

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12

IEEE PROJECT 802
LAN / MAN STANDARDS COMMITTEE (LMSC)
WORKING GROUP (WG)
POLICIES AND PROCEDURES (P&P)

As approved XXXX

Last edited 7/12/2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2	TABLE OF CONTENTS	I
3	PROLOGUE	III
4	1. PREFACE	1
5	2. MODIFICATIONS TO THESE PROCEDURES	1
6	3. HIERARCHY	1
7	4. FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES OF OPERATION	2
8	5. WORKING GROUP RESPONSIBILITIES	2
9	6. OFFICERS	3
10	6.1 Officer Overview-----	3
11	6.2 Election of Officers-----	3
12	6.3 Temporary Appointments to Vacancies-----	4
13	6.4 Removal of officers-----	4
14	6.5 Responsibilities of Working Group Officers-----	5
15	6.5.1. Chair-----	5
16	6.5.2. Vice-Chair(s)-----	6
17	6.5.3. Secretary-----	6
18	6.5.4. Treasurer-----	6
19	7. WORKING GROUP	7
20	7.1 Overview-----	7
21	7.2 Working group membership status-----	7
22	7.2.1. Establishment-----	7
23	7.2.2. Retention-----	8
24	7.2.3. Loss-----	8
25	7.2.4. Rights-----	8
26	7.2.5. Meetings and Participation-----	8
27	7.3 Subgroups of the Working Group-----	9
28	8. WORKING GROUP MEMBER ROSTER	9

1	8.1	Working Group Member list -----	9
2	9.	VOTING	10
3	9.1	Approval of an action -----	10
4	9.2	Actions Requiring Approval by a Majority -----	10
5	9.3	Actions Requiring Approval by two-thirds or three-quarters Vote -----	10
6	9.4	Voting between meetings -----	11
7	9.5	Quorum -----	11
8	9.6	Voting on Draft Standards -----	11
9	9.7	Roll Call Votes -----	12
10	10.	MEETINGS	12
11	11.	CONDUCT	13
12	12.	APPEALS	13
13	13.	COMMUNICATIONS	14
14	14.	WG FINANCIAL OPERATIONS	14
15	14.1	WG Financial Operation with Treasury -----	14
16	14.2	WG Financial Operation with Joint Treasury -----	16

17

1 **Prologue**

2

3 Sections of this document with grey highlighting are dictated by AudCom and shall not be
4 changed by the IEEE 802 Executive Committee, or its subgroups.

1. Preface

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified, except to add additional material.

In today's technological environment, standards play a critical role in product development and market competitiveness. Responsibility for how a standard evolves begins in the working group (WG). Every input, behavior, and action has both a contributory and a potential legal consequence. These procedures help protect working group participants and the IEEE by establishing the necessary framework for a sound standardization process.

WG in IEEE 802 operate under the Policies and Procedures of IEEE® Project 802, LAN/MAN Standards Committee (ref. [rules3]) and the hierarchy of policies under which IEEE® Project 802 operates. In the event of any conflict between the Policies and Procedures in this document and the Policies and Procedures of IEEE® Project 802, the Policies and Procedures of IEEE® Project 802 take precedence.

Comment [mjs1]: Based on text for 802.11 WG P&P

2. Modifications to these procedures

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified.

These operating procedures outline the orderly transaction of business by the working group. The working group may amend these procedures with the approval of its Sponsor. The Sponsor may modify these procedures. Modification in this context means that material in these procedures may be modified as long as that clause is not indicated as one that cannot be changed. It is strongly recommended that all subjects included in these procedures be addressed by the working group or Sponsor. (See also clause 9.)

3. Hierarchy

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except to identify the specific superior procedures of the Sponsor by name.

The latest version of several documents takes precedence over these procedures in the following order:

- New York State Not-For-Profit Corporation Law
- IEEE Certificate of Incorporation
- IEEE Constitution
- IEEE Bylaws
- IEEE Policies
- IEEE Board of Directors Resolutions
- IEEE Standards Association Operations Manual
- IEEE-SA Board of Governors Resolutions
- IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws
- IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual
- IEEE-SA Standards Board Resolutions
- IEEE Computer Society (CS) Constitution

Comment [mjs2]: Would like to change to 'published' resolutions but probably can't...

IEEE CS Bylaws
IEEE CS Policies and Procedures Manual (PPM), Section 10
IEEE CS Board of Governors Resolutions
IEEE CS Standards Activities Board Policies and Procedures (SAB P&P)
IEEE Project 802 LAN/MAN Standards Committee (LMSC) Sponsor Policies and Procedures (LMSC P&P)
IEEE Project 802 LAN/MAN Standards Committee (LMSC) Operations Manual (LMSC OM)

Robert's Rules of Order (Revised) is the recommended guide on questions of parliamentary procedure not addressed in these procedures.

Comment [mjs3]: Should feed back to Audcom that this reference is not the recommended format from Robert's Rules...

4. Fundamental Principles of Operation

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified.

For the development of standards, openness and due process are mandatory.

Openness means that any person who has, or could be reasonably expected to have, a direct and material interest, and who meets the requirements of these procedures has a right to participate by:

- a) Attending working group meetings
- b) Becoming a member of the working group
- c) Becoming an officer of the working group
- d) Expressing a position and its basis,
- e) Having that position considered, and
- f) Appealing if adversely affected.

IEEE due process requires a consensus of those parties interested in the project. Consensus is defined as at least a majority agreement, but not necessarily unanimity.

Due process is based upon equity and fair play. The standards development process should strive to have both a balance of interests and not be dominated by any single interest category.

5. Working Group Responsibilities

This clause may be modified.

Each draft document produced by a WG must be within the scope of IEEE 802 and the scope of the WG as determined by the Sponsor. It must also be within the scope of an approved PAR.

The working group shall:

- a) Complete projects from Project Authorization Request (PAR) approval through to IEEE-SA Standards Board approval within the allotted times (normally 48 months) that are assigned to them by the Sponsor
- b) Use the IEEE Standards document template format

Comment [mjs4]: TAG will no longer be able to created recommended practices or guides, but may created other correspondence. Only WG can hold PARs. TAGs will be for advisory purposes only.

Comment [mjs5]: Thompson noted he has continuing concern about a WG being formed to write a Recommended Practice believing that gives them an ongoing license to elevate their work to standards generation.

Comment [mjs6]: Based on text in subclause 5.1.1 paragraph 1 of the Sponsor P&P.

- c) Submit to the Sponsor any documentation required by the Sponsor; for example, a project schedule or a monthly status report
- d) Notify the Sponsor of the draft development milestones
- e) Notify the Sponsor when the draft is ready to begin IEEE Standards Sponsor ballot
- f) Maintain and amend existing standards issued by IEEE developed by the WG.
- g) Attend to other matters (such as interpretations) assigned to them by the Sponsor.

Comment [mjs7]: Adjust list so that proper standoff between list denominators and text

Comment [mjs8]: Note that no scope statement is made in this section. The scope of a WG is the summation of its PARs and ultimately determined by the EC.

Primary responsibility for achieving these goals shall sit with the WG Chair. The WG Chair may assign activities within the WG (in ways compliant with this document and other WG approved documents) so as to facilitate completion of those activities. The WG chair may assign to and be advised by others (Task Group Chairs, Task Force Chairs, Advisory Groups, etc) on matters within the WG to ensure they are attended to and completed.

The WG shall periodically review and confirm that the response to the five criteria (See subclause 5.2 if the IEEE 802 Operations Manual) used to approve its PAR(s) still reflect the state of the project(s) to which they relate. Should a WG need to modify the responses to the five criteria during a projects' development in order to accurately reflect the state of the project, the modified responses shall be submitted to the Sponsor for approval.

Comment [mjs9]: From Mat to try and tie to typical IEEE 802 operating procedures...

Comment [mjs10]: Based on text in subclause 5.1.1 paragraph 2 of the Sponsor P&P.

6. Officers

6.1 Officer Overview

This clause may be modified.

There shall be a Chair and a Secretary, and there should be a Vice-Chair. The office of Treasurer is suggested if significant funds are involved in the operation of the working group and/or its subgroups or if the group has multiple financial reports to supply to the IEEE Standards Association. All officers shall be IEEE members and individual IEEE-SA members. The specific WG officers and their activities should be described in a WG Operations Manual (WG OM) if one exists.

Comment [mjs11]: Make this consistent with the section on Treasury and 802 P&P.

Comment [mjs12]: Added by Mat based on 802.11 recommended WG P&P

At the first organizational session, the working group shall elect its operating officers in accordance with the procedures of its Sponsor, and, where necessary, Robert's Rules of Order. WG officers should read the training material available through [IEEE Standards Development Online](#).

Comment [mjs13]: Check that this is consistent with requirement of IEEE 802 P&P, review all should and shalls in this text.

Comment [mjs14]: Originally read meeting

Initial appointments and temporary appointments to fill vacancies due to resignations or removals for cause, may be made by the Chair of the LMSC, and shall be valid until the end of the next plenary session.

Comment [mjs15]: Taken from 802.11 recommended WG P&P

6.2 Election of Officers

This clause may be modified.

An individual who has served as Chair or Vice Chair of a given WG for a total of five terms or part-terms in that office may not run for election to that office again, unless the WG has passed a motion, one plenary in advance of the election, permitting that individual to stand for re-election.

Comment [mjs16]: Need to discuss confirmation process. Must it be during a plenary?

1 For this motion to pass, 75% or greater approval of the voting membership present in the
2 meeting is needed.

3
4 A WG may elect a new Chair at any plenary session, subject to confirmation by the IEEE 802
5 Sponsor. A motion to hold an election must be passed by 75% of the voting members of the WG
6 present.

7
8 All WG elections become effective at the end of the plenary session where the election occurs.
9 A plenary session is as defined in the IEEE 802 Operation Manual, subclause 4.1. Prior to the
10 end of that plenary session, persons that have been elected during the session are considered
11 'Acting', and do not vote. Persons who are succeeding someone that currently holds the position
12 do not acquire any rights for that position until the close of the plenary session.

Comment [mjs17]: Taken from
LMSC OM 3.2.1.

13
14 The term for all WG officers ends at the close of the first plenary session of each even numbered
15 year. Elected officers maintain their offices until the next election opportunity unless they resign,
16 are removed for cause, or are unable to serve for another reason.

Comment [mjs18]: Adaapted from
first two paragaphs of subclause 3.1 of
the LMSC P&P.

17
18 The Sponsor shall affirm the election of the Chair and Vice-Chair(s). If the sponsor affirmation
19 fails the Chair or Vice-Chair, another election will be run. The sponsor will make a temporary
20 appointment per clause 6.3.

Comment [mjs19]: Some groups
permit more than one.

Comment [mjs20]: Clarified from
original text

Comment [mjs21]: Clarified from
original text

21
22 All confirmed positions become effective at the end of the plenary session where the
23 appointment/election occurs. Prior to the end of that plenary session, such persons filling
24 vacancies are considered 'Acting', and do not vote. Persons who are succeeding someone that
25 currently holds the position do not acquire any Sponsor rights until the close of the plenary
26 session. The term for all WG Chairs and Vice Chairs ends at close of the first plenary session of
27 each even numbered year. Unless otherwise restricted by these P&P individuals may be
28 confirmed for a subsequent term if reappointed or re-elected to the position. Officers appointed
29 and affirmed maintain their appointments until the next appointment opportunity unless they
30 resign or are removed for cause.

Comment [mjs22]: Taken from
subclause 5.1.2 of the Sponsor P&P.

33 **6.3 Temporary Appointments to Vacancies**

34 **This clause may be modified.**

35
36 If an office becomes vacant due to resignation, removal, lack of nomination at an election or for
37 another reason, a temporary appointment shall be made for a period of up to six months. In the
38 case of Chair or Vice-Chair, the Sponsor Chair shall make the temporary appointment, with input
39 from the working group. In the case of Secretary, the WG Chair shall make the temporary
40 appointment. An appointment or election for the vacated office shall be conducted at the earliest
41 practical time.

Comment [mjs23]: Inserted by Mat
to be consistent with current procedures.

Comment [mjs24]: Clarification

43 **6.4 Removal of officers**

44 **This clause may be modified.**

1
2 An officer may be removed by approval of two-thirds of the members of the working group.
3 Removal of the Chair and/or Vice-Chair requires affirmation by the Sponsor. Grounds for
4 removal shall be included in any motion to remove an officer of the working group. The officer
5 suggested for removal shall be given an opportunity to make a rebuttal prior to the vote on the
6 motion for removal.
7

Comment [mjs25]: We need to discuss and clarify what this means. Is it members at a meeting? All members? Plenary session only? Letter ballot?

Comment [mjs26]: Original read 'and'. However I think or was intended and is less confusing.

8 **6.5 Responsibilities of Working Group Officers**

9

10 **6.5.1. Chair**

11
12 The main responsibility of the WG Chair is to enable the WG to operate in an orderly fashion,
13 produce a draft standard, recommended practice, or guide, or to revise an existing document.
14

Comment [mjs27]: Taken from 3.2.1.1 of LMSC OM

15 The Chair or his designee shall have the following responsibilities.

- 16 a) To lead the activity according to all of the relevant policies and procedures
- 17 b) To decide which matters are procedural and which matters are technical
- 18 c) To decide procedural matters or defer them to a majority vote by the WG
- 19 d) To place issues to a vote by WG members
- 20 e) To preside over WG meetings and activities of the WG according to all of the relevant
21 policies and procedures
- 22 f) To entertain motions, but not make motions
- 23 g) To delegate necessary functions as needed
- 24 h) To set goals and deadlines and endeavor to adhere to them
- 25 i) To prioritize objectives to best serve the group and the goals
- 26 j) To seek consensus of the Sponsor if required as a means of resolving issues
- 27 k) To be objective
- 28 l) To not bias discussions
- 29 m) To ensure that all parties have the opportunity to express their views
- 30 n) To be knowledgeable in IEEE standards processes and parliamentary procedures
- 31 o) To call meetings and issue a notice for each meeting at least four weeks prior to the
32 meeting
- 33 p) To issue meeting minutes and important requested documents to members of the WG, the
34 Sponsor, and liaison groups The meeting minutes are to include:
 - 35 • List of participants and their affiliations
 - 36 • Next meeting schedule
 - 37 • Agenda as revised at the start of the meeting
 - 38 • Voting record (Resolution, Mover / Second, Numeric results)

39
40 Minutes shall be made available within 45 days of the meeting to the attendees of the
41 meeting, all members, and all liaisons.

- 42 q) To maintain liaison with other organizations at the direction of the Sponsor or at the
43 discretion of the WG Chair with the approval of the Sponsor

- r) To ensure that any financial operations of the WG comply with the requirements of clause 14 of these P&P
- s) To speak on behalf of the WG to the Sponsor and, in the case of a “Directed Position”, vote the will of the WG in accordance with the Directed Position Procedure of this OM (See subclause 5.2 of the LMSC P&P - Procedure for Establishing a Directed Position)
- t) To establish WG rules beyond the WG rules set down by the Sponsor. These rules must be written and all WG members must be aware of them
- u) To assign / unassign subtasks and task leaders (e.g., secretary, subgroup chair, etc.)
- v) To determine if the WG is dominated by an organization and, if so, treat that organizations’ vote as one (with the approval of the Sponsor)
- w) To manage balloting of projects

Comment [mjs28]: Taken from 3.2.1.1 of the LMSC OM.

6.5.2. Vice-Chair(s)

This clause may be modified.

The Vice-Chair(s) shall

- a) Carry out the Chair's duties if the Chair is temporarily unable to do so or chooses to recuse himself or herself (i.e., to give a technical opinion)
- b) Be familiar with training materials available through IEEE Standards Development Online

If more than one Vice Chair exists, one Vice Chair shall be designated the First Vice Chair and assume the Vice Chair responsibilities identified here.

Comment [mjs29]: Taken from 3.2.1.2 of LMSC OM.

6.5.3. Secretary

This clause may be modified.

The Secretary shall record and publish minutes of each meeting within 30 calendar days of the end of the meeting.

Comment [mjs30]: Taken from 3.2.1.3 of LMSC OM.

6.5.4. Treasurer

This clause may be modified

The Treasurer shall

- a) Maintain a budget
- b) Control all funds into and out of the working group’s bank account
- c) Follow IEEE policies concerning standards meetings and finances
- d) Adhere to the *IEEE Financial Operations Manual*
- e) Bring any discrepancies between the requirements of the IEEE financial operations manual and sponsor P&P to the attention of the sponsor

Comment [mjs31]: Need to discuss - Are we adding responsibilities that aren't in the manual or hare we highlighting stuff for the benefit of someone running for office?

Comment [mjs32]: Added in comment resolution

7. Working Group

7.1 Overview

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures.

Working group membership is by individual. Those attending meetings shall pay any required meeting fees if established. Participants shall fulfill the requirements to gain and maintain membership in the working group.

Comment [mjs33]: I don't agree with this statement and think it should be removed. I think our rules should allow for observers who don't obtain membership. This should be fed back to AudCom.

7.2 Working group membership status

This clause may be modified.

Membership belongs to the individual, not an organization, and may not be transferred.

Members of the sponsor are ex officio members of all WGs.

Comment [mjs34]: From Pat - Our existing membership rules could be put into 7.2 in place of what's there. I wouldn't consider that a "force fit". I doubt that we want to change our rules to allow 50% attendance instead of 75% for a qualifying meeting. Also, these rules would require more attendance to maintain voting rights - at least for those working groups that have interim working group meetings. It isn't clear to me how the rules in the baseline apply to groups like 802.1 and 802.3 that usually have interim task group meetings rather than a meeting of the full working group.

7.2.1. Establishment

All persons participating in the initial meeting of the WG become members of the WG. Thereafter, membership in a WG is established by participating in the meetings of the WG at two out of the last four plenary sessions, and (optionally) a letter of intent to the Chair of the WG. Participation at a meeting is defined as at least 75% presence at a meeting. Participation at a session is defined as participating in meetings during at least 75% of the meetings slots (designated as required for attendance credit) at that session. Membership starts at the third plenary session attended by the participant. The meetings from one duly constituted interim WG or Task Group session may be substituted for the WG meetings at one of the two plenary sessions required to establish membership (See subclause 7.2.5).

Comment [mjs35]: Clarification.

Attendees of the WG who have not achieved member status are known as observers. Liaisons are those designated individuals who provide liaison with other working groups or standards bodies.

Comment [mjs36]: Added as a clarification.

Although not a requirement for membership in the WG, participants are encouraged to join the IEEE, IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) and the IEEE Computer Society. Membership in the IEEE SA will also allow participants to join the sponsor level ballot group.

WG members shall participate in the consensus process in a manner consistent with their professional expert opinion as individuals, and not as organizational representatives.

Membership may be declared at the discretion of the WG Chair (e.g., for contributors by correspondence or other significant contributions to the WG).

The procedure for hibernating a WG is described in subclause 5.1.3.1 in the LMSC P&P. Upon reactivation of a hibernated WG, if at least 50% of the most recent membership roster attends the

plenary session where the WG is reactivated, the membership shall be comprised of that roster, and the normal rules for gaining and losing membership will apply. If less than 50% of the membership attends, the procedure for developing membership in a new WG shall be followed.

7.2.2. Retention

Membership is retained by participating in at least two of the last four plenary sessions. One duly constituted interim WG or task group session may be substituted for one of the two plenary sessions.

Comment [mjs37]: Removed the term meeting from the end of sentence.

Comment [mjs38]: Originally read meeting.

Comment [mjs39]: Originally read meeting.

Comment [mjs40]: From Adrian:

I have interpreted this in 802.11 to mean any interim following the first of the 4 consecutive plenaries. Others may interpret this to mean any interim following the plenary before the first of 4 consecutive plenaries.

It may not matter that the rules are non-specific. But it does require an interpretation of the users of the rules.

7.2.3. Loss

Excepting recirculation letter ballots membership may be lost if two of the last three WG letter ballots are not returned, or are returned with an abstention for other than "lack of technical expertise." This rule may be excused by the WG Chair if the individual is otherwise an active participant. If lost per this subclause, membership is re-established as if the person were a new candidate member.

7.2.4. Rights

The rights of the WG's members include the following:

- a) To receive a notice of the next session
- b) To receive a copy of the minutes
- c) To vote at meetings if and only if present
- d) To vote in WG Letter Ballots
- e) To examine all Working Draft documents
- f) To lodge complaints about WG operation with the Sponsor
- g) To petition the Sponsor in writing

Members of WG/TAG's are members of IEEE 802. A petition signed by two-thirds of the membership of IEEE 802 forces the Sponsor to implement the resolution if allowed by applicable governance.

7.2.5. Meetings and Participation

WG meetings are open to anyone who has complied with the registration requirements (if any) for the meeting. Only members have the right to participate in the discussions. The privilege of observers to participate in discussions may be granted by the WG Chair.

7.3 Subgroups of the Working Group

This clause may be modified.

The working group may, from time to time, form subgroups for the conduct of its business. Only working group members appointed to the subgroup shall vote on questions within such subgroups. Such formation shall be explicitly noted in an official record, such as meeting minutes. At the time of formation, the working group shall determine the scope and duties delegated to the subgroup. Any changes to its scope and duties will require the approval of the working group. Any resolution of a subgroup shall be subject to confirmation by the working group.

The Chair of the working group shall appoint the chair of the subgroup.

8. Working Group Member Roster

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except for the distribution of the roster or to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures.

A working group member roster is a vital aspect of standards development. It serves as a record of members in the working group and is an initial tool if an issue of indemnification arises during the process of standards development.

A working group officer or designee shall maintain a current and accurate roster of members in the working group. The membership roster shall include at least the following:

- a) Title of the Sponsor and its designation
- b) Title of the working group and its designation
- c) Officers--Chair, Vice-Chair, Secretary, Treasurer
- d) Members (including names, email addresses, and affiliations for all members)

A copy of the working group member roster shall be supplied to the IEEE Standards Association at least annually by a working group officer or designee. Due to privacy concerns, the roster shall not be distributed, except to the SA staff, SA Board of Governors and SA Standards Board, unless all Working Group members have submitted their written approval for such distribution.

8.1 Working Group Member list

This clause may not be modified except for the distribution of the roster or to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures.

A working group officer or designee shall maintain a current and accurate membership list. The membership list can be posted on the committee web site and can be publically distributed. The membership list shall be limited to the following:

6. Title of the Working Group and its designation
7. Scope of the Working Group

Comment [mjs41]: We need to discuss how specific we should be here, vs leaving discretion in the OM. Some groups may prefer to not have an OM, and have freedom in how they define their subgroups.

Comment [mjs42]: From Adrian - I've always viewed the LMSC's P&P as in error when it requires that the operation of study groups within a working group requires plenary-by-plenary approval of the EC.

The working group P&P imply that a working group can create subgroups without the involvement of higher layers.

IMHO, the LMSC's P&P should not care how a working group organizes itself internally. Provided the "gozintas" and "gozoutas" are correct, and the rules about openness and fairness etc... apply, it shouldn't care.

The case of a study group is peculiar, because the purpose is uniquely to create a PAR and 5C. But a PAR and 5C can be created outside a study group too. So what would a working ... [1]

Comment [mjs43]: Pat Thaler - One item I noticed was that voting in a subgroups requires being appointed to the subgroup (and the rules don't say who has the right to appoint). I object to that requirement. I think that our subgroups generally allow full participation by all attendees or allow any voting member of the working group to vote or, in th ... [2]

Comment [mjs44]: Taken from 3.2.2 of LMSC OM

Comment [mjs45]: Adrian:

This can be read as saying that the WG cannot record additional information - e.g. attendance, letter ballot response and emails.

I think what it's saying is that that list that is publicly available is limited as specified, ... [3]

8. Officers: Chair, Vice-Chair, Secretary (Treasurer)
9. Members: for all, name, [affiliation]

9. Voting

9.1 Approval of an action

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified, except to choose between two-thirds and three-quarters or to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures.

Approval of an action listed in 9.2 and 9.3 requires approval by a majority or *two-thirds or three-quarters* vote. A majority or *two-thirds or three-quarters* vote is defined as either:

- a) At a meeting (including teleconferences) where quorum has been established, a vote carried by majority or *two-thirds or three-quarters* approval of the votes cast (i.e., Approve or Do Not Approve votes, excluding abstentions) by the voting members in attendance.
- b) By electronic means (including email), a vote carried by majority or *two-thirds or three-quarters* of the votes cast (i.e., Approve or Do Not Approve votes, excluding abstentions), provided a majority of all the voting members of the Committee responded.

Comment [mjs46]: Should we discard 9.1 - 9.4 and replace them with 3.2.3.1.1 - 3 of our P&P. .2 and .3 would be combined as a single subclause.

This issue is that we don't want to deviate too much from the AudCom rules because it makes it hard for them to review and they might reject it. Bit it is difficult to stick their rules in our format. Right now I've hacked in a compromise position part way between our current rules and what AudCom desires, but I'll go with the consensus on all issues here.

Comment [mjs47]: Note that per RoR Chapter 2 Part 4 under "Chair's Vote As Part of the Announcement, Where It Affects the Result." The chair can vote if he is a member which he is. I'd prefer not to state more than necessary in this clause so I have omitted explicit statement of tat fact.

Comment [mjs48]: Should we add a response time requirement here as in 3.2.3.1.2 of the LMSC OM.

9.2 Actions Requiring Approval by a Majority

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except to include additional voting actions, or to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures.

The following actions include approval by a majority vote

- a) Adoption of working group procedures or revisions thereof
- b) Formation of a subgroup, including its procedures, scope, and duties
- c) Disbandment of subgroups
- d) Any other procedural matter put to a vote by the Chair not defined elsewhere in Clause 9 of this document.

Comment [mjs49]: From Pat - I'm concerned that modification of working group procedures in the model is by majority approval. I think that it is more appropriate to have that require a supermajority. It looks like that could be modified to comply with sponsor proceedings if our procedures required a supermajority. Otherwise, the only modification allowed is to add items.

9.3 Actions Requiring Approval by two-thirds or three-quarters Vote

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except to include additional voting actions, or to change approval to three-quarters or to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures.

The following actions require approval by *two-thirds* vote:

Comment [mjs50]: Based on LMSC OM 3.2.1.1 c., now in 6.5.1 of WG P&P.

The following actions require approval by *three-quarters* vote:

- a) Approval of change of the working group scope
- b) Approval to move the draft standards project to the Sponsor for IEEE Standards Sponsor ballot
- c) Any matter regarding the establishment or modification of a PAR or that would make a non-editorial change to a draft standard
- d) A decision to submit a draft standard or a revised standard to the Sponsor for conduct of Sponsor Ballot. See 9.6 for additional constraints.
- e) Permit officer to run for election who has held the office 5 or more partial terms (See 6.2).
- f) Initiate officer elections other than at the first plenary session of even numbered years (See 6.2).
- g) Any other technical matter not defined elsewhere in Clause 9 of this document

Comment [mjs51]: Originates from 3.2.3.1.1 of LMSC OM 3rd paragraph

Comment [mjs52]: Based on 3.2.3.1.3.

Comment [mjs53]: Originates from first paragraph of 3.2.1 of LMSC OM

Comment [mjs54]: Originates from second paragraph of 3.2.1 of LMSC OM

Comment [mjs55]: Based on 3.2.3.1.1 of LMSC OM, first line

These actions are subject to confirmation by the Sponsor.

Comment [mjs56]: Should we permit all action to be conducted eltronically, particularly instatement of chairs?

9.4 Voting between meetings

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures.

The working group shall be allowed to conduct votes between meetings at the discretion of the Chair by use of a letter or electronic ballot. If such actions are to be taken, they shall follow the rules of IEEE Bylaw I-300.4(4).

9.5 Quorum

This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except to modify shaded values and state quorum definitions otherwise approved by the Sponsor.

Comment [mjs57]: Plenary sessions have an automatic quorum. Should that be reflected here?

The presence of a quorum must be announced by the Chair at the beginning of each meeting. Unless otherwise approved by the Sponsor, a quorum shall be defined as one-third of working group members. If a quorum is not present actions may be taken subsequent to confirmation by a letter or electronic ballot as detailed in 9.4, or at the next working group meeting.

Comment [mjs58]: This change is in agreement with the current LMSC OM 3.2.3.1.1.

No quorum is required at meetings held in conjunction with the plenary session since the plenary session time and place is established well in advance. No quorum is required for any WG meeting publicly announced at least 45 days in advance. A quorum is required at other WG meetings.

Comment [mjs59]: See current LMSC OM 3.2.3.1.1

9.6 Voting on Draft Standards

Such decisions shall be decided by letter ballot. Abstains shall require a reason be given, and Do Not Approve votes shall require comments on changes required to modify the vote to approve.

Comment resolution, recirculations, etc should be consistent with Sponsor ballot rules and 5.4.3.2 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*.

The response time for a WG LB on a draft shall be at least thirty days. However, for recirculation ballots the response time shall be at least fifteen days.

Submission of a draft standard or a revised standard to the Sponsor shall be accompanied by any outstanding negative votes and a statement of why these unresolved negative votes could not be resolved.

9.7 Roll Call Votes

A roll call vote may be held at the discretion of the chair.

In addition, a roll call vote may be called for by any member of the group, at any time from when the question has been put until the vote tally is completed. The call does not require a second, and cannot be debated, amended, or have any other subsidiary motion applied to it.

Upon a call for a roll call vote, the chair shall proceed according to these three options.

- a) The chair may hold the vote
- b) The chair may hold a vote on the question of whether to hold a roll call vote. This vote shall achieve greater than 25% of the members voting Yes to pass. The 25% is counted by dividing the count of Yes votes by the sum of the Yes and No votes. This vote is not subject to a roll call vote.
- c) The chair may refuse the request for a roll call vote if this privilege is being abused by members repeatedly calling for a roll call vote. The chair shall allow both the majority and minority reasonable and fair use of the roll call vote.

Each roll call vote and call for a roll call vote shall be recorded in minutes of the meeting. For each roll call vote, the minutes shall include each member's name, their vote and the final result of the vote. For each call for a roll call vote, the minutes shall include:

- i. The name of the requestor of the roll call vote.
- ii. The decision of the chair on the request and, when applicable, the results of the vote on whether to hold the roll call or the reasons of the chair for denying the roll call vote.

10. Meetings

This clause may be modified.

Working Group meetings shall be held, as decided by the working group, the Chair, or by petition of three-twentieths or more of the members, to conduct business, such as making

Comment [mjs60]: Taken from 3.2.3.1.1 of LMSC OM

Comment [mjs61]: From Jon:

This is another clause where "session" and "meeting" may be confused. The last two paragraphs seem to be in the wrong Clause. Balance and affiliation should be in different clause. I would suggest 7.2.5 as a target for the affiliation requirement. Although it is interesting that we declare in 7.2.1 that WG members are professional expert individuals, and not representatives, so how can one represent others...

Comment [mjs62]: From Pat - Meetings looks like it at least needs to change to include meeting as part of the sponsor's plenary meeting since that isn't "as decided by the working group, the Chair, or by petition of three-twentieths or more of the members". Three-twentieths (15%) seems a rather strange amount and rather low.

1 assignments, receiving reports of work, considering draft standards, and considering views and
2 objections from any source.

3
4 A working group meeting shall be announced, by a working group officer or designee, 21
5 calendar days in advance to all participants. An agenda shall be distributed at least 14 calendar
6 days in advance of a meeting.

7
8 The working group, or meeting host, may charge a meeting fee to cover services needed for the
9 conduct of the meeting. The fee shall not be used to restrict participation by any interested
10 parties.

11
12 While having a balance of all interested parties is not an official requirement for a working
13 group, it is a desirable goal. As such, the officers of the working group should consider issues of
14 balance and dominance that may arise and discuss them with the Sponsor. A balanced body is
15 required for IEEE Standards Sponsor ballot.

16
17 Participants shall be asked to state their affiliation at each working group meeting. If the
18 participant is a consultant, that participant may be asked to declare if he or she represents the
19 interests of an organization other than himself or herself at the meeting.

20 21 **11. Conduct**

22 **This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except to be compliant with the**
23 **Sponsor's procedures.**

24
25 It is expected that participants in the working group behave in a professional manner at all times.
26 Participants shall demonstrate respect and courtesy towards officers and each other, while
27 allowing participants a fair and equal opportunity to contribute to the meeting, in accordance
28 with the IEEE Code of Ethics.

29
30 All working group participants shall comply with all applicable laws (nation-based and
31 international) and act in accordance with all IEEE Standards policies and procedures. Where
32 applicable, working group participants shall comply with IEEE Policies Section 9.8 on Conflict
33 of Interest.”

34 35 **12. Appeals**

36 **This clause shall be included and shall not be modified except to be compliant with the**
37 **Sponsor's procedures.**

38
39 The working group recognizes the right of appeal. If technical or procedural appeals are referred
40 back to the working group, every effort should be made to ensure that impartial handling of
41 complaints regarding any action or inaction on the part of the working group is performed in an
42 identifiable manner.

43
44 If the working group must conduct an appeal hearing, it shall model its appeals process based on
45 the appeals processes of the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

13. Communications

This clause may be modified.

Inquiries relating to the working group should be directed to the Chair and recorded by the Secretary. All replies to such inquiries shall be made through the Chair. These communications shall make it clear that they are responses from the working group.

14. WG Financial Operations

A WG may wish or need to conduct financial operations in order for it to host interim sessions for itself or one or more of its sub groups or to acquire goods and/or services that it requires for its operation.

A WG that claims any beneficial interest in or control over any funds or financial accounts whose aggregate value is \$500 or more is determined to have a treasury and said to be “operating with treasury”.

A WG may operate with treasury only if it requests permission and is granted permission by the Sponsor to operate with treasury and thereafter complies with the rules of this subclause. The WG request to operate with treasury shall be supported by a motion that has been approved by the WG. The WG may, again by WG approved motion, surrender Sponsor granted permission to operate with treasury. The Sponsor may withdraw permission for a WG to operate with treasury for cause.

A WG subgroup shall not operate with treasury.

14.1 WG Financial Operation with Treasury

The financial operations of a WG operating with treasury shall comply with the following rules.

a) The WG shall conduct its financial operations in compliance with all IEEE, IEEE-SA, and IEEE Computer Society rules that are applicable to the financial operations of standards committees. As of January 2005, the documents containing these rules include, but are not limited to, the following:

- IEEE Policies, Sections 11 IEEE Financial Matters and 12.6 Contracts with Exclusive Rights
- IEEE Financial Operations Manual (FOM), Sections FOM.3 Asset/Liability Management and FOM.8 Contract and Purchasing Orders
- Computer Society Policies and Procedures Manual, Section 16.7.1 Checking Accounts
- IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 5.3 Standards development meetings

- b) The WG shall have a Treasurer who is responsible to the WG Chair and Sponsor Treasurer for the operation of the WG treasury, for ensuring that the operation of the WG treasury and the WG financial accounts complies with this OM and follows prudent financial procedures. The WG Treasurer shall:
- i) Maintain a budget
 - ii) Control all funds into and out of the WG's bank accounts
 - iii) Follow IEEE policies concerning standards meetings and finances
 - iv) Read the IEEE Finance Operations Manual
- c) The WG shall have an Executive Committee (WG EC) comprised of, at minimum, the WG Chair, Vice Chairs, Secretaries, and Treasurer. The WG Chair shall be the Chair of the WG EC.
- d) The WG shall open and maintain a WG bank account whose title shall begin with "IEEE" followed by the numerical identity of the WG (e.g., IEEE 802.1). The LMSC Chair shall be an authorized signer for the account. The LMSC Treasurer shall be notified within 30 days of the bank, account number, account title, and authorized signers for the account when the account is opened and whenever any of these items change.
- e) The WG may open and maintain one or more WG merchant accounts for the settlement of credit card transactions. The title of each merchant account shall begin with "IEEE" followed by the numerical identity of the WG (e.g., IEEE 802.1). Each WG merchant account shall be linked to the WG bank account. The LMSC Treasurer shall be notified within 30 days of each merchant account, account number, and account title when the account is opened and whenever any of these items change.
- f) All funds collected and/or received by a WG shall be deposited in the WG bank account.
- g) All funds retained by a WG shall be held in the WG bank account or in IEEE approved investments.
- h) The WG may disburse and/or retain funds as appropriate to pay approved expenses and maintain an approved operating reserve.
- i) Signature authority for any WG financial account is restricted to those IEEE, IEEE-SA, and Computer Society officers and/or staff that are required to have signature authority by IEEE, IEEE-SA, and Computer Society regulations; to LMSC officers and to the officers of the WG owning the account, with the sole exception that, at most, two other individuals may be granted signature authority for the WG bank account for the sole purpose of assisting the WG in conducting its financial operations, provided that each such individual has provided agreements, indemnity, and/or bonding satisfactory to the IEEE. The granting of signature authority to any individual other than the WG Treasurer and those required by IEEE, IEEE-SA, Computer Society, or LMSC regulations shall be by motion that is approved by the WG.
- j) The WG shall prepare and maintain its own accounting and financial records.
- k) The WG Treasurer shall prepare for each WG plenary session a financial report that summarizes all of the WG financial activity since the last such report. The report shall be submitted to the LMSC Treasurer before the opening of the session, shall be presented to WG membership at the opening plenary meeting of the session, and shall be included in the session minutes. The format and minimum content of the report shall be as specified by the LMSC Treasurer.

- 1 l) The WG Treasurer shall prepare and submit an audit package for each calendar year
2 during any portion of which the WG operated with treasury, as required by IEEE
3 regulations. The package shall contain all material required by IEEE Audit Operations for
4 an IEEE audit and shall be submitted to the IEEE for audit or to the LMSC Chair for
5 local audit, as required by IEEE audit regulations. If the package is submitted to the
6 IEEE, a summary of the WG's financial operations for the audit year shall be submitted
7 to the LMSC Chair at the same time that the audit package is submitted to the IEEE. The
8 format and minimum content of the summary shall be as specified by the LMSC
9 Treasurer.
- 10 m) The maximum and minimum size of the WG operating reserve may be set by the
11 Sponsor.
- 12 n) All WG expenditures require the approval of the WG EC, with the sole exception that
13 each WG EC member may be reimbursed from the WG treasury for up to \$200 of WG
14 expenses incurred between WG sessions without specific approval of the WG EC.
- 15 o) The location, date, and fees for each interim session hosted or co-hosted by the WG
16 require the approval of the WG EC.
- 17 p) For each interim session hosted or co-hosted by the WG, all reasonable and appropriate
18 direct expenses for goods and/or services for the session that are provided under
19 contract(s) and/or agreement(s) that are exclusively for that interim session are approved
20 when the WG EC approves the location, date, and fees for the session.
- 21 q) Any contract and/or agreement to which the WG is a party, whose total value is greater
22 than \$5000 and that is not for goods and/or services exclusively for a single interim
23 session hosted or co-hosted by the WG, requires the approval of the WG EC and the
24 Sponsor before execution.
- 25 r) The WG shall maintain an inventory of each item of equipment that it purchases that has
26 a useful life of greater than 6 months and purchase price of greater than \$50. A copy of
27 the inventory shall be provided to the LMSC Treasurer during December of each year.
28

29 **14.2 WG Financial Operation with Joint Treasury**

30 Two or more WGs with the approval of the Sponsor, may operate with a single joint treasury.
31 WGs that operate with a joint treasury shall have no other treasury. The merger of separate WG
32 treasuries into a joint treasury or the splitting of a joint treasury into separate WG treasuries
33 requires approval of the Sponsor. Each such action shall be supported by a motion from each of
34 the involved WGs that requests the action and that has been approved by the WG.
35

36 The operation of a joint treasury is subject to the same rules as a WG operating with treasury
37 with the following exception: The Executive Committee overseeing the joint treasury shall be a
38 Joint Executive Committee that is the union of the Executive Committees of the WGs operating
39 with the joint treasury. The Chair of the Joint EC shall be selected by the Joint Executive
40 Committee and shall be the Chair of one of the participating WGs.
41

42 | Comment [mjs63]: Taken from 3.2.4
43 of LMSC OM.

From Adrian - I've always viewed the LMSC's P&P as in error when it requires that the operation of study groups within a working group requires plenary-by-plenary approval of the EC.

The working group P&P imply that a working group can create subgroups without the involvement of higher layers.

IMHO, the LMSC's P&P should not care how a working group organizes itself internally. Provided the "gozintas" and "gozoutas" are correct, and the rules about openness and fairness etc... apply, it shouldn't care.

The case of a study group is peculiar, because the purpose is uniquely to create a PAR and 5C. But a PAR and 5C can be created outside a study group too. So what would a working group do if the EC refused to allow a study group? I suspect that a group of individuals (the same ones who would have attended the study group) create a PAR and 5C, get it approved by their WG, and then bring it to the EC.

So this is clearly a case of the EC having a rule it shouldn't have that has no effect and wastes everybody's time organizing, creating, reviewing and bringing motions to the EC.

Pat Thaler - One item I noticed was that voting in a subgroups requires being appointed to the subgroup (and the rules don't say who has the right to appoint). I object to that requirement. I think that our subgroups generally allow full participation by all attendees or allow any voting member of the working group to vote or, in the case of 802.1, no votes are taken in subgroups.

Adrian:

This can be read as saying that the WG cannot record additional information - e.g. attendance, letter ballot response and emails.

I think what it's saying is that that list that is publicly available is limited as specified, but it is not saying anything about records required to perform usual duties - e.g. contact details, attendance and voting data.