning tree). Failover has become a key feature of the work. Only works on full duplex links. A *conversation* will always go down one link. A *conversation* is not defined by the work, as it beyond the scope of the 802. (e.g. it could well be determined by a level 3 address).

- Plug and play

Initial management configuration controls which links are aggregated together. No further management is needed, and only links that can support aggregation will come up as aggregated links.

- Key control

Exchange of *keys* control establishment of aggregated links.

- Aimed at wide range of hardware
- Physical link signals
- Distributor/collection function

The collector only needs to know that traffic coming off a link must be kept in order. The distributor can implement a complex load sharing algorithm, and still interoperate with other implementations.

- Frame format

802.3 use a new Ethernet type and one of the reserved 802.1 multicast addressed for the control protocol.

- Flush protocol

Used to mark *conversations*, allowing them to be moved to another aggregated port, by exchange of mark information. (A returned mark indicates that the conversation has cleared a port).

Major effort has been the creation of the control protocol (a few state machines). This has been published on the 802.3ad web site (written by Tony Jeffree and Mick Seaman).

Motions

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-01
Moved by:	Ken Wilson	Date:	9 Nov
Seconded by:	John Hill	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
The minutes of the July plenary meeting ('GG' – La Jolla, CA), published as 802.5/98/07-02r2, be approved.			
Yes:	10	No:	0
Abstain:	1		

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-02
Moved by:	John Messenger	Date:	9 Nov
Seconded by:	Ken Wilson	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
The minutes of the August interim meeting ('gg' – Harrisburg, PA), published as 802.5/98/08-02r1, be approved.			
Yes:	11	No:	0
Abstain:	1		

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-03
Moved by:	Karl Reinke	Date:	9 Nov
Seconded by:	John Messenger	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
Agenda as published as 802.5/98/11-01r1 and modified during the plenary be approved. The new agenda to be published as 802.5/98/11-01r2.			
Yes:	12	No:	0
Abstain:	1		

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-04
Moved by:	John Messenger	Date:	9 Nov
Seconded by:	Karl Reinke	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
The committee adopts the straw polls taken at meeting 'gg'.			
Yes:	11	No:	0
Abstain:	1		

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-05
Moved by:	Ken Wilson	Date:	9 Nov
Seconded by:	Neil Jarvis	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
802.5w, draft 1.0 be published for 30 day working group ballot on December 1 st . Comment resolution to take place in January.			
Yes:	10	No:	0
Abstain:	2		

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-06
Moved by:	Karl Reinke	Date:	9 Nov
Seconded by:	John Messenger	Status:	PASS

Move that:

All future committee documents intended for IEEE publication should be developed using Framemaker, in conjunction with the IEEE standards' template.

Yes: No: Abstain:

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-07
Moved by:	Ken Wilson	Date:	11 Nov
Seconded by:	Andy Fierman	Status:	PASS

Move that:

The PAR (contained in 802.5/98/11-09) for 802.5z (Aggregation of Multiple Link Segments) be adopted.

Yes: No: Abstain:

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-08
Moved by:	Andy Fierman	Date:	11 Nov
Seconded by:	Karl Reinke	Status:	PASS

Move that:

802.5/98/11-09, containing the PAR and 5 criteria for 802.5z (Aggregation of Multiple Link Segments) be adopted and submitted to the SEC for their approval.

Yes: No: Abstain:

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-09
Moved by:	Karl Reinke	Date:	11 Nov
Seconded by:	Neil Jarvis	Status:	PASS

Move that:

802.5/98/11-10, containing the PAR and 5 criteria for 802.5x (Virtual Bridged Local Area Networks: Source Routing) be adopted and submitted to the SEC for their approval.

Yes: No: Abstain:

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-10
Moved by:	John Messenger	Date:	11 Nov
Seconded by:	Ken Wilson	Status:	PASS

Move that:

802.5/98/11-11, containing the PAR and 5 criteria for 802.5REV be adopted and submitted to the SEC for their approval.

Yes: No: Abstain:

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-11
Moved by:	John Hill	Date:	11 Nov
Seconded by:	John Messenger	Status:	PASS

Move that:

The presentation entitled "Gaining and retaining 802.5 voting rights" (802.5/98/11-08) be adopted by the committee as the new rules for gaining and retaining 802.5 voting rights.

Yes: No: Abstain:

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-12
Moved by:	Karl Reinke	Date:	11 Nov
Seconded by:	Ken Wilson	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
Annex AA is published with 802.5t/d2.5 (LMSC recirculation ballot). Annex AA sources will be available for BRG review by November 23 rd .			
Yes:	13	No:	0
Abstain:	0		

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-13
Moved by:	John Messenger	Date:	12 Nov
Seconded by:	Ken Wilson	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
802.5 form a study group to investigate "Enhanced Source Routing Operation", and ask the SEC to approve it. Christian Thryssøe will be the study group chair.			
Yes:	12	No:	0
Abstain:	0		

Straw Poll or Vote?	Straw Poll	Number:	11-14
Moved by:	Tad Szostak	Date:	12 Nov
Seconded by:	Richard Knight	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
802.5 solicits input on optic fibre connectors that may be used in token ring equipment and the factors that led to the choice.			
<i>Note:</i> This request will be made on the IEEE 802.5 email reflector.			
Yes:	12	No:	0
Abstain:	3		

Straw Poll or Vote?	Vote	Number:	11-15
Moved by:	John Messenger	Date:	12 Nov
Seconded by:	Karl Reinke	Status:	PASS
Move that:			
802.5t BRG be extended until 802.5t is approved by the IEEE Standards Board.			
Yes:	10	No:	0
Abstain:	0		