### IEEE-SA Baseline Policies and Procedures for Standards Development – Sponsor (Version February 2018)

### Society/Sponsor: \_\_IEEE Computer/LAN/MAN Sponsor

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Identification of document (including date of document) | Red line provided (Yes/No) | Reviewers: | Review date | Recommendation(Accept, Conditionally Accept, Return for follow up with comments) |
| Rev 0 | Proposed 802 LMSC 5-2-2019.docx | Yes | Phil Winston Jingyi Zhou | 2019-05-31 | Return for follow up with comments) |
| Rev 1 | Proposed 802 LMSC 5-2-2019.docx |  | Phil Winston Jingyi Zhou | 2019-06-25 | Return for follow up with comments) |
| Rev 2 | Ec-18-0102-12-OPNP-proposed\_LMSC\_P&P-2018 | Yes | Phil Winston Jingyi Zhou | 2019-09-26 | Return for follow up with comments) |
| Rev 3 |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Reviewers’ additional comments:** |
| Rev 0 | Significant comments and concerns noted. One item to be considered by the Standards Committee (Sponsor) may be to request and extension to the existing expiration date into 2020. This would allow the use of the 2019 revised template which likely will address many of the items noted below. It is noted that the approved language for the 2019 Template is still being developed and as such it is not yet determinable if the proposed language in this P&P will be consistent with the language in the revised 2019 template. |
| Rev 1 | AudCom was directed by the Standards Board to allow the change from Sponsor to Standards Committee to be an acceptable change. As such the checklist has been updated into R1Please take into account respond to both R0 and R1 comments.* Section 1.7 IEEE Sponsor - Scope may worth some discussion.
* Section 3.1 and 3.3 - Need to complete the procedures in a new officer generation and removal process
* Section 10 Dominance – Standards Committee action need to be aligned with IEEE-SASB bylaw.
* Section 11 Standards Committee Ombudsman – Content may be disseminated to section 3.0 and 3.4
* Section 12 - May be moved to an O&P document of P802
* Other minor changes in verbiage has also been made in several sections.
 |
| Rev 2 | Significant changes have been made. Some minor items still need to be addressed. See individual comments below.* Changes are made against instruction in section 5.5 (although changes might be technically correct)
* Additional Section 11 may not belong to Standards Committee P&P
 |
| Rev 3 |  |

Modifiable column: sections shaded in red shall not be modified; please note instructions in other sections.

| **Section in Baseline Sponsor P&Ps** | **Modifiable?** | **Modified?** | **Acceptable?** | **Comments (please indicate Rev #)** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Yes** | **No** | **Yes** | **No** |
| 0.0 | NO | Yes |  | Yes |  | On Page x, Table of Contents is not allowed in P&P document; per Standards Committee P&P Review Process item 1 bR2: Table of Contents determined to be OK |
| 1.0 Introduction | No text | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  1.1 Role of Standards Development and these Procedures | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  1.2 Conduct | No | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: Hyper link appears inserted correctly.  |
|  1.3 Modification to these Procedures | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  1.4 Hierarchy | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |   |
|  1.5 Fundamental Principles of Standards Development | Only ID Sponsor | Yes |  |  | No | R2: Use full name of Standards Committee  |
|  1.6 Definitions | Only additional definitions | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  1.7 IEEE Sponsor Scope | Must addSponsor scope | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: Substantive: 1. “using an open and accredited process,” Perhaps, we can change it to ““using an open, IEEE-SA acceptable accredited process”
2. “Its technical scope is intended to be flexible and is ultimately determined by the sum of its approved PARs.”

In IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws 4.2.2.1, The PAR project scope shall be within the scope and purpose of the IEEE, that standards projects are assigned to the proper Society. Hence, suggesting revise the text: “Its technical scope is intended to be flexible in coordination with other Standards Committee(s) within IEEE as technical merits required and is ultimately determined by the sum of its approved PARs.” R2: Scope determined to be the formal Scope of the Standards Committee |
| 1.8 Organization of the Sponsor |  | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 2.0 Responsibilities of the Sponsor | Only to add responsibilities | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  2.1 Sponsorship | Sponsor Name | Yes |  | Yes  |  |  |
| 3.0 Officers | Only to add more officers | Yes |  | Yes |  | Substantive:R0: R1:Since additional officers are allowed, altering the titles to include additional officers is within the spirit of allowance.  |
|  3.1 Election or Appointment of Officers | Select Case 1, 2, or 3 or define Sponsor process | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: Substantive: 1. This P&P did not follow officer generation schema in the template: Case 1, Case 2, and Case 2 (or the combination of case 1/2/3). P&P designed a new schema that elect Chair and Chair appoint other officers. AudCom allows this the alternation of schema. There are few important procedural steps missing in the proposed schema:
	1. Election term – once per year?
	2. Election administrator and appointment procedure
	3. Nomination procedure and nominee acceptance procedure
	4. Election voting procedure

R2: Process found to be acceptable |
|  3.2 Temporary Appointments to Vacancies | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  3.3 Removal of Officers | Select Case 1 or 2 or define Sponsor process | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: Substantive: 1. AudCom allows the alternative schema, but proper procedures need to be developed along with alternative procedures. (e.g., percentage of the vote; rebuttal)

R2: process found to be acceptable  |
|  3.4 Responsibilities of Officers | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  3.4.1 Chair | Only to add responsibilities | Yes |  |  | No | R0: Substantive:1. Deleting “b) Forming study groups, as necessary.” text is not allowed

R2: Comment not addressed “b)” should be reinserted per instruction no modification except addition  |
|  3.4.2 Vice Chair | Only to add responsibilities | Yes |  |  | No | R2: since a first and a second vice chairs have been noted, the duties of these two distinct officers should be noted. Perhaps as 3.4.2.1 and 3.4.2.2 or as done with the multiple secretary titles. |
|  3.4.3 Recording Secretary |  Add or move responsibilitiesShaded values | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  3.4.4 Treasurer | May add responsibilities or indicated designated officer | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  3.4.5 Responsible Subcommittee Chair | Omit if N/A; may add responsibilities | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 3.4.6 Executive Secretary | Adding additional role is allowed in section 3.4 | Yes |  | Yes |  |   |
| 4.0 Membership | No text |  | No | Yes |  |  |
|  4.1 Attendance at Meetings | Modify to clarify requirements or N/A if none | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  4.2 Non-voting Membership | Modify to clarify requirements or N/A  | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  4.3 Voting Membership | Select a Case address brackets or N/A | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: Substantive1. Sentence needs to be clarified: “This letter is to document several key factors relative to their participation on the Standards Committee and is to be signed by both the Standards Committee member and an individual who has management responsibility for the Standards Committee member.” What role in the Standards Committee is considered has management responsibility? Chair? First Vice Chair? Second Vice Chair? Etc.

R2: Comment addressed. Clarification made. |
|  4.3.1 Requirements for Voting members | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  4.3.2 Request to the Chair for Voting Membership | Yes, or N/A | Yes |  |  | No | R0: Editorial 1. Changing Section title from “Request to the Chair” to “Request to the Standards Committee Chair” is usually not allowed with exception of advised in instructional text and special circumstance

R2: Comment not addressed. Section Title should be changed to the template text. |
|  4.4 Review of Membership  | Yes, or N/A if ex-officio only | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  4.5 Ex-officio Voting Membership | Yes (clause and heading) | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  4.6 Other Membership Classes | Define additional membership classes or N/A | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  4.7 Membership Roster | Yes, except distribution; Address bracketed text | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  4.8 Membership Public List | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 5.0 Subgroups Created by the Sponsor | Only to change from majority to 2/3 vote. | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  5.1 Executive Committee | Yes, or N/A | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  5.2 Responsible Subcommittee  | Only to address bracketed options, or N/A | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  5.3 Working Groups – Individual Method | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  5.4 Working Groups – Entity Method  | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  5.5 PAR Development | No | Yes |  |  | No | R2: SubstantiveFirst Paragraph, changes – 1. “as a subgroup of the Standards Committee”
2. ”as a subgroup of”

Are not permitted per instruction |
|  5.5.1 PAR Study Group | No | Yes |  |  | No | R0: Substantive1. 1st Paragraph, Changes are not permitted.
2. 2nd Paragraph, it is a new paragraph, is not permitted.
3. 3rd Paragraph, Changes are not permitted.

R2: Comments 2) and 3) have been addressed. Comment 1) is still outstanding   |
|  5.5.2 Criteria for Consideration of a PAR by the Sponsor | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  5.5.3 Participation and Voting  | Only to increase figure for approval | Yes |  |  | No | R0:Substantive1. 1st Paragraph, Changes are not permitted.
2. 2nd Paragraph, No wordsmith is permitted and changes are permitted
	1. remove brackets
	2. increase numbers

R2: Modifications made; however, the three changes made in first paragraph (although possibly technically correct) are not permitted per the instructions.  |
|  5.5.4 Submission of PAR to the Sponsor | No | Yes |  |  | No | R0: Substantive1. 1st Paragraph, Change (deletion the phrase “or Working Group” is not permitted.
2. 2rd Paragraph is a new paragraph which is not permitted

Note: The action described in this paragraph seems not belong to the Standard Committee. R2: comment 2) above addressed; however, : Modifications made; however, the change from ‘PAR Study Group” to ‘PAR Study Group or Working Group’ (although possibly technically correct) is not permitted per the instructions.   |
| 5.5.5 Other rules for PAR Study Groups | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |   |
|  5.6 Other subgroups | Only to change majority to two-thirds | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 5.7 Technical Advisory Groups | No | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0:Substantive1. Section is new, which is not permitted under AudCom 2017 P&P Template

R2: Changes were determined to be OK  |
| 5.8 Additional Rules for Working Groups | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0:Substantive1. Section is new, which is not permitted under AudCom 2017 P&P Template

R2: Changes were determined to be OK |
| 5.8.1 Assignment of PARs to a Working Group | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 5.8.2 Working Group Policies and Procedures | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 5.8.3 Hibernation of a Working Group | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 5.8.4 Disbanding a Working Group | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 6.0 Meetings | Onlyshaded values, bracketed text | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  6.1 Quorum | Only to increaseshaded values | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  6.2 Executive Session | No | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: EditorialSubstantive1. 2st Paragraph, changing “executive session” into “Executive Session” violated the clause shall not be modified instruction.

R2: Changes were determined to be OK |
|  6.3 Meeting Fees | Yes, or N/A | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  6.4 Minutes | No | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: Editorial Substantive:Changing “executive session” into “Executive Session” violated the clause shall not be modified instruction.R2: Changes were determined to be OK |
| 7.0 Voting | No text |  | No | Yes |  |  |
|  7.1 Approval of an action | No | Yes |  | Yes  |  |  |
|  7.1.1 Actions requiring approval by a majority vote | Only to add actions or edit bracketed text or move to 7.1.2 | Yes |  |  | No | R0: Editorial 1. Editing Item e) violated the instruction only edit bracketed text

R2: Comment not addressed |
|  7.1.2 Actions requiring approval by a two-thirds vote | Only to add items | Yes |  |  | No | R0: SubstantiveEditing Item a) violated the instruction clause shall not be modified3rd Paragraph is a new paragraph contain notes which violated the instruction except to include additional voting actionsR2: Comment not addressed |
|  7.2 Sponsor approvals | No text | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  7.2.1 Moving a draft standard to Sponsor ballot | No | Yes |  | Yes  |  |  |
|  7.2.2 Change in scope of a standards project | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  7.3 Proxy Voting | Only if Proxy voting not allowed, change to N/A | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  7.4 Voting between meetings | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 8.0 Communications | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  8.1 Formal Internal Communication | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  8.2 External Communication | No | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: Substantive1. Editing text in the section violated the instruction clause shall not be modified

R2: Changes were determined to be OK |
|  8.3 Public Statements for Standards | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  8.3.1 Sponsor Public Statements | Only to add requirements | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  8.3.2 Subgroup Public Statements | Only to add requirements | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  8.3.3 Public Statements to be Issued by Other Entities | No | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
|  8.4 Informal Communications | No | Yes |  | Yes |  | . |
|  8.5 Standards Publicity | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 9.0 Appeals | Only to add custom appeals process  | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |
| 10.0 Dominance | No | Yes |  | Yes (?) |  | R0: R1:Note: Further considering other sections of AudCom convention, taking all sections in context, additional sections are acceptable.Substantive:1. Paragraph 5 “the Standards Committee may direct that the votes of individuals in the dominating party shall be treated as a single vote for the purpose of that activity.”

This dominance action is in conflict with SASB bylaw section 5.2.1.3 Dominance paragraph 3 and 4, * Standards Committee “only” monitor/report/recommend corrective actions.
* SASB shall determine dominance exists, corrective action needed and specify approved corrective action(s).

Standards Committee implement SASB approved corrective action(s)R2: Revised language addresses the comment. The verbiage in the second paragraph needs to be checked for consistency of final Dominance language. |
| 11.0 Standards Committee Ombudsman | No | Yes |  | Yes |  | R0: R1:Note: Further considering other sections of AudCom convention, taking all sections in context, additional sections are acceptable.Substantive:1. Is the ombudsman an officer of the Standards Committee? if yes, please define the role in section 3.0 and define role’s responsibilities in section 3.4

The content of this section can be moved to section 3.0 and 3.4 respectivelyR2: section has been removed  |
| 11.0 Revision of Standards Committee P&P | N/A |  |  |  | No | R2: The reviewers have considered the Standards Committee’s comment; however, we do not agree that this is appropriate in the P&P. The section can either be removed or it will be a discussion item at the next AudCom meeting. |
| 12.0 Revision of Standards Committee P&P | N?A |  |  |  | No | R0: R1: Substantive: This section is more appropriate to be included in a submitters O&P manual or similar documentR2: Section changed to section 11. See section 11 for comments.  |