



1000Mbit/s DTR Operation 802.5v/D1.2: Comment Index

JLM-01	2
JLM-02	3
JLM-03	3
JLM-04	2
JLM-05	1
JLM-06	1
JLM-07	1
JLM-08	2
JLM-09	2
KR-01	3



1000Mbit/s DTR Operation 802.5v/D1.2: Full Comment Report

Comment JLM-05

Section 0.1 Line 28 Severity A/C Type ED Status ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee Commenter Agrees? Editing Complete

Concern: 802.5t has now been (conditionally) approved.

Solution: Change '802.5t Draft Supplement' to 'IEEE Std 802.5t:1999'.

Response:

Rebuttal:

Comment JLM-06

Section 1.2 Line 43 Severity A/C Type ED Status ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee Commenter Agrees? Editing Complete

Concern: 802.3ab is approved.

Solution: Remove note.

Change title for 802.3ab to Information Technology - Telecommunications and information exchange between systems - Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Part 3: Carrier Sense Multiple Access with Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) Access Method and Physical Layer Specifications - Physical Layer Parameters and Specifications for 1000 Mb/s Operation over 4 pair of Category 5 Balanced Copper Cabling, Type 1000BASE-T

If more general reference to 802.3 is required, then add references as necessary from <http://standards.ieee.org/catalog/IEEE802.3.html>, but most likely, just add IEEE Std 802.3, 1998 Edition.

Response:

Rebuttal:

Comment JLM-07

Section 1.5 Line 60 Severity A/C Type ED Status ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee Commenter Agrees? Editing Complete

Concern: Acronyms and abbreviations are to be formatted with an equals sign, not a colon

Solution: Change the ones on lines 60-65 to match those on lines 58 and 59. In the published standard, the equals signs line up vertically.

Response:

Rebuttal:

Comment JLM-08

Section 9.0 **Line** 7 **Severity** A/C **Type** ED **Status** ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee **Commenter Agrees?** **Editing Complete**

Concern: This bullet point appears to be slightly too far to the right.

Solution: Align it with the one it follows.

Response:

Rebuttal:

Comment JLM-09

Section 9.2 **Line** 389 **Severity** A/C **Type** ED **Status** ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee **Commenter Agrees?** **Editing Complete**

Concern: This blank line appears on a page by itself

Solution: If this page is wanted, it needs an "almost blank" banner, else blot it.

Response:

Rebuttal:

Comment JLM-04

Section A.5 **Line** 106 **Severity** A/C **Type** ED **Status** ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee **Commenter Agrees?** **Editing Complete**

Concern: Tables in A.5 and following sections of the PICS have variable widths, and some of them are so wide that they may fall outside the printable area when published.

Solution: Adjust the table widths to match those earlier in A, so that they stay within the normal text margins. I can provide a 'volunteer' to perform this task if desired.

Response:

Rebuttal:

Comment JLM-01

Section A.6 **Line** 133 **Severity** A/C **Type** ED **Status** MODIFIED

Highlight To Committee **Commenter Agrees?** **Editing Complete**

Concern: Bad table split.

Solution: Start A.6.6.3 on next page, or keep table together.

Response: Other formatting changes to the PICS have removed the bad break.

Rebuttal:

Comment JLM-02

Section A.7 **Line** 200 **Severity** A/C **Type** ED **Status** ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee **Commenter Agrees?** **Editing Complete**

Concern: Items MI14b etc are too wide to fit in their column.

Solution: Increase the width of the Item column to fit.

Response:

Rebuttal:

Comment KR-01

Section AC **Line** 215 **Severity** A/C **Type** ED **Status** ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee **Commenter Agrees?** **Editing Complete**

Concern: PMC-XF is no longer a valid term

Solution: replace "PMC-XF" with "PMC-SX and PMC-LX"

Response:

Rebuttal:

Comment JLM-03

Section AC.8 **Line** 58 **Severity** A/C **Type** ED **Status** ACCEPTED

Highlight To Committee **Commenter Agrees?** **Editing Complete**

Concern: Data_octet -> Data_byte is shown as a change, but d1.1 already contained this change as voted on. (It was corrected in the PDF.)

Solution: Next time, accept this kind of change before sending out the document!

Response: Yeah, yeah.

Rebuttal:



1000Mbit/s DTR Operation 802.5v/D1.2: Comment Summary

	ED	TECH
A/C	10	0
DIS	0	0
Q	0	0

Total A/C Comments: 10
Total DIS Comments: 0
Total Q Comments: 0
Total Comments: 10

	Total	To Be Closed
OPEN	0	0
ACCEPTED	9	0
MODIFIED	1	0
REJECTED	0	0
ANSWERED	0	0
WITHDRAWN	0	0

Comment IDs by Type. Bold IDs require closure.

A/C Comment IDs: JLM-05 JLM-06 JLM-07 JLM-08 JLM-09 JLM-04 JLM-01 JLM-02 KR-01 JLM-03

DIS Comment IDs

Q Comment IDs: